

1-2020

Feminist Action Against Pornography in Japan: Unexpected Success in an Unlikely Place

Caroline Norma

Royal Melbourne Institute of Technology University, caroline.norma@rmit.edu.au

Seiya Morita

Kokugakuin University, fs_tr_mrt@yahoo.co.jp

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalcommons.uri.edu/dignity>



Part of the Asian Studies Commons, Civic and Community Engagement Commons, Community-Based Research Commons, Courts Commons, Criminal Law Commons, Criminology Commons, Domestic and Intimate Partner Violence Commons, Gender and Sexuality Commons, Human Rights Law Commons, Inequality and Stratification Commons, Law and Gender Commons, Law and Society Commons, Legal Remedies Commons, Politics and Social Change Commons, Sexuality and the Law Commons, Social Control, Law, Crime, and Deviance Commons, and the Social Work Commons

Recommended Citation

Norma, Caroline and Morita, Seiya (2020) "Feminist Action Against Pornography in Japan: Unexpected Success in an Unlikely Place," *Dignity: A Journal of Analysis of Exploitation and Violence*: Vol. 4: Iss. 4, Article 4. <https://doi.org/10.23860/dignity.2019.04.04.04>

This Research and Scholarly Article is brought to you by the University of Rhode Island. It has been accepted for inclusion in Dignity: A Journal of Analysis of Exploitation and Violence by an authorized editor of DigitalCommons@URI. For more information, please contact digitalcommons-group@uri.edu. For permission to reuse copyrighted content, contact the author directly.

Feminist Action Against Pornography in Japan: Unexpected Success in an Unlikely Place

Abstract

In late 2016 a feminist movement against problems of commercial sexual exploitation, and especially issues of coerced pornography filming, arose in Japan. This article describes the history of this movement as it mobilized to combat human rights violations perpetrated by the country's pornographers. The movement's success came not spontaneously or haphazardly; in fact, it was orchestrated earlier over a full decade-and-a-half by activists who persevered in researching and highlighting pornography's harms in a civil environment of hostility, isolation and social derision, even among progressive groups and individuals. The Anti-Pornography and Prostitution Research Group (APP) was particularly prominent in this history. Its members were inspired and instructed early on by the work of Catharine MacKinnon and Andrea Dworkin in bringing to public attention victims' accounts of pornography's harms in the US from the 1980s, and they attempted to follow this example. The example of feminist anti-pornography activism we described here, therefore, is a case of unlikely political success achieved in an unexpected place (e.g., Japan currently ranks 110th-place in global gender equality league tables), and it is offered in real-world example of MacKinnon's "butterfly" model of radical social change.

Keywords

Japan, feminist, pornography, commercial sexual exploitation, pornographers, harm, movement, social change, Anti-Pornography and Prostitution Research Group, Catharine MacKinnon, Andrea Dworkin, court, legal, "butterfly model"

Creative Commons License



This work is licensed under a [Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-No Derivative Works 4.0 License](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/).

Acknowledgements

The authors acknowledge and thank members of the Anti-Pornography and Prostitution Research Group (APP) and the Organization for Pornography and Sexual Exploitation Survivors (PAPS). Dignity thanks the following people for the time and expertise to review this article: Heather Brunskell-Evans, Visiting Research Fellow, Kings College, London; Rebecca Whisnant, Associate Professor and Director of Women's and Gender Studies Program, University of Dayton, Ohio; and Mary Anne Layden, Director of Education, Center for Cognitive Therapy, Department of Psychiatry, University of Pennsylvania

FEMINIST ACTION AGAINST PORNOGRAPHY IN JAPAN: UNEXPECTED SUCCESS IN AN UNLIKELY PLACE

Caroline Norma

Royal Melbourne Institute of Technology (RMIT), Australia

Seiya Morita

Kokugakuin University, Japan

ABSTRACT

In late 2016 a feminist movement against problems of commercial sexual exploitation, especially issues of coerced pornography filming, arose in Japan. This article describes the history of this movement as it mobilized to combat human rights violations perpetrated by the country's pornographers. The movement's success came not spontaneously or haphazardly; in fact, it was orchestrated earlier over a full decade-and-a-half by activists who persevered in researching and highlighting pornography's harms in a civil environment of hostility, isolation and social derision, even among progressive groups and individuals. The Anti-Pornography and Prostitution Research Group (APP) was particularly prominent in this history. Its members were inspired and instructed early on by the work of Catharine MacKinnon and Andrea Dworkin in bringing to public attention victim accounts of pornography's harms in the US from the 1980s, and they attempted to follow this example. The example of feminist anti-pornography activism described here is a case of unlikely political success achieved in an unexpected place, given that Japan ranks 110th-place in global gender equality league tables out of 150 countries, and it is offered as a real-world example of MacKinnon's "butterfly" model of radical social change.

KEYWORDS

Japan, feminist, pornography, commercial sexual exploitation, pornographers, harm, movement, social change, Anti-Pornography and Prostitution Research Group, Catharine MacKinnon, Andrea Dworkin, court, legal, "butterfly model"

[S]mall actions in a collective context can produce systemic changes. Butterfly politics encourages multidimensional political thinking, precise engagement, principled creativity, imagination, instinct, and adaptability. It inspires interventions, even tiny ones...Equality seekers, spread your wings. You're stronger than you think. You never know what can happen (MacKinnon, 2017, p. 8).

THE #METOO MOVEMENT that emerged in the United States in 2017 to rally against male sexual harassment and assault of women in work, and which continues today in different guises in a number of countries, does not yet encompass those women for whom male sexual harassment and assault is work. Melissa Farley raised the question, "Will we include prostituted women under the #MeToo umbrella as sisters who are both victims of male violence and survivors of

it?” (2018), and Catharine MacKinnon also wrote that the test of the #MeToo movement’s truly transformative nature will be whether or not it leads to men “who outright buy others for sexual use” being “unmasked and penalized as the predators they are” (2019, pp. xxii-xxiii). This failure of #MeToo advocates to understand prostitution and pornography as fundamental blueprints for, and pure forms of, the workplace sexual harassment they campaign against is a critique of the movement by its loyalist friends.

From an international viewpoint, however, these friends possibly judge too harshly. The #MeToo movement in South Korea, for example, campaigns against male celebrities prostituting and pimping women, and this focus has only strengthened since the outbreak of the Burning Sun club scandal in January 2019, which involved male celebrities mediating the prostitution of women through high-end clubs under their ownership (“Police step up probe of Burning Sun club,” 2019). Before this, moreover, from late 2017, South Korea’s feminist movement was animated by the issue of illicitly captured “spy-cam” footage uploaded to a domestically hosted pornography website called Sora.net (Cho, 2014). In other words, the Korean #MeToo movement, which in fact arose earlier than its counterpart in the US when a feminist rally was held to protest a Gangnam railway station femicide in May 2016 (Boroweic, 2016), has, over the course of its development, come to center practices of commercial sexual exploitation in its campaigning. In Korea there exists, therefore, a #MeToo movement that passes some of the test that Farley and MacKinnon wish to see met by movement advocates in the United States.

This Korean precedent for the global #MeToo movement is, of course, well known in the English-speaking feminist world (Kuk, Park & Norma, 2018), and has attracted celebration and journalistic attention in both feminist and mainstream media outlets. Furthermore, it attracts even greater attention among Japanese feminists, for different reasons. In Japan, Korea’s #MeToo movement is of interest as a counterpoint lesson for introspective questioning of what went wrong in the local movement, and why it failed when its Korean counterpart flourished.

Widely lamented is journalist survivor Shiori Ito being forced to flee to England from Japan one year after she emerged to lead the #MeToo movement in late 2017 with the publication of her book-length testimonial of a work-related rape, and subsequent media conferences describing her violent victimization by a high-profile male journalist with links to Japan’s ruling politicians. Ito is now forced, further, to defend a six-figure counter-civil suit brought by her perpetrator (Mishima, 2019; Norma, 2019). Japanese feminists are impressed but confounded at the contrasting success of the Korean #MeToo movement, because they know women in that country endure conditions of patriarchy similar to those in Japan, if not of greater severity.

However, although feminists are not necessarily incorrect to judge Japan’s #MeToo movement as failed, given Shiori Ito’s experience among many other problems, this assessment is possibly another example of friends judging too harshly. Most notably, it overlooks a parallel movement that sprung up in Japan from late 2016 taking a political shape more closely resembling that of the movement in Korea—namely a movement organizing against problems of commercial sexual exploitation, and especially issues of coerced pornography filming and scout-mediated recruitment of homeless young women for entry into sex businesses operating in Japan’s big cities.

In this article we describe this original #MeToo movement mobilizing in Japan from 2016 to combat human rights violations perpetrated by the country's pornographers. Its success came not spontaneously or haphazardly; in fact, it was orchestrated a full decade-and-a-half earlier by activists who persevered in researching and highlighting pornography's harms in a civil environment of hostility, isolation and social derision, even among progressive groups and individuals. The second author of this article was one of these embattled early activists, alongside other members of the Tokyo-based Anti-Pornography and Prostitution Research Group (APP).

Morita and his colleagues were inspired and instructed early on by the work of Catharine MacKinnon and Andrea Dworkin in bringing to public attention victim accounts of pornography's harms in the US from the 1980s (Nakasatomi, 2004), and they attempted to follow this example (MacKinnon & Dworkin, 1998). The example of feminist anti-pornography activism described herein, therefore, is a case of unlikely political success achieved in an unexpected place. It is offered as a real-world example of MacKinnon's "butterfly" model of radical social change, as she articulates in the quote at the beginning of this article, that modest but sustained efforts over nearly two decades to document harms of pornography laid groundwork in Japan for subsequent public outcry following a civil court case heard over the years 2014 and 2015 in which a victim of coerced filming was sued by a pornographer, as will be described. Media reporting of the case prompted other victims of coerced pornography filming to step forward, and their collaboration with feminist activists from 2016 prompted the emergence of Japan's lesser-known, and *more successful*, #MeToo movement against commercial forms of sexual violence against women. This movement continues today, and we suggest it represents an example of 'systemic change' produced through 'small actions in a collective context', as MacKinnon characterizes her "butterfly" theory of politics.

The movement's powerful foe: Japan's pornography industry

Japan's local pornography industry emerged in the 1960s, and by the year 2000 was releasing over 30,000 films a year with an annual turnover of the equivalent of US\$2–4 billion (Morita, 2002). Although, similar to countries elsewhere, annual revenues of Japan's pornography industry today have declined to around fifty billion yen (approximately a half-billion US dollars). As in other countries, the cause of this contraction in the size of the industry is proliferation of freely available pornographic footage on the internet ("Adaruto bideo no shijō kibo [Pornography market size in Japan]," 2019). Now it is estimated 500 young women each year newly fall victim to pornography filming (Poruno/kaishun mondai kenkyū kai, 2016, p. 7).

The pornography industry is dominated by three companies, which together generate most revenue (DMM Group, Soft on Demand, and Prestige). Even child pornography occupies market share, and local English-language journalists comment that Japanese society exercises "surprising tolerance for sexual exploitation of young children as entertainment." As a result, "Japanese 'entrepreneurs' at home and abroad are ... major producers of child pornography in the world market" (Adelstein & Kubo, 2014). Production is mostly local, and one domestic child pornography website between January 2017 and April 2018 generated the equivalent of US\$2.5 million through registering 7200 customers, including primary school teachers, police, and local government officials ("Jidō poruno DVD kounyū no utagai yaku 870-nin wo shorui soken," 2018). The industry's size emerges out

of its near-unregulated status over decades. Even the possession of pornographic products featuring live children was criminalized outright only in 2014 after the selling and buying of these materials was finally banned in 1999 (Watanabe, 2017; Hirayama, 2019).

Even with eventual regulation of these child sexual exploitation crimes, the bulk of Japan's pornography industry today still operates in an environment largely free of government interference, and this has facilitated the emergence of a raft of businesses profiting from the sexual exploitation of, overwhelmingly, young local Japanese women. These businesses include retail outlets encouraging school-aged girls to sell identified items of used clothing, such as underwear and school-uniforms, which are then used to arrange "dates" with sex buyers or are worn as props in pornography filming. There also exist agencies that recruit underage girls (and groom their families) for filming in swimsuits and underwear (called *chakuero*), which operate for the ultimate purpose of ensnaring underage victims for later pornography filming as adults. Some "idol" talent entertainment agencies operate in the same way (Dooley, 2017; Miyake, 2017). In Japan's big cities there are businesses that commission scouts to procure young women to act as non-sexual "companions" for paying male customers, and so facilitate their eventual prostitution through the bribes and badgering these customers wage over months (Human Rights Now, 2016). These so-called "JK" businesses sexually trading underage girls are not rare, and only in 2017 were they legally barred from hiring people under the age of 18 (Kuroki & Iwahashi, 2017). "Maid cafes" and other ventures employing girls are not yet so restricted, and the trading of girls and young women through social media continues, and especially targets underage individuals rendered homeless after fleeing abusive households ("131 'JK business' operators recognized in Japan," 2018).

The normalization, trivialization, and even celebration of local sex industry ventures makes the industry's influence on the mainstream, everyday life of Japanese society substantial and far-reaching. In 2016, the CEO of DMM Group (a man named Kameyama Keishi), one of the country's largest online pornography distribution companies, was invited to speak at Tokyo's prestigious Keio University about, ironically, the "virtues of running a socially responsible business" (Alpeyev, 2017). Not only pornographers but also their products enjoy similar welcome entrée to mainstream spheres of Japanese society: only in August 2019 did 7-Eleven, Lawson and Family Mart (Japan's big three convenience stores) stop selling pornographic magazines ("Sebun to Rōson, seijin hanbai teishi e, hachigatsu madeni," 2019), and only since 2011 had convenience stores in Tokyo been required to restrict the shop-floor display of pornographic products, which include incest, bestiality and other abuse-themed comic books appealing to children. Japan's pornography industry, perhaps even more than the industries of other countries, through products like manga comic books, has enjoyed access to the country's children over decades to cultivate as consumers from an early age.

The Anti-Pornography and Prostitution Research Group (APP) and its early activities

In this context it was unexpected, therefore, when, in 2016, feminists and their activist allies began scoring social and legal wins against Japan's pornographers. Although these victories were sudden, and arose in quick succession, they did not occur spontaneously—they can be traced to groundwork laid from the year 1999 in the form of research and advocacy on the harms of pornography undertaken by the

Anti-Pornography and Prostitution Research Group (APP or Poruno/kaishun mondai kenkyū kai) (Morita, 2010a). This group, whose members continue to play a central role in abolitionist efforts in Japan today, undertook awareness raising and organizing that can be directly linked to the later emergence of collaborative efforts between activists and sex industry survivors to build a movement against so-called “coerced pornography filming” (*kyōjō satsuei*). Some of APP’s campaigns are already described in English by the first author of this chapter (in 2012), and the second author earlier in 2004 wrote a book chapter in English describing broad conditions of commercial sexual exploitation in Japan (Morita, 2004). The next few paragraphs describe in more detail APP’s early work from 1999, which eventually, and quite directly, bore fruit in the form of successful campaigns against coerced pornography filming, as will be later described.

APP commenced its activities by first exposing members to the reality of pornography’s content. The decision to do so was made by APP members who believed that even pornography’s opponents are not necessarily aware of the full range of violence and harm inflicted on victims in its making. Another factor was that pornography popularly circulating in Japan in the 1990s included films openly showing the torture of women; these materials weren’t part of any secretly operating club: they did not circulate underground, and their manufacturers were not especially concerned about legal repercussion. On the contrary, the products were sold openly. The materials were representative of Japan’s pornography industry of the 1990s as much as “soft” pornography might have been. Accordingly, in 2000, APP partnered with the Tokyo Women’s Foundation to hold a screening of one film in a notorious series called *Nyohan (Woman-Fucking)* produced by a man called Baksheesh Yamashita. His films show women enduring all manner of abuses, including detention over whole days and nights, gang rape, dragging around by the hair, and kicking, punching and inducement to vomit. Importantly, the *Nyohan* series was not a black-market, unknown pornographic product: both the series and its producer had been praised in mainstream Japanese media like AERA (a liberal weekly magazine published by Asahi Shimbun) and by high-profile public intellectuals like Shinji Miyadai. APP members gave a 40-minute verbal briefing before the screening to warn audience members of the intensity and atrocity of the content to be shown, and a “break-out” room was prepared with refreshments for those needing time out. Around 80 people attended the screening event (Poruno/kaishun mondai kenkyū kai, 2001).

Although not comparable to the suffering endured by victims, APP and audience members experienced significant distress watching the film, and the psychological shock of its contents affected many on a personal level for years thereafter. Nonetheless, through the screening, they were able to “find out about the reality of what was being done to women in violent pornography that many people have tried to conceal,” so that they could “summon determination to tackle the problem” (Morita, 2011, p. 6). Indeed, exposure to the film afterwards prompted APP members to write a number of research articles documenting the series’ contents and aspects of their production. These were published in the 2001 second edition of the group’s journal (called *APP Journal: Ronbun/shiryō-shū*). This publication was the beginning of APP’s research efforts against Japan’s torture pornographers, and subsequent research drew on interviews with staff involved in the production of the films (Poruno/kaishun mondai kenkyū kai, 2008), and an interview with a female reporter who had attended a pornography filming set where police were called (Poruno/kaishun mondai kenkyū kai, 2007b).

Around this time, in 2004, arrests were made in Tokyo of eight men working for a torture pornography production company called Bakky Visual Planning (Poruno/kaishun mondai kenkyū kai, 2004; Yamamoto, Norma & Dep Weerasinghe, 2018). A total of ten men involved with the company were eventually convicted of injurious assault, forcible rape and other crimes in Japan's courts. These convictions were pursued over a film series made in 2003 that had inflicted injuries on a woman that required a month's hospitalization. APP members even before these arrests had campaigned to expose the company's crimes, and so were able to lodge a statement with the court at the time the case was heard. In December 2007, its managing producer (who had not been on the film set) received an 18-year prison sentence for crimes of aggravated rape, criminal conspiracy, and association. The series made in 2003 had involved women being detained for periods of three days, during which time they were gang raped, bashed, forced to ingest large volumes of liquid to the point of being unable to breathe, and brought close to drowning in bathtubs. Victims were shown begging for filming to stop, but their pleas were ignored. The criminal conviction of these pornographers was a small victory for Japan's anti-pornography movement, even if films comprising evidence of their crimes continued to be sold online to pornography consumers. APP members subsequently campaigned over years for their removal from sale, but they remain available online to the current day. Bakky Visual Planning changed its company name to collector-web.com after the arrest of its staff and continued selling its films through this newly named website.

Although APP's early activism focused on Japan's torture pornographers and their products, not long after its formation, in 2001, the organization received a grant-in-aid for scientific research from the Japan Society for the Promotion of Science to survey pornography's role in gender-based violence. This funded research surveyed 2500 lawyers, social workers and counsellors about their experience of hearing clients or people in their care disclose harms involving pornography, with an eventual response rate of 311 returned surveys. These results uncovered an astounding range of ways in which pornography is used against victims, including revenge pornography, spy-cam filming, child abuse facilitation, and pornographic "mash-up" collages that facilitate blackmail and extortion (Poruno/kaishun mondai kenkyū kai, 2003). Comprehensive and wide-ranging, the research empirically captured the impact that pornography was having on women and children in Japanese society at the turn of the century, which included harms additional those arising for filmed victims. The research was published in the 2003 edition of APP's journal. Notably, similarly large empirical studies of pornography's far-reaching social impacts did not emerge in English-language scholarship until a decade later, even if Catharine MacKinnon and Andrea Dworkin's taxonomy of pornography's harms in their model ordinance comprises an early blueprint for research (MacKinnon & Dworkin, 1988). APP's early ground-breaking research established an empirical base for the group's activities thereafter, which were pursued on a range of fronts relating to the commercial sexual exploitation of women in Japan.

Anti-Pornography and Prostitution Research Group's empirical research of pornography's harms

Following their investigation of pornography's social impacts, over two months in 2006 APP members ran an online and paper-based survey of men's views of pornography and the sexual behaviors it promoted. The group secured more than

850 valid responses to survey questions, mostly from online respondents. Along with these answers, over the duration of the survey period they also received a stream of abusive emails and postings to the group's website about the research project. Most of these questioned its assumed link between men's pornography consumption and their sexual behavior. There were also messages of protest at the existence of APP itself. "Anti-pornography proponents, including those against child pornography, should move to China or North Korea!" one wrote, for example (Poruno/kaishun mondai kenkyū kai, 2007a).

The survey enquired as to the kinds of pornography respondents watched, and why; whether they believed pornography affected the way they viewed women; and whether they had enacted, or wanted to enact, any of the sex acts they had seen in pornography (and which ones). Among other findings, nine percent of respondents (with a slightly lower percentage recorded for the larger cohort responding to the online survey) had enacted or wanted to enact rapes they had seen in pornography. Although this figure appears small, it likely reflects a tip of an iceberg of men violently influenced by pornography, given that the APP web-based survey was actively targeted by pornography users online who attempted to skew its findings through bulk submissions. Even with this methodological limitation, the research still indicated a not insubstantial number of respondents harboring views of rape influenced by pornography. In reporting this finding, APP members reminded readers that, supposing there were 30 million pornography users in Japan (the country had a population of roughly 128 million at the time), then the figure of nine percent represents between two and three million men living in the country who, as a result of pornography usage, had, or were willing to, rape women (Poruno/kaishun mondai kenkyū kai, 2007a, p. 27).

As part of another empirical project investigating social impacts of pornography undertaken around the same time, over the years 2005 and 2006 APP members took site surveys of managers, administrators and other staff overseeing venues that were widely recognized as hot-spots in Japan for spy-cam filming. This filming is usually undertaken for uploading to pornography websites and involves capturing footage of women without their knowledge in places like toilets and hotel rooms. APP's survey aimed to gauge the extent to which mainstream businesses were aware of problems of spy-cam filming, and the nature of measures they had taken to tackle the problem. Over two years APP members surveyed a total of 47 venues, including department stores, hotels and public bathhouses, and asked whether staff had ever become aware of spy-cam footage having been taken onsite at their business, whether they knew of the miniature size of the spy-cam equipment used by perpetrators, and of the filming strategies and techniques they were using, and whether they were aware of proposed government regulations that would oblige businesses to take action to prevent spy-cam filming of customers. APP members found high levels of awareness of the problem of spy-cam filming among commercial businesses, but very few efforts being made towards preventing it (Nakasatomi, 2007). Notable is that APP members undertook this research more than a decade prior to the large-scale feminist rallies held in Seoul over 12 months in 2018 that protested spy-cam filming at similar commercial venues in South Korea (see Kuk, Park & Norma, 2018).

Over the course of the spy-cam project, APP members were able to inform business owners and proprietors about tricks and techniques used by spy-cam film perpetrators because of research previously undertaken by APP member Yukino Yamamoto. This research was later published in the 2007 edition of the group's

journal (Yamamoto, 2007). In it, Yamamoto harvested data from Internet chat forums for spy-cam film fans (including producers of the footage). Her analysis of postings to these forums uncovered information about where and how perpetrators were organizing their crimes, and their self-stated motivations for producing spy-cam pornography. Yamamoto concluded that perpetrators gained a sense of satisfaction at being able to control women by producing footage of them taken without their permission. Posters to the online forums appeared to derive pleasure also from the idea that women and their families would be hurt and shamed upon discovering online films taken of them.

APP members undertook these kinds of empirical research projects on the social impacts of pornography while concurrently organizing public awareness campaigns about products like rape-themed computer games (Poruno/kaishun mondai kenkyū kai, 2004), and *chakuero* sexualised films of underage girls (Poruno/kaishun mondai kenkyū kai, 2009). They also undertook large volumes of translation of English-language radical feminist texts, including of pieces by Catharine MacKinnon, John Stoltenberg, Andrea Dworkin, Robin Morgan, and other radical feminists and abolitionists (Poruno/kaishun mondai kenkyū kai, 2000; 2002; 2005; 2019).

Protest actions, auditing a court case, and theoretical activity

These activities were, furthermore, periodically accompanied by protest actions against pornographers and their supporters. In 2007, for example, APP members attempted to expose and publicly shame the children's book publisher Rironsha (founded in 1947) for having commissioned the earlier-mentioned pornographer Baksheesh Yamashita to author a title in a book series targeted at junior high-school students. Yamashita was invited to write the "sex-ed" edition of the series, titled *Hito wa minna hadaka ni naru* [*Everyone ends up naked*], but, rather than information about sexual health and reproductive rights, his discussion tutored readers in the business of pornography (Yamashita, 2007; Tsuji, 2001). Although Rironsha had long been known as a progressive children's book publisher in Japan, its editors took a hostile and contemptuous attitude to protestors who attempted to enter into discussions with the company about the book's publication (Morita, 2009).

APP members were alerted to the existence of the book by the activists mentioned above who were working at the time as facility directors within Japan's women's shelter network. These senior social workers became involved with the APP because their facilities had historically operated in service of women leaving Japan's sex industry after the enactment of the 1958 *Prostitution Prevention Law*. Significantly, they approached APP to understand how they should respond to the pro-prostitution arguments of "sex work" proponents who were becoming politically influential in Japan around this time. Although the 1958 law and shelter network were never perfectly conceived from a feminist anti-prostitution perspective, they nonetheless operated to assist women to leave and stay out of Japan's sex industry, even if on a much-reduced scale by the 1990s. The collaboration of these facility directors with APP members in campaigning against Rironsha led, later on, in 2009, to the creation of another anti-pornography group, People Against Sexual Violence and Pornography (PAPS), made up of activists, researchers and practitioners whose activities extended beyond APP's focus on research and education to sustained grassroots campaigning (such as that against Rironsha and the Mori

Art Museum) and a range of public relations activities (see PAPS, 2013; Morita, 2014).

Other APP activities around this time included auditing a long-running court case in Fukushima city relating to a series of rapes perpetrated in 2001 by a 16-year-old boy who broke into women's homes and raped, bashed, and tied them up. The boy victimized 30 different women over a one-year period in this way. A total of 130 pornographic films and 210 pornographic texts were found in his bedroom at the time of his arrest, and he testified in court that the films, all featuring women being raped, had inspired him to commit the crimes (Nihei, 2004). Acquiring the pornography is not likely to have been difficult for him, even 20 years ago when he perpetrated the crimes. In his 1999 monograph APP co-founder Sugita Satoshi notes that 60-70% of pornography on sale in second hand video/DVD shops in Japan at the time he was writing comprised films of women being raped. This early development in Japan of an environment of commercial sexual exploitation and violence, in the context of which boys as well as men became consumers, perhaps explains the emergence of APP a whole decade prior to any similar feminist anti-pornography organization developing elsewhere abroad.

APP members, especially Nakasatomi and Morita, in addition to undertaking empirical research and translating the texts of western feminists, have themselves produced theoretical works. These include a categorization and analysis of various porn-harms, an elucidation of the politics of pornography and rape, a criticism of the free speech defense of pornography, and a critique of sex work theory (Morita, 2000; Morita, 2002; Nakasatomi, 2007a; Nakasatomi, 2008; Morita, 2009; Nakasatomi, 2010a; Nakasatomi 2010b; Morita, 2010a; Morita, 2010b; Morita, 2010d; Morita, 2010e; Yamamoto, 2010; Morita, 2011; Morita, 2012; Morita, 2014; Nakasatomi, 2016; Morita, 2016; Nakasatomi, 2019; Morita, 2019).

The inspiration and perspective that APP members brought to their research and theorizing was guided by voluminous reading and translating of Catharine MacKinnon's work. One member, the lawyer who assisted a victim to bring Japan's first ever sexual harassment case to the courts in 1999, Yukiko Tsunoda, had earlier studied under MacKinnon's guidance in the US. Members Morita and Nakasatomi undertook major translations of MacKinnon's work, including *Women's Lives, Men's Laws*, which was published in Japanese in 2011. By 2002, the pair had already translated MacKinnon's *Pornography and Civil Rights*, which she wrote with Andrea Dworkin in 1988, and, after publication of this translation, APP sponsored MacKinnon to visit Tokyo in 2002 where she gave a presentation and answered questions in front of an audience of around 50 participants, including APP members. One memorable aspect of this question and answer session was MacKinnon's response to an audience member question about recommended future steps for APP. Her answer emphasized the need to attract support and cooperation from sex industry survivors:

The main difficulty in working with the survivors is, I think, that they find you and you find them, that you find each other. So that they are "us," it is not "them and "us," it is just, "us, together." And my experience is that...if you have something actually to offer them, then you have no trouble with them finding you, and working together.¹

¹ In Japanese, MacKinnon's speech and question and answer session are translated and published as Poruno/kaishun mondai kenkyū kai, Kyasarin Makkinon to kataru: porunogurafi to baibaishun [In

At the time MacKinnon gave this advice, APP had not yet established networks among survivors. But members took MacKinnon's advice to heart, as their activities 10 years later attest. These are described further below.

Anti-Pornography and Prostitution Research Group and its collaborating groups

Domestically, APP members maintained networks among women's groups organizing against sexual violence, even if there existed no other group in Japan like APP undertaking research and campaigning specifically against Japan's sex industry. Among these collaborating groups was the Violence Against Women in War Research Action Center (VAWW-RAC), which hosted APP members including Nakasatomi and Morita early on to speak about pornography, and, later, in 2016, Setsuko Miyamoto, a founding member of PAPS, to speak about her recently published book about Japan's sex industry (Miyamoto, 2016). Cooperation with VAWW-RAC was significant for the dissemination of an anti-sex industry perspective among women's groups in Japan because VAWW-RAC members were primarily involved in research and campaigning in support of the former 'comfort women' military sexual slavery victims, rather than abolitionist activities. In turn, APP members like Morita contributed to scholarship and campaigning on the topic of wartime sexual slavery from an anti-prostitution perspective (see Morita, 1999; 2017). Over three issues between the years 2014 and 2015, VAWW-RAC's newsletter *Vaurakku Tsūshin* carried articles by Morita about the harms of pornography and sexual violence (Morita, 2014-2015).

The Osaka-based Sei-bōryoku wo yurusanai onna no kai [Osaka Women Against Sexual Assault] also peripherally supported APP's activities, and this group had long beforehand maintained a radical feminist and abolitionist stance. Further, APP members later worked with the Osaka-based SEAN ("Self-empowerment Action Network") and some Christian groups such as YWCA-Nagoya. In 2005 the former group, SEAN, invited APP members to an event at the Dawn Centre to discuss pornography and the sexualization of children (Poruno/kaishun mondai kenkyū kai, 2007c), and, in 2016, Seiya Morita gave a lecture on the relationship of hate speech and pornography at a SEAN public meeting in Osaka. In 2011, YWCA-Nagoya held a symposium together with APP in Nagoya to discuss the social influences of pornography.

But the most significant organization connected to APP emerged as the group entered its 10th year, and this organization effectively now operates as a sister organization to APP with substantial overlap of membership. People Against Pornography and Sexual Violence (PAPS; now known as the Organization for Pornography and Sexual Exploitation Survivors), mentioned above, was launched in 2009 as a broad group of researchers, practitioners and activists cooperating to carry out activities beyond the mainstay focus of APP's research and education.

Early on, between the years 2009-2012 the organization held a series of four symposia, on topics relating to commercial sexual exploitation, especially that of children. The first on the "Harms of Pornography and the Human Rights of Women and Children" was held in October 2009. The second held in November 2010 was titled "Pornography's Harms and Child Poverty: Child Sexuality at Risk,"

conversation with Catharine MacKinnon: pornography and prostitution], Tokyo: Fuma Shobo, 2003. However, her quoted words here are taken from an English-language recording of the event on file with the second author.

and a third symposium in November 2011 discussed “Sexual Harm in the Everyday Lives of Children: at School, on the Street, and in Institutions.” A final symposium, held in October 2012, included a presentation on Australia’s sex industry by the first author, and was titled “Globally Spreading Harms of Prostitution: Reports from Australia, South Korea and Japan.” The conferences, each held in Tokyo, attracted between 120 and 200 audience members, and presented a yearly opportunity for women’s and child-rights groups to cooperate. PAPS continued its activities after the conclusion of the symposium series, and, now, 10 years after its founding, runs services for victims of coerced pornography filming, as will now be described.

Japan’s regulation of the sex industry and its inadequacy

PAPS emerged during a period of rising concern in Japanese society about the activities of the country’s sex industry, and particularly those affecting children. The Tokyo metropolitan government in 2005 had amended its public nuisance regulations to outlaw the activities of street-based scouts who solicit young women for contracting with “talent” or nude modelling agencies. Then, again, in June 2010, a raft of amendments to local regulations (*Seishōnen kenzen ikusei jyōrei kaiseian*) were proposed to strengthen city efforts protecting youth from pornographic manga comic book exposure (Morita, 2010c). The revised ordinance was passed with amendments the following year at the Tokyo Metropolitan Assembly in 2011. However, the passing of a proposed amendment to restrict the display in convenience stores of pornographic manga magazines favorably depicting sex crimes like rape was delayed because of public opposition, not only from defenders of Japan’s graphically animated pornography industry, but also from famous manga artists, the publishers union, the Tokyo lawyers association, the chairman of the Japan Federation of Bar Associations, the Democratic Party of Japan, the Social Democratic Party, the Japan Communist Party, and editors of the leftist magazine *Shukan Kinyōbi*. While ECPAT Japan and UNICEF Japan supported the proposed restriction, APP and PAPS members were the only people to speak out publicly in support of it, and in fact argued it didn’t go far enough, because it required merely the in-shop zoning of materials, rather than their ban (Morita, 2010c). Although restrictions on the display of pornographic manga magazines were eventually enacted in Tokyo in 2011 with the backing of the ruling LDP/Kōmeitō coalition party, in 2019 convenience stores independently agreed to remove the materials from their outlets in advance of the 2020 summer Olympics. Ironically, this wholesale change provoked no comment from any of the liberal groups who, just seven years earlier, had opposed even modest shop display restrictions.

By November 2018 six of Japan’s prefectures had enacted ordinances against the procurement of naked digital photographs from children. Japan’s child pornography law (1999) does not yet criminalize such soliciting behavior, and so prefectural government ordinances were needed to tackle the crime’s perpetration (‘Seiteki na jiga dori ni bassoku: ken jōrei kaisei e (Kumamoto-ken)’, 2018), which had escalated along with advances in technology. Before this, in July 2017, the Tokyo Metropolitan Assembly had passed an ordinance prohibiting girls under the age 18 from working in sugar daddy-type businesses and requiring these so-called “JK” (*joshi kokoōsei* or high-school girl) businesses register their employee rosters with the city’s public safety commission (United States Department of State, 2018). These so-called “JK” businesses operate to facilitate the trading of young or under-age women to men for “dates,” “companionship,” “city strolls,” and other activities

that establish a ruse for customers to bribe young women for prostitution. Like pornography agencies, the businesses make use of street-based scouts who offer assistance to homeless girls wandering around Tokyo, often in the form of apartment housing from which they eventually cannot escape (“Shōjo tachi wa naze “kawareta” noka: jidō kaishun no higai uttaeru kikakuten 12-gatsu 1-2-nichi ni Chiba de’, 2018). These businesses arose as a focus of attention of the United Nation’s special envoy on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography during her fact-finding mission to Japan in 2015, and the 2018 Trafficking in Persons Report of the U.S. State Department similarly shines a light on them for harboring “girls subjected to labor and sex trafficking” (U.S. Department of State, 2018).

Whether enacted through municipal regulation or case law, however, the real-world effect of such restrictions on child sexual exploitation in Japan in the first decade of the twenty-first century was undoubtedly minimal. More substantial efforts to discourage male sexual demand for the prostitution and exploitation of young women and underage girls remain mostly untried, and enforcement continues to be patchy with inadequate training of police and the judiciary. As described next, however, the public emergence of survivors of coerced pornography filming, supported by the advocacy and research of groups like APP and PAPS, has brought some improvement to this situation.

The emergence of survivors and the development of public awareness

Survivors were not a substantial part of Japan’s feminist anti-pornography movement at the time of APP’s founding in 1999. PAPS in its early years, too, between 2009 and 2011, was approached for assistance by only a small number of victims. In fact, both PAPS and Lighthouse, a Tokyo-based anti-trafficking NGO, had each assisted just one victim of the pornography industry in each of the years 2012 and 2013. However, this number jumped to 40 cases in 2014, to 111 in 2016 and by 2018 increasing to 126 consultations. Victims approached the two organizations seeking assistance for problems relating to coercive filming contracts, as well as illicitly circulating pornographic footage on the internet that they wished to see removed. PAPS now maintains an English-language website (<https://www.en.paps.jp/>), holds yearly stakeholder meetings, and lobbies overseas internet service providers to take down Japanese pornography produced using coerced victims.

One cause of this sudden escalation in activity by organizations like PAPS was the decision in 2015 of the Tokyo-based NGO Human Rights Now (HRN) to commission PAPS and Lighthouse to supply research for a report on coerced pornography filming to be released the following year. This research comprised examples of stories of victims who approached the organizations for assistance with problems arising in the pornography and sex industries. As will be discussed, victims of coerced pornography filming had begun to approach PAPS in large number from 2014 when media reported on a civil court case involving a pornographer suing a young woman for breach of contract. The defendant’s lawyer, Kazuko Ito, who founded HRN, posted details of the case to social media (Poruno/kaishun mondai kenkyū kai, 2016). The report that HRN subsequently released on the problem of coerced pornography filming (Human Rights Now, 2016), which drew heavily on case studies reported by PAPS staff, was also widely reported in Japan’s media.

The publication of this report promoted mainstream interest in the problem of coerced pornography filming, and much subsequent reportage focused on the tactics of pornographers in forcing victims to continue participating in the filming of whole series of productions on the basis of “contracts” signed with dispatch “talent” agencies. The HRN report described agency staff using threats, deceit, harassment, and violence against young women to force their continued acquiescence to filming, even while victims were self-harming and threatening suicide. It further described techniques of control exercised by pornographers over victims, which included installing them in apartments, raping them if they approached agency staff asking to be freed from filming contracts, and inducing them to undergo plastic surgery so they would be saddled with debt trapping them in filming. Survivor “Kurumin Aroma” became prominent in the subsequent HRN campaign against coerced pornography filming after the release of the report in 2016, and she was eventually followed by other survivors, including Saki Otsuka, Saki Kōzai, Asuka Hoshino, Nozomi Asō, and Yuri Komuro. They, even if not all advocating an abolitionist approach to Japan’s sex industry, publicly talked about their own experiences of being victimized. For example, Kōzai was coerced into pornography filming after eight months of grooming by a producer from 2010, and some of the resulting footage, across the 50 films made, shows her crying through the filmed abuses. She was then pimped by the same producer from 2012 (“Ima demo furas-shu bakku ni nayamasareru”, *sennō no kako wo kataru*, 2016).

The issue of coerced pornography filming had reached such levels of public attention by 2017 that even mainstream organizations began to investigate it. In November 2017 the NPO consumer rights organization Shōhisha Kikō Nippon began researching the issue, and, in early April 2018, submitted a list of corrective demands to a Tokyo-based pornography production company called Arushe. These included the demand that the company desist from tricking women into signing contracts through verbal promises that they would never be publicly exposed or have their names revealed as a result of pornography filming. The NGO further insisted that the company’s practice of having agency staff teams collectively pressure young women to sign filming contracts be stopped, and tactics of physical and psychological intimidation to prevent non-compliance by women ended. The NGO further raised the issue of recruitment scouts who did not necessarily declare their true intentions to the young women they were soliciting. On this basis, Shōhisha Kikō Nippon (Consumers Organization of Japan, COJ) called for the banning of scouts, and for the introduction of an 8-day “cooling off” period for women signing pornography filming contracts. Further, it called for commonplace ‘promotional’ shots taken of women at the time of registration with agencies to be undertaken fully clothed and not topless (Shōhisha Kikō Nippon, 2017).

Pornographers in Japan’s courts

As previously mentioned, the turning point in public awareness and official action against Japan’s pornographers occurred when the media reported on a civil court case in 2014 against a young woman coerced into pornography filming. The Tokyo District Court’s September 2015 decision against the plaintiff pornographer (technically, a dispatch agency), and in favor of his victim, represented a watershed shift in judicial approach to the issue of commercial sexual exploitation in Japan. The verdict was the first example of a court ruling that gave victims of coerced filming and their supporters hope that they would be able to stand up to pornog-

raphy agencies in breaking filming agreements without incurring penalties for contract cancellation or suffering contractual obligations of specified performance of duties.

The defendant in the case had originally, as a high school student, been recruited by a scout at a train station on the ruse she would eventually be able to work in Japan's entertainment industry if she first did some modelling. Like many girls in Japan, she had dreamed of a life as an entertainer since she was young. After being taken back to the office of a "talent dispatch" agency, she ended up signing a lengthy contract she didn't fully read, and which wasn't explained to her. At that point she was still underage, so the contract did not specify any overt requirements of pornography filming. Nonetheless, she wasn't given a copy of it, and no co-signing of the contract by an adult guardian was sought or obtained. Afterwards she thought she had signed up for entertainment industry work, but the job assignments she received all involved wearing skimpy bathing costumes, posing in sexualized ways, and making sexualized gestures. Films of her in such circumstances were made and sold while she was still an adolescent. A short while later she told agency staff she no longer wanted to do the work, but this drew threats of the equivalent of US\$9,000 in breach-of-contract fees and the prospect of having her parents contacted. As a result, she continued the work, and a few more films were made of her. Once reaching 18 years of age, she was then coerced into pornography filming. Again, now as an adult, she expressed a desire to quit, but was again threatened by agency staff with breach-of-contract fees. Her later published comment in the media recalled that:

people in the porn industry were the smoothest talkers you could ever imagine, and practically brainwashed me through threats and through saying that appearing in pornography was good. And the fees for breaching my contract just went up and up every time I did a film. I was forced into filming in the end because I was pushed into thinking that I'd lose in a court case over breach of contract fees, and would end up being forced to pay them anyway (Poruno/kaishun mondai kenkyū kai, 2016, p. 5).

On the first day of filming she was sexually penetrated by multiple men on set. It was after this film that she was induced to sign a second contract that included provisions for pornography production. After being filmed a second time, she strongly protested to agency staff that she wanted to discontinue, but was threatened, this time with breach-of-contract fees totaling the equivalent of US\$90,000 (10 times the amount first mentioned when she was underage and wanting to leave the agency). These fees would be imposed, she was told, unless she appeared in another *nine* films.

In a state of despair and desperation, she found the PAPS website and emailed the organization. She met with PAPS/APP member Kazuna Kanajiri (who has since become a leading activist in Japan against coerced pornography filming) the next day and was accompanied to a police station to file a report. With assistance she telephoned the agency to declare she would no longer participate in filming. A producer then visited her house that evening and threatened her, even while police were present, and, astoundingly, the police agreed with the producer and proposed the situation be resolved through her performing in "just two more films." With the assistance of a lawyer (Kazuko Ito) introduced through PAPS, a cancellation of

contract letter was sent to the agency, but their astonishing response was to bring a civil suit against the victim for damages of roughly the equivalent of US\$223,000.

As mentioned, fortunately the Tokyo district court in September 2015 ruled against this claim, because the judge deemed the contract signed between the two parties not one of contracting for the services of an agency for representation in the entertainment industry but, rather, one in which the company wholly directed the defendant's work and sent her to filming locations, and so on. There existed no contract between parties of equal standing, in other words, but, rather, a contract between a dominant and a dependent person. Additionally, and importantly, the judge reminded the plaintiff of the fact that, when unavoidable grounds exist, contracts may be legally cancelled.

The 2015 judgement disallowed the enforcement of sex acts against an individual's will, even after signing contracts to appear in pornography that specify breach-of-contract penalties. The court endorsed the view that breach-of-contract fees for the non-performance of sexual acts constituted "unavoidable grounds" upon which an individual could legally and immediately cancel a contract. In adopting this view, the court refused to apply standard legal rules of commercial contract to pornography filming agreements. In other words, the court in practice rejected the "sex work" perspective that regards sexual acts in pornography and prostitution as forms of labor governed by contract (Poruno/kaishun mondai kenkyū kai, 2016).

By the time of the 2015 Tokyo district court case, APP members had long maintained that human sexuality comprises a core component of personhood, and therefore human dignity and autonomy needed to be protected on far stricter grounds than those governing other kinds of labor. Thus, in the case of commercial sexual activity, a person's right to decline participation in sexual acts needs to be strongly upheld (Morita, 2010e, pp. 51-52). The 2015 judgement echoed this view.

Three subsequent court cases further weakened the hand of pornographers in attempting to secure judicial backing for their commercial activities. The first was a June 2016 criminal judgement against a pornographer for violating Japan's labor-dispatch agency law (that is, the law governing the temp-labor industry). The former CEO of an agency called Mark Japan was arrested for violations of the law, and this was significant because Japanese pornography agencies routinely attempt to argue that the agreements signed with victims are not employment contracts but, instead are contracts for representational services as a talent agency (in other words, the contracts put them in the employ of the victim, not the other way around).

Following that case, in September 2017, the website manager of a company called Moemoe Style was fined the equivalent of US\$3000 and sentenced to three years in prison for crimes of coerced pornography filming against multiple victims, but this sentence was wholly suspended. Prosecutors appealed the sentence, and, on 20 October 2017, this time successfully achieved a custodial sentence for the man of two years and six months with a fine of roughly the equivalent of US\$2700. The Tokyo district court ruled, moreover, consistent with the 2015 case, that pornography filming contracts could not be enforced for specific (that is, sexual) performance, and no penalty fees could be imposed to secure such performance (NHK, 2018). In this case, more than 200 female victims, including high school students, had been recruited by the man via his website on the ruse they would become models. He then coerced them into pornography filming and made sure

they were filmed holding up personal identity papers in an effort to make their actions appear voluntary. He perpetrated these crimes over a five-year period during which time the business generated roughly US\$1.5 million in revenues.

Most recently, in December 2018, the Tokyo district court further found another pornographer guilty of breaches of Japan's Employment Security Act relating to the facilitation of harmful work activities and sentenced a 37-year-old man to 18 months' imprisonment, but suspended for four years (Takano, 2018). He had coerced a 19-year-old woman into pornography filming. The impact of the crime on her, unlike his suspended sentence, was lifelong: she quit her university degree in March 2016, soon after the incident occurred, and not even a year after enrolling in April 2015 ("Watashi ga AV shutsuen saserareru madeni okitakoto: hidosugiru kyōyō higai no jittai," 2016).

Government's new actions and the industry's response

Acting on public outcry after the release of the HRN report in early 2016 and building on initiatives pursued by the Kōmeitō party women's committee earlier in the decade against child pornography and pornographic manga products, Japan's ruling coalition party, in a cabinet-endorsed decision in 2016, declared coerced pornography filming a form of violence against women that needed to be prevented and eradicated. Towards this end it announced it would partner with local NGOs to assess the situation and support victim services. By this time the Japan Communist Party (JCP) was not obstructing but ardently endorsing efforts against the sex industry, which represented another small victory for the anti-pornography movement because, as mentioned, the JCP in 2010 had opposed even modest retail regulation of manga pornography. By March 2017, therefore, the government was able to convene a cross-party parliamentary committee that included delegates from all seven of Japan's ministries, as well as all political parties, chaired by Health, Labour and Welfare Minister Katsunobu Katō. The initiative was announced by chief cabinet secretary Yoshihide Suga who designated April a month of harm prevention in relation to both coerced pornography filming and JK businesses ("AV shutsuen kyōyō ni seihu ga kinkyū taisaku e, Suga kanbō chōkan, 'jūdai na jinken shingai'," 2017).

In May 2017 this parliamentary committee announced a raft of measures against the problem that would be implemented across a raft of ministries (including the Ministry of Education, Ministry of Home Affairs, the national police, the Ministry of Justice, and so on, and which would involve strengthened regulation, education, and outreach services. By the end of March, the Ministry of Justice had set up the website, "Is that contract legit?" to assist people involved in Japan's sex industry to understand their rights (Gender Equality Bureau Cabinet Office, 2017). The parliamentary committee, later in November 2017, sponsored a panel symposium in a break-out room of the Diet that gave a speaking platform to representatives of PAPS, HRN, and Lighthouse, as well as survivor leader Kurumin Aroma.

In April 2018 the Gender Equality Bureau Cabinet Office of Japan's national government sponsored a public event led by its director, the then-head of the Bureau, Seiko Noda (who was also Minister of Public Management, Home Affairs, Posts and Telecommunications at the time in the LDP ruling cabinet). She was accompanied by Japan's Minister of Health, Labour and Welfare Katō within whose department the Bureau was located, as well as the mayor of Shibuya district. Hold-

ing a wide protest banner between them, the three officials, accompanied by survivor leader Kurumin Aroma, led a street-based rally against so-called “JK” businesses as well as coerced pornography filming. It was held in the main square of downtown Shibuya in Tokyo, and the officials were joined at the front of the rally by Lighthouse Director Shihoko Fujiwara, and Yumeno Nitō, the head of the street-based outreach organization Colabo. Their rallying cry was “Let’s get rid of it! All sexual exploitation of young women.” Around 130 participants joined the event, and mainstream media outlets covered the story (“AV shutsuen kyōyō: Shibuya de konzetsu uttaeru kyanpēn: higaisha ‘minna mo hitogoto dewa nai,’” 2018).

Japan’s sex industry reacted to new government and public pressure through spokespeople connected to its industry association, obscurely named the “Alliance for the Promotion of Intellectual Property.” These publicists acknowledged that the industry’s former system of self-regulation had not been adequate and committed themselves to taking urgent steps to improve its business practices and promoting industry renewal. Specifically, the industry would commit to 22 action items, including “greater respect of personal autonomy.” The Alliance in August 2016 was served with a list of demands for industry reform by Human Rights Now, which included the demand that penetration no longer take place in pornography production (given the requirement for the mosaic blurring of genitals in pornography already legislated in Japan, HRN argued that penetration could be mimicked, as it had been in domestically produced pornography in previous decades) (Takano, 2018). Unsurprisingly, this suggestion received no response from the Alliance. Further, in 2017 as the problem of coerced pornography filming continued to hold public and government attention, a second sex industry-sponsored “independent” body emerged, this time to promote “ethics” in the industry as an independent “human rights” advisory committee with members comprising lawyers and academics. It is called the AV jinken rinri kiko, or, in English on its website, the AV Human Rights Ethics Organization.

Conclusion

The “butterfly” political effects of efforts in Japan since the late 1990s against the sex industry are astounding for the context in which they occurred—Japan is Asia’s pornography industry hub. There remains, of course, much to be done—the focus of the Japanese government and its agencies continues to be on “coercion” in the sex industry as a source of harm, rather than sexual exploitation itself as requiring eradication to minimize harm. Overturning this misogynistic view—that women can be used in the manufacture of pornography while still having their human rights upheld—is the long-term challenge still facing abolitionists. They face this challenge, however, in large part thanks to the early work of the APP, well-supported by a body of empirical research showing the harms of pornography for filming victims, as well as for women and girls, and men and boys, widely in Japanese society.

For abolitionists abroad, this example of unexpected success against the sex industry in an unlikely place usefully shows outcomes arising from empirical research in terms of later development of direct-outreach groups, and then the subsequent emergence of survivors who collaborate with these groups in campaigning. The crucial role of survivor leadership in public awareness-raising, and in later influencing government, is also clear from the example described here. The butterfly political effects of early APP efforts in creating a body of empirical research and

theoretical critique of the sex industry continue to cause ripples in current-day Japan. As of mid-2019, PAPS and its collaborating groups are cultivating support among parliamentarians of all parties for the tabling of a bill drafted by the groups themselves that heavily curtails the commercial activities of pornographers in the country. This law, if eventually successful, is likely to represent the world's first-ever piece of stand-alone legislation addressing pornography as an industry of harm and of human rights violation. If one day enacted in Japan, it will stand as legal tribute to Catharine MacKinnon and Andrea Dworkin whose work in the 1980s was the inspiration for early efforts of APP members that produced, as MacKinnon theorized 20 years later, a butterfly political phenomenon that can be recognized as Japan's main contribution to the contemporary worldwide #MeToo movement.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The authors acknowledge and thank members of the Anti-Pornography and Prostitution Research Group (APP) and the Organization for Pornography and Sexual Exploitation Survivors (PAPS). *Dignity* thanks the following people for the time and expertise to review this article: Heather Brunskell-Evans, Visiting Research Fellow, Kings College, London; Rebecca Whisnant, Associate Professor and Director of Women's and Gender Studies Program, University of Dayton, Ohio; and Mary Anne Layden, Director of Education, Center for Cognitive Therapy, Department of Psychiatry, University of Pennsylvania.

AUTHOR BIOGRAPHIES

Caroline Norma lectures at the Royal Melbourne Institute of Technology (RMIT) in Melbourne, Australia. She is a member of the Coalition Against Trafficking in Women-Australia (CATWA).

Seiya Morita lectures at the Kokugakuin University in Toyko, Japan. He is a member of the Anti-Pornography and Prostitution Research Group (APP).

RECOMMENDED CITATION

Norma, Caroline and Seiya Morita. (2019). Feminist action against pornography in Japan: Unexpected success in an unlikely place. *Dignity: A Journal of Sexual Exploitation and Violence*. Vol. 4, Issue 4, Article 4.

<https://doi.org/10.23860/dignity.2019.04.04.04> Available at <http://digitalcommons.uri.edu/dignity/vol4/iss4/4>.

REFERENCES

"131"JK business" operators recognized in Japan," *Jiji Press English News Service*, 27 March 2018.

Adelstein, Jake & Kubo, Angela Erika (2014), "Japan's kiddie porn empire: bye-bye?," *Daily Beast*, 3 June, <https://www.thedailybeast.com/japans-kiddie-porn-empire-bye-bye>

Alpeyev, Pavel (2017), "Billionaire porn king reinvents himself as Japan's startup guru," *Bloomberg*, 24 August, <https://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2017-08-23/billionaire-porn-king-reinvents-himself-as-japan-s-startup-guru>

- “AV shutsuen kyōyō ni seihu ga kinkyū taisaku e, Suga kanbō chōkan, “jūdai na jinken shingai” [Japanese government takes emergency measures against coerced AV filming, Suga chief cabinet secretary said “this is a serious human rights violation”],” 21 March 2017, *Huffington Post Japan*, https://www.huffingtonpost.jp/2017/03/21/av-extortion_n_15510798.html [in Japanese].
- “AV shutsuen kyōyō: Shibuya de konzetsu uttaeru kyanpēn: higaisha “minna mo hitogoto dewa nai” [Campaigning in Shibuya against coerced pornography filming: victims say, “it’s not someone else’s problem”],” *Oricon News*, 20 April 2018, <https://www.oricon.co.jp/article/444198/> [in Japanese].
- Borowiec, Steven (2016), “A woman’s slaying in Seoul’s Gangnam district stirs emotions in South Korea,” *Los Angeles Times*, 21 May, <https://www.latimes.com/world/asia/la-fg-south-korea-woman-killed-20160521-snap-story.html>
- Cho, Hannah (2016), “Sora.net: when online conspiracies become a reality,” *Columbia Journal of Transnational Law*, February 15, <http://jtl.columbia.edu/sora-net-when-online-conspiracies-become-a-reality/>
- Dooley, Stacey (2017), “Young sex for sale in Japan,” *BBC Three and Stacey Dooley Investigates*, <https://www.bbc.co.uk/programmes/p04t0h2b>
- Farley, Melissa (2018), “#MeToo must include prostitution,” *Dignity: A Journal on Sexual Exploitation and Violence*, Vol. 3, No. 1, <https://doi.org/10.23860/dignity.2018.03.01.09>
- Gender Equality Bureau Cabinet Office (2017), “Sono keiyaku daijōbu?” [“Is that contract legit?”], http://www.gender.go.jp/policy/no_violence/avjk/index.html [in Japanese].
- Hirayama, Maki (2019), “Developments in information technology and the sexual depression of Japanese youth since 2000,” *International Journal of the Sociology of Leisure*, Vol. 2, Issue 1–2, pp. 95–119, <https://doi.org/10.1007/s41978-019-00034-2>
- Human Rights Now (2016), Poruno to adaruto sangyō ga umidasu josei/shōjo ni taisuru jinken shingai chōsa hōkokusho [Research report into human rights violations against women/girls through pornography and the adult video industry], <http://hrn.or.jp/wpHN/wp-content/uploads/2016/03/c5389134140c669e3ff6ec9004e4933a.pdf> [in Japanese].
- “Jidō poruno DVD kounyū no utagai yaku 870-nin wo shorui sōken [Briefs sent to prosecutors for 870 people suspected of buying child pornography DVDs],” *Sankei News*, 11 December 2018, <https://www.sankei.com/affairs/amp/181211/afr1812110034-a.html> [in Japanese].
- “Kōzai Saki-san: “Ima demo furasshu bakku ni nayamasareru”, sennō no kako wo kataru [“I still have flashbacks,” Saki Kōzai talks about her hellish past],” 27 August 2016, https://www.bengo4.com/c_23/n_5044/ [in Japanese].
- Kuk, Jihye, Park, Hyejung & Norma, Caroline (2018), “Radical feminism paves the way for a resurgent South Korean women’s movement,” 7 November, *Feminist Current*, <https://www.feministcurrent.com/2018/11/07/radical-feminism-paves-way-resurgent-south-korean-womens-movement/>
- Kuroki, Kazuma & Iwahashi, Yusuke (2017), “Tokyo’s new “JK” ordinance takes aim at schoolgirl exploitation,” *Japan Times*, 6 July, <https://www.japantimes.co.jp/news/2017/07/06/national/crime-legal/tokyos-new-jk-ordinance-takes-aim-schoolgirl-exploitation/>

- MacKinnon, Catharine & Dworkin, Andrea (1988), *Pornography and civil rights: a new day for women's equality*, Organizing Against Pornography, Minneapolis.
- MacKinnon, Catharine & Dworkin, Andrea (1998), *In harm's way: the pornography civil rights hearings*, Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- MacKinnon, Catharine (2017), *Butterfly politics*, Cambridge, MA, The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press.
- MacKinnon, Catharine (2019), "Preface to the paperback edition," pp. ix-xxxi, *Butterfly politics: changing the world for women*, Cambridge, MA, The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press.
- Mishima, Azusa (2019), "Journalist Shiori Ito gets help with fight for damages over alleged rape," 12 April, *The Asahi Shimbun*, <http://www.asahi.com/ajw/articles/AJ201904120054.html>
- Miyake, Kyoko (2017), *Tokyo idols*, BBC4.
- Miyamoto, Setsuko (2016), *AV shutsuen o kyojōsareta kanojotachi [They were coerced in pornography filming]*, Tokyo: Chikuma Shobō, 2016 [in Japanese].
- Morita, Seiya (1999), "Senji no sei-bōryoku, heiji no sei-bōryoku [Sexual violence in wartime, sexual violence in peacetime]," *Yuibutsuron-Kenkyū Nenshi [Annual Materialism Studies]*, Vol. 4, Tokyo: Aoki Shoten, pp.113-140 [in Japanese].
- Morita, Seiya (2000), "Porunogurafi to reipu [Pornography and rape: Morgan, Steinem, Dworkin, and MacKinnon]," *APP Journal: Ronbun/shiryō-shū*, Vol. 1 [in Japanese].
- Morita, Seiya (2002), "Nihon ni okeru josei no jinken to poruno/baibaishun mondai [Women's human rights and the problem of pornography and prostitution in Japan]," *APP Journal: Ronbun/shiryō-shū*, Vol. 3, pp. 1-17 [in Japanese].
- Morita, Seiya (2004), "Pornography, prostitution, and women's human rights in Japan," in Rebecca Whisnant and Christine Stark eds., *Not for sale: feminists resisting prostitution and pornography*, North Melbourne, Spinifex Press, pp. 64-84.
- Morita, Seiya (2009), "Rironsha mondai to porunogurafi no seiji-gaku [The Rironsha problem and the politics of pornography]," *APP Journal: Ronbun/shiryō-shū*, Vol. 9, pp. 1-17 [in Japanese].
- Morita, Seiya (2010a), "Harms of pornography and freedom of expression," *Anti-Pornography and Prostitution Research Group*, http://www.app-jp.org/modules/about/index.php?content_id=18
- Morita, Seiya (2010b), "Poruno higai eno hoteki apurōchi wo meguru sho-sōten [Several points of dispute on legal approaches to porn-harms]," *APP Journal: Ronbun/shiryō-shū*, Vol. 10, pp. 8-17 [in Japanese].
- Morita, Seiya (2010c), "Tokyo-to seishōnen kenzen ikusei jōrei kaisei an wo dou miru bekika [Understanding the amendments to the Tokyo Youth Protection Law]," *APP Journal: Ronbun/shiryō-shū*, Vol. 10, pp. 18-26 [in Japanese].
- Morita, Seiya (2010d), "Kikan Sekushuariti" mondai to sekkusu waaku-ron [The problem of *Quarterly Sexuality* and sex work theory]," *APP Journal: Ronbun/shiryō-shū*, Vol. 10, pp. 72-110 [in Japanese].
- Morita, Seiya (2010e), "Poruno higai towa donoyōna monoka? [What are porn-harms?]" in PAPS (ed.), *Shōgen: gendai no sei-bōryoku to poruno higai [Evidence from the field: present day sexual violence and harms of pornography]*, Tokyo: Tokyoto-shakaifukushi-kyōgikai, pp. 40-67 [in Japanese].
- Morita, Seiya (2011), "Poruno higai to hyōgen no jiyū [Harms of pornography and freedom of expression]," *APP Journal: Ronbun/shiryō-shū*, special issue, pp. 3-17 [in Japanese].

- Morita, Seiya (2012), “Porunogurafi to sei-higai: hyōgen no jiyū-ron no saikōn ni mukete [Pornography and its sexual harms: towards a reconsideration of the free speech doctrine],” in Tamie Kainō, et al eds., *Kōza jendā to hō* [Gender and the Law Series], Vol. 3, Nihon Kajo Shuppan, pp. 201-216 [in Japanese].
- Morita, Seiya (2014), trans. Caroline Norma, “On racial discrimination and gender discrimination in Japan: the gap separating the Zaitokukai march and the Aida Makoto exhibition,” *The Asia-Pacific Journal: Japan Focus*, Vol.11, Issue. 22, No. 3, 2 June, <http://apjff.org/2014/11/22/Morita-Seiya/4123/article.html>
- Morita, Seiya (2014-2015), “Poruno to sei-bōryoku higai [Pornography and the harms of sexual violence, parts I, II and III],” *Vaurakku Tsūshin*, Nos. 6-8 [in Japanese].
- Morita, Seiya (2016), “Dansei shinwa, porunogurafi, sei-bōryoku [Masculine myths, pornography, and sexual violence],” *APP Journal: Ronbun/shiryō-shū*, Vol. 11, pp. 19-35 [in Japanese].
- Morita, Seiya (2017), trans. Caroline Norma, “Overcoming double erasure: Japanese “comfort women”, nationalism and trafficking,” *The Asia-Pacific Journal: Japan Focus*, Vol. 15, Issue 21, No. 3, 1 November, <https://apjff.org/2017/21/Morita.html>
- Morita, Seiya (2019), “Baibaishun to sekkusu wāku-ron [Prostitution and sex work theory: A critique],” <https://www.academia.edu/40573693/> [in Japanese].
- Nakasatomi, Hiroshi (2004), “The significance of MacKinnon-Dworkin anti-pornography civil rights ordinance and the issues in Japan,” *Gyōsei Shakai Ronshū*, Vol. 16, No. 3, pp. 39-62, <https://www.lib.fukushima-u.ac.jp/repo/repository/fukuro/R000000980/2-323.pdf>
- Nakasatomi, Hiroshi (2007a), *Porunogurafi to sei-bōryoku* [Pornography and sexual violence], Tokyo: Akashi-shoten [in Japanese].
- Nakasatomi, Hiroshi (2007b), “Dai 2-kai “tōsatsu taisaku ni kan suru ankēto” chōsa kekka to bunseki [The second round of questionnaires about measures against spy-cam filming: results and analysis],” *APP Journal: Ronbun/shiryō-shū*, Vol. 7, pp. 43-48 [in Japanese].
- Nakasatomi, Hiroshi (2008), “Sekkusū wāku-ron: jendā kenkyū eno bakkurasshu [Sex work theory: a backlash to gender studies],” *APP Journal: Ronbun/shiryō-shū*, Vol. 8 [in Japanese].
- Nakasatomi, Hiroshi (2009), “Sekkusū wāku, seitēki-jikokettei-ken, jinkaku-ken [Sex work, sexual self-determination rights, and personal dignity rights],” *APP Journal: Ronbun/shiryō-shū*, Vol. 9, pp. 60-70 [in Japanese].
- Nakasatomi, Hiroshi (2010a), “Sei-fūzoku sangyō no jinken shingaisei, [Sex industry violations of human rights],” *APP Journal: Ronbun/shiryō-shū*, Vol. 10, pp. 61-68 [in Japanese].
- Nakasatomi, Hiroshi (2010b), “Sei-bōryoku toshite no porunogurafi [Pornography as sexual violence]” in PAPS (ed.), *Shōgen: gendai no sei-bōryoku to poruno higai* [Evidence from the field: present day sexual violence and harms of pornography], Tokyo: Tokyo-shakaifukushi-kyōgikai, pp. 22-39 [in Japanese].
- Nakasatomi, Hiroshi (2016), “Sei-baibai kisei hō no kokusaiteki dōkō: Hokuō moderu no kanōsei, [The international situation relating the regulation of the sex trade: prospects for the Nordic Model],” *APP Journal: Ronbun/shiryō-shū*, Vol. 11, pp. 63-76 [in Japanese].
- Nakasatomi, Hiroshi (2019), “Sei no baibai o meguru kenri to hō [On rights and laws relating to the sex trade],” in Yamamoto, Hajime et al (eds.), *Kenpō no fūhen-sei to rekishi-sei* [The universal and historical character of Japan’s Constitution], Tokyo: Nihon-hyōron-sha, 2019, pp. 281-309 [in Japanese].

- NHK (2018), “Watashi wa AV shutsuen wo kyōyō saretā: “futsū” no ko ga nerawareta [A “normal” girl was targeted: I was coerced into pornography filming],” *Kurōzu-appu Gendai*, 19 October [in Japanese].
- Nihei, Yumiko (2004), “Kōhan bōchō ki: keizokuteki poruno shichō to renzoku gōkan [Observing the court case of a serial rapist: the close relationship between watching rape pornography and perpetrating serial rapes],” *APP Journal: Ronbun/shiryō-shū*, Vol. 5, pp. 46-58 [in Japanese].
- Norma, Caroline (2012), “Challenging pornography in Japan: the Anti-Pornography and Prostitution Research Group (APP),” in Abigail Bray and Melinda Tankard Reist (eds), *Big porn inc: exposing the harms of the global pornography industry*, Melbourne: Spinifex Press, pp. 288-290.
- Norma, Caroline (2019), “Japanese women remain marooned in a patriarchal paradise,” *Feminist Current*, 1 October, <https://www.feministcurrent.com/2019/10/01/japanese-women-remain-marooned-in-a-patriarchal-paradise/>
- PAPS (Poruno higai to sei-bōryoku wo kangaeru kai) (2010), *Shōgen: gendai no sei-bōryoku to poruno higai [Evidence from the field: present day sexual violence and harms of pornography]*, Tokyo: Tokyoto-shakaifukushi-kyōgikai [in Japanese].
- PAPS, *Mori Bijutsukan mondai to sei-bōryoku hyōgen [The Mori Art Museum problem and sexual violent expression]*, Tokyo: Fuma Shobō, 2013 [in Japanese].
- “Police step up probe of Burning Sun club,” 21 March 2019, *The Straits Times*, <https://www.straitstimes.com/lifestyle/police-step-up-probe-of-burning-sun-club>
- Poruno/kaishun mondai kenkyū kai (2000), *APP Journal: Ronbun/shiryō-shū*, Vol. 1 [in Japanese].
- Poruno/kaishun mondai kenkyū kai (2001), “Eizō to bōryoku [Film footage and violence],” *APP Journal: Ronbun/shiryō-shū*, Vol. 2 [in Japanese].
- Poruno/kaishun mondai kenkyū kai (2002), *APP Journal: Ronbun/shiryō-shū*, Vol. 3 [in Japanese].
- Poruno/kaishun mondai kenkyū kai (2003), “Poruno higai no jittai to bunseki [The reality and its analysis of the harms of pornography],” *APP Journal: Ronbun/shiryō-shū*, Vol. 4 [in Japanese].
- Poruno/kaishun mondai kenkyū kai (2004), *APP Journal: Ronbun/shiryō-shū*, Vol. 5 [in Japanese].
- Poruno/kaishun mondai kenkyū kai (2005), “Poruno higai toshiteno tōsatsu [Spy-cam as a porn-harm],” *APP Journal: Ronbun/shiryō-shū*, Vol. 6 [in Japanese].
- Poruno/kaishun mondai kenkyū kai (2007a), “Porunogurafi to sei kōdō ni kan suru ishiki chōsa no kekka to hōkoku [Results of the survey on “pornography and sexual behaviour”],” *APP Journal: Ronbun/shiryō-shū*, Vol. 7, pp. 1-34 [in Japanese].
- Poruno/kaishun mondai kenkyū kai (2007b), “Raitā Miyanaga Sakura-san ni AV satsuei no genba o kiku [Interview with a pornography review magazine writer about a torture-pornography film set],” *APP Journal: Ronbun/shiryō-shū*, Vol. 7, pp. 65-86 [in Japanese].
- Poruno/kaishun mondai kenkyū kai (2007c), “Kodomotachi wo torimaku porunogurafi to sei-bōryoku [Pornography and sexual violence surrounding children in Japan],” *APP Journal: Ronbun/shiryō-shū*, Vol. 7, pp. 87-102 [in Japanese].
- Poruno/kaishun mondai kenkyū kai (2008), “Moto purodakushon manejā rin-san ni kiku [Interview with an ex-employee of a pornography production company],” *APP Journal: Ronbun/shiryō-shū*, Vol. 8, pp. 83-94 [in Japanese].

- Poruno/kaishun mondai kenkyū kai (2009), *APP Journal: Ronbun/shiryō-shū*, Vol. 9 [in Japanese].
- Poruno/kaishun mondai kenkyū kai (2016), “Poruno higai no sōdan/shien katsudō no hiyakuteki hatten [The exponential development of supporting activity for victims of pornography],” *APP Journal: Ronbun/shiryō-shū*, Vol. 11, pp. 4-8 [in Japanese].
- Poruno/kaishun mondai kenkyū kai (2019), *APP Journal: Ronbun/shiryō-shū*, Vol. 12 [in Japanese].
- “Sebun to Rōson, seijin hanbai teishi e, hachigatsu madeni [Seven-Eleven and Lawson announce they will stop selling adult magazines by August],” *Nihon Keizai Shimbun*, 21 January 2019, <https://t.co/zWnmSm8DHt> [in Japanese]. “Seiteki na jiga dori ni bassoku: ken jōrei kaisei e (Kumamoto-ken) [Banning naked selfies: amending the prefecture ordinance],” *Nishi Nippon Shimbun*, morning edition, 23 November 2018, <https://www.nishinippon.co.jp/nnp/kumamoto/article/467757/> [in Japanese].
- Shohisha Kikō Nippon (Consumers Organization of Japan) (2017), “AV jinken rinri kikō ni taishite adaruto bideo shutsuen keiyaku ni kansuru ikensho wo teishutsu shimashita [We submitted a statement about contracts for adult video filming to the Adult Video Human Rights Ethics Organization],” 12 December, http://www.coj.gr.jp/iken/topic_171212_01.html [in Japanese].
- “Shōjo tachi wa naze “kawareta” noka: jidō kaishun no higai uttaeru kikakuten 12-gatsu 1-2-nichi ni Chiba de [Why were these girls bought by men?: An exhibition against child prostitution will be held on December first and second in Chiba],” *Tokyo Shimbun*, 30 November 2018 [in Japanese].
- Sugita, Satoshi (1999), *Danken shugi teki sekushuaritii: poruno baibaishun yōgoron hihan* [Patriarchal sexuality: a critique of pro-prostitution and pro-pornography arguments], Tokyo: Aoki Shoten [in Japanese].
- Takano, Shingo (2018), “AV kyōyō mondai no saiban: bōchō tsuzuketa moto yūmei joyū “kuni kanyō ga hitsuyō kamo” no shin”i [Coerced pornography filming court case: the former pornography star who sat in the court gallery: I think the government needs to intervene],” 27 December, *withnews*, <https://withnews.jp/article/f0181226002qq0000000000000000W05s10101qq000018547A> [in Japanese].
- United States Department of State (2018), *2018 Trafficking in Persons Report: Japan*, <https://www.refworld.org/docid/5b3e0b0da.html>
- Watanabe, Mayuko (2017), ‘An analysis of the Japanese viewpoint on regulatory policy of virtual child pornography,’ 14th International Telecommunications Society (ITS) Asia-Pacific Regional Conference: ‘Mapping ICT into Transformation for the Next Information Society’, Kyoto, Japan, 24-27 June, International Telecommunications Society (ITS), Kyoto, <https://www.econstor.eu/bitstream/10419/168547/1/Watanabe.pdf>
- “Watashi ga AV shutsuen saserareru madeni okitakoto: hidosugiru kyōyō higai no jittai,” [What my life was like leading up to being coerced into pornography filming: the reality of the heinous harms of coercion] *withnews*, 24 June 2016, <https://withnews.jp/article/f0160624003qq0000000000000000G00110101qq000013591A?ref=kijiunder> [in Japanese].
- Yamamoto, Yukino (2007), ‘Tōsatsu kanren sureddo kara mierumono [What we know from online threads of spy-cam filming websites],’ *APP Journal: Robun/shiryō-shū*, Vol. 7, pp. 49-53 [in Japanese].

- Yamamoto, Yukino (2010), 'Shōhin-ka sareru sei-bōryoku: bōryoku-poruno no jittai [Commodified sexual violence: realities of violent pornography]' in PAPS (ed.), *Shōgen: gendai no sei-bōryoku to poruno higai [Evidence from the field: present day sexual violence and harms of pornography]*, Tokyo: Tokyoto-shakaifukushi-kyōgikai, pp. 68-83 [in Japanese].
- Yamamoto, Yukino, Norma, Caroline & Dep Weerasinghe, Ruwan (2018), 'Consumer involvement in Japanese pornography production,' *Dignity: A Journal on Sexual Exploitation and Violence*, Vol. 3, No. 2, <https://doi.org/10.23860/dignity.2018.03.02.09>
- Yamashita, Baksheesh (2007), *Hito wa minna hadaka ni naru*, Tokyo: Rironsha [in Japanese].