Search for Subsolar-Mass Ultracompact Binaries in Advanced
LIGO's First Observing Run

Robert Coyne
University of Rhode Island, robcoyne@uri.edu

Et Al

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.uri.edu/phys_facpubs

Citation/Publisher Attribution
or.org.uri.idm.oclc.org/10.1103/PhysRevLett.121.231103
Search for Subsolar-Mass Ultracompact Binaries in Advanced LIGO's First Observing Run

Creative Commons License

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.

This article is available at DigitalCommons@URI: https://digitalcommons.uri.edu/phys_facpubs/328
Search for Subsolar-Mass Ultracompact Binaries in Advanced LIGO’s First Observing Run

B. P. Abbott et al.*
(LIGO Scientific Collaboration and Virgo Collaboration)
and S. Shandera

(Received 15 August 2018; published 7 December 2018)

We present the first Advanced LIGO and Advanced Virgo search for ultracompact binary systems with component masses between 0.2 $M_\odot$–1.0 $M_\odot$ using data taken between September 12, 2015 and January 19, 2016. We find no viable gravitational wave candidates. Our null result constrains the coalescence rate of monochromatic (delta function) distributions of nonspinning (0.2 $M_\odot$, 0.2 $M_\odot$) ultracompact binaries to be less than $1.0 \times 10^6$ Gpc$^{-3}$ yr$^{-1}$ and the coalescence rate of a similar distribution of (1.0 $M_\odot$, 1.0 $M_\odot$) ultracompact binaries to be less than $1.9 \times 10^4$ Gpc$^{-3}$ yr$^{-1}$ (at 90% confidence). Neither black holes nor neutron stars are expected to form below ~1 $M_\odot$ through conventional stellar evolution, though it has been proposed that similarly low mass black holes could be formed primordially through density fluctuations in the early Universe and contribute to the dark matter density. The interpretation of our constraints in the primordial black hole dark matter paradigm is highly model dependent; however, under a particular primordial black hole binary formation scenario we constrain monochromatic primordial black hole populations of 0.2 $M_\odot$ to be less than 33% of the total dark matter density and monochromatic populations of 1.0 $M_\odot$ to be less than 5% of the dark matter density. The latter strengthens the presently placed bounds from microlensing surveys of massive compact halo objects (MACHOs) provided by the MACHO and EROS Collaborations.

DOI: 10.1103/PhysRevLett.121.231103

Introduction.—The era of gravitational wave astronomy began with the observation of the binary black hole merger GW150914 [1]. Since then, four additional binary black hole mergers [2–5] and one binary neutron star merger [6] have been announced as of November 2017. Thus far, Advanced LIGO and Advanced Virgo searches have targeted binary systems with total masses from 2–600 $M_\odot$ [7,8], but the LIGO and Virgo detectors are also sensitive to ultracompact binaries with components below 1 $M_\odot$ if the compactness (mass to radius ratio) is close to that of a black hole. White dwarf binaries, while often formed with components below one solar mass, are not sufficiently compact to be a LIGO/Virgo gravitational wave source. Neutron stars or black holes are sufficiently compact as would be other exotic compact objects. Previous gravitational wave searches for sub-solar-mass ultracompact binaries used data from initial LIGO observations from February 14, 2003–March 24, 2005 [9,10]. Advanced LIGO [11] presently surveys a volume of space approximately 1000 times larger than the previous search for sub-solar-mass ultracompact objects, therefore improving the chances of detecting such a binary 1000-fold.

In conventional stellar evolution models, the lightest ultracompact objects are formed when stellar remnants exceed ~1.4 $M_\odot$, the Chandrasekhar mass limit [12,13]. Beyond the Chandrasekhar mass limit, electron degeneracy pressure can no longer prevent the gravitational collapse of a white dwarf. The lightest remnants that exceed the Chandrasekhar mass limit form neutron stars [14]. When even the neutron degeneracy pressure cannot prevent collapse, heavier stellar remnants will collapse to black holes. Some equations of state predict that neutron stars (~1 $M_\odot$) are not stable down to ~0.1 $M_\odot$ [15]; there is no widely accepted model for forming neutron stars below ~1 $M_\odot$, though a recent measurement does not exclude the possibility of 0.92 $M_\odot$ neutron star [16]. This result may be due to the low inclination of the system. The lowest precisely measured neutron star mass is 1.174 $M_\odot$ [17]. Observationally, black holes appear to have a minimum mass of ~5 $M_\odot$ with a gap between the heaviest observed neutron star (~2 $M_\odot$) and black hole masses [18–21]. Detecting ultracompact objects below one solar mass could challenge our ideas about stellar evolution or possibly hint at new, unconventional formation scenarios.

Beyond conventional stellar evolution, one of the most prolific black hole formation models posits that primordial black holes (PBHs) could have formed in the early Universe through the collapse of highly overdense regions.
It has been suggested that PBHs could constitute a fraction of the missing dark matter [23,26], though this scenario has been constrained [27]. LIGO’s detections have revived interest in black hole formation mechanisms and, in particular, the formation of primordial black holes (PBHs) [28–30]. Though there are proposals on how to distinguish a primordial black hole distribution from an astrophysical one [31–36], disentangling them is challenging when the populations overlap in mass. Hence, detection of sub-solar-mass ultracompact objects would provide the cleanest signature for determining primordial formation. Still, recent proposals for nonbaryonic dark matter models can produce sub-solar-mass black holes either by allowing a lower Chandrasekhar mass in the dark sector [37], or by triggering neutron stars to collapse into $\sim 1 \, M_\odot$ black holes [38].

This Letter describes a gravitational wave search for ultracompact binary systems with component masses between 0.2 $M_\odot$ and 1.0 $M_\odot$ using data from Advanced LIGO’s first observing run. No viable gravitational wave candidates were identified. We briefly describe the data analyzed and the anticipated sensitivity to sub-solar-mass ultracompact objects, as well as the search that was conducted, which led to the null result. We then describe how the null result constrains the merger rate of sub-solar-mass binaries in the nearby universe. We consider the merger rate constraints in the context of binary merger rate estimates most recently given by Sasaki et al. [29] thereby constraining the fraction of dark matter density made up of PBHs between 0.2 $M_\odot$ and 1.0 $M_\odot$. Finally, we conclude with a discussion of future work.

Search.—We report on data analyzed from Advanced LIGO’s first observing run, taken from September 12, 2015–January 19, 2016 at the LIGO Hanford and LIGO Livingston detectors. After taking into account data quality cuts [39] and detector downtime, we analyzed a total of 48.16 days of Hanford-Livingston coincident data. The data selection process was identical to that used in previous searches [40].

During Advanced LIGO’s first observing run, each LIGO instrument was sensitive to sub-solar-mass ultracompact binaries at extra-galactic distances. Figure 1 shows the maximum distance to which an equal-mass compact binary merger with given component masses would be visible at a signal-to-noise ratio of 8 in either LIGO Hanford or LIGO Livingston.

The search was conducted using standard gravitational wave analysis software [41–46]. Our search consisted of a matched-filter stage that filtered a discrete bank of templates against the LIGO data. The peak SNR for each template for each second was identified and recorded as a trigger. Subsequently, a chi-squared test was performed that checked the consistency of the trigger with a signal [42]. The triggers from each LIGO detector and gravitational wave template were combined and searched for coincidences within 20 ms. Candidates that pass coincidence were assigned a likelihood ratio $\mathcal{L}$ that accounts for the relative probability that the candidates are signal versus noise as a function of SNR, chi-squared, and time delay and phase offset between detectors. Larger values of $\mathcal{L}$ were deemed to be more signal-like. The rate at which noise produced candidates with a given value of $\mathcal{L}$ was computed via a Monte Carlo integral of the noise derived from noncoincident triggers, which we define as the false alarm rate of candidate signals.

Our discrete bank of 500332 template waveforms [47] conformed to the gravitational wave emission expected from general relativity [48,49]. We use the 3.5 post-Newtonian order TaylorF2 waveform to model the inspiral portion of the binary evolution, which is constructed under the stationary phase approximation [49]. The TaylorF2 waveform has been used in previous low-mass Advanced LIGO and Advanced Virgo searches. The bank covered component masses in the detector frame between 0.19–2.0 $M_\odot$ with 97% fidelity. While we restrict our analysis of the search results to the subsolar region, we have allowed for the possibility of high mass ratio systems. Our template bank assumed that each binary component has negligible spin. Relaxing that assumption is a direction for future work, but is a computationally challenging problem requiring resources well beyond those used for this and previous LIGO analyses. We integrated the template waveforms between 45–1024 Hz, with the longest waveform lasting about 470 seconds. Advanced LIGO is sensitive down to $\sim 15$ Hz, but integrating from that frequency would have been too computationally burdensome. Our choice to integrate from 45 to 1024 Hz recovered 93.0% of the total possible SNR that integration...
over the full band would have provided. Additional details are described in Ref. [47].

No viable gravitational wave candidates were found. Our loudest gravitational wave candidate was consistent with noise and had a false alarm rate of 6.19 per year.

**Constraint on binary merger rate.**—We constrained the binary merger rate in this mass region by considering nine monochromatic mass distributions with equal component masses and negligible spin. We constructed sets of simulated signals with component masses $m_i \in \{0.2, 0.3, \ldots, 1.0\} M_\odot$ distributed uniformly in distance and uniformly on the sky. We injected 374480 simulated signals into the LIGO data and conducted a gravitational wave search with the same parameters as described earlier. We then calculated our detection efficiency as a function of distance $c_i(r)$. This allowed us to compute the volume-time $\langle VT \rangle$ that was accessible for our search via

$$\langle VT \rangle_i = T \int 4\pi r^2 c_i(r) dr,$$

where $T$ is 48.16 days. We then used the loudest event statistic formalism [50] to compute an upper limit on the binary merger rate in each mass bin to 90% confidence,

$$R_{90,i} = \frac{2.3}{\langle VT \rangle_i}.$$  

We report the upper limits on the binary merger rate in Fig. 2. Several factors in our analysis could lead to uncertainty in

$R_{90}$ at the 25% level, including LIGO calibration errors and Monte Carlo errors. However, these errors are far smaller than potential systematic errors in the models we will be considering in the next section, so we do not attempt to further quantify them in this work.

**Constraint on primordial black holes as dark matter.**—For an assumed model of PBH binary formation, the constraint on the binary merger rate places bounds on the total fraction of dark matter made of primordial black holes, $f$. These bounds are derived from the expected event rate for a uniform distribution of monochromatic PBHs with mass $m_i$ as considered above. The limits on $f$ are sensitive to the model of binary formation. Motivated by previous LIGO searches [9] we follow a method originally proposed by Refs. [51,52] and recently used to constrain $\sim 30 M_\odot$ PBH mergers by Ref. [29].

We assume an initial, early Universe, monochromatic distribution of PBHs. As the Universe expands, the energy density of a pair of black holes not too widely separated becomes larger than the background energy density. The pair decouples from the cosmic expansion and can be prevented from prompt merger by the local tidal field, determined primarily by a third black hole nearest the pair. The initial separation of the pair and the relative location of the primary perturber determine the parameters of the initial binary. From those, the coalescence time can be determined. Assuming a spatially uniform initial distribution of black holes, the distribution of coalescence times for those black holes that form binaries is

$$dP = \begin{cases} \frac{3\pi}{58} \left[ f^2 \left( \frac{1}{T^2} \right)^2 - \left( \frac{1}{T^2} \right) \right] \frac{1}{T}, & t < t_c \\ \frac{3\pi}{58} \left[ f^2 \left( \frac{1}{T^2} \right)^2 - \left( \frac{1}{T^2} \right) \right] \frac{1}{T}, & t \geq t_c \end{cases},$$

where $t_c$ is a function of the mass of the PBHs and the fraction of the dark matter they comprise:

$$t_c = \frac{3}{170} \frac{c^5}{(Gm_i)^{5/3}} \left( \frac{f^2}{1 + z_{eq}} \right)^4 \left( \frac{8\pi}{3H_0^2\Omega_{DM}} \right)^{4/3}.$$  

This expression is evaluated at the time today $t_0$, then multiplied by $n_{BH}$ the current average number density of PBHs, to get the model event rate [29]:

$$R_{\text{model}} = n_{BH} \frac{dP}{dt} \bigg|_{t=t_0}.$$
parameters, they provide a conservative estimate of not to take into account other effects on the binary range we consider. The mass distributions of PBHs this effect is small in the mass research, though it appears that for the expected narrow formation as well as the mass distribution of PBHs. The effect of this imbalance on the predicted merger rate has not been quantified. We also stress that our present results do not rule out an extended mass function that peaks below 0.2 \( M_\odot \) and extends all the way to LIGO’s currently detected systems or above 30 \( M_\odot \). Each model would have to be explicitly checked by producing an expected binary merger rate density that could be integrated against Advanced LIGO and Advanced Virgo search results. Extensions to more general distributions have already been considered in the literature.

The first two areas of future work are computational challenges. Lowering the minimum mass and including spin effects in the waveform models could easily increase the computational cost of searching for sub-solar-mass ultracompact objects by an order of magnitude each, which would be beyond the capabilities of present LIGO data grid resources.

Advanced LIGO and Advanced Virgo have not reached their final design sensitivities. The distance to which Advanced LIGO will be sensitive to the mergers of ultracompact binaries in this mass range should increase by a factor of 3 over the next several years. Furthermore, at least a factor of 10 more data will be available than what were analyzed in this work. These two facts combined imply that the merger rate constraint should improve by \( \geq 2 \) orders of magnitude in the coming years.

The authors gratefully acknowledge the support of the United States National Science Foundation (NSF) for the construction and operation of the LIGO Laboratory and Advanced LIGO as well as the Science and Technology Facilities Council (STFC) of the United Kingdom, the Max-Planck-Society (MPS), and the State of Niedersachsen/Germany for support of the construction of Advanced LIGO and construction and operation of the GEO600 detector. Additional support for Advanced LIGO was provided by the Australian Research Council. The authors gratefully acknowledge the Italian Istituto Nazionale di Fisica Nucleare (INFN), the French Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique (CNRS), and the Foundation for

---

**FIG. 3.** Constraints on the fraction of dark matter composed of primordial black holes for monochromatic distributions \( f = \Omega_{PBH}/\Omega_{DM} \). Shown in black are the results for the nine mass bins considered in this search. For this model of primordial black hole formation, LIGO finds constraints tighter than those of the MACHO Collaboration [58] for all mass bins considered and tighter than the EROS Collaboration [59] for \( m_1 \in (0.7, 1.0) M_\odot \). The limits presented here also improve upon other constraints at this mass [60]. The curves shown in this figure are digitizations of the original results from Refs. [58,59,61,62]. We use the Planck ‘TT, TE, EE + lowP + lensing + ext’ cosmology [63].
Fundamental Research on Matter supported by the Netherlands Organisation for Scientific Research, for the construction and operation of the Virgo detector and the creation and support of the EGO consortium. The authors also gratefully acknowledge research support from these agencies as well as by the Council of Scientific and Industrial Research of India, the Department of Science and Technology, India, the Science & Engineering Research Board (SERB), India, the Ministry of Human Resource Development, India, the Spanish Agencia Estatal de Investigación, the Vicepresidencia y Conselleria d’Innovació, Recerca i Turisme and the Conselleria d’Educació i Universitat del Govern de les Illes Balears, the Conselleria d’Educació, Investigació, Cultura i Esport de la Generalitat Valenciana, the National Science Centre of Poland, the Swiss National Science Foundation (SNSF), the Russian Foundation for Basic Research, the Russian Science Foundation, the European Commission, the European Regional Development Funds (ERDF), the Royal Society, the Scottish Funding Council, the Scottish Universities Physics Alliance, the Hungarian Scientific Research Fund (OTKA), the Lyon Institute of Origins (LIO), the Paris Île-De-France Region, the National Research, Development and Innovation Office Hungary (NKFI), the National Research Foundation of Korea, Industry Canada and the Province of Ontario through the Ministry of Economic Development and Innovation, the Natural Science and Engineering Research Council Canada, the Canadian Institute for Advanced Research, the Brazilian Ministry of Science, Technology, Innovations, and Communications, the International Center for Theoretical Physics South American Institute for Fundamental Research (ICTP-SAIFR), the Research Grants Council of Hong Kong, the National Natural Science Foundation of China (NSFC), the Leverhulme Trust, the Research Corporation, the Ministry of Science and Technology (MOST), Taiwan and the Kavli Foundation. The authors gratefully acknowledge the support of the NSF, STFC, MPS, INFN, CNRS and the State of Niedersachsen/Germany for provision of computational resources. Funding for this project was provided by the Charles E. Kaufman Foundation of The Pittsburgh Foundation. Computing resources and personnel for this project were provided by the Pennsylvania State University. This Letter has been assigned the document number LIGO-P1800158-v13.

[38] C. Kouvaris, P. Tinyakov, and M. H. G. Tytgat, Non-prrimordial solar mass black holes,


PHYSICAL REVIEW LETTERS 121, 231103 (2018)
159 King’s College London, University of London, London WC2R 2LS, United Kingdom
160 Indian Institute of Technology, Gandhinagar Ahmedabad Gujarat 382424, India
161 Indian Institute of Technology Hyderabad, Sangareddy, Khandi, Telangana 502285, India
162 International Institute of Physics, Universidade Federal do Rio Grande do Norte, Natal RN 59078-970, Brazil
163 Villanova University, 800 Lancaster Ave, Villanova, Pennsylvania 19085, USA
164 Andrews University, Berrien Springs, Michigan 49104, USA
165 Università di Siena, I-53100 Siena, Italy
166 Trinity University, San Antonio, Texas 78212, USA
167 Van Swinderen Institute for Particle Physics and Gravity, University of Groningen, Nijenborgh 4, 9747 AG Groningen, Netherlands
168 Colorado State University, Fort Collins, Colorado 80523, USA
169 The Pennsylvania State University, University Park, Pennsylvania 16802, USA

† Deceased.
‡ Corresponding author.lsc-spokesperson@ligo.org, virgo-spokesperson@ego-gw.it