

11-2022

The Erasure of Sex: The Global Capture of Policies on Sex by Gender Identity Activists and the Effects on the Rights of Women and Girls

Feminists from Europe, Asia, North America, Latin America, and Africa

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalcommons.uri.edu/dignity>



Part of the Gender and Sexuality Commons, Health Policy Commons, Inequality and Stratification Commons, International and Area Studies Commons, Leadership Studies Commons, Linguistics Commons, Policy Design, Analysis, and Evaluation Commons, Policy History, Theory, and Methods Commons, Politics and Social Change Commons, Social Justice Commons, and the Social Policy Commons

Recommended Citation

from Europe, Asia, North America, Latin America, and Africa, Feminists (2022) "The Erasure of Sex: The Global Capture of Policies on Sex by Gender Identity Activists and the Effects on the Rights of Women and Girls," *Dignity: A Journal of Analysis of Exploitation and Violence*: Vol. 7: Iss. 4, Article 1. <https://doi.org/10.23860/dignity.2022.07.04.01>

This Research and Scholarly Article is brought to you for free and open access by DigitalCommons@URI. It has been accepted for inclusion in Dignity: A Journal of Analysis of Exploitation and Violence by an authorized editor of DigitalCommons@URI. For more information, please contact digitalcommons@etal.uri.edu.

The Erasure of Sex: The Global Capture of Policies on Sex by Gender Identity Activists and the Effects on the Rights of Women and Girls

Abstract

This article reviews the goals, history, and impact of the new *gender identity* politics. Based on the *Yogyakarta Principles*, these new ideas and policies will profoundly affect the rights of women and girls worldwide. The *Principles* are a document from an international meeting about sexual orientation and gender identity in 2006. In 2017, the document was updated to the *Yogyakarta Principles Plus 10*. The *Principles* recommend legal changes by states worldwide, resulting in the erasure of sex as a legal and cultural category. These principles have been widely used to lobby for legal changes resulting in profound structural changes that lead to undermining and eliminating protections for women and girls from sex-based discrimination and state obligations to achieve de facto sex equality. One of the most far-reaching recommendations is “States [national governments] must abolish all legal records of sex from all legal documents, including birth certificates and passports.” These recommendations are being implemented globally, although they have never been discussed or adopted by member states or any international organization, nor were any official women’s organizations consulted. This article was written by a collective of many feminist activists, researchers, and specialist service providers from Europe, Asia, North America, Latin America, and Africa who met every week at the Women’s Declaration International (WDI) sessions. They collected evidence and collaborated on creating this document from 2019 to 2022.

Keywords

Europe, Asia, North America, Latin America, Africa, sex, gender, gender identity, policy, Yogyakarta Principles, prostitution, pornography, surrogacy, transgender, United Nations, conventions, law

Creative Commons License



This work is licensed under a [Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-No Derivative Works 4.0 License](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/).

**THE ERASURE OF SEX:
THE GLOBAL CAPTURE OF POLICIES ON SEX BY
GENDER IDENTITY ACTIVISTS AND THE EFFECTS ON
THE RIGHTS OF WOMEN AND GIRLS**

Feminists from Europe, Asia, North America, Latin America, and Africa

ABSTRACT

This article reviews the goals, history, and impact of the new *gender identity* politics. Based on the *Yogyakarta Principles*, these new ideas and policies will profoundly affect the rights of women and girls worldwide. The *Principles* are a document from an international meeting about sexual orientation and gender identity in 2006. In 2017, the document was updated to the *Yogyakarta Principles Plus 10*. The *Principles* recommend legal changes by states worldwide, resulting in the erasure of sex as a legal and cultural category. These principles have been widely used to lobby for legal changes resulting in profound structural changes that lead to undermining and eliminating protections for women and girls from sex-based discrimination and state obligations to achieve de facto sex equality. One of the most far-reaching recommendations is “States [national governments] must abolish all legal records of sex from all legal documents, including birth certificates and passports.” These recommendations are being implemented globally, although they have never been discussed or adopted by member states or any international organization, nor were any official women’s organizations consulted. This article was written by a collective of many feminist activists, researchers, and specialist service providers from Europe, Asia, North America, Latin America, and Africa who met every week at the Women’s Declaration International (WDI) sessions. They collected evidence and collaborated on creating this document from 2019 to 2022.

KEYWORDS

Europe, Asia, North America, Latin America, Africa, sex, gender, gender identity, policy, Yogyakarta Principles, prostitution, pornography, surrogacy, transgender, United Nations, conventions, law

IN 2006, A SELF-SELECTED GROUP OF EXPERTS, among them several members of United Nations committees and former United Nations Special Rapporteurs, signed a document entitled the *Yogyakarta Principles* (International Commission of Jurists [ICJ], 2007). The document has never been formally discussed or adopted by the member states of any international organization. Nevertheless, it has possibly become one of the most successful global lobbying tools in history. In 2017, this document was updated to the *Yogyakarta Principles plus 10* (ICJ, 2017).

The *Principles* recommend legal changes in states around the world. One of the most far-reaching Articles is that “States [national governments] must abolish all legal records of sex from all legal documents, including birth certificates and passports” (ICJ, 2017, p. 9). This article reviews the document’s history, goals, and potential influence of its advocacy of the new gender identity politics.

Initially, the gender identity project revolved around the advocacy to support a few statistically rare individuals who suffer from body dysmorphic disorder, then defined as a mental health disorder in which one cannot stop thinking about one or more perceived defects or flaws in one's appearance (Bjornsson, Didie & Phillips, 2010, n.p.). This diagnosis was combined with a paraphilia called *autogynephilia*, a "male's propensity to be sexually aroused by the thought of himself as a female" (Lawrence, 2011, n.p.). Lawrence characterized autogynephilia as "encompass[ing] sexual arousal with cross-dressing and cross-gender expression that does not involve women's clothing per se" (Lawrence, 2011, n.p.). Lawrence theorized that autogynephilia underlays transvestism and forms of male-to-female (MtF) transsexualism.

Although initially defined and characterized as individual disorders or expressions, the autogynephilia concept has politically evolved into a political discourse to gain power by people who want to be perceived as the opposite sex. It is now advocated by many institutions, including academic and health institutions and corporations, worldwide (Lindsay, 2020).

Under the argument of reducing the stigma of these initially classified mental disorders and sexual paraphilias, the Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders (DSM-V) of the American Psychiatric Association reclassified the disorder *gender dysphoria* into a separate category (Garg, Elshimy & Marwaha, 2020). Increasingly, transgender activists want it removed altogether as homosexuality once was (Zucker, 2015).

Sex stereotypes are used as the criteria for inclusion in the label gender dysphoria (Garg et al., 2020). These stereotypes have become the basis for medicalizing and pathologizing children. Included in the criteria are:

- a "strong desire or insistence to be the other gender,"
- a strong preference for cross-gender roles in fantasy play,
- a strong preference for toys and games stereotypically used by the other gender or rejection of those assigned to their gender,
- a strong preference for playmates of the other gender, and
- a strong dislike of one's sexual anatomy" (Garg et al., 2020).

Although there is evidence that gender dysphoria will resolve over time (Ristori & Steensma, 2015), the activists promote gender affirmation as the favored response. Gender affirmation is recommended to therapists so that children can self-declare themselves as girls or boys. Therapists are advised to accept and affirm the child's self-declaration of gender with subsequent treatment of puberty-blocking hormones, cross-sex hormones, and permanent surgical interventions such as mastectomies and vaginoplasties. Nonetheless, gender dysphoria usually disappears around or after puberty (Ristori & Steensma, 2016), except in children who were urged to continue on a gender dysphoria pathway by gender affirmation (Carmichael et al., 2020).

With little review or discussion, the term *gender dysphoria* was changed to *gender incongruence*. The World Health Organization (WHO) has lobbied to change gender dysphoria to gender incongruence and eliminate all connections to mental, behavioral, and sexual disorders (BBC, 2019). This plan to normalize the dissociation of the body and the mind is the basis of powerful industries such as beauty, sex, prostitution, pornography, and surrogacy industries and the naturalization/legalization of other sexual perversions. In the case of adolescents and adults, the focus is maintained on

the incongruence with gender desire or conviction that one has the feelings and reactions of the other *gender*.

Several international non-governmental organizations (NGOs) have gradually become the main drivers of this powerful and well-funded international project (International Trans Fund, 2017). They include The International Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Trans and Intersex Association (ILGA), Transgender Europe, Outright International, Arc International, Arcus Foundation Trans Global Initiative, and a number of UN agencies, as well as foundations, notably Arcus Foundation, and its brother foundation Stryker (Stryker's Allies for Equality (SAFE)) in the USA. They have become a special interest group to protect the right to self-declare one's gender over sex.

DEFINITIONS

The International Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Trans, and Intersex Association in Europe (ILGA Europe, 2015), a well-known international umbrella organization advocating for the rights of persons who identify as transgender, recommends the following definitions of new terms:

Trans

Trans is an inclusive umbrella term referring to those people whose gender identity and/or gender expression differs from the sex they were assigned at birth. It includes, but is not limited to: men and women with transsexual pasts and people who identify as transsexual, transgender, transvestite/cross-dressing, androgyne, polygender, genderqueer, agender, gender variant, or with any other gender identity and/or expression which is not standard male or female and expresses their gender through their choice of clothes, presentation, or body modifications, including undergoing multiple surgical procedures (ILGA Europe, 2015).

This definition is used as the basis for legislative advocacy in what is known as *trans rights activism*. However, it is impossible to understand whose rights states are supposed to legislate on because:

- sex is not assigned at birth; it is biologically determined, and
- there is no universal socially constructed male and female standard. Therefore, any human could be described as trans (Hilton et al., 2021).

This definition of trans rests on three concepts in the Yogyakarta Principles:

Gender Identity (GI)

Gender identity is “each person’s deeply felt internal and individual experience of gender, which may or may not correspond with the sex assigned at birth, including the personal sense of the body (which may involve, if freely chosen, modification of bodily appearance or function by medical, surgical or other means) and other expressions of gender, including dress, speech, and mannerisms” (ICJ, 2007, p. 8).

Gender Expression (GE)

Gender expression is “each person’s presentation of the person’s gender through physical appearance—including dress, hairstyles, accessories, cosmetics—and mannerisms, speech, behavioral patterns, names, and personal references, and noting further that gender expression may or may not conform to a person’s gender identity” (ICJ, 2017, p. 6).

Sex Characteristics (SC)

Sex characteristics are “each person’s physical features relating to sex, including genitalia and other sexual and reproductive anatomy, chromosomes, hormones, and secondary physical features emerging from puberty” (ICJ, 2017, p. 6).

The *Yogyakarta Principles* never defines gender; at times, it is used interchangeably or simultaneously with sex. Also, the above definitions include several subjective criteria such as *deeply felt expressions* (gender expression) which appear to be characteristics of what is commonly understood as personality and sometimes stereotyped roles of men and women. These definitions mean there are as many genders or sexes as personalities.

Despite the lack of clarity, circularity, inconsistency, contradiction, and difficulty in verifying these changes objectively and universally, activists lobbied for these changes without any consultation with the general public or states and with no impact assessment on the rights of other groups, such as women (Fair Play for Women, n.d.), girls (Scotland Report, 2019), lesbians (Wild, 2019) and violence against women (Fair Play for Women, n.d.; & Impacts of trans activism, n.d.).

Broadly, the process of the elimination of the legal category of sex is set to these general steps, aided by jurisprudence before high courts to create legal precedents of law:

- **Step 1:** Allowing change of legal sex under restricted conditions (age, medical diagnosis, waiting period). This step has been completed in most countries in the world.
- **Step 2:** Allowing change of legal sex without any restrictions (age, hormonal treatment or surgery, mental health diagnosis, criminal records). This step has been completed in several countries in Europe, South and North America, and other regions.
- **Step 3:** Removing the record of sex from specific or all legal documents (e.g., birth certificates, passports, IDs), also known as “gender neutral” documents. This step is being implemented in the Netherlands (Wareham, 2020) and was proposed (and rejected through citizens’ initiative) in Finland (Citizens’ Initiative, 2020).
- **Step 4:** Biological sex is treated as *private information*, and its disclosure is punished by law.
- **Step 5:** Replacement of the category of legal sex with
 - a) sex characteristics,
 - b) gender identity, and
 - c) gender expression in all legal documents.

STRATEGIES FOR IMPLEMENTATION

Under the Radar

The implementation of the gender identity project includes a legal lobby to reform state [national government] laws, policies, constitutions, and international law instruments. The strategy of the gender identity special interest groups is to pass legislation often based on misleading information by stealth (Binetti, 2020) or *under the radar* (Murray et al., 2020a). The lobby for the UN Independent Expert on Protection Against Violence and Discrimination Based on Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity is their most effective effort to get *gender theory* into the international human rights system (United Nations Office of the High Commissioner on Human Rights, n.d.; United Nations Office of the High Commissioner on Human Rights, 2021).

To accomplish these goals, activists use fallacious arguments. One false claim widely used is that individuals who define themselves as *trans* are the most discriminated against group of people and are more subject to gendered crimes such as *femicide*. This claim is not supported by evidence. In the UK, two to three women are murdered by men per week (Allen et al., 2020), and there are 62.5% more trans-identified male homicide suspects than victims (Smith, 2019). Activists promote their agenda in the following ways:

- by claiming that gender identity is innate and integral to all human beings,
- by changing terminology and mandating inclusive language,
- by getting the unrestricted legal right of children to self-declare their sex and repeal any prohibition of their medicalization/sterilization,
- by repealing any laws that require trans-identified individuals to medically transition and,
- by criminalizing conversion therapy for those who do not affirm gender dysphoria (Arty Morty, 2020).

Gender identity activists use new *inclusive* language, such as:

- using gender and/or gender identity instead of or interchangeably with sex,
- neutralizing female nouns and forbidding female pronouns, for example, “parent 1 and 2” instead of mother and father,
- classifying women under multiple genders and diversities (LGBTQ+), and
- creating a new term for women, such as cis, or applying a new formula that uses a person plus a function, as in “gestating or pregnant person,” equating transwomen to women and transwomen to being a feminist, making intersectionality an acceptance of trans dominance of LGBTQ+, and bodily autonomy the right to sexually exploit oneself and change one’s sex/gender.

Appropriation of Fundamental Rights in Human Rights Movements

Gender identity activists appropriate fundamental rights and core principles in international human rights treaties. Two of the most targeted human rights movements by the gender identity special interest groups are the women’s rights movement, by appropriating the concepts of intersectionality and bodily integrity (Price, 2020), and the lesbian, gay, bisexual (LGB) rights, by utilizing the concepts of ending stigma and social exclusion (Aravosis, 2007).

For example, in the domain of children’s rights, the gender identity project has been able to argue that allowing a minor to determine their sex on legal documents, as well as consenting to invasive and life-altering treatments, such as stalling a child’s sexual development through chemical intervention, or removal of healthy breast tissues or ovaries, satisfy the principle of serving “best interest of the child” and providing best conditions for their “personal development.” In the domain of disability rights, the gender identity project successfully appropriated the right to a life free from “inhuman, cruel and degrading treatment” and the “highest attainable standard of health.” In the indigenous people’s movement, the gender identity project utilized the right to cultural autonomy by appropriating gender roles for homosexuals as trans (Beatrice, 2020). In migration and asylum, the gender identity project has embedded itself into gender-based persecution, implying that any individual unable to change their legal sex in the country of origin is the subject of persecution.

Joint Lobby with Other Male Sexual Desire and Criminal Industries

The gender identity project embraced and went hand in hand with the sexual and reproductive exploitation industries through joint lobbying and funding. These industries' size and global expansion are evident in their global worth. The prostitution industry (Havocscope, n.d.) is estimated to be worth 186 billion worldwide; the pornography market is estimated to be worth USD 35.17 billion in 2020; and the video game industry is tightly connected to pornography consumption (Stockdale & Coyne, 2018) is worth USD 151 billion (Grandview Research, 2020). The surrogacy market (Global Market Insights, 2021) is currently USD 4.2 billion and will surpass USD 33.5 billion by 2027. The gender reassignment surgery market will grow 25% by 2026 from the current 316 million (Global Market Insights, 2019). It is no coincidence that the primary consumers of pornography (Pornhub, 2019) coincide with the most prominent International Monetary Fund (IMF) advanced economies (Wikipedia, n.d.-a) and the wealthiest liberal democracies—the G7—of the world (Wikipedia, n.d.-b). Their revenue is only maintained by lobbying to decriminalize or legalize their industries. They cleanse their images through false publicity, colonizing academia, and funding the media and civil society.

These industries support the decriminalization of trafficking and pimping by using the euphemism *sex work* (Network of Sex Work Projects, n.d.). They lobby to decriminalize trafficking for reproductive purposes under the euphemism *surrogacy* or *womb rental* (Borraz, 2019). Furthermore, body and mental dissociation, homophobia, lowering the age of consent, and controlling puberty are at the heart of these industries that have led to naturalization and under-the-radar lobbying to legalize incest, pedophilia, and pederasty. All of these have similar and parallel financial and political interests.

The joint lobbies share these three scenarios:

- under the LGBT acronym, funding has concentrated on the T (transgender) agenda imposed by men who identify as trans women,
- total decriminalization of pornography, trafficking, pimping, and sex buying is lobbied through cover organizations that speak under the euphemism of *sex workers*, many of them led by males who identify as trans women (XBiz, 2020),
- decriminalization of trafficking for reproductive purposes is lobbied for under the euphemism *surrogacy* or *womb rental* under the LGBT acronym. Still, it is imposed mainly by gay men and men who identify as trans women.

This joint work can be seen when organizations present these industries as progressive job opportunities. They are members of and support networks (Red Umbrella Fund, n.d.) and initiatives with these goals that have direct funding from the same philanthropies that are part of the Sex Work Donor Collaborative, which includes the Global Philanthropy Project, the Red Umbrella Fund, Count Me in Consortium, and others (Sex Work Donor Collective, n.d.). The so-called Affirmation of Feminist Principles (n.d.) is the latest initiative to fund feminist organizations that commit to the Generation Equality Forum Beijing +25 agenda.

They all have similar and parallel financial and political interests in which women can be bought and sold for men's sexual and reproductive desires.

Stigmatizing Critical Perspectives and Creating Political Polarization

Any critique of the gender identity discourse is resisted by what feminists have long identified as forms of male violence, such as silencing analyses or facts (O'Hara,

2020), producing targeted harassment (Human Rights Committee, 2019), threats (TERF is a slur, n.d.), censorship (Price, 2020), vexatious litigation (Slatz, 2020), and physical violence to individuals, in particular women who question their claims (Bindel, 2019).

With a global rise in ultra-right movements that oppose abortion, same-sex marriage, and *gender ideology*, these movements are conflated with anyone opposing the gender identity project from a human rights and feminist perspective. This created conditions for the actors and supporters of this project (media, political parties) to stigmatize and dismiss the feminist critique of gender as the subordination of women. As a result, the feminist opposition to eliminating sex from the law is seen as non-progressive and conservative.

This strategy of the gender identity project to classify feminists as *right-wing* is not unique to gender identity; it is imported from other anti-women's rights industries, such as prostitution, pornography, and surrogacy. Both liberal and conservative supporters of these industries have historically labeled feminist analysis *anti-rights*, causing division in the women's rights movement. The gender identity project has gone as far as to become the critical marker of progressive versus conservative politics in different countries worldwide. A case in point is the change in public opinion in Colombia about supporting the peace process of a 50-year-old guerrilla because it included gender identity and ideology (Giraldo, 2017). This modern geopolitical distinction tied to funding is seen in the United States with President Biden's support for *The Equality Act* (The Biden Plan, (n.d.) and the Spanish fight on the left to approve a trans law (Polo, 2021).

Despite these strategies, the opposition to the gender identity project has grown in recent years and is found on all sides of the political spectrum. The opposition is critiquing and demystifying the misconceptions the gender identity project is promoting with its agenda (The State Media, 2020).

EFFECT OF GENDER IDENTITY ON LAWS

The inclusion of gender identity in laws has endangered women's right not to be discriminated against based on sex. Gender identity ideology also promotes the idea that *trans women are women*, which means males who self-identify as women or with the male stereotypes of women are women under the law.

Some of the instruments where gender identity has been included are discussed below. The inclusion of gender identity in law and policy endangers the two main principles underpinning women's human rights, i.e., substantive equality and non-discrimination based on sex.

Constitutions and Secondary Laws, Including the Laws on Self-Declaration of Sex

Once the concepts and language of gender identity and expression enter into law, a country's entire legal system must be adjusted. Typically, this process of legal restructuring starts with the introduction of laws that regulate the change of legal sex. In those countries where the self-declaration of legal sex exists in law, governments are taking steps (Laursen, 2020) to further expand its scope by eliminating age restrictions or removing sex from legal documents (Wareham, 2020). Other laws that become progressively restructured are: anti-discrimination and equality laws, laws on education, laws on maternity care, laws on hate crime and hate speech, laws on health, prisons and shelters, laws on free speech and expression, and finally, laws on

positive and/or special measures for women (e.g., quotas for political parties or women on boards).

Gender identity is now included in several countries' constitutions (Ecuador, Bolivia, Fiji, Nepal, and Malta). States that have rewritten laws on self-declaration of legal sex include Argentina (Identidad de Genero, 2014), Denmark, Colombia (Orientacion Sexual e Identidad de Genero, 2015), Ireland (Gender Identity Act, 2015), Chile (Biblioteca del Congreso Nacional de Chile, 2014), Malta (Gender Identity, Gender Expression, and Sex Characteristics Act, 2015), Norway, Belgium (Belgium: Legal Gender Recognition Law, 2017, 2018), Austria (Rainbow Europe, n.d.), Pakistan (Hashim, 2018), Luxemburg (Lög, 2020), Portugal (Lei, 2018), and Greece (Νόμος 4491/2017). In many countries where self-identification (self-ID) of legal sex has not been introduced *de jure*, however, it exists *de facto* through various other law provisions (e.g., Brazil). In contrast, in other countries (e.g., Canada, Mexico, and Australia (Rodrigues, 2020)), these states allow self-identification. In Europe, at the time of this publication, proposals to introduce sex self-identification laws are currently being discussed by the parliaments of Cyprus, Finland, Germany, Netherlands, Scotland, and Spain. Proposals to introduce gender identity, gender expression, and sex characteristics into national laws are pending before governments worldwide. One of the latest proposals was included in the so-called feminist constitution, which was voted against in Chile in 2022 (Svensson, 2022). In Europe, the Americas, and Asia, people are allowed to have a legal sex change under various restricted conditions. In many states where laws on self-declaration of sex have been introduced, people can change their sex on legal documents without any medical procedures (e.g., UK (Gender Recognition Act, 2004), France, and Canada).

International Instruments

Gender identity has been included in international instruments such as the Council of Europe's Istanbul Convention, the CEDAW General Recommendation 28 on Violence Against Women, and several country reports. The Council of Europe 2048 Resolution on Discrimination Against Transgender People in Europe (Parliamentary Assembly, 2015) recommends that states belonging to the Council of Europe introduce self-determination of sex laws. Other recommended resolutions recommend officially establishing sexual orientation and gender identity legal procedures: a United Nations General Assembly resolution on gender identity (2018) and a resolution that establishes an independent expert on sexual orientation and gender identity (Third Committee, General Assembly, 2016). The 2018 submission by the UN Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity office to the United Nations Legal Committee concerning its drafting of the Convention on Crimes Against Humanity demanded to replace sex (referred to as "gender" in the Statutes of Rome as a ground for prosecution) with gender identity, gender expression, and sex characteristics (UN High Commissioner for Human Rights, personal communication, 30 Nov 2018).

Gender identity is now included in the EU's Victims' Rights and Asylum directives. Several reports (Report 2018, Report 2020) produced under the aegis of the European Commission recommend enshrining it in the European law and treaties, with the most recent one asking all EU states to align national legislature with the demands of Yogyakarta Principles (European Commission et al., 2018). The Council of Europe established the Sexual Orientation Gender Identity Unit in 2014 (Sexual orientation and gender identity unit [SOGI], n.d.). The European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR) has incorporated gender identity into its case law under Art 14 ('other status') of the European Convention of Human Rights (2022). The Inter-American Court (2019) has

also issued several decisions protecting and reinforcing gender identity (Contesse, 2018).

International Processes Related to Women's Rights

In 2020, UN Women organized the Beijing Platform +25 anniversary to renew the global commitments to empower women worldwide and carry the platform out in full as new forces threaten women's and girls' rights. In this context, the gender identity project has been able to erase women from declarations and action coalitions by replacing women with gender identity, and by instrumentalizing the "Global South" has promoted "sex work" and decriminalizing third parties, such as traffickers, pimps, and sex buyers as an option for poor women. Under the heavy influence of UN agencies in development programs, even UNWomen actively promoted eliminating women's sex-based protections from the law, including suggesting a new language at the Generation Equality Forum in Mexico that includes "women in all their diversity" "multiple gender identities," gender transformative, "sex workers" "sex/gender assigned at birth," and "transphobic violence" (Bautista, 2020). They also promoted the conflation of discrimination based on sex with hate crimes against *diversities* (Foro Generacion Igualdad, 2021).

IMPACT ON THE LIVES OF WOMEN AND THEIR HUMAN RIGHTS

Women in the Public and Political Life and Decision Making

Women in public and political spheres have unequal and separate standards and unequal opportunities and treatment due to limited socialization processes as girls. There are invisible barriers due to lack of education, the unequal burden of home, family, childrearing, and unequal opportunities for jobs and wages. Parity (50% women, 50% men) in public office is the primary positive discrimination measure used by governments to reduce the gap between women and men, be eligible for public elected bodies, participate in the formulation of government policy and implementation, and hold public office.

With gender identity, positions meant for women are being taken over by males who identify as trans women. For example, in women-only lists for public office (Fain, 2020), women's particular needs and interests are not represented, fewer human and financial resources are assigned to them, and fewer policies are directed toward them. Additionally, a lack of sex-based indicators does not allow for follow-up on improving gaps related to public and political life (Gallego, 2021).

In Mexico, for example, in 2018, 19 men signed up for public election positions as trans women (Plazas, 2018). A group of *muxes* (a male in the Zapotec culture of Oaxaca who dresses as a female) denounced this as a misappropriation of this traditional female sex role assigned to homosexual men who are not born women (Plazas, 2018). Gender identity is also used to take over quotas on boards of corporate and non-governmental organizations, civil associations, and international agencies (Garnier, 2020).

In India, in January 2021, the Bombay High Court allowed a trans-identified male who goes by the name Anjali to contest the village *panchayat* (town council) polls as "female" from a ward reserved for women, saying that such persons have the right to a "self-perceived gender identity." (Joshi, 2021). The candidate went on to win the election. In March 2021, the Kerala High Court allowed a trans-identified male to join the NCC (National Cadet Corps) and called for changes in the enrolment criteria. The single bench of Justice Anu Sivaraman said: "in view of the specific provisions of the

2019 act, a transgender person has the right to be recognised not only as a transgender but also a right to self-perceived gender, i.e., the female gender.” (Hindustan Times, 2021).

Males who identify as transwomen also call themselves feminists (Gamboa, 2020) and occupy positions in women’s studies programs (Johnson, 2020) and academia (Harvard University, 2017). They receive substantial funding (Lowrey, 2018), participate in events and spaces, and even deal with issues exclusively related to women’s bodies, such as menstrual hygiene, abortion, female genital mutilation, and sexual and reproductive health and rights. An example is the case of Petra de Sutter, who is today a “female vice prime minister” in Belgium and is also a “female Member of the European Parliament” (Moens, 2020) and the president of the European Parliamentary Forum on Population and Development (The European Parliamentary Forum for Sexual and Reproductive Rights, n.d.). In the recent guidance to the Women on Boards law, the Scottish government declared that the law applies to anyone who uses female pronouns and female names (Murray et al., 2020b). This law was recently contested in court (Davidson, 2021).

Young Women and Detransitioners

In a patriarchal society, girls are constantly confronted with beauty standards, stereotyped representations of sex roles, and pornography that portray them as sexual objects. They are exposed to dysphoria and more inclined to feel uneasy in their bodies, not because they were assigned the “wrong sex” at birth, but because they face physical, sexual, psychological, and economic male violence in their everyday lives.

The NGO Stonewall launched an LGBT-inclusive curriculum guide for primary schools in the UK in 2019 for children to learn they have inner gender identities that can only be discovered by liking “girl things” like dresses and long hair or “boy things” like skateboarding, that is, by simply refusing to act according to the stereotypes assigned to the masculine or the feminine (Stonewall, 2019). Similar programs are being introduced globally, as part of the obligatory mainstreaming of gender identity in school curricula, from Canada (Charlotte, 2020) to Spain (Carrasco, 2020). The message for girls who do not conform to social standards is deeply homophobic and generates fear of lesbianism, as they are pressured to transition to being a “boy.”

The beauty, big pharma, medical, and fashion industries (Bilek, 2021) have promoted the transitioning business (Bilek, 2018) in a corporate agenda (Bilek, 2020) to deconstruct sexual dimorphism in law for profit, even in the fashion industry. There has been a surge in girls and young women transitioning to the stereotype of males. Many experience depression, anxiety, and agitation, coupled with deep involvement in online chat groups that support their sense of dislocation. They are encouraged to view voices of moderation (including parents) as enemies, and they echo the cultish language of pro-anorexia and pro-suicide.

Some girls, who previously decided to “transition” in an attempt to become boys, are now participating in the surge to *detransition*. Increasingly, they are finding their voices and joining networks in the USA and Latin America (Jeffreys et al., 2020). They regret their mastectomies, hysterectomies, infertility due to puberty blockers, and permanently lowered voices. They realize they are forever changed after these painful processes.

Male Violence Against Women

Male violence against women, such as rape, incest, sexual harassment, wife assault, battery, trafficking, and prostitution, is an epidemic worldwide. Women need women-only spaces for protection, trauma therapy, recovery, and empowerment. The Vancouver Rape Relief and Women's Shelter, Canada's oldest women's crisis shelter, was stripped of municipal funding in 2019 because of lobbying pressure from a male politician who identified as a trans woman. He accused the shelter of being discriminatory and exclusionary because the shelter exercised its right under the law to offer single-sex services for women (Hopper, 2019). In Canada, female victims who do not wish to share intimate space with natal males are expelled from shelters (Brean, 2018). As more and more women's bathrooms, gyms, and women-only spaces are open to males who self-identify as trans women, hundreds of physical assaults and rapes on women have been documented (Anti-female-receipts, 2016), and there is recrimination for their attitudes and lack of support for inclusion (Brink & Dunne, 2018).

At an art show at the San Francisco Library, trans women were portrayed as victims of oppression from TERFs (trans-exclusionary radical feminists), which is a slur and misogynistic term (Intellectual Takeout, n.d.). The display depicted males who self-identify as women being threatened by women with weaponry—including axes and bats. This display of false victimhood inverts who usually does the harming and who is usually harmed. The perpetrator or offender may deny the behavior and then attack the individual doing the confronting, and reverse the roles of victim and offender so that the perpetrator assumes the victim role and turns the true victim (or whistleblower) into an alleged offender" (Freyd, 1997). Psychologists describe this tactic as DARVO, which stands for Deny-Attack-Reverse-Victim and-Offender.

In public debates, questioning the discourse of "born in a wrong body" and stating the existence of biological sex are sanctioned as "hate speech" and portrayed as "literal acts of violence" against those who identify as trans. Among many acts of violence against women perpetrated by transactivists are physical assault (Davidson, 2019), the loss of jobs (Forstater, 2019), the burning of writer J.K. Rowling's books (Nolan, 2020), being cyber-lynched (Schon, 2020) or being falsely accused based on lies (Volcanicas, 2022). Sixty thousand gender-critical women have been banned on Reddit (Chart, 2020). As of October 2020, the UK, for example, had at least 25 cases contesting the harmful effect of gender identity in courts, gender clinics, schools, universities, NGOs, and the government in the period 2019 to 2022, and has currently at least 15 ongoing cases (Legal Crowdfunding, n.d.). These cases are self-funded by women and two men. Many academics, feminists, and intellectuals have been dismissed from their positions, and others choose to keep quiet for fear of being labeled TERFS or "transphobes" (Murphey, 2020).

In prisons, male sex offenders are placed with females (Shaw, 2020), and where gender identity laws do not exist yet, such provisions are being introduced (e.g., state of New York, SB 4702A, 2019). According to the former prison governor of Scotland, the male transgender population transferred to female estates will soon outnumber the female offenders in female prisons (Hotchkiss, 2020).

Lesbian and Bisexual Women

Lesbian and bisexual women have fought to enjoy equal rights and the right not to be discriminated against based on their sexual orientation, homosexuality, or bisexuality. However, most LGBT organizations worldwide have been taken over, and their funds are used to promote trans rights under a *gender multiple spectra* (Funders

for LGBTQ Issues, 2018). Under gender identity laws, a heterosexual man with a beard and a penis can self-identify as a woman, effectively becoming a lesbian. Any lesbian who rejects him as a potential sexual partner is labeled transphobic, bigoted, and hateful (Cotton ceiling, n.d.). As lesbians denounce the fact that they have been erased from the movement in Pride Parades and activism, new lesbian groups (Get The L Out of UK, n.d.) and lesbian, gay, and bisexual groups (LGB Alliance, n.d.) have been created to clarify that homosexuality is same-sex attraction, that sex is binary, real, and not a spectrum. Many former LGBT activists in countries with self-ID laws turn away from LGBT groups when they realize the danger of gender identity (Salakova, 2020).

Women Sexually Exploited in Prostitution and Pornography

The harms of prostitution in women and girls include grave human rights violations, systematic rape, domestic violence, torture, trafficking, physical, and mental health problems, such as complex post-traumatic stress disorder, reproductive disability, addictions, suicide, non-desired pregnancies, and abortions (Farley, n.d.). They are often “disappeared,” meaning they are killed and never found. These murders are femicide. Women and girls are gravely harmed through exploitation in prostitution and pornography, with the effects passed on to their children.

Gay men and trans-identified males join and lead the unincorporated interests of “sex worker unions” in the public debate (International Committee of the Rights of Sex Workers in Europe, n.d.). They propose total decriminalization of the sex trade, including pimps, traffickers, and sex buyers, and even justify trafficking as economic migration (DecminNY, n.d.). They also lead strategic litigation in courts, typically with cases of police violence against men who self-identify with the stereotype of women, and also call themselves “sex workers” to pressure governments to decriminalize pimps and traffickers or legalize prostitution under “sex work” (IHRC, 2021). Powerful Global North philanthropists (Diez, 2019), donor collaboratives (Sex Work Donor Collaborative, n.d.), international organizations, such as Amnesty International (2015) and UN agencies have joined efforts to promote the sexual exploitation of women and girls in prostitution and pornography worldwide. They use euphemisms and promote the legalization /total decriminalization of *sex work*, including pornography and online business models such as webcamming, Only Fans, and others.

Connections between these two industries include representing transgender people and working for total decriminalization of pimps laws like in New York City (Arnold, 2019) and commercialization of transgender surgeries and forced castration in poor countries, such as India and from Argentina to Rome (Madaik, 2021).

Mothers and Women Exploited in Surrogacy

Women have long fought to protect pregnancy and maternity from harm and have paid maternity leave and social benefits without loss of employment. They have worked to get child-care facilities and equal responsibility in child upbringing by both parents.

Under the gender identity framework, words such as mother or pregnant woman are being replaced by neutral and asexual concepts of persons to which dissociated functions are added, such as “menstruating person,” “breastfeeding person” (Slaazar, 2021, Feb 12), “pregnant person,” “human milk,” “procreational will,” and “solidarity gestation,” while not requiring a legal mother (Young, 2018). For example, since the introduction of gender identity and gender expression in Maltese law, birth certificates in Malta no longer have mother and father but Parent 1 and 2 (Delia, 2020). Similar changes were proposed in France and Italy. Moreover, court rulings are

becoming increasingly bizarre. In the USA, a woman was fired from her job because she was breastfeeding, which according to the company, was not sex discrimination, partly because men can lactate under certain circumstances (Marcotte, 2015).

In a joint effort with the gender identity lobby, a new reproductive exploitation industry, aided by biotechnology, has emerged under the euphemisms of surrogacy or substitution pregnancy (Center for Bioethics and Culture Network, 2013). It is no coincidence that in 2016 Dr Sutter, a male senator from Belgium, was the author of a controversial proposal for a resolution to regulate surrogacy in Europe (European Post, 2016).

The gender identity lobby works to introduce into law the human right to use a female body as a “surrogate” for people who cannot have children because of their sexual orientation or gender identity. Offspring are reduced to a product that can be bought and disconnected from their biological mother; simultaneously, men who identify as trans women claim the right to a womb transplant to have babies. While laws are passed in wealthier countries, women used in this industry come from poor countries (Klaine, 2018) without regard for the mental and physical impacts on their health (Lahl, 2018). Many women exploited in surrogacy are migrant women from impoverished backgrounds and war/conflict-torn territories, subjected to violations of their freedom of movement and bodily autonomy (ENoMW, CIAMS, 2022). Many of these women have been in prostitution or are further prostituted for the pleasure of the punters (Roberts, 2014). Also, some clients of surrogate mothers did not want them to get vaccines for COVID-19 because of their fears that the vaccines could affect the children they had ordered. All the while, they usually got the vaccine (Domínguez, 2021).

Women in Sports

Women have fought to have the same rights and opportunities as men to participate actively in sports. The concept of fair play is the modern basis for all competitive sports (Fair Play for Women, n.d.). It promotes meaningful competition by grouping different body types into sex, age, and weight categories. Since performance is strongly influenced by physiological factors like muscle force, power-producing capacity, and cardiovascular and metabolic factors, it is well-documented that males have an advantage over females (Donovon, 2020). For example, males have 66% more upper-body muscle and 50% more lower-body muscle and are faster than women in swimming, short and long-distance running, rowing, and kayaking (Save Women's Sports, n.d.).

Recently, most national and international sports bodies around the globe have opened the female sports category to male athletes who self-identify as female. The 2015 International Olympic Committee guidelines state that athletes who *transition* from male to female can compete in the women's category without requiring surgery, provided their testosterone level is kept under ten nanomoles/liter for at least a year (Ingle, 2019). These guidelines, now adopted by most sports bodies, are deemed unscientific (Fair Play for Women, 2019) based on male bone and muscle density, muscle memory, and biomechanics (Reuters, 2019). In September 2014, mixed martial arts fighter Tamikka Brents fought her trans opponent Fallon Fox; during the first round, Brents suffered severe injuries, including a concussion and a skull fracture (Presley, 2019; Sarmah, 2022). In India, in 2018, at a university in Kerala, a trans-identified male participated in women's sports and, in so doing, deprived a woman of her rightful spot. “Riya,” a first-year degree student, came first in the 3-km walk, long jump, and hammer throw. Aside from competing in the wrong category, he also competed

outside his age group. Though authorities have specified an upper age limit of 25, the 28-year-old “Riya” competed and won (Mili, 2018). These are not isolated cases. The move towards *sports inclusiveness* has negatively affected women and girls, who lose meaningful and fair competition at all levels and groupings of female sports (Save Women’s Sports, n.d.).

Girls and Children

The gender identity project has modified the definition of a child’s best interest to one in which consent to harmful practices, such as breast binding of girls, or medical transitions, such as hormone treatment and surgery, can override parental consent. Instead of using psychotherapy or trauma treatment for many children who might suffer gender dysphoria as a coping mechanism for child rape and trauma, the medical system produces dissociated girls and boys who will be patients in the medical system for life. Puberty blockers damage the brain (Cauffman & Steinberg, 2001), shorten bones (Vlot et al., 2017), and create a younger appearance in girls that should have body changes with puberty. Children can now be bought by anyone in the surrogacy market and used in prostitution and pornography, among other social systems that allow sexual access to children. Additionally, there is pressure to naturalize incest and pedo-criminal acts (sexual abuse of children) by lowering the age of consent for sexual relationships and marriage (Falcón, 2021).

CONCLUSIONS

GENDER IDENTITY SPECIAL INTEREST GROUPS

The Gender Identity Project started as the gradual advocacy by a few powerful transsexuals in the USA to support what appeared to be statistically rare individuals suffering from bodily dysphoria and autogynephilia, with a desire, especially of males, to be viewed by society as the opposite sex. They converted this desire into a well-programmed and proactive project to deconstruct and eliminate the legal notion/concept of sex based on biological sex (female/male). This project saw rapid growth due to the non-binding Yogyakarta Principles document written in 2006, substantial international funding and lobbying in the UN System and other supra-national structures, and a joint venture with other male supremacist industries (such as the sex and reproductive exploitation industry).

By doing this, they have been able to create *policy capture*, defined by the International Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) as a situation “where public decisions over policies are consistently or repeatedly directed away from the public interest towards a specific interest, which can exacerbate inequalities and undermine democratic values” (Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development, 2017, n.p.).

Their powerful propaganda has allowed them to undermine international human rights law and state laws built with these standards to have the unrestricted expansion of their commercial operations on a global level. By working on the legal framework in which records of biological sex have no legitimate purpose before the law, they have been able to create the conditions for the following:

- (1) *Normalizing the alteration and commodification of human biology*: a profitable industrial high-tech/medical market (surgeries, biogenetics, transplants, hormones, fertility manipulation, among others) based on stereotypes and biology of women,

with medical patients for life and profitable sex and reproductive exploitation market, an unlimited supply of vulnerable individuals (primarily women and girls),

- (2) *Making inequality between women and men invisible*: a legal context that weakens the accountability of states and international bodies in monitoring human rights violations and working for equality between women and men, measurable only by indicators based on sex, and
- (3) *Naturalizing male violence against women and girls and their exploitation*: a legal context in which it is impossible to identify and prosecute numerous crimes which are primarily male violence against women and children, such as trafficking, sexual and reproductive exploitation, prostitution, pornography, forced pregnancy forced marriage, female genital mutilation, rape sexual harassment, femicide, and many others (The Williams Institute at UCLA School of Law, 2018).

Gender Identity Is Discrimination Based on Sex

The Gender Identity project has most visibly become a policy capture of eradicating discrimination based on sex. The Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW) defined discrimination based on sex in Article 1 as any distinction, exclusion, or restriction made based on sex that has the effect or purpose of impairing or nullifying the recognition, enjoyment or exercise by women, irrespective of their marital status, on a basis of equality of men and women, of human rights and fundamental freedoms in the political, economic, social, cultural, civil or any other field (CEDAW, n.d).

Later, in General Recommendation No 28 (1.5) of 2010 on the core obligations of the State Parties, the CEDAW Committee stated that the term *sex* referred to biological differences between men and women, while the term *gender* refers to socially constructed identities, attributes, and roles for women and men, including society's social and cultural meaning for these biological differences which results in hierarchical relationships between women and men and the distribution of power and rights favoring men and disadvantaging women. This social positioning of women and men is affected by political, economic, cultural, social, religious, ideological, and environmental factors and can be changed by culture, society, and community.

At the same time, in article 5, CEDAW stated the need “to modify the social and cultural patterns of conduct of men and women to achieve the elimination of prejudices and customary and all other practices which are based on the idea of the inferiority or the superiority of either of the sexes or stereotyped roles for men and women.” This article encompasses what was later referred to as gender in numerous international law instruments and only defined as such explicitly in the Council of Europe's Istanbul Convention as “the socially constructed roles, behaviors, activities and attributes that a given society considers appropriate for women and men.”

Feminists, who wanted to combat the restrictions placed on women because of sex and biology, adopted the use of gender—the concept originated in linguistics and was promoted by US sexologists in their studies on transsexualism in the 1960s (Stoller, 1968)- to challenge the idea of inferior destiny for women. Feminists maintained that the claimed inferiority of women based on their biology instead of their cultural roles is patriarchal. In the classical feminist interpretation, gender refers to all norms, stereotypes, and values imposed on people based on their sex. The use of gender must be intimately connected to sex because it refers to it.

It is evident that the problem States Parties were to eliminate and correct was not the definition or recording of sex but the discrimination and unequal relationship

between men and women based on the fact that women were born women, as well as the prejudice, stereotyped roles, customs, and other practices that made women inferior or subordinate to men. For this reason, sex constitutes a unique ground for discrimination as defined in CEDAW Article 1, and it has been introduced as a significant indicator and a comparator in assessing the disparities between women and men in such international frameworks as Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) to which all member states of the United Nations are participants.¹

The CEDAW definition of discrimination against women considered that substantive equality required both identical treatment based on human dignity and differentiated treatment based on sex difference. However, at the time of writing the Convention, it was not foreseen that the lack of distinction based on sex would become an arbitrary action that would nullify women's recognition, enjoyment, and exercise of their rights. This is what gender identity activists have achieved for themselves and against women and girls: the gradual conflation of sex with gender and gender identity, the consequent erosion of sex distinctions, and the weakening and elimination of sex-based protections and special measures have led to the exclusion and restriction of rights, such as the ones we have documented in the previous sections of this document.

This clash of rights between the transgender project and women's rights appears as indirect discrimination because measures that appear neutral do not provide equal results for women and do not recognize historical discrimination and inequality. Women are reduced to humans with functions stuck to their *neutral bodies*.

Violations of CEDAW Articles and Substantive Equality for Women

Eliminating legal sex and/or its replacement with the categories of gender identity, gender expression, and sex characteristics constitutes a misinterpretation and abuse of international law and the legally binding understanding of discrimination based on sex. It also includes policy capture of laws, temporary measures, and public policies designed to modify stereotyped roles of women and men, eradicate women's discrimination and obtain substantive or de facto equality for women. By including *gender identity* in sex or by replacing sex with *gender identity* in law, the very obligation of state parties to effect substantive equality becomes impossible or impotent.

Several articles and general recommendations clarifications are violated by the gender identity project, including CEDAWs preamble, art 4.2, 5b on the social significance of maternity, the primordial interest of the child, and 11.1.f on health and reproduction; articles 5, 10c, concerning eliminating stereotyped roles of men and women; 10d on equal opportunities to benefit from scholarships and study grants, Art 7 and 8, concerning being publicly elected in public, private and non-governmental organizations at national and international levels; 10g to equal opportunities in

¹ The global indicator framework on SDG was adopted by the UN General Assembly in July 2017 as part of the Resolution A/RES/71/313. Despite the resolution's commitment "to increase and use high-quality, timely and reliable data disaggregated by sex" (UN, 2017, p.2), according to the SDG Report 2022, "Among the 32 SDG indicators with a requirement of sex disaggregation, only 21 have the latest disaggregated data available in most countries (more than 80 per cent with a requirement of sex disaggregation, of countries have at least one data point since 2015); for 8 indicators, no sex disaggregated data are available at all. Data are available for only 7 out of 21 indicators that require disaggregation by both sex and age" (UN, 2022, p.4)

sports and 11c to job security and free choice of profession and employment; 11d to equal remuneration and treatment; Art 6 to a life free from trafficking in women and exploitation of prostitution, and GR 19 and 35 other forms of gender-based violence; 15b the right to choose a spouse and enter marriage, including same-sex relationships. Additionally, GR 14 protects women from female genital mutilation, GR 24 the right to the best physical and mental health, and GR 36 to education.

The other fundamental right that is violated by gender identity is de facto or substantive equality for women, to achieve which three standards are essential:

- a. Recognizing differences while affirming equality,
- b. Correcting arbitrary, unfair, and unjustifiable actions produce unequal power relationships and results, and
- c. Offering equal opportunities, access to them, outcomes, and benefits for women. All of these are violated by the gender identity project.

GLOBAL FEMINIST & PROGRESSIVE RESISTANCE TO GENDER IDENTITY PROJECT

Despite the deep and protracted structural changes caused by the gender identity project undermining the hard-earned protections and rights of women and girls, lesbians and gays, and children, as well as the freedom of speech, belief, and assembly, globally, feminists, activists, writers, journalists, medical experts are investigating, documenting, writing and speaking out on this issue to create awareness, inform the public and prevent further damage.

The Declaration on Women's Sex-Based Rights is an international declaration and a campaign created by the founders to lobby nations to maintain language protecting women and girls based on sex rather than "gender" or "gender identity." It is now the basis of a worldwide movement of women who meet and support each other in maintaining CEDAW language. Declaration on Women's Sex-Based Rights has been translated into 20 languages and signed by nearly 33,300 individual women and over 463 organizations in 160 countries.

In the UK, after several years of grassroots mobilization of women to oppose gender identity in law, on 22 Sep 2020 Secretary of State issued a statement rejecting calls for self-identification of sex (Government Equalities Office & Truss, 2020). At the same time, in Scotland, due to a successful court case brought by a feminist organization For Women Scotland, by the decision of the Scottish Supreme Court, the Scottish government was obliged to reverse its changes to the Women on Public Boards law, according to which any male with female pronouns could qualify for the position in a public board in the category reserved for women (Opinion of the Court, 2022).

Altogether, since 2018 in the UK, at least 30 legal cases have been mounted by feminists and other human rights defenders against gender identity clinics, prisons, and public and private institutions, to draw public attention to the imminent harms done by gender identity to the equality and protection of women, children, homosexual persons, students, and citizens. Keira Bells' case in the UK in 2021 is a landmark in protecting children from unethical puberty blocker treatment promoted by the transgender industry (Doward, 2020). Bell's case was one in a series of actions taken by private individuals as well as the UK government around the significant UK gender identity clinic Tavistock, which eventually resulted in the closure of the clinic due to safeguarding concerns (Lane, 2022) following the state commissioned investigation (Cass, 2022). At the same time in Sweden, in February 2022, the National Board of

Health and Welfare officially curtailed the practice of prescribing puberty blockers and cross-sex hormones to gender-dysphoric patients under 18-year-old, concluding that the evidence base for hormonal interventions for gender-dysphoric youth is of low quality, and that hormonal treatments may carry risks.

Maya Foraster's case is also a landmark case in the UK. She was fired from her job for expressing a critical view on gender identity and its replacement of the category of sex. After a two-year legal battle, she received a judgment in which people with what has been termed as "gender-critical beliefs" are legally protected from discrimination and harassment in employment and as service users (Sex Matters, 2021). Now she advocates and produces resources to promote clarity about sex in public policy, law, and culture to reestablish that sex matters in rules, laws, policies, language, and culture (NGO Sex Matters (n.d.)).

Education professionals, parents of gender non-conforming children, and detransitioners have organized to inform others and work to accept every child's body as they are born. They have web pages such as Transgender Trend (n.d.), Parents of Rapid Onset Gender Dysphoria (Rapid-Onset Gender Dysphoria, n.d.), Genspect (n.d.) (an international alliance of 20 parent and professional groups whose aim is to advocate for parents of "gender-questioning" children) and others such as Amada (Amada_Familias, n.d.) and No Corpo Certo (n.d.), are gender critical professionals who educate on the impact mainly on children and young boys and girls.

Internationally, expert groups and initiatives have been formed by the concerned scientists, medical practitioners, researchers, and academics: Society for Evidence-Based Gender Medicine (SEGM) (n.d), Project Nettie: Scientists Supporting Biological Sex (n.d), Thoughtful Therapists (n.d.), Rethink Identity Medicine Ethics (n.d.), Stats for Gender. (n.d.), the Franco-Belgian organization Le Petite Sirene (n.d)

Academics and experts have also published several books providing a comprehensive analysis of the transgender global industry: *Trans: When Ideology Meets Reality* by Helen Joyce, *Material Girls* by Katheleen Stock, *The Doubthink* by Janice Raymond, *The Abolition of Sex* by Kara Dansky, *Irreversible Damage: The Transgender Craze Seducing Our Daughters* by Abigail Shrier, and *Genderörületek Németországban és Magyarországon* (Gender Differences in Germany and Hungary) by Eszter Kováts.

The US Equality Act and Women (n.d.) is pending in Congress in the US. This issue of men being housed in prisons with women is being challenged by the Women's Liberation Front (n.d.), Women's Space (n.d.) in Ireland, Contra el Borrado de las Mujeres (n.d.) in Spain, No Corpo Certo (n.d.) in Brazil, and other vital campaigns fighting local laws and policies that have been introduced to undermine the rights of against women and girls. Finally, there are also critical communications by rap singers such as Francis Aaron with Clownfish (2021).

Judges are also reacting to cases. The Interamerican Human Rights Court judge, Elizabeth Odio Benito, has bravely written two dissident opinions on using frameworks designed to protect women from solving issues related to men who identify with the stereotype of women (Odio, 2021 and 2022).

Because of this new form of patriarchy, a new generation of women has retaken the value of CEDAW as the international standard of true feminist values. Hopefully, they will reverse this global trend to erase the recognition that half of humanity has been subordinate because of our sex.

AUTHOR BIOGRAPHY

This article is the result of the collection of evidence and analysis of countless feminist activists, researchers, and specialist service providers from Europe, Asia, North America, Latin America, and Africa who met every week at the Women's Declaration International (WDI) sessions and collaborated in their advocacy efforts during the period 2019-2022.

RECOMMENDED CITATION

Feminists from Europe, North America, Asia, Central America, and Africa. (2022). The erasure of sex: The global capture of sex by *gender identity* activists and the effects on the rights of women and girls. *Dignity: A Journal of Analysis of Exploitation and Violence*. Vol. 7, Issue 4, Article 1. Available at <http://digitalcommons.uri.edu/dignity/vol7/iss4/1>.
<https://doi.org/10.23860/dignity.2022.07.04.01>

REFERENCES

- Aaron, Francis. (2021). Clownfish. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=rV-Exeal17s>
- Adams, J. C., (2020, May 7). Pornhub announces partnership with SWOP-USA: Makes \$50K donation to mark women's day. *Xbiz.com*.
<https://www.xbiz.com/news/250717/pornhub-announces-partnership-with-swop-usa-makes-50k-donation-to-mark-womens-day>
- Affirmation of Feminist Principles. (n.d.) <https://www.feministaffirmation.org/>
- Allen, R., Elliott, K., Harvey, H., O'Callaghan, C., & Smith, K. I. (2020). Femicide Census 2020. In *Femicide Census*. https://www.femicidecensus.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/02/010998-2020-Femicide-Report_V2.pdf
- Amanada Familias. (n.d.). https://www.instagram.com/amanda_familias/?utm_medium=copy_link
- Amnesty International. (2015, August 14). Sex workers' rights are human rights. *Amnesty International*. <https://www.amnesty.org/en/latest/news/2015/08/sex-workers-rights-are-human-rights/>
- Anti-female-receipts. (2016, April 27). The tip of the iceberg. *Tumblr*. <https://anti-female-receipts.tumblr.com/post/143507891820/the-tip-of-the-iceberg-please-add-to-this-list>
- Arc International. (n.d.). www.arc-international.net
- Arcus Foundation. (n.d.). <https://www.arcusfoundation.org/global-trans-initiative/>
- Arcus Foundation (n.d.) (www.arcusfoundation.org)
- Arnold, Chad. (2019, June 10). Some lawmakers want to decriminalize prostitution in New York. *Democrat & Chronicle*.
<https://www.democratandchronicle.com/story/news/politics/albany/2019/06/10/some-lawmakers-want-decriminalize-sex-work-new-york/1407958001/>
- Aravosis, J. (2007, October 8). How did the T get in LGBT? *Salon*.
<https://www.salon.com/2007/10/08/lgbt/>
- Arty Morty. (2020). A Quick Reminder: I'm gay, I oppose gay conversion therapy, and I also oppose most bills to ban it. *YouTube*.
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=hYboWXveGM8>
- Bautista, Jimena. (2020, September 22). Are trans rights a threat to women's rights? *Women's Declaration International*. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Daq8PRc-2s8&t=291s>
- BBC. (2019, May 29). Transgender no longer recognized as "disorder" by WHO. *BBC News*.
<https://www.bbc.com/news/health-48448804>

- Beatrice, L. (2020, December 6). The sex binary is not a “Western construct,” gender identity is. *Feminist Current*. <https://www.feministcurrent.com/2020/12/06/the-sex-binary-is-not-a-western-construct-gender-identity-is/>
- Belgium: Legal Gender Recognition Law (2017, 2018, August 21). *TGEU*. <https://tgeu.org/belgium-legal-gender-recognition-law-2017/>
- Biblioteca del Congreso Nacional de Chile. (2014, November 27). Guía legal sobre: Ley de identidad de género [Legal guide on: gender identity law]. BCN. <https://www.bcn.cl/leyfacil/recurso/ley-de-identidad-de-genero>
- Bilek, J. (2018, February 20). Who are the rich, white men institutionalizing transgender ideology? *The Federalist*. <https://thefederalist.com/2018/02/20/rich-white-men-institutionalizing-transgender-ideology/>
- Bilek, J. (2020, September 3). Women ceding ground to transgenderism. *The 11th Hour*. <https://www.the11thhourblog.com/post/women-ceding-ground-to-transgenderism>
- Bilek, J. (2021, January 26). The allure of body dissociation. *The 11th Hour*. <https://www.the11thhourblog.com/post/the-allure-of-body-dissociation?postId=6005ffb9b86ba00017557e08>
- Bindel, J. (2019, June 14). It’s time for progressives to protect women instead of pronouns. *Quillette*. <https://quillette.com/2019/06/14/its-time-for-progressives-to-protect-women-instead-of-pronouns/?fbclid=IwAR0FP9reY1DvUFphjx-r6YzYjOK1s5D6O3UYJh5eVeJcuIxCQRMdYHgiV4>
- Binetti, M. J. (2020, October 14). Latin America: A free zone for queer colonization. *Women’s Liberation Now!* <https://www.filia.org.uk/latest-news/2020/10/14/latin-america-a-free-zone-for-queer-colonization>
- Bjornsson, Andri S.; Didie, Elizabeth R.; & Phillips, Katharine A. (2010). Body dysmorphic disorder. *Dialogues Clinical Neuroscience*. 12 (2): 221-32. <https://doi.org/10.31887/DCNS.2010.12.2/abjornsson>
- Borraz, M. (2019, July 22). *Ciudadanos reivindica la gestación subrogada como un derecho LGTBI, pero ¿es una demanda del colectivo?* *ElDiario.es*. https://www.eldiario.es/sociedad/ciudadanos-reivindica-gestacion-subrogada-lgtbi_1_1436895.html
- Brean, Joseph. (2018, August 2). Forced to share a room with transgender woman in Toronto shelter, sex abuse victim files human rights complaint. *National Post*. <https://nationalpost.com/news/canada/kristi-hanna-human-rights-complaint-transgender-woman-toronto-shelter>
- Brink, Marjolein van den & Dunne, Peter. (2018, November). Trans and intersex equality rights in Europe: A comparative analysis. *European Commission, Directorate-General for Justice and Consumers*. <https://data.europa.eu/doi/10.2838/902953>
- Carmichael, P., Butler, G., Masic, U., Cole, T. J., De Stavola, B. L., Davidson, Skageberg, E. M., Khadr, S., & Viner, R. M. (2021). Short-term outcomes of pubertal suppression in a selected cohort of 12 to 15-year-old young people with persistent gender dysphoria in the UK. *PLOS ONE*, 16(2), e0243894. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0243894>
- Carrasco, Silvia. (2020, Aug 28). What’s happening regarding teaching ‘gender identity’ in schools in Spain? *Women’s Declaration International*. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=HiABh29RNq4&t=173s>
- Cass, Hilary. (2022, February). Independent review of gender identity services for children and young people <https://cass.independent-review.uk/publications/interim-report/>
- Centre for Bioethics and Culture Network. (2013, Oct 14). Eggsploration updated and expanded. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=GOzw2hmMHXg>

- Citizens' Initiative, Finland (2020, Apr 16). Abandoning the reform of the identity code to make it gender-neutral. <https://www.kansalaisaloite.fi/fi/aloite/6455>
- Charlotte. (2020, Aug 28) What's happening regarding teaching "gender identity" in schools in Canada? *Women's Declaration International*.
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=sXh1FjRnRIU&t=190s>
- Chart, Natasha. (2020, June 29). What's current: social media companies escalate crackdowns on gender identity crisis. *Feminist Current*.
<https://www.feministcurrent.com/2020/06/29/whats-current-social-media-companies-escalate-crackdowns-on-gender-identity-critics/>
- Contesse, J. (2018, July 26). *The Inter-American Court of Human Rights' advisory opinion on gender identity and same-sex marriage*. American Society of International Law.
<https://www.asil.org/insights/volume/22/issue/9/inter-american-court-human-rights-advisory-opinion-gender-identity-and>
- TERF Is A Slur. (n.d.). Cotton ceiling and autogynephilia. *TERF Is a Slur*.
<https://terfisaslur.com/cotton-ceiling/>
- Cauffman, Elizabeth & Steinberg, Laurance. (2001, Feb 5). (Im)maturity of judgment in adolescence: Why adolescents may be less culpable than adults. *Behavioral Sciences and the Law*. <https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1002/bsl.416>
- Ciudadanos reivindica la gestacion subrogada como un derecho LBTBI, pero ¿es demanda del colectivo? (n.d.). El Diario.es. https://www.eldiario.es/sociedad/ciudadanos-reivindica-gestacion-subrogada-lgtbi_1_1436895.html
- Contra el Corrado de las Mujeres. (n.d.) <https://contraelborradodelasmujeres.org/>
- Davidson, Gina. (2019, June 6). Feminist speaker Julie Bindel' attacked by transgender person' at Edinburgh University after talk. *The Scotsman*.
<https://www.scotsman.com/news/scottish-news/feminist-speaker-julie-bindel-attacked-transgender-person-edinburgh-university-after-talk-545841>
- Davidson, Gina. (2021, January 7). *Scottish government can "ride roughshod" over equalities law in row over definition of women in new Act*. The Scotsman.
<https://www.scotsman.com/news/politics/scottish-government-can-ride-roughshod-over-equalities-law-row-over-definition-women-new-act-3089086>
- DecrimNY. (n.d.) Working to Decriminalize, Decarcerate, and Destigmatize the Sex Trades in New York City and the State. <https://www.decrimny.org/>
- Diez, S. (2019, April 2). *¿Quién está detrás del discurso para regular la prostitución? [Who is behind the discussion to regulate prostitution?]*. TribunaFeminista.
<https://tribunafeminista.org/2019/04/quien-esta-detras-del-discurso-para-regular-la-prostitucion/>
- Delia, Julian. (2020, Nov 26). Couples may leave baby's gender blank, men may choose partner's surname. *Times of Malta*.
<https://timesofmalta.com/articles/view/couples-can-leave-babys-gender-blank-have-more-surname-choice-in-new.834625>
- Dominguez, Teresa. (2021, Sep 4). Vientres de alquiler: Las mujeres embarazadas se encuentran en al categoría de mayor riesgo frente a COVID-19. *Periodismo Alternativo*. <https://nuevarevolucion.es/gestacion-subrogada-los-clientes-exigen-que-las-madres-de-alquiler-no-reciban-la-vacuna-contra-el-covid19/>
- Donovon, Emile. (2020, Aug 4). The science of transgender women in sport. *RNZ Podcast*.
<https://www.savewomenssport.com/the-facts>
- Doward, Jamie. (2020, Dec 6). Keira Bell lawyer warns on internet coverage of transgender issues. *The Observer*. <https://www.theguardian.com/uk-news/2020/dec/06/keira-bell-lawyer-warns-on-internet-coverage-of-transgender-issues>
- European Court of Human Rights. (2022). *Factsheet – Gender identity issues*.
https://www.echr.coe.int/Documents/FS_Gender_identity_eng.pdf

- Fain, M. K. (2020, June 24). Male wins “female leadership” position in New York Democratic Council. *4W*. https://4w.pub/male-wins-female-leadership-position-in-nyc-dem-council/?fbclid=IwAR0nKrzgVohYxAUckstHIKCN1rs3ixq0Vvuvap3uD5P_fb1xBiQaX7KXG4o
- Fair Play For Women. (n.d.). *Supporting Women in Domestic and Sexual Violence Services*. https://fairplayforwomen.com/wp-content/uploads/2018/09/FPFW_report_19SEPT2018.pdf
- Fair Play for Women. (2019, Mar 1). Why is transgender inclusion a problem for female competitive sport? *Fair Play for Women*. https://fairplayforwomen.com/sport_info/
- Hashim, A. (2018, May 9). Pakistan passes landmark transgender rights law. *Aljazeera*. <https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2018/5/9/pakistan-passes-landmark-transgender-rights-law>
- Hotchkiss, Rhona. (2020, January 31). *For Women Scotland*. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=KpFTBEXqGQM&t=168s>
- Falcón, Lidia. (2021, Jan 4). S1E13. *Savage Minds Podcast*. https://savageminds.substack.com/p/lidia-falcon?fbclid=IwAR0F60KntwaFW7W3XFiu6_kCj6WE0iILR0mvEQyEUdDAapZJPLPewfl2svg&s=r
- Farley, Melissa. (n.d.). Mental and physical health effects of prostitution and the sex trade. *Prostitution Research & Education*. <https://prostitutionresearch.com/category/library/health-mentalphysical/>
- Forstater, M. (2019, May 4). I lost my job for speaking up about women’s rights. *Medium*. <https://mforstater.medium.com/i-lost-my-job-for-speaking-up-about-womens-rights-2af2186ae84>
- Freyd, J. (1997) What is DARVO? Retrieved from <https://dynamic.uoregon.edu/jjf/defineDARVO.html>
- Funders for LGBTQ Issues. (2018). *2016 tracking report*. https://lgbtfunders.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/04/2016_Tracking_Report.pdf
- Gaetano, P. (2017, November 15). *David Reimer and John Money Gender Reassignment Controversy: The John/Joan Case*. Embryo Project Encyclopedia; Arizona State University. <https://embryo.asu.edu/pages/david-reimer-and-john-money-gender-reassignment-controversy-johnjoan-case>
- Gallego, J. (2021, January 17). El silencio de la Universidad [The silence of the University]. *Publico*. https://blogs.publico.es/cuarto-y-mitad/2021/01/17/el-silencio-de-la-universidad/?utm_source=whatsapp&utm_medium=social&utm_campaign=web
- Gamboa, L. C. B. (2020, May 17). *Brigitte Baptiste, la rectora de la diversidad social colombiana* [Brigitte Baptiste, the rector of the Colombian social diversity]. *El Pais*. <https://www.elpais.com.co/elpaispalante/brigitte-baptiste-la-rectora-de-la-diversidad-social-colombiana.html>
- Garg, Garima, Elshimy, Ghada, & Marwaha, Raman. (2020). Gender dysphoria. *StatPearls*. <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/books/NBK532313/>
- Garnier, Jorge. (2020, August 5). *Resolución General nro. 34/2020 - Inspección General de Justicia - composición del órgano de administración y fiscalización* [General Resolution no. 34/2020 – General Inspectorate of Justice – composition of the administration and control body]. *EY Law*. https://www.ey.com/es_ar/law/ey-law-alerts-argentina/resolucion-general-numero-34-2020#:~:text=34%25252F2020%252520
- Gender Identity, Gender Expression and Sex Characteristics Act, Chapter 540 *Legizlazzjoni Malta* (2015). <https://legislation.mt/eli/cap/540/eng/pdf>
- Gender Recognition Act 2015, Number 25 *Irish Statute Book*. (2015). <https://www.irishstatutebook.ie/eli/2015/act/25/enacted/en/pdf>

- Genspect. (n.d.) <https://genspect.org>
- Get the L out UK. (n.d.) <http://www.gettheloutuk.com/>
- Giraldo, I. (2017, December 6). The "gender ideology" menace and the rejection of the peace agreement in Colombia. *Discover Society*.
<https://archive.discoversociety.org/2017/12/06/the-gender-ideology-menace-and-the-rejection-of-the-peace-agreement-in-colombia/>
- Foro Generación Igualdad, (2021). Un camino hacia la agenda feminista para la generación igualdad, prioridades y recomendaciones [A pathway toward a feminist agenda for the generation equality forum priorities and recommendations].
<https://forogeneracionigualdad.mx/wp-content/uploads/2021/04/CAMINO-HACIA-UNA-AGENDA-FEMINISTA-GEF.pdf>
- Global Market Insights. (2019). Sex reassignment surgery market by gender transition (male to female (facial, breast, genitals), female to male (facial, chest, genitals): Industry analysis report, regional outlook, application potential, price trends, competitive market share and forecast, 2020-2026. <https://www.gminsights.com/industry-analysis/sex-reassignment-surgery-market>
- Global Market Insights. (2021, June 8). Surrogacy market size worth over \$33.5bn by 2027. *Global Market Insights*. <https://www.gminsights.com/pressrelease/surrogacy-market>
- Global Network of Sex Work Projects. (n.d.). *Where our members work*. NSWP.
<https://www.nswp.org/members>
- Government Equalities Office & Truss, Elizabeth. (2020, Sep 22). Government responds to Gender Recognition Act consultation. *Government Equalities Office*.
<https://www.gov.uk/government/news/government-responds-to-gender-recognition-act-consultation>
- Grandview Research. (2020). Video game market size, share and trends: Analysis report by device (console, mobile, computer), by type (online, offline), by region, and segment forecasts, 2020-2027. <https://www.grandviewresearch.com/industry-analysis/video-game-market>
- Havoscope. (n.d.). *Prostitution statistics*. <https://havoscope.com/prostitution-statistics/>
- Harvard University. (2017). Gender, politics, and imagination. *YouTube*.
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=R3z4143mA9s>
- Hilton, E., Thompson, P., Wright, C., & Curtis, D. (2021). The reality of sex. *Irish Journal of Medical Science*, 190, 1647. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1007/s11845-020-02464-4>
- Hindustan Times. (2021, 15 Mar). Kerala High Court allows transgender woman to join NCC, calls for changes in enrolment criteria. <https://www.hindustantimes.com/india-news/kerala-hc-says-transwoman-entitled-to-enrol-in-ncc-101615790351281.html>
- Home. (n.d.). DecrimNY. <https://www.decrimny.org/>
- Hopper, Tristin. (2019, March 18). Canada's oldest rape crisis centre stripped of city funding for refusing to accept trans women. *National Post*.
<https://nationalpost.com/news/canada/canadas-oldest-rape-crisis-centre-stripped-of-city-funding-for-refusing-to-accept-trans-women>
- Human Rights Committee. (2019). [Meeting broadcast]. In *parliamentlive.tv*.
<https://parliamentlive.tv/event/index/0364bfc3-5adc-4aef-99bd-48c68daacc38>
- Identidad de Genero, Ley N° 26.743 (2014).
http://www.jus.gob.ar/media/3108867/ley_26743_identidad_de_genero.pdf
- ILGA Europe. (2015). Trans person/people/man/woman. *ILGA-Europe*. https://www.ilga-europe.org/sites/default/files/glossary_october_2015_edition.pdf

- Independent Expert on Protection Against Violence and Discrimination Based on Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity. (2021, June 1). Report on gender theory. *UN High Commissioner for Human Rights*. <https://www.ohchr.org/en/calls-for-input/reports/2021/report-gender-theory>
- Independent Expert on Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity. (n.d.). Purpose of the mandate. *UN High Commissioner for Human Rights*. <https://www.ohchr.org/en/special-procedures/ie-sexual-orientation-and-gender-identity>
- Impacts of trans activism on the human rights of women and girls. (n.d.). *Feminist Legal Clinic*. <https://feministlegal.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/03/Impacts-of-Transactivism-on-the-Human-Rights-of-Women-and-Girls-no-image.pdf>
- Ingle, Sean. (2019, Sep 14). IOC delays new transgender guidelines after scientists fail to agree. *The Guardian*. <https://www.theguardian.com/sport/2019/sep/24/ioc-delays-new-transgender-guidelines-2020-olympics>
- Interamerican Human Rights Court (2021, JUNE 28) Honduras es responsable por violar el derecho a la vida de una mujer transgénero. Caso Vicky Hernández y otras Vs. Honduras. https://www.corteidh.or.cr/comunicados_prensa.cfm?lang=es&n=717
- International Coalition for the Abolition of Surrogate Motherhood and European Network of Migrant Women. (2022, Oct). Migrant women and reproductive exploitation in the surrogacy industry: Joint investigation by ENoMW ICASM – October 2022. <https://usercontent.one/wp/www.migrantwomennetwork.org/wp-content/uploads/ENG-Final-Migration-and-surrogacy.pdf>
- International Commission of Jurists (ICJ). (2007, March). Yogyakarta Principles: Principles on the application of international human rights law in relation to sexual orientation and gender identity. http://yogyakartaprinciples.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/08/principles_en.pdf
- International Commission of Jurists (ICJ). (2017, November 17). Yogyakarta Principles plus 10 - Additional principles and state obligations on the application of international human rights law in relation to sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression and sex characteristics to complement the Yogyakarta Principles. http://yogyakartaprinciples.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/11/A5_yogyakartaWEB-2.pdf
- International Committee on the Rights of Sex Workers in Europe (ICRSE). (n.d). ICRSE Strategic Plan 2016-2019. *International Committee on the Rights of Sex Workers in Europe*. <http://www.sexworkeurope.org/about-us>
- International Conference on Transgender Law and Employment Policy. (1995, June 17). International Bill of Gender Rights. <https://www.learningforjustice.org/classroom-resources/texts/international-bill-of-gender-rights>
- International Conference on Transgender Law and Employment Policy (ICTLEP). (1996, July 4). *International bill of gender rights*. <https://www.digitaltransgenderarchive.net/downloads/2z10wq28m>
- International Trans Fund. (2017). *Www.transfund.org*. <https://www.transfund.org/>
- Jeffreys, Sheila, Pereira, Ariel & Beck, Julia. (2020, June 7). On queer politics. *Women's Declaration International*. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=kFyQ5EStiRs&t=22s>
- Johnson, Elin. (2020, June 24). A transgender woman will lead a women's- and gender-studies program. Here's why that's remarkable. *The Chronicle of Higher Education*. <https://www.chronicle.com/article/a-transgender-woman-will-lead-a-womens-and-gender-studies-program-heres-why-thats-remarkable>
- Jones, J. C. (2020). Appendix: A brief history of transgender ideology. In *The Political Erasure of Sex*. https://thepoliticalerasureofsex.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/10/The-Political-Erasure-of-Sex_Appendix.pdf

- Joshi, Neha. (2021, Jan 5). Self-perceived Gender Identity] Bombay High Court allows Transgender person to contest Panchayat election as female from ward reserved for women. Bar and Bench. <https://www.barandbench.com/news/litigation/transgender-village-panchayat-nomination-bombay-high-court-aurangabad>
- Klaine, K. (2018, October 29). The dangerous effects of surrogacy: A review of “A Transnational Feminist View of Surrogacy Biomarkers in India.” Public Discourse. <https://www.thepublicdiscourse.com/2018/10/42720/>
- Lahl, Jennifer. (2018, May 21). Toni’s experience as a surrogate mother. It’s been a nightmare! *The Center for Bioethics and Culture Network*. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=HF1gEttfn8>
- Lane, Bernard. (2022, Aug 5). Shuttering the Tavistock. Quillette. <https://quillette.com/2022/08/05/closing-the-tavistock-is-an-important-step/>
- Laursen, S. (2020, August 22). *Danish government launches historic legislation initiatives*. LGBT komiteen. https://komiteen.dk/?p=956&fbclid=IwAR35o8qAxaBqKqJZc_jiOPbhyafGvnGxLIH_WuwXRofunnHUBhnTVhqRZlr8
- Lawrence, Anne A. (2011). Autogynephilia: An underappreciated paraphilia. *Advances in Psychosomatic Medicine*. 31:135-48. <https://doi.org/10.1159/000328921>
- Legal Crowdfunding. Women Speak Scotland. (n.d.). <https://womenspeakscotland.com/legal-crowdfunding/>
- Legislation.gov.uk. (2004). Gender Recognition Act. <https://www.legislation.gov.uk/ukpga/2004/7/contents>
- Lei no 38/2018 [Law number 38/2018]. (2018, August 7). *Diário Da República Eletrónico*. <https://dre.pt/dre/detalhe/lei/38-2018-115933863>
- Lindsay, James. (2020, December 25). Psychopathy and the origins of totalitarianism. *New Discourses*. <https://newdiscourses.com/2020/12/psychopathy-origins-totalitarianism/>
- LGB Alliance. (n.d.) <https://lgballiance.org.uk/about/>
- Lög um kynrænt sjálfræði [Act on sexual autonomy]. (2020, May 1). *Alþingi*. <https://www.althingi.is/lagas/150b/2019080.html>
- Lowrey, K. (2018, January 3). Considering the rapid rise of trans ideology in academia, we should follow the money. *Feminist Current*. <https://www.feministcurrent.com/2018/01/03/considering-rapid-rise-trans-ideology-academia-follow-money/>
- Madaik, Devyani. (2021, July 14). Assam police busts trafficking, sex-change racket arrests six transgender persons. *The Logical Indian*. <https://thelogicalindian.com/trending/assam-police-busts-trafficking-sex-change-racket-arrests-six-transgender-persons-29612>
- Marcotte, Amanda. (2015, Feb 4). Breastfeeding mom loses discrimination case because men can lactate too. *Slate*. <https://slate.com/human-interest/2015/02/angela-ames-sex-discrimination-case-breast-feeding-mom-loses-because-men-can-lactate-too.html>
- Mili, Anupama. (2018, Nov 15). Calicut varsity to approach AIU to amend rules for transgender student. <https://www.onmanorama.com/news/kerala/2018/11/15/calicut-uty-transgender-student-athletics.html>
- Moens, Barbara. (2020, October 1). Green MEP Petra de Sutter to be named deputy Belgian PM. *Politico*. https://www.politico.eu/article/green-mep-petra-de-sutter-to-be-named-deputy-belgian-pm/?utm_source=RSS_Feed&utm_medium=RSS&utm_campaign=RSS_Syndication

- Murphy, M. (2020, June 15). Podcast: Prof Kathleen Lowrey didn't hide her views on gender identity ideology and was punished for it. *Feminist Current*. <https://www.feministcurrent.com/2020/06/15/podcast-prof-kathleen-lowrey-didnt-hide-her-views-on-gender-identity-ideology-and-was-punished-for-it/>
- Murray, K., Blackburn, L. H., & Mackenzie, L. (2020a). Reform "under the radar"? Lessons for Scotland from the development of gender self-declaration laws in Europe. *Edinburgh Law Review*, 24(2), 281–289. <https://doi.org/10.3366/elr.2020.0634>
- Murray, K. L., Blackburn, L. H., & Mackenzie, L. (2020b, April 21). Shifting sands on the definition of "woman" in Scots law: The journey of the gender representation on Public Boards Act from consultation to implementation. *Murray Blackburn Mackenzie*. <https://murrayblackburnmackenzie.org/2020/04/21/shifting-sands-on-the-definition-of-woman-in-scots-law-the-journey-of-the-gender-representation-on-public-boards-act-from-consultation-to-implementation/>
- No Corp Certo. (n.d.) <https://nocorpocerto.com/>
- No Corpo Certo (n.d.). <https://nocorpocerto.com/referencias/>
- Nolan, Emma. (2020, September 16). J.K. Rowling book burning videos are spreading like wildfire across TikTok. *Newsweek*. <https://www.newsweek.com/jk-rowling-books-burned-tiktok-transgender-issues-1532330>
- l'Observatoire La Petite Sirène. (n.d.). <https://www.observatoirepetitesirene.org>
- Odio Benito, Elizabeth. (2021, Mar 26). Voto parcialmente disidente caso Vicky Hernandez y otros vs. Honduras.
- Odio Benito, Elizabeth. (2022, May 30). Voto parcialmente disidente opinión consultiva CIDH, OC-29/22, Enfoques diferenciados respecto de determinados grupos de personas privadas de la libertad. Vsc_odio_422_esp.docx
- O'Hara, Maureen. (2020, August 15). "No debate": Gender identity ideology and speech control. *Women's Declaration International*. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=B3LYjQwtgNc>
- Opinion of the Court. (2022, Feb 18). Reclaiming Motion by For Women Scotland Limited against the Lord Advocate and the Scottish Ministers. <https://www.scotcourts.gov.uk/docs/default-source/cos-general-docs/pdf-docs-for-opinions/2022csih4.pdf>
- Organization of American States (OAS). (2019, March 29). Inter-American Commission on Human Rights (IACHR) welcomes progress on recognition of the rights of trans persons in the region. https://www.oas.org/en/iachr/media_center/PReleases/2019/085.asp
- Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development. (2017, Mar 30). Preventing policy capture: Integrity in public decision making. Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development. <https://www.oecd.org/gov/preventing-policy-capture-9789264065239-en.htm>
- Orientacion Sexual e Identidad de Genero, T-099/15 Corte Constitucional Republica de Colombia. (2015). <https://www.corteconstitucional.gov.co/RELATORIA/2015/T-099-15.htm>
- Outright International. (n.d.). www.outrightinternational.org
- Parliament Assembly. (2015, April 22). *Resolution 2048 Discrimination against transgender people in Europe*. Council of Europe. <https://assembly.coe.int/nw/xml/XRef/Xref-XML2HTML-EN.asp?fileid=21736>
- Plazas, Natalia. (2018, May 13). México: Instituto Electoral canceló las candidaturas de 17 hombres que fingieron ser transgénero [Mexico: Electoral Institute canceled the candidacies of 17 men who pretended to be transgender]. *France 24*. <https://www.france24.com/es/20180513-mexico-eleccion-candidatura-transgenero-muxe>

- Polo, Astrid Tvevad. (2021, April 21). The debate surrounding Spain's new trans law: Introducing gender self-determination in Spain. *The Cambridge Global Affair*. <https://www.thecambridgeglobalaffair.co.uk/collaborators/the-debate-around-spains-new-trans-law>
- Pornhub. (2019, December 11). The 2019 year in review. Porn Hub Insights. <https://www.pornhub.com/insights/2019-year-in-review>
- Price, Christen. (2020). Women's Spaces, Women's Rights: Feminism and the Transgender Rights Movement. *Marquette Law Review*, 103(4), 1509–1564.
- Presley, Richard. (2019, Jan 31). Transgender MMA fighter Fallon Fox breaks opponent's skull. *ATBK*. <https://www.attacktheback.com/transgender-mma-fighter-fallon-fox-breaks-opponents-skull/>
- Project Nettie. (n.d.) <https://projectnettie.wordpress.com>
- Rapid-Onset Gender Dysphoria (ROGD). (n.d.) <https://www.parentsofrogdkids.com/>
- Rainbow Europe. (n.d.). Austria. *Rainbow-Europe.org*. <https://rainbow-europe.org/#8621/0/0>
- Red Umbrella Fund. (n.d.). Sex worker networks. <https://www.redumbrellafund.org/sex-worker-networks/>
- Rethink Identity Medicine Ethics (n.d.). <https://rethinkime.org>
- Reuters Staff. (2019, Jul 30). Weightlifter Hubbard becomes lightning rod for criticism of transgender policy. *Reuters*. <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-weightlifting-newzealand-hubbard-idUSKCN1UP0F0>
- Ristori, Jiska & Steensma, Thomas D. (2016). Gender dysphoria in childhood. *Review of psychiatry*. Vol 28:1, <https://doi.org/10.3109/09540261.2015.1115754>
- Roberts, Gareth. (2014, Dec 31). "Breastfeeding prostitution ring" raided by police in China where men "pay to suckle young mums." *Mirror*. <https://www.mirror.co.uk/news/weird-news/breastfeeding-prostitution-ring-raided-police-4897565>
- Rodrigues, Eugenia. (2020, Apr 15). Feminist question time. *Women's Declaration International*. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=viXp9euNWk0&t=929s>
- Salakova, Anna. (2020, September 22). Are transgender rights are threat to women's rights? *Women's Declaration International*. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Daq8PRc-2s8&t=291s>
- Salazar, Ivannia. (2021, Dec 2). Talking about breast milk in banned in London hospitals. *World Today*. <https://www.world-today-news.com/talking-about-breast-milk-is-banned-in-london-hospitals/>
- Sarmah, Manjit. (2022, Mar 23). Who is Tamikka Brents, whose skull was broken by Fallon Fox in an MMA fight? *Sportskeeda*. <https://www.sportskeeda.com/mma/news-who-tamikka-brents-whose-skull-broken-fallon-fox-mma-fight>
- Save Women's Sports. (n.d.) <https://savewomenssports.com/images-and-infographics>
- Schon, Amanda. (2020, July 2). Trans violence and cyber lynching in Brazil. *Women's Declaration International*. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=x49QeEFrGok&t=123s>
- Sex Matters. (n.d.) <https://sex-matters.org/about/>
- Sex Matters. (2021, Jun 10). We are worthy of respect in a democratic society. *Sex Matters*. <https://sex-matters.org/posts/updates/gender-critical-beliefs-are-worthy-of-respect-in-a-democratic-society/>
- Sexual orientation and gender identity (SOGI). (n.d.). *Council of Europe*. <https://www.coe.int/en/web/sogi/>
- Sex Work Donor Collaborative. (n.d.) <https://www.sexworkdonorcollaborative.org/members>

- Shaw, Diana. (2020, September 26). Transgender Teen With Pattern of Violence Against Women “Anxious” to be Jailed With Women. *Women Are Human*. <https://www.womenarehuman.com/transgender-teen-charged-with-making-death-threats-against-two-individuals/>
- Slatz, A. (2020, February 2). Jessica Yaniv sues more immigrant salon workers—tribunal says “enough.” *The Post Millennial*. <https://thepostmillennial.com/breaking-jessica-yaniv-sues-more-immigrant-salon-workers-tribunal-says-enough>
- Smith, K. I. (2019, October 17). Comparing UK homicide perpetration and suspect rates for male, female and trans people April 2007 - March 2018. *As I See It*. <https://kareningalasmith.com/2019/10/17/comparing-uk-homicide-perpetration-and-suspect-rates-for-male-female-and-trans-people-april-2007-march-2018/>
- Society for Evidence-Based Gender Medicine (SEGM) (n.d.) <https://www.segm.org>
- State of New York. SB 4702A, 2019-2020 Reg. Sess. (NY 2019). <https://legislation.nysenate.gov/pdf/bills/2019/S4702A>
- Stats for Gender. (n.d.). <https://www.statsforgender.org>
- Stockdale, Laura & Coyne, Sarah M. (2018). Video game addiction in emerging adulthood: Cross-sectional evidence of pathology in video game addicts as compared to matched healthy controls. *Journal of Affective Disorders*, Vol 225(1), pp. 265-272. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jad.2017.08.045>
- Stonewall. (2019). *Best practice guide*. https://www.stonewall.org.uk/system/files/stonewall_primary_best_practice_guide_2018_-_final.pdf
- Stoller, R. J. (1968). *Sex and Gender: On The Development of Masculinity and Femininity*. New York: Science House.
- Stryker’s Allies for Equality (n.d.). <https://www.stryker.com/pt/en/about/corporate-responsibility/strykers-allies-for-equality-safe.html>
- Summary of Crowd Funded Judicial Reviews, Employment Tribunals, and Appeals 2018. (n.d.). [Slides]. Padlet. https://padlet-uploads.storage.googleapis.com/464378456/7133b2943b7a0bd96b0a1f3d47ffb1fb/Crowdfunding_10_sept_20_screened.pdf
- Svensson, Manfred (2022, Sep 6) Cómo la política identitaria corrompió el proceso constituyente <https://www.ciperchile.cl/2022/09/06/politica-identitaria-y-proceso-constituyente/>
- TERF Is a Slur. (n.d.). <https://terfisaslur.com/>
- The Biden plan to advance LGBTQ+ equality in America and around the world. (n.d.). *Joe Biden for President: Official Campaign Website*. <https://joebiden.com/lgbtq-policy/>
- The European Parliamentary Forum for Sexual and Reproductive Rights. (n.d.). <https://www.epfweb.org/node/46>
- The European Post. (2016, Sep 20). Council of Europe to discuss again pro-surrogacy report of controversial rapporteur De Sutter. *The European Post*. <http://europeanpost.co/council-of-europe-to-discuss-again-pro-surrogacy-report-of-controversial-rapporteur-de-sutter/>
- The International Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Trans, and Intersex Association (ILGA). (n.d.). www.ilga.org
- The International Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Trans, and Intersex Association-Europe. (n.d.). <https://www.ilga-europe.org/who-we-are/what-ilga-europe>
- The State Media. (2020, September 10). Gender Ideology - Full Version. *YouTube*. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=9Zkc4P0rpI4&t=331s>

- The William Institute at UCLA School of Law. (2018, Jan 17). Update on the Yogyakarta Principles. *The William Institute at UCLA School of Law*.
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=RxQsKLSI_dg&t=1189s
- Thoughtful Therapists (n.d.) <https://thoughtfultherapists.org>
- Threats of violence and violent imagery. (n.d.). *TERF Is a Slur*. <https://terfisaslur.com/>
- Transgender-identified archives. (n.d.). *Women Are Human*.
<https://www.womenarehuman.com/category/crime/trans-identified-men/>
- Transgender Europe*. (n.d.). www.tgeu.org
- Transgender Trend. (n.d.) <https://www.transgendertrend.com/detransition/>
- United Nations (2017, Jul 10). Resolution on Work of the Statistical Commission pertaining to the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development. <https://documents-dds-ny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/N17/207/63/PDF/N1720763.pdf>
- United Nations. (2022). The Sustainable Development Goals Report 2022.
<https://unstats.un.org/sdgs/report/2022/The-Sustainable-Development-Goals-Report-2022.pdf>
- United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights. (2018, November 30). *Re: Comments regarding the persecutory grounds in the draft crimes against humanity convention* [Letter for Publication to UN International Law Commission].
- United Nations General Assembly. (2018, July 12). *Protection against violence and discrimination based on sexual orientation and gender identity*, UNGAOR, 73rd Sess, UN Doc A/73/152 (2018).
https://www.un.org/en/ga/search/view_doc.asp?symbol=A/73/152
- United Nations General Assembly, Third Committee. (2016, November 21). Intense debate, close voting as gender identity, sexual orientation, digital-age privacy take centre stage in third committee. *United Nations*.
<https://www.un.org/press/en/2016/gashc4191.doc.htm>
- Updated recommendations for hormone therapy for gender dysphoria in adolescents. (2022, Feb 22). Swedish National Board of Health and Welfare (Socialstyrelsen).
<https://www.socialstyrelsen.se/om-socialstyrelsen/pressrum/press/uppdaterade-rekommendationer-for-hormonbehandling-vid-konsdysfori-hos-unga/>
- Vigo, Julian. (2018, June 12). The Degenderettes: How a Violent “Art Show” Is Seeking to Silence Women. *Intellectual Takeout*.
<https://www.intellectualltakeout.org/article/degenderettes-how-violent-art-show-seeking-silence-women/>
- Vlot, Mariska C., Klink, Daniel T., Heijer, Marin den, Blankenstein, Marinus, A., Rottevell, Joost, & Heijboer, Annemieke C. (2017, Feb). Effect of pubertal suppression and cross-sex hormone therapy on bone turnover markers and bone mineral apparent density (BMAD) in transgender adolescents. *Bone*. Vol95, pp. 11-19.
<https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/27845262/>
- Volcanicas. (2022, October 8), El terfismo en América Latina: un borrado histórico de las personas trans. <https://volcanicas.com/el-terfismo-en-america-latina-un-borrado-historico-de-las-personas-trans/>
- Wareham, J. (2020, July 7). Dutch ID cards to become gender free – could more of Europe follow? *Forbes*. <https://www.forbes.com/sites/jamiewareham/2020/07/07/dutch-id-cards-to-become-gender-free--could-more-of-europe-follow/?sh=3b9ee2503207>
- Wikipedia. (n.d.-a). Wikipedia—developed country.
https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Developed_country#IMF_advanced_economies
- Wikipedia. (n.d.-b). Wikipedia—liberal democracy.
https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Liberal_democracy

- Wild, A. C. (2019). Lesbians at ground zero: How transgenderism is conquering the lesbian body. *Get The L Out UK*.
<https://www.gettheloutuk.com/blog/category/research/lesbians-at-ground-zero.html>
- Women's Liberation Front. (n.d.) Protecting single-sex prisons: Resources, relevant news, and important litigation. <https://www.womensliberationfront.org/womens-prisons>
- Women's Liberation Front (WOLF). (2019, Apr 28). Selected examples of harms from *gender identity* policies. *Women's Liberation Front*
https://static1.squarespace.com/static/5f232ea74d8342386a7ebc52/t/5f2b1421d210ff042aedb41a/1596658721184/Selected-examples-of-harm-from-GI-policies_April-30-2019.pdf
- Women and Girls in Scotland. (2019). *Female only provision: A Women and Girls in Scotland report*. https://hjn.a49.myftpupload.com/wp-content/uploads/2019/09/WGS_female_only_provision_report.pdf
- Declaration on Women's Sex-Based Rights. (n.d.). Declaration on women's sex-based rights. <https://www.womensdeclaration.com/en/>
- Women's Space. (n.d.) <https://www.womensspaceireland.ie/>
- Yogyakarta Principles Plus 10. (2017). http://yogyakartaprinciples.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/11/A5_yogyakartaWEB-2.pdf
- Yogyakarta Principles. (2006). <https://yogyakartaprinciples.org/principles-en/>
- Young, Sarah. (2018, June 2018). Baby born to transgender man could become first in UK "without a legal mother." *The Independent*. <https://www.independent.co.uk/life-style/transgender-man-baby-father-birth-certificate-uk-a8389141.html>
- Zucker, Kenneth J. (2015). The DSM-5 diagnostic criteria for gender dysphoria. In: *Management of gender dysphoria: A multidisciplinary approach*. (Eds: Trombetta C., Liguori, G. & Bertolotto, M.) Springer-Verlag Italia. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-88-470-5696-1_4