

University of Rhode Island

DigitalCommons@URI

Senior Honors Projects

Honors Program at the University of Rhode
Island

5-2009

Sex Trafficking and Decriminalized Prostitution in Rhode Island

Melanie Shapiro

University of Rhode Island, shapiro@shapirokravitz.com

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalcommons.uri.edu/srhonorsprog>



Part of the [Arts and Humanities Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Shapiro, Melanie, "Sex Trafficking and Decriminalized Prostitution in Rhode Island" (2009). *Senior Honors Projects*. Paper 135.

<https://digitalcommons.uri.edu/srhonorsprog/135>

This Article is brought to you by the University of Rhode Island. It has been accepted for inclusion in Senior Honors Projects by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@URI. For more information, please contact digitalcommons-group@uri.edu. For permission to reuse copyrighted content, contact the author directly.

Sex Trafficking and Decriminalized Prostitution in Rhode Island

Melanie Shapiro

Senior Honors Thesis

April 2009

Faculty Sponsor: Donna M. Hughes, PhD.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | |
|---|-----|
| -Acknowledgments..... | 3 |
| -Abstract..... | 5 |
| - Introduction..... | 7 |
| CHAPTER ONE: Research Aims and Methods..... | 10 |
| CHAPTER TWO: 1970s: Pre-Decriminalization Background..... | 21 |
| CHAPTER THREE: Decriminalization..... | 32 |
| CHAPTER FOUR: Asian Massage Parlors: Patterns and Case Studies..... | 48 |
| CHAPTER FIVE: Conclusion..... | 77 |
| APPENDIXES: | |
| -Appendix A: Statutes..... | 80 |
| -Appendix B: Information COYOTE v. Roberts Parties..... | 100 |
| -Appendix C: Defendant Outcomes in US v. Kim..... | 104 |
| -Appendix D: Rhode Island Brothel Database..... | 111 |
| REFERENCES..... | 147 |

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Thank you to everyone who believed in my work and supported me along the way. I would to thank my sponsor, Donna M. Hughes for her direction, encouragement, and support.

Thank you to Jody Lisberger for her writing tips and support.

Thank you to all the librarians who helped me uncover information when I thought was impossible to find. Specifically, thank you to the University of Rhode Island Librarians, Mary MacDonald and Deborah Mongeau. Thank you to the librarians at the Rhode Island Law Library, the Providence Public Library, and the State Archives.

Thank you to everyone—service providers, faith-based groups, social justice groups, government officials, law enforcement officers, attorneys, and students—who helped broaden my understanding of sex trafficking and decriminalization in Rhode Island. The passion, encouragement, and thirst to know more and do more to fight sex trafficking from a number of individuals has helped me keep doing work, that at times, is difficult. It is not possible to properly acknowledge all of you here.

Thank you to Rep. Joanne Giannini for her continued efforts on behalf of victims of sex trafficking.

Thank you to the Undergraduate Research Grant Committee at the University of Rhode Island for financing my research.

Thank you to Roger Williams University School of Law for believing in my work.

Thank you to my partner, Desiree who has supported everything I have done. Thank you to my family.

This research is dedicated to the growing number of silenced women and girls in our state's brothels.

The will to domination is a ravenous beast. There are never enough warm bodies to satiate its monstrous hunger. Once alive, this beast grows and grows, feeding on all the life around it, scouring the earth to find new sources of nourishment. This beast lives in each man who battens on female servitude.

—Andrea Dworkin

When we abolish slavery of half of humanity, together with the whole system of hypocrisy it implies, then the “division” of humanity will reveal its genuine significance and the human couple will find its true form.

—Simone de Beauvoir

The disturbing tendency to treat prostitution as a business or industry not only contributes to the trade in human beings, but is itself evidence of a growing tendency to detach freedom from the moral law and to reduce the rich mystery of human sexuality to a mere commodity.

—Pope John Paul II

When someone has been bartered and sold like a used car, or has been made to stay in a motel room while men file in and out taking turns sexually exploiting or raping her, she needs to repeatedly hear that she is a valuable human being who can make a difference in the world

—Norma Hotaling

Likewise, for those of us who are in a position to do something to combat human slavery, however small our contribution, neutrality is a sin.

—Inspector General Joseph E. Schmitz, Department of Defense

ABSTRACT

Rhode Island is the only state in the United States where prostitution is decriminalized indoors. Since decriminalization in 1980, the sex industry has expanded and Rhode Island has become a destination for commercial sex in New England. Rhode Island is one of only three states that have not had a human trafficking prosecution. Rhode Island has had no prosecutions of sex trafficking since the state anti-trafficking law was passed in 2007. The goal of this project was to research the history of decriminalization, gather information on Asian massage parlor brothels, and determine if sex trafficking is occurring in these establishments.

Research on Asian massage parlor brothels and sex trafficking was carried out by observation of brothels, content analysis of writings by “johns” in online forums, newspaper stories, analysis of federal, state, and local statutes, analysis of known prostitution and sex trafficking cases, and advertisements by Asian massage parlor brothels. Asian massage parlors were the focus of the research since they advertise publicly, making them easier to research than other brothels in Rhode Island. The massage parlor advertisements and the reported experiences of “johns” were monitored for indications of sex trafficking. Interviews about massage parlor brothels and sex trafficking were conducted with public officials, law enforcement personnel, social justice groups, faith-based organizations, and victim service providers. To research the history of decriminalization, the trial transcripts, affidavits, motions, and briefs of the federal case were analyzed. Lawyers, officials, and other people knowledgeable about the decriminalization case were interviewed.

Results of the research identified thirty-three Asian massage parlor brothels. Indicators of sex trafficking were found, such as barred windows and sealed exit doors, and the use of

surveillance video cameras. Indications of women's restricted freedom and limited mobility were identified, such as living on the premises and being rotated through a circuit of massage parlors. Content analysis of "johns'" reports of buying sex revealed examples of women's resistance to engage in sex acts, indicating they may not have been acting freely. Research into the history of prostitution and massage parlor raids found evidence of sex trafficking. In 2006, a federal multi-state sex trafficking case included a Providence massage parlor.

Decriminalization of prostitution indoors resulted from a confluence of factors. In the late 1970s, citizens demanded police action against street prostitution in their neighborhoods. The existing prostitution laws made criminal procedures slow, and since prostitutes remained on the streets awaiting jury trials, it was ineffective to reduce prostitution. In addition, a prostitutes' rights group filed a federal sex discrimination against the state of Rhode Island because more women than men were being arrested for soliciting sex even though the statute was gender-neutral.

Decriminalized prostitution has factored in the expansion of the commercial sex industry and the absence of any federal or state sex trafficking cases. Decriminalization of prostitution also makes it difficult to use existing statutes for organizing and controlling prostitution. Decriminalization of prostitution also interferes with the ability to identify and assist victims of sex trafficking.

INTRODUCTION

I became interested in sex trafficking when I learned sex trafficking happens everywhere in the world, including down the street from my house. Being concerned about local media attention to possible sex trafficking in Rhode Island and my concern for exploitation of and violence against women compelled me to research whether sex trafficking was occurring in Rhode Island, and if so, where, how, and what could be done to stop it. The demand for commercial sex that fuels the multi-billion dollar organized criminal industry of sex trafficking is incomprehensible.

Sex trafficking is a form of modern-day slavery. Women and girls, mostly, and sometimes men and boys are recruited, harbored, transported, provided, or obtained for the purpose of a commercial sex act through force, fraud, deception, coercion, enticement, and various means or if the victim has not reached the age of 18.¹ According to the U.S. State Department's Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons (TIP), "annually 600,000-800,000 people—mostly women and children—are trafficked across national borders which, does not count millions trafficked within their own countries," including the United States. Sex trafficking is a severe human rights violation, poses a global health risk, and it "fuels the growth of organized crime."²

Sex trafficking is not occurring only in Southeast Asia, South America, or Eastern Europe. The United States Department of State estimates that annually 14,500 to 17,500 people

¹ The language comes from the definition of sex trafficking obtained from the Trafficking Victims Protection Act of 2000 from the U.S. State Department website: <http://www.state.gov>. A *commercial sex act* is when any sexual service is exchanged for money or any material value.

² United States Department of Justice Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons. "The Link Between Prostitution and Sex Trafficking." Fact Sheet. 24 November 2004. <<http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/38901.pdf>>. 31 March 2009.

are trafficked for sex into the United States.³ This figure represents only foreign nationals. The number of American citizens trafficked within the United States is likely much higher. Sex trafficking in the United States does not involve only foreign nationals. Sex trafficking happens everywhere—in every major city in the United States, in urban, rural and suburban areas, in poor and wealthy areas, in brothels on sex trafficking networks, or in basements or apartments, to foreign nationals and American women and girls. Women are trafficked by strangers, parents, friends, men pretending to be boyfriends, and siblings.

Prostitution and sex trafficking are intrinsically linked. Toleration of prostitution both fuels demand for commercial sexual activity and attracts brothel owners and traffickers to an area with less concern for legal recourse. There is a misconception prostitution is an empowering choice for women or a legitimate form of work. The United States Department of Justice writes: “few activities are as brutal and damaging to people as prostitution.”⁴ Any time sex trafficking occurs, prostitution occurs.

Rhode Island is the only state in the United States where there are no laws on indoor prostitution. The media has been writing about sex trafficking in Rhode Island since 1998 and since there has been growing coverage of an expanding massage parlor brothel industry said to be linked to sex trafficking.⁵ Rhode Island is one of only three states that have not had a single

³ United States Department of Health and Human Services Rescue and Restore Campaign. “Human Trafficking Fact Sheet.” < http://www.acf.hhs.gov/trafficking/about/fact_human2004.pdf>. Accessed: 14 April 2009.

⁴ United States Department of Justice Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons. “The Link Between Prostitution and Sex Trafficking.” Fact Sheet. 24 November 2004. <<http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/38901.pdf>>. 31 March 2009.

⁵ Rockoff, Johnathan.. “Police allege club a brothel; The Providence police say that women from southeast Asian were brought to Club Osaka to work as prostitutes to pay off their passage to the United States” Providence Journal on November 24, 1998, B-1, Before 1998, the coverage of massage parlors was minimal, but after, there was growing media coverage of the massage parlor brothels. This was the first time the issue of sex slavery was explicitly mentioned for what it was. Before, there were cases of coercive prostitution mentioned, but the connection to trafficking was never made.

human trafficking case.⁶ Over the past year, I have researched decriminalization of prostitution indoors and sex trafficking in Rhode Island. The goal was to research how prostitution was decriminalized, gather information about the Asian massage parlor brothels, and find out if sex trafficking is occurring in the brothels, and if so, if decriminalization fueled sex trafficking.

⁶ U.S. Customs and Border Control, Human Trafficking Symposium, Washington, D.C., September 9, 2008

CHAPTER ONE:

RESEARCH AIMS AND METHODS

Research Aims

The research aimed to gather information on Asian massage parlor brothels and determine if sex trafficking is occurring. Also, the research sought to uncover the history of decriminalization of prostitution indoors. The specific goals were as follows:

- Establish a research framework for studying sex trafficking in Rhode Island.
- Determine patterns and trends of massage parlor brothels to uncover indicators of sex trafficking.
- Provide case studies of identified massage parlor brothels.
- Determine the origins of decriminalization and its impact on prosecution of sex trafficking in Rhode Island.
- Uncover information about the history of the sex industry in Rhode Island.

Research Methods

Overview:

Between April 2008 and April 2009, the decriminalization of prostitution indoors in Rhode Island and the Asian massage parlor brothel industry was researched. Various sources and methods were used to create a framework to monitor the identified massage parlor brothels in the state and understand decriminalization of prostitution.

Decriminalization

Very little was known about the history of decriminalized prostitution in Rhode Island. The research tried to locate the history of and media attention to decriminalization through case law, interviews, and media. Journalists, attorneys, officials, and other people knowledgeable about the decriminalization were interviewed. The surrounding political, community, and sex industry were reviewed through the *Providence Journal* and *Providence Evening Bulletin* “Sex and Law” indexes. Existing federal, state, and local statutes related to prostitution, massage parlors, and sex trafficking were analyzed.

Legislation:

The analysis of existing federal, state, and local statutes related to prostitution, massage parlors, and sex trafficking were analyzed to find existing enforceable statutes and determine enforcement difficulties because of decriminalization. Legislation has been obtained through government websites.

Case Law:

Case law was used to research the decriminalization and sex trafficking in Rhode Island. The affidavits, trial transcript, motions, briefs, and opinions in the COYOTE v. Roberts file were used.⁷ The affidavit and press release of the Federal sex trafficking case U.S.A. v. Kim were also analyzed.⁸ Other related cases discussed in the media throughout the research period and local media coverage period were analyzed, too.

⁷ The full citation is C.O.Y.O.T.E. v. Roberts, et. al. [CV 76-0254].

⁸ The full reference is Case F # 2006R00United States of America v. Kim, Il, Lnu, Park, Bae, Polachek, Son, Lee, Choi-Son, and Lnu pursuant to T. 18 U.S.C. §§ 2, 371, 2421, 1960 (a), and 3148.

Asian Massage Parlor Brothels

The Asian massage parlor brothels have been associated with sex trafficking in the past. Research of massage parlor brothels was conducted to evaluate the impact of decriminalization on the massage parlor industry. Various sources were used to identify the existence and name and location changes of massage parlor brothels. These sources were also used to identify indicators of sex trafficking. For instance, if what was believed to be a new massage parlor brothel was advertised in *Providence Phoenix*, other sources would be checked to corroborate the finding, such as the erotic section of *Craigslist.com*, the USA Sexguide, Corporate Export files, Corporate filings, observation of the brothel, and other massage parlor brothel review websites.

To follow the general patterns of the massage parlor brothels, a content analysis of online forums, advertisements, and newspaper stories was conducted and brothels were observed. Interviews about massage parlor brothels and sex trafficking were conducted with public officials, law enforcement personnel, social justice groups, faith-based organizations, and victim service providers

Web forums:

The primary “john” forum analyzed was the USA Sexguide.⁹ The USA Sexguide is a forum for and by men who buy sex, i.e. “johns.” It is part of the International Sex Guide. The USA Sexguide is divided by state and certain territories and special interests. There are numerous threads within each state section. In the Rhode Island section, johns post on the following threads: “Massage Parlor Reports,” “Strip Club Reports,” “Streetwalker Reports,”

⁹ The USA Sex Guide or “the john forums,” are located at <http://www.usasexguide.info/forum>.

“General Discussion,” “Spa L,” and archived reports. In the “Massage Parlor Reports” section, johns and prospective johns discuss their experiences at the massage parlor brothels, concerns about law enforcement and prostitution laws, fantasy scenarios, and general procedural and safety information for prospective johns. Specifically, I have analyzed the following threads: “2000-2004 Archives,” “2005 Archives,” “Massage Parlor Reports,” and “Spa L.” The content analysis of the USA Sexguide focused on the following:

- Facilities descriptions, services available, length of time in operation, changes in management, location, or name of suspected brothels which have been used to generally reflect on patterns of massage parlor brothels in Rhode Island.
- Mentions of raids and coverage in the media.
- Legal and safety concerns of the johns and the establishments.
- Description of the physical appearance, age, and overt emotional state of the women and girls at these establishments
- Services offered at establishments, procedure, and code language.
- “Fantasy” scenarios and descriptions of desires of johns indicated the “demand” of the region.
- General attitudes of the johns about these experiences and their expectations.

Observation:

Direct observation photo documentation of and phone conversations with massage parlor brothels were used to observe patterns. Independently and with others, photos were taken of the massage parlor brothels and the surrounding area considering safety, accessibility to major interstates and highways, type of area, and busyness. Observation of “Spa L” and “Spa E” was

conducted by colleagues three to four times a week for a two month period (from the end of June 2008 until the beginning of August 2008). This observation usually was done in the evening.

In the fall, a mentor and I observed and photographed the following spas: “Spas A, B, C, E, F, H, J, L, M, N, Q, R, S, T, U, X, Y, Z, DD, EE, and FF.” In the spring, a mentor, a reporter, and I observed the following spas: “E, F, K, L, Q, R, V, Y, Z, GG, and HH.” Nearly all of the massage parlor brothels were observed independently, as well. During observation the following were noted:

- Entrances and exits
- Number of men entering and exiting and the length of time in the massage parlor brothel.
- Number of women exiting the brothel, how they exited the brothel, if they were accompanied, and whether they returned.
- Use of surveillance cameras.
- The correlation of busyness of the massage parlor brothel and the busyness of surrounding businesses.
- The level of self-containment.

Local and National Media:

The Providence Journal and the *Providence Evening Bulletin* were reviewed from 1975 to April 2009 looking for indicators of sex trafficking in prostitution cases, raids of massage parlor brothels, and attempts to change related laws. Limited national media coverage has been traced in the past several years. In addition to the *Providence Journal* and the *Providence Evening Bulletin*, I have also used *Rhode Island Monthly*, *Catholic News Service*, *Boston Globe*, *Washington Post*, *New York Times*, *Brown Daily Herald*, and *WTOP News*.

Interviews:

Formal and informal interviews were conducted with attorneys, politicians, service providers, faith-based leaders and congregants, local business owners and operators, professors, students, reporters, activists, and law enforcement personnel. Generally, the interviews were discussions about decriminalization, existing and proposed laws, massage parlor brothels, and legislative and service strategies.

Parties conversed with had differing ideas about prostitution laws, but many understood the link between prostitution and sex trafficking. Some felt prostitution should re-criminalized, others felt it should remain decriminalized, and a few opted for legalization. Most felt the human trafficking law should be amended, and a few felt the problem was enforcement. Some individuals were reluctant to discuss these issues.

My conversations were also extended to women in the massage parlors. I called several of the massage parlor brothels. I noted the accent, the ability to speak English, the comfort in tone. I asked about appointments, services, management, licenses, and the nature of advertisement in erotic venues such as Craigslist.com or *The Providence Phoenix*. I also conversed with one madam face to face and noted her intonation, appearance, and comfort.

Advertisements:

The massage parlor brothels use several printed and electronic forms of advertisement. The venues of advertisement were located and traced for similarities in advertisements between massage parlor brothels, how sexually explicit the advertisements were, the frequency of advertisement, and the services advertised. The following four venues were most closely analyzed, although several other sites were used:

- *The Providence Phoenix*: *The Providence Phoenix*, a local weekly arts and adult entertainment publication, was analyzed between July 2008 and April 2009. In the “adult entertainment” section, the subsection entitled “spas” is used by the massage parlor brothels to post ads. For the most part, Rhode Island massage parlors are advertised, but, occasionally, massage parlors in Connecticut, New York, and Massachusetts are listed. Weekly, the ads were collected and compared to previous listings and other massage parlor listings, looking for similarities between listings, name, telephone, or location changes, or changes in services offered.
- *Craigslist*: Craigslist.com is an international classifieds website on which events, employment, items for sale, and services are listed and requested. There are also discussion forums on a number of topics. On Craigslist.com, “therapeutic” and “erotic” services sections list massage parlor brothel advertisements. The most explicit and greatest number of massage parlors usually advertise in the “erotic” services section. The “erotic” and “therapeutic” services sections were monitored daily.
- *FindaLay*: www.findalay.com is an adult directory listing escort services, erotic massage parlor reviews, porn stores, sex books, and more. The “erotic massage parlor” section was reviewed. The section features ads of the massage parlor brothels, location information, reviews of specific “providers,” services offered, hours, costs, types of payments accepted, and information about facilities.
- *BigDoggie*: The escort reviewer site, www.bigdoggie.net, was also monitored. The Rhode Island message board and escort directory advertisements were followed.

Corporation records:

- *Corporate Export Files:* Once a week, corporate export files are released through the Rhode Island Secretary of State website. The corporate export files were used to cross-reference advertisements of new massage parlor brothels on *Craigslist.com* and in the *Providence Phoenix*. *The Corporate Export Files* list the company number, official name, date, jurisdiction (the code under which they have registered indicating the type of business they are), the type of corporation registered as, address, owner, and owner's address. The site allows access to the weekly *Corporate Export Files* back to 2006.
- *Corporations Database:* I have used the *Corporations Database* on the Secretary of State website to obtain further legal information about these establishments. The site allows searching by name, address, purpose, company number, filing number, and individual. The information includes the name, entity type, identification number, and date of incorporation in Rhode Island, location of principal office, mailing address, registering agent information, officers and directors of corporation, home address of incorporator, purpose, stock shares and the ability to search for filings. Typical filings that open include annual reports, articles of incorporation, and revocations.

Language and Terminology:

The following language and terminology will be used throughout the thesis. The terms have been chosen to ease communication. Some of the terms are widely used sex industry terms and will be put in quotations. Using these terms does not legitimize the sex industry.

Brothel- any physical structure in which two or more women are providing commercial sex acts or a physical structure in which a woman is prostituted by a pimp.

Commercial sex act- is any sexual service exchanged for money or any material value.

Decriminalization- is a shortened term for “the decriminalization of prostitution indoors in Rhode Island.”

“**John**”- will be used to refer to a male purchaser of commercial sex acts.

“**Johns**” **forums-** refers to several online forums on which “johns” discuss their experiences at the massage parlor brothels, their fantasies, and other relevant issues.

“**Madam**”- female manager of a brothel.

“**Mamasan**”- Another word for madam. This term is very common in Rhode Island Asian massage parlor brothels.

Massage parlor brothel- will be used to describe massage parlors that are suspected to advertise and provide commercial sex acts, and may be linked to sex trafficking.

“**Pimp**”- is a person who controls and derives material gain from a prostitute. A pimp could control one or many prostitutes in one or many locations.

prostitute- is a person who provides commercial sex acts.

Self-containment- refers to the ease of access to exit for those inside the massage parlor brothels. Self-containment considers, for instance, if there is more than one way in and out, if surveillance video cameras are used to monitor entrances and exits, if fire escapes are connected,

if garage doors appear to open and close, or if windows are able to be opened. An example of a highly self-contained massage parlor brothel would be one with sealed exit doors and barred windows that use surveillance video cameras to monitor entrances and exits.

Sex trafficker- According to Rhode Island statute “Trafficking in Persons for Involuntary Servitude or Commercial Sexual Activity,” a sex trafficker is a person who “knowingly recruits, entices, harbors, transports, provides, or obtains by any means, or attempts to recruit, entice, harbor, transport, provide, or obtain by any means, another person, intending or knowing that the person will be subjected to forced labor in order to commit a commercial sexual activity.”¹⁰

Sex trafficking- as defined by the Trafficking Victims Protection Act of 2000 is “the recruitment, harboring, transportation, provision, or obtaining of a person for the purpose of a commercial sex act.” Severe forms of sex trafficking include the use of minors in commercial sex acts, or a commercial sex act induced by “force, fraud, or coercion.”¹¹

When a person is sex trafficked, the person engages in commercial sex acts because of force, fraud, or coercion. Not every person who engages in commercial sex acts is a victim of sex trafficking. The thesis does not view every woman performing commercial sex acts at Asian massage parlors as victims of sex trafficking. But, observances of the Asian massage parlor brothel industry have found indicators and evidence of sex trafficking.

¹⁰ Definition obtained from the Rhode Island §11-67-3 (a) Trafficking in Persons and Involuntary Servitude. Rhode Island General Laws may be accessed through the Rhode Island General Assembly website: <http://www.rilin.state.ri.us/>

¹¹ Definitions obtained from the Trafficking Victims Protection Act of 2000 from the U.S. State Department website: <http://www.state.gov>.

Analysis

The framework created to research decriminalization and the massage parlor brothels in Rhode Island was successful. The research was able to locate the origins of the decriminalization and the history of the sex industry in Rhode Island following the decriminalization. Asian massage parlor brothels were identified, observed, and analyzed. Sex trafficking evidence and indicators were found historically and at the massage parlor brothels. An analysis of case law, federal, state, and local statutes, and interviews contextualized the problems with decriminalization and its relation to an expanding massage parlor brothel industry and sex trafficking prosecution.

CHAPTER TWO:

The 1970s: PRE-DECRIMINALIZATION BACKGROUND

Rhode Island has been described in the media as a sex industry destination for the past decade.¹² This recognition coupled with the decriminalization of prostitution indoors in 1980 has generated rapid growth in the massage parlor brothel industry, an industry that has been linked to sex trafficking. Even though there were coercive prostitution situations covered in the media, the use of the term and connection to sex trafficking did not occur until 1998.¹³ The coercive prostitution case in the 1970s did not resemble the Asian massage parlor brothel industry today, which did not exist until many years later. The history of the sex industry has been filled with phases of community action, attention to prostitution and sex trafficking in the media, and debate about the prostitution laws. This pattern has continued since the 1970s, and nearly thirty years after decriminalization, there is *still* contention about the prostitution laws.

Before the decriminalization of prostitution indoors in 1980, Rhode Island's sex industry was smaller and concentrated in strip clubs and street prostitution. During the late 1960s and

¹² Malinowski, W. Zachary. "Providence, R.I., Sex Industry Expands at Startling Pace." Providence Journal. 23 April 2002. This article calls Providence "the most densely concentrated red-light district in New England" that "attracts thousands of out-of-town spenders."

¹³ Rockoff, Johnathan. "Police allege club was a brothel; The Providence police say that women from Southeast Asia were brought to Club Osaka to work as prostitutes to pay off their passage to the United States." Providence Journal. 24 November 1998. B-1.

1970s, Providence had two prominent strip clubs, the Gemini Hotel and Civic View Inn, at which members of the Italian mob were said to hang out.¹⁴ Both were noted as frequently plagued by shootings, robberies, and fights. Strippers were frequently arrested for prostitution.

In the mid-seventies, sexual liberalism and a growing strain of feminism advocated that prostitution was a legitimate and empowering form of work for women. Several prostitutes' rights groups were formed in the 1970s before prostitution was decriminalized indoors. The Prostitution Union of Massachusetts (PUMA), led by Stephen Lewis, a decriminalization advocate, attempted to unionize prostitutes in Rhode Island.¹⁵ Lewis, a business management graduate of Northeastern University, was inspired by Call Off Your Old Tired Ethics (COYOTE), a prostitutes' rights group advocating for decriminalization, founded in 1973. Lewis claimed in Boston that year, \$568,000 was spent on prostitution arrests, prosecution, and incarceration.¹⁶ From further research, however, it was found that just one single "call girl" operation, the "Squire Lane Operation" was able to bring in over half a million a year, untaxed, while engaging in illegal activity such as prostitution, possession of stolen goods, kidnapping, and possession of illegal substances.¹⁷ This seemed to be one of several operations, which leads

¹⁴ Malinowski, W. Zachary. "Providence, R.I., Sex Industry Expands at Startling Pace." *Providence Journal*. 23 April 2002. Providence. One of the smaller strip clubs, Peppermint Lounge, which was located on Broadway Street, was a "hangout for mob figures." Malinowski reports that: "All three are gone today. Gemini Hotel near the new Providence Police station was razed a few years ago. The Peppermint Lounge was replaced with a lot. Civic View is now home to Sportsman's Inn" a strip club. From "Prostitution, pimping charged" in the *Providence Evening Bulletin* on 4/14/77, page B-3, discusses the arrest of William "Slim" Sampson, the 24-year-old pimp at Civic View Inn on 4/13/77. Two 17 year old prostitutes were found outside the strip club in a man's car. Sampson was released on a \$2500 bail.

¹⁵ Lioce, Tony, "Prostitutes union now soliciting support in R.I." *Providence Evening Bulletin*. 22 October 1976. A-3.

¹⁶ Lioce, Tony, "Prostitutes union now soliciting support in R.I." *Providence Evening Bulletin*. 22 October 1976. A-3.

¹⁷ Prosnitz, Franklin S.. "4 more 'Village' women face prostitution charges." *Providence Journal*. 2 November 1976. A-8.

to an assumption that more money was being made illegally than the amount of money spent to make arrests, prosecute, and jail pimps, “johns,” and prostitutes.

A member of PUMA and self-proclaimed “call girl,” “Danielle,” disagreed with criminalizing prostitution. She claimed prostitution was a victimless crime, prostitution was stigmatized, and criminalizing prostitution was classist. “Danielle” described what she believed a misconception of prostitutes as “‘poor things’ who are forced by their economic situation to support themselves in so degrading a manner.”¹⁸ “Danielle” followed these ideas by posing the question: “What is prostitution anyway?” “Danielle’s” question was similar to public concern during the 1970s about rising prostitution.

During the 1970s, significant media attention represented prostitution as a victimless crime, and explored prostitution as an empowering choice for women, with less emphasis on exploitation and coercion. Media representation of prostitution busts and testimony from a sex discrimination case demonstrated the dangers for women engaging in prostitution and the negative effects on the community and influenced attempts to regulate the massage parlor industry and crack down on street prostitution.¹⁹

Jane Doe, an anonymous woman claiming to be a prostitute in Rhode Island testified in a class-action sex discrimination suit on behalf of all Rhode Island prostitutes in September 1979. This case will be discussed in depth in the next chapter. During the COYOTE v. Roberts trial, Doe characterized the commercial sex industry in Rhode Island. She distinguished four types of

¹⁸ Lioce, Tony, “Prostitutes union now soliciting support in R.I.” Providence Evening Bulletin, 22 October 1976, A-3. This is an interesting misconception to be promoting since today many prostitutes’ rights activists use the same argument to legitimize prostitution.

¹⁹ After decriminalization in 1980, there was less attention in the media to a positive portrayal of prostitution than in the 1970s, and more attention was focused on harms to women and the community. These foci after the decriminalization helped change misconceptions of prostitution, and answer “Danielle’s” question, “What is prostitution anyway?”

prostitutes: “call girls,” “camp girls,” “bar girls,” and “street girls.” All four types indicated vulnerability to sex trafficking.

Doe said “camp girls” are hired by the bosses of the farms employing migrant workers. They are transported to sexually service migrant workers and farm workers by request of bosses with someone acting as a “go-between” or pimp who she said was necessary because the camp was a “very rough area” and “most of the girls couldn’t go out to such a camp by themselves without some sort of protection”²⁰:

“Well, a ‘camp girl’, any time that there’s a place where there’s a large crop of food or anything that has to be picked, there’s always a lot of migrant workers or farm workers, and these girls usually go out on these camps when the men get paid, and they just work strictly on these camps, because most of them can’t speak English, or anything, and they don’t go into town, so usually their bosses, or whatever, will hire girls, you know, to come out to these places”²¹

Today, we would say that Jane Doe was giving indicators of sex trafficking of the “camp girls.” These indicators include the middleman or pimp involvement, the boss of the migrant farm contacting the middlemen to purchase women, the dangerous circumstances necessitating pimp protection, and the women being confined to working only at the migrant farms. Bosses targeted their employees, migrant farm workers who seemed to possess language and cultural barriers, on the days when they were paid. Since the bosses of the migrant farms hired women to come when the workers were paid, the benefit to the bosses could be a share of profits.

A “street girl,” or “streetwalker,” as defined and described by Jane Doe, is “usually a girl that works just mainly on the street” by standing or walking along a road and waiting for a man

²⁰ COYOTE v. Roberts [CV 76-0254] transcript. See page 17.

²¹ See page 16 of the above transcript.

to approach her for sex.²² Nearly all the time, Doe claimed “street girls” would just stand and wait to be approached by a john, and she and the john would reach a decision about what sexual services would be performed and for what price. “Street girls” are susceptible to pimps, who Doe describes as “somebody who just uses the girls just to line his own pockets... it’s like a tick on a dog.”²³ She said pimps watch a “street girl’s” every move and collect money from them immediately. Doe says most of the “street girls” work out of the “john’s” car, or sometimes an apartment or hotel. Jane Doe said her presence in areas known for prostitution, like Elmwood Avenue or Broad Street was enough to attract “johns.”²⁴ Prostitution was concentrated in the West End of Providence and on the above streets specifically during 1970s and remains so today.

Doe’s description of the relationship between pimps and “street girls” displays elements of coercion. The “street girls,” whom Doe considers to be highly susceptible to being pimped, are closely monitored and have money taken from them as soon as it is received, meaning the women likely do not have free mobility or agency, much like the women in the Asian massage parlor brothels today. This could indicate a quota set by pimps to be met by “street girls” daily, the consequences for not meeting the quota potentially dangerous. Doe’s description of a pimp being like “a tick on a dog” analogizes the often ruthless and destructive measures pimps use to materially benefit from women they prey on and feed off of.

According to Doe, a “bar girl” is a prostitute who uses bars as her place to find “johns,” and once an agreement is met, the sexual services usually take place at an apartment or motel. Doe said nearly all the bars frequented by “bar girls” were in Providence. She says “bar girls” are

²² See pages 18 and 19 of the above transcript. Doe says that about “a good 75 per cent of the time...[a prostitute does not] have to say anything, just stand there.”

²³ COYOTE v. Roberts [CV 76-0254] transcript. See page 17.

²⁴ See page 17 of the above transcript.

“not as susceptible to pimps” but often work with the bartender to attract “johns”, and in return the “bar girl” usually gives the bartender a portion of the money or sexual services²⁵:

“She might have maybe two or three locations, it doesn’t have to be one particular place, it might be two or three bars that she might frequent, and she usually just goes in and sits and has a few drinks...until someone approaches her... and then she would probably let the gentleman know that she is working”²⁶
Even though “bar girls” are less susceptible to pimps, a number are pimped. Bartenders acting as middlemen in varying degrees generate profits from the “bar

girls” or pressure the women to provide sexual services in return. This setup positions bartenders as pimps who find and manage “johns” and earnings for the “bar girls,” who they expect to be at their sexual disposal. Bartenders manage a base network of “johns” who they supply with “bar girls.”

Jane Doe said the business of “call girls” is “strictly people that she knows that call her on the phone” who set up some sort of date to be followed by sexual services.²⁷ She said most of the “call girls” start as “bar girls” who develop a client base. Doe claimed it is the safest of the four types since generally the “call girl” already knows and trusts the client and about 75 to 80 per cent are repeat clients²⁸. She said the sexual services usually take place in the “call girl’s” apartment or occasionally at a motel or hotel with “just ordinary businessmen, doctors, lawyers.”²⁹

The “call girls” are least susceptible to pimping, but like Jane Doe, who worked as the other types of prostitutes first, have to develop a network of “johns” who become their regulars usually through prostitution on the street or in bars. During the 1970s, the media mentioned a couple of “call girl” rings, circuits in several cities, controlled by pimps who

²⁵ See pages 23 and 43 of the above transcript.

²⁶ See page 21 of the above transcript.

²⁷ See page 24 of the above transcript.

²⁸ See page 26 of the above transcript.

²⁹ See page 26 of the above transcript.

controlled and exploited the women through threat of violence to the women, their families, and confinement.³⁰

Doe expressed her concern about the inability to report crimes because of police discrimination against prostitutes at the time. When questioned about the effect of enforcement of prostitution laws, she said if she were assaulted she would be unable to approach the police:

“If you do have some crazy person that might rob you, beat you to within an inch of your life, there’s really no way that I can go down [to the police station] and make a complaint or charge against anybody, because [the police] probably would laugh me right out of the police station and say I got what I deserved because I was a prostitute.”³¹

Doe described a scenario in which she was physically assaulted when visiting a friend on Broad Street, which verified her stigmatized status as a prostitute. She was hit in the head repeatedly with a bottle and needed twenty stitches for the injury. Doe approached a police officer who, upon discovering she was a prostitute, “didn’t want to hear it [her] way” and questioned whether she was trying to rob a “john.”³²

Doe worked as all four types of prostitution in the following order: from “camp girl” to “street girl” to “bar girl” to “call girl.”³³ Starting as a “camp girl” and working up the prostitution hierarchy to a “call girl” seemed typical.

Doe did not mention the existence of massage parlor brothels, one of the most visible and widespread sites of commercial sexual activity occurring in Rhode Island today. While much of the breadth of the sex industry seems to have been concentrated in strip clubs and “street

³⁰ Prosnitz, Franklin S.. “4 more ‘Village’ women face prostitution charges.” Providence Journal. 2 November 1976. A-8.

³¹ COYOTE v. Roberts [CV 76-0254]. See page 28.

³² See pages 29 and 30 of the above transcript.

³³ See page 35 of the above transcript.

walking,” in the 1970s, there were two massage parlors, Bachelor’s Quarters and Swedish Sauna, recognized as brothels by the police. In February of 1976, the Providence City Council passed a bill regulating massage parlors. The bill included the licensing of massage parlor operators by many city agencies and prescribed specific health and safety standards.³⁴ The Police Chief, Colonel Walter A. McQueeny, commented on his support, saying some of the massage parlors were “nothing more than houses of prostitution.”³⁵

In March 1976, Major Stephen M. Maroney, the acting Providence Police Chief, conducted a three-week investigation of Bachelor’s Quarters massage parlor located at 225 Waterman Street in Providence. The raid of Bachelor’s Quarters found fourteen men and several American women. The women offered undercover officers sexual services. They were questioned and released. Edward J. McKee, a 68-year-old Cumberland resident, was arrested and charged with harboring prostitution and maintaining an establishment used for prostitution.³⁶

Following the raid, there was a lengthy deliberation as to whether the licensing board would grant licenses to Bachelor’s Quarters and other massage parlors that were suspected to be brothels.³⁷ In July 1976, a group of East Side residents tried to rally against the licensing.³⁸ Because of procedural errors by the police in gathering evidence, Bachelor’s Quarters was granted a license.³⁹ It was not until April of 1977 that the Providence Bureau of Licenses was

³⁴ “Council gives massage bill first boost.” Providence Journal. 20 February 2007. B-3.

³⁵ “Massage parlor regulations voted.” Providence Journal, 5 March 1976. B-3.

³⁶ “Massage parlor raided, 8 jailed.” Providence Journal, 21 March 1976. A-12.

³⁷ Sutton, Jr., William W. “Massage decision delayed.” Providence Evening Bulletin. 6 August 1976. B-1. The other massage parlors seeking licenses were: Swedish Sauna located at 101 Dyer Street in Providence, Provost Health Club located at 11 Peck Street in Providence, and 1111 North Main Street in Providence.

³⁸ “Meeting called by foes of massage parlor.” Providence Journal. 20 July 1976. B-3.

³⁹ Collins, William E. “License bd. Gives OK to four parlors.” Providence Evening Bulletin. 13 August 1976. B-1.

able to find Bachelor's Quarters to be in violation of the terms of their license and they were ordered to shut down.⁴⁰ The police ordered the facility to close at once.

Like Bachelor's Quarters, Swedish Sauna was one of the four massage parlors involved in a Providence Bureau of Licenses hearing. During the hearing, one of the women working there admitted to offering sexual services to an undercover police officer.⁴¹ The board suspended the license for two weeks. Swedish Sauna appealed, arguing on the grounds that one arrest for prostitution was insufficient cause for the license to be suspended. A temporary reprieve was granted.⁴² The attempts to regulate the massage parlors through licensing during the 1970s indicate a prevalent knowledge of the existence of prostitution in massage parlors, like Bachelor's Quarters and Swedish Sauna.

The efforts to change the massage parlor licensing laws and shut down Bachelor's Quarters and Swedish Sauna reflect the existence and awareness of massage parlor brothels in the state, and the community and political disapproval of the brothels. Towns such as Warwick and Smithfield passed local ordinances to regulate massage parlors to prohibit brothels.⁴³ During the 1970s, the women at the massage parlor brothels seemed to be American women and there were very few massage parlor brothels compared to the amount today.

During the 1970s there were several mentions in the local media about instances when women and girls were forced or coerced into prostitution. For example, there was a large call girl ring that was broken up in 1976, reported to have been part of a larger ring operating in New

⁴⁰ "Board shuts Bachelor's massage place." Providence Evening Bulletin. 15 April 1977. B-1.

⁴¹ "Sauna masseuse admits she solicited policeman" Providence Evening Bulletin. 6 May 1977. B-3.

⁴² "Swedish sauna will appeal." Providence Journal. 6 May 1977. A-8.

"Swedish sauna granted stay of closing order" Providence Journal. 10 May 1977. A-10.

⁴³ "Massage parlor bill submitted" Providence Journal. 4 March 1977. B-2.

York, Massachusetts, and Rhode Island.⁴⁴ Those running the larger ring were not located on the premises, but madams were placed at the sites to manage the operation. The police conducted a two-month investigation after being tipped off by a woman who said she feared for the safety of her two-year-old child. The anonymous prostitute was arrested in Massachusetts. The pimp kidnapped her child and sent the child to New York to pressure her not to testify. After the child was retrieved and returned, the woman vanished.

The raid of the “Squire Lane Operation,” as coded by police, found at least five women being prostituted in a “call girl” ring. The women were expected to turn over up to \$200 a day to the operators, which they had to earn by charging \$20 to \$30 per sex act.⁴⁵ The women were only allowed to keep the remaining money after they met their quota. The woman who tipped off police officers said the operation attracted clients from Providence and brought them to the East Providence location. She estimated a potential annual revenue of over half a million dollars. Police monitored the apartment operation. In the course of one day, more than 100 men were seen entering the premises.

Police arrested several men and women on prostitution and drug-related charges. Those arrested, had long criminal records ranging from murder to loitering for prostitution. Stolen television sets and underwear were confiscated; ledgers of clients found included those belonging to prominent businessmen and politicians.⁴⁶ One of the women found was suffering from a venereal disease. The “Squire Lane Operation” was part of a larger “call girl” network. It was one of a few other “call girl” operations in the area, but by far the most popular.

⁴⁴ Posnitz, Franklin S. “E. Providence prostitution rings broken.” Providence Journal. 30 October 1976. A-1 and A-36.

⁴⁵ Posnitz, Franklin S. “E. Providence prostitution rings broken.” Providence Journal. 30 October 1976. A-1. & Posnitz, Franklin S. “4 more ‘Village’ women face prostitution charges.” Providence Journal. 2 November 1976. A-2.

⁴⁶ “Indictments crack ring of hookers” Providence Evening Bulletin. 6 May 1977. B-2.

Decriminalization occurred when the Governor signed the amendments to the prostitution statute in May of 1980. The increase in street prostitution, attempts to regulate massage parlors, prostitution arrests at strip clubs, sexual liberalism, public debate about prostitution, and the founding of prostitutes' rights groups nationwide developed a climate for community demands for change and efforts to curb prostitution and for *COYOTE v. Roberts* to have a significant impact. It was not until 1998 that situations like these would be considered as sex trafficking in Rhode Island.⁴⁷ While today the majority of the media focus locally has been on the massage parlors in connection to sex trafficking, previously there had been a number of women and teenage girls prostituted on the streets, farms, bars, or in apartments through coercion.

⁴⁷ Rockoff, Johnathan. "Police allege club was a brothel; The Providence police say that women from southeast Asia were brought to Club Osaka to work as prostitutes to pay off their passage to the United States." Providence Journal. 24 November 1998. B-1.

CHAPTER THREE:
DECRIMINALIZATION OF PROSTITUTION INDOORS

Introduction:

The decriminalization of prostitution indoors in Rhode Island has placed the state in a unique position as the only state in the United States to have decriminalized prostitution. Unlike legalized prostitution, which is regulated or criminalized prostitution which is prohibited by law, decriminalized prostitution means there are no laws or means to regulate or suppress prostitution. Prostitution was decriminalized in May of 1980 by amendments made to the Transportation For Indecent Purposes- Streetwalking- Harboring Prostitution statute in the Rhode Island Criminal Code. This chapter will analyze the community response to prostitution in the years leading up to decriminalization, the sex discrimination law suit, COYOTE v. Roberts, and the need for prostitution law reform, which contributed to decriminalization.

The confluence of factors described in the previous chapter—sexual liberalism, an increase in street prostitution, media attention to increasing prostitution and situations of coercive prostitution, and an emergence of American massage parlor brothels and escort services—created an environment in which the decision of decriminalization was made.

Community Response to Increased Street Prostitution

About twenty people, mainly from the Cranston Street area, met on June 20, 1978. at the Assumption Church on Potters Avenue to discuss the increase in prostitution on the West End and the negative outcomes for the community.

Attendees at the West End Community Center sponsored meeting included Police Major John Eddy, Officer Malcom Brown (in charge of prostitution arrests), and Chief Justice Henry Laliberte (who would draft amendments that would decriminalize prostitution). Residents were outraged at the increase in street prostitution in their community and resolved to write to Mayor Vincent Cianci, Jr. and Police Chief Angelo Ricci urging them to take measures to curb prostitution.⁴⁸ Providence Mayor Vincent A. Cianci, Jr. finally announced a crackdown on November 29, 1979, after a period of complaints. Several residents expressed their frustrations to reporter Bob Wyss. Mary Ross, resident of the West End and member of the block club, said every time she tried to complain to the police, they would tell her prostitution is “a victimless crime” and Mayor Cianci, Jr. would say he had done what he could and it was up to the courts to respond accordingly.⁴⁹ Several residents also expressed concerns before the House Judiciary Committee about the impact of prostitution on women and girls in the community.

Reverend Daniel Trainor, the pastor of Assumption Church at the time, testified before the House Judiciary Committee about the erosion of the community values and the nuisance for resident women and girls because of the increase in prostitution:

“No female over the age of ten can feel safe on the streets of the neighborhood... People cannot send their daughter out to the store for a quart of milk or a loaf of

⁴⁸ “Residents Write Mayor on Harlots.” Providence Journal. 21 June 1978.

⁴⁹ Wyss, Bob. “Prostitution crackdown works, but residents worry it won’t last” Providence Journal. 13 December 1979.

bread...because if they do they know some guy will drive up and say something to her....But if you try to do something you get your windows smashed, your gas line cut, or your tires slashed. It's a reign of terror."⁵⁰

Several residents expressed frustration about insufficient law enforcement protection and inefficiencies of the prostitution-case prosecutions. Residents reported the Transportation For Indecent Purposes- Streetwalking- Harboring Prostitution statute resulted in long delays in obtaining convictions and didn't get prostitutes off the streets or punish "johns."

COYOTE v. Roberts

On July 1, 1976, the plaintiffs, COYOTE, COYOTE of Rhode Island, Jane Doe and Sally Roe (two anonymous prostitutes)⁵¹ filed a civil class action suit in the U.S. Federal District Court of Rhode Island on behalf of all prostitutes, in Rhode Island against the defendants, RI Attorney General Julius Michaelson and Providence Police Chief Walter P. McQueeney on behalf of the state of RI in its law enforcement capacity.⁵² The plaintiffs claimed Transportation For Indecent Purposes- Streetwalking- Harboring Prostitution, which did not distinguish between buying and selling of sex, was used to arrest more women than men.

Plaintiffs also challenged the constitutionality of the Transportation For Indecent Purposes- Streetwalking- Harboring Prostitution statute. They argued criminalizing prostitution

⁵⁰ Walsh, Thomas E. "Legislators get message from West Enders and 'yea' bill to change prostitution laws." 22 March 1980. Rev. Trainor testified on 3/22/80.

⁵¹ Jane Doe and Sally Roe both claimed to be prostitutes at the time in the Providence area. Their actual identities were never revealed during the trial or in any case files. Likewise, attorneys I have spoken to were unaware of their identities.

⁵² Attorney General Julius Michaelson and Providence Police Chief Walter P. McQueeney were defendants when the case was filed, but during the period of the case the Attorney General became Dennis J. Roberts, II and the Providence Police Chief became Angelo C. Ricci both representing the State and the City in the suit, respectively. The court agreed to allow aliases for the prostitutes based on Attorney Ralph Gonnella's argument present on page 2 of the trial's transcript: "The more publicity or knowledge that the police have of who the girls are that do engage in this activity [prostitution], the more likely it is that the witnesses will be harassed."

criminalized a private consensual activity between two adults. They argued regulating sex was an infringement of the constitutional right to privacy. Additionally, plaintiffs argued the statute was void since it conflated both illegal and lawful consensual sex. The plaintiffs claimed the greater number of women than men arrested on prostitution charges was rooted in sexist and “stereotypic beliefs that the woman who engages in prostitution is ‘deviant’ whereas the man who purchases her services is just a ‘normal’ man.”⁵³

For *COYOTE v. Roberts* to be heard, the plaintiffs had to prove they had legal standing. To have legal standing, also known as a “case and controversy,”⁵⁴ a party has to demonstrate enough real harm from a law or action to have a legal stake in the case. The three requirements to prove standing are causation, injury, and redressability.⁵⁵

Causation, a direct causal connection between the party and the complaint, must be found. The party must have a real, not a theoretical, interest. Thus, a third party cannot sue. For instance, if a person falls down the stairs at the doctor’s office and breaks their leg, the person’s neighbor would be a third party, and they could not sue. The person who broke their leg would have to sue to have standing. The plaintiff’s claim was considered to be a “case and controversy” since the threat of prosecution was not imaginary or speculative since Jane Doe and Sally Roe were arrested in the past under Transportation For Indecent Purposes- Streetwalking- Harboring

⁵³ *COYOTE v. Roberts* [CV 76-0254] transcript. See page 74. This is part of Deborah Boyer’s testimony.

⁵⁴ The term “case and controversy” is the same as “standing.” Article III, section 2, clause 1 of the U.S. Constitution reads: “The judicial power shall extend to all cases, in law and equity, arising under this Constitution, the laws of the United States, and treaties made, or which shall be made, under their authority;--to all cases affecting ambassadors, other public ministers and consuls;--to all cases of admiralty and maritime jurisdiction;--to controversies to which the United States shall be a party;--to controversies between two or more states;--between a state and citizens of another state;--between citizens of different states;--between citizens of the same state claiming lands under grants of different states, and between a state, or the citizens thereof, and foreign states, citizens or subjects.” This imposes a requirement that all cases tried in U.S. federal courts must pose an actual dispute between adverse parties that the court can resolve. This also is the basis of the concept of legal standing. In *COYOTE v. Roberts*, the defendants are the Attorney General and Chief of Police are public ministers representative of the state of Rhode Island, and as such, the case is shown to have standing. See *Marbury v. Madison* 5 U.S. (Cranch) 137 (1803).

⁵⁵ Neubauer, David W. and Stephen S. Meinhold. *Judicial Process: Law Courts, and Politics in the United States*. (4th Ed.). Belmont, CA: Thomson Wadsworth, 2007. P. 450.

Prostitution and could be arrested again under the statute. Both women felt police discriminated against and targeted female prostitutes.

To have legal injury means the plaintiff, and not a third party, must have or will suffer because of the matter disputed. Both Jane Doe and Sally Roe's previous and prospective future arrests showed legal injury. Since the law suit was class-action on behalf of all prostitutes, Sally Roe and Jane Doe, both prostitutes, and the local and national COYOTE organizations largely comprised of prostitutes were vulnerable to arrests under criminal prostitution laws.

Redressability means a favorable court decision will likely remedy or prevent further injury to the parties. Plaintiffs advocated for decriminalization and for the police to stop discriminatorily enforcing the prostitution laws against women. In the Supplemental Opinion's discussion of causation, the case was found to be moot when the Transportation For Indecent Purposes- Streetwalking- Harboring Prostitution statute was amended and effectively decriminalized.⁵⁶ The amendments, therefore, gave redress.

While the defendants claimed they did not discriminatorily apply Transportation For Indecent Purposes- Streetwalking- Harboring Prostitution, the evidence from the defense's response to questions, or interrogatories, posed by plaintiffs prove otherwise.⁵⁷ Walter J. Clark, Administrative Assistant for the Providence Police Department, responded to the plaintiff's second set of interrogatories addressed to Angelo Ricci, former Chief of Providence Police in 1976, with answers about prostitution-related arrests between 1974 and 1977:

⁵⁶ When a legal issue is moot that means it is no longer an issue and the case has no standing.

⁵⁷ Interrogatories are just a formal set of written questions that are produced and propounded by one litigant to an adversary for the purpose of clarifying evidence, previewing, and determining what evidence will be used in trial.

Prostitution-Related Arrests in Providence, Rhode Island by Year and Sex

1974-1977

| Year | | §11-34-5 Transportation, Streetwalking or Harboring for Prostitution | | §11-45-1 Lewd, Wanton or Lascivious Behavior | | Total Arrests | |
|-------------|-------|--|---------|--|---------|------------------|---------|
| | | N | Percent | N | Percent | N | Percent |
| 1974 | Women | 90 | 91% | 9 | 64% | 99 | 87% |
| | Men | 9 | 9% | 5 | 36% | 14 | 13% |
| 1975 | Women | 158 | 89% | 45 | 86% | 203 | 88% |
| | Men | 20 | 11% | 7 | 14% | 27 | 12% |
| 1976 | Women | 92 | 48% | 158 | 89% | 250 | 68% |
| | Men | 99 | 52% | 20 | 11% | 119 | 32% |
| 1977 | Women | 268 | 78% | 26 | 63% | 294 | 76% |
| | Men | 76 | 22% | 15 | 37% | 91 | 24% |

The table above shows the number of prostitution-related arrests under Transportation For Indecent Purposes- Streetwalking- Harboring Prostitution and Lewd, Wanton, or Lascivious

Behavior. The chart is divided by gender, year, offense, and a total per year between 1974 and 1977.

The claim made by the plaintiffs that more women than men were arrested under the prostitution-related offenses is evidenced above. In the Supplemental Opinion for *COYOTE v. Roberts*, Judge Pettine said there were 846 women and 253 men arrested. The arrests show the difference between the number of men and women arrested. The discrimination is apparent. For violations under the same statute, of the 846 women arrested, all were charged, of the 253 men arrested, it is possible that no more than three were charged.⁵⁸ Of the 1,097 people arrested for prostitution-related offences, 77% were women and 23% were men.

From questions posed by the plaintiffs, the number of undercover police officers employed for prostitution investigations between 1974 and 1977 was revealed. It was not until 1976, the year the case was filed, that a female undercover officer was hired. After that, male undercover officers still accounted for 96% of the undercover officers for this period. In total, for the period between 1974 and 1977, of the 63 undercover officers hired, 87% were men and 13% were women.⁵⁹ The gendered differences in the data pointed to discrimination.

Three witnesses testified in the *COYOTE v. Roberts* trial on September 25, 1979: Jane Doe (an anonymous prostitute), Margo St. James (founder of *COYOTE*), and Deborah Boyer (a research assistant for Dr. Jennifer James). All witnesses testified on behalf of the plaintiffs and

⁵⁸ In the December 17, 1980 Supplemental Opinion for *COYOTE et. al. v. Roberts et. al.* [CV 76-0254], Judge Pettine mentioned the above statistics which can also be found in the defendant's responses to interrogatories. In footnote 11, Pettine says that there are no firm statistics on the number of males actually charged, and that it could range from three to forty-eight. Three males were charged in 1977, as confirmed by Narcotics Inspector for the Providence Police Department, Malcom Brown. The affidavit of records keeper for the State-wide Judicial Information System said that forty-eight males "had been indicted or had criminal information returned against them in Providence County for §11-34-5" between 1968 to February 1979.

⁵⁹ This information came from the defendants' interrogatories. Interesting to note is that the first women employed as undercover officers in the prostitution investigations were hired in 1976, the year *COYOTE v. Roberts*. [CV 76-0254] was filed.

advocated for decriminalization of prostitution based on their experience. In his opinion, Judge Pettine reflected that the plaintiffs were most concerned with decriminalizing the act of prostitution. Part of the plaintiff's campaign and motivation for decriminalization was to protect the privacy of adult consensual sex from control of the state.

At the time of the trial, Jane Doe claimed to be a thirty year old prostitute, working as a "call girl" and living in Providence. She said she began prostituting at age twenty in Florida. She was arrested once before the trial, and was brought before the Grand Jury, who did not return an indictment.⁶⁰ Doe had been a member of the Rhode Island chapter of COYOTE for three years. She claimed there were approximately 100-150 members in Rhode Island who were trying to change the prostitution laws and provide legal counsel to those arrested.⁶¹ Doe testified about the four types of prostitution she believed existed: "call girls," "camp girls," "bar girls," and "street girls." She worked as all four types of prostitutes, in the following order: "camp girl," "street girl," "bar girl," and finally "call girl."

In Doe's descriptions of each type of prostitute in the previous chapter, issues of safety, susceptibility to pimp control, sexism, and classism were present. The prostitutes' safety was discussed in each type of prostitution, including the likelihood of reporting crimes committed against the prostitutes. Doe used the story of her assault, un-related to prostitution, to show the prejudice of law enforcement against prostitutes and the effects of displacing the blame from perpetrator to victim or not taking an attack seriously. Also, since the act of prostitution was illegal, the women feared being arrested if they reported a crime committed against them. Doe explained many prostitutes were susceptible to pimp control to protect them from violent "johns," to support a substance abuse addiction, to find "johns," or to help them find legal

⁶⁰ COYOTE v. Roberts [CV 76-0254] transcript. See pages 14 through 46 for Jane Doe's testimony.

⁶¹ See pages 33-35 of the above transcript.

counsel should they be arrested. Doe said the relationship with the pimp is a false sense of protection. She said the pimps are greedy, selfish, and the situation could become exploitative. Doe accused police of being motivated by sexism and classism in making arrests. She believed “call girls” were least likely to be arrested because they are more likely to regularly service wealthy clients, while “street walkers” or “camp girls,” who more often service working-class men, are most frequently arrested. Doe claimed, rightfully so, more women were arrested than men.

Margo St. James, the founder of COYOTE, was the second witness called. In 1962 St. James was arrested for “soliciting and keeping a disorderly house.”⁶² She later said: “I was a loose woman and always had people hanging out and smoking dope and partying.”⁶³ She claimed she worked as a prostitute for a number of years, and in 1973, St. James founded COYOTE in San Francisco. In her testimony, St. James said the purpose of COYOTE:

“was to decriminalize prostitution in the U.S., to repeal the prohibition against prostitution and to collect information that can help lawyers facilitate that change in the law...and to give us the information to lobby the legislatures to change the laws.”⁶⁴

In her testimony in COYOTE v. Roberts, St. James relayed her belief that law enforcement discriminatorily enforced prostitution laws, first and foremost, against women, and also along race and class lines.⁶⁵ St. James contended she did not want to

⁶² Christine Beatty. “The Gospel According to St. James: San Francisco’s Pioneering Personal Freedom Advocate Runs for Supervisor, *The Spectator*, November 1, 1996, p.9.

⁶³ From page 184 of *From Time Without Work: People Who Are Not Working Tell Their Stories, How They Feel, What They Do, How They Survive*” by Walli F. Leff and Marilyn G. Haft. Boston: South End Press, 1983.

⁶⁴ COYOTE v. Roberts [CV 76-0254] transcript. See pages 47-49.

⁶⁵ On page 52 of the above transcript, Margo St. James testifies that in jail studies she alleges were done by COYOTE, in which she participated, were conducted over six month periods spanning for four years with questionnaires: it was found that 50% of women in jail are there for prostitution, the average age of those women in

see prostitution legalized but legitimized. She rejected criminalizing prostitution because she felt it violates the right to privacy of sex whether or not remuneration occurs and felt it does not help stop ancillary crimes or exploitation:

“In my opinion the criminalizing of the prostitute accelerates the degree of her victimization from assault, rape, robbery, exploitation, and it also encourages both parties, let’s not forget the customer, to commit the crimes against each other.”⁶⁶

She further promoted decriminalization by denouncing legalization in discussing the exploitative legalized brothels in Nevada:

“It’s brothelized, and that’s the landlord’s system, which I see as exploitive and the women’s mobility is sharply curtailed. She has to stay in the building for two or three weeks...[She works] 14 to 18 hours a day, and the house takes at least half, and then she has to pay expenses. She’s lucky if she gets away with a third of the money that she generated while she worked there, and if she does there are laws in those little towns where the brothels are located that she cannot go out except between 4:00 p.m. and 6:00 p.m., she can only go to the store or one bar, brothel, the owner happens to own the bar, she’s not allowed into the casinos, she’s not allowed on the street, she’s not allowed to have any family living in that town, so I think those kinds of laws we’ve got to guard against.”⁶⁷

Deborah Boyer, who then was a graduate student at the University of Washington and research associate of Dr. Jennifer James, a professor of anthropology and human sexuality at the University of Washington in Seattle, was the last witness called.⁶⁸ Boyer said Dr. James is a “nationally recognized expert on prostitution” with extensive

21, with an average of 11 years in school, one child, mostly divorced, most arrested more than three times, and over 70% are minority women.

⁶⁶ COYOTE v. Roberts [CV 76-0254] transcript. See page 58-59. Later on pages 61-62, Margo St. James illustrates the exploitative circumstances of criminalized prostitution in brothels in Italy in which “all the women [were put] out on the street, and that became a worse problem than the brothels had been.”

⁶⁷ See pages 63-64 of above transcript.

⁶⁸ See pages 70-97 of the above transcript for the testimony of Deborah Boyer. Dr. Jennifer James sent Deborah Boyer to testify on her behalf. Dr. James (Ph.D. in anthropology) worked also in the Department of Psychiatry and Behavioral Sciences and had done research on prostitution and “female deviant criminal behavior” for the past ten years. Deborah Boyer has a B.A. in criminal justice. Deborah Boyer, who received her Ph.D. became a cultural anthropologist and for the past twenty years has focused on studying those who are homeless and on the streets according to “Seattle Woman Studies Anthropology of Homelessness” by Ann Dornfield of Oregon Public Broadcasting 5/30/2008.

publications in the field who has done several studies on prostitution.⁶⁹ Boyer was working with Dr. James since 1976, during which time she worked on two projects “studying female deviants, adult prostitution, juvenile prostitution, female criminal involvement, and addiction.”⁷⁰ She was also involved with a task force reviewing prostitution legislation in Seattle and King County, Washington. Boyer was working with Dr. James on a book, had spoken at several public forums, and counseled prostitutes.

Boyer discussed her observance of enforcement of prostitution. She said:

“It’s very obvious that the laws are enforced against women. It’s very seldom that customers are arrested. If they are arrested it’s generally some type of a political cleanup tactic to make somebody look good and very, very seldom are there ever any sentences imposed.”⁷¹

Boyer argued prostitution should be decriminalized in the criminal code, but supported regulation in the civil code. Boyer argued criminalizing prostitution only made it dangerous.⁷² She said that pimping, however, should remain illegal: “...pimping is a very exploitive and coercive situation in which someone is practically a slave...the woman is dependent on the pimp for protection,” and when prostitution is illegal Boyer alleged the prostitute is much more dependent on the pimp.⁷³ She said what is particularly dangerous about this is since the prostitute is involved in an illegal activity,

⁶⁹ See page 72 of the above transcript.

⁷⁰ COYOTE v. Robters [CV-0254] transcript. See page 71.

⁷¹ See pages 76-77 of the above transcript.

⁷² See pages 81-82 of the above transcript. When asked about the moral need for laws against prostitution to protect against illegal sexual activity and protect the sanctity of marriage, Boyer responds that : “Well, our studies on customers and reports from the women whom we have interviewed who are involved in prostitution are that the majority of customers are married men, their average age is 40 years old, they’re generally white, they’re middle class, with children, so the laws literally have no effect on the sanctity of marriage.”

⁷³ See page 87 of above transcript.

if some other illegal activity is committed against her, such as physical assault or rape, the police treat the illegal activities together.⁷⁴

The testimony of Jane Doe, Margo St. James, and Deborah Boyer, and the statistics from the interrogatories, showed discrimination based on sex was taking place in enforcing prostitution laws. The testimony also characterized the nature of prostitution, and showed its potential for exploitation, coercion, and physical danger, while maintaining prostitution is a harmless, private, consensual sexual act.

Causation of COYOTE v. Roberts for Decriminalization

Before the case could be taken further, amendments to Transportation For Indecent Purposes—Streetwalking—Harboring Prostitution mooted the case. Judge Pettine wrote in his December 17, 1980 Supplemental Opinion, that due to the amendments to Transportation For Indecent Purposes—Streetwalking—Harboring Prostitution, which both parties felt had substantially diminished the unconstitutionality of the statute: “the amendments appear to have decriminalized the sexual act itself, even when undertaken for remuneration.”⁷⁵ Because the sexual act was decriminalized, COYOTE v. Roberts was no longer a “case and controversy.” Regardless of the continuation of anti-solicitation laws, the decriminalization of prostitution

⁷⁴ See page 91 of the above transcript. Boyer also says “Prostitutes are raped and no charges will be filed. There’s the idea that a prostitute can’t be raped.”

⁷⁵ The issue of mootness was addressed in the Memorandum and Order filed on December 17, 1980 concerning attorney’s fees. Judge Pettine wrote: “In this §1983 action challenging the constitutionality of a Rhode Island criminal statute, plaintiffs seek attorney’s fees on the theory that their action was at least partially responsible for recent amendments to the statute which effectively mooted the case.” On September 22, 1980 a consent order was filed declaring the case moot. See pages 9-10 of the supplemental opinion filed on December 17, 1980 by Judge Pettine. Pettine observes that prostitution, while decriminalized, may be difficult to engage in because all preparatory activity remains felonious.

indoors furthered the campaign for decriminalization of what the plaintiff's called: "private, adult consensual sexual activity" despite the commercial transaction occurring.⁷⁶

Once the case was mooted, the plaintiffs' attorneys filed for fees. No award to the attorneys could be made if the court found the plaintiffs' actions to be completely superfluous in bringing about changes to Transportation For Indecent Purposes—Streetwalking—Harboring Prostitution.

The court found that the procedural amendments that made prostitution a petty misdemeanor were a response to the community outcry against the increase in prostitution on the West End of Providence. The procedural amendments sought for streamlining the prosecution process hoping for speedier convictions that would stem the increase in prostitution. This did not account for the substantive amendments addressing phrases related to outlawing the commission of acts of prostitution and other indecent acts. Specifically, the substantive amendments to Transportation for Indecent Purposes— Streetwalking—Harboring Prostitution removed language about committing sex acts in a private place.

Concisely, community action may be responsible in part for changing penalties in the Transportation For Indecent Purposes—Streetwalking—Harboring Prostitution statute, but COYOTE v. Roberts is completely responsible for decriminalizing prostitution indoors. It would not have happened without the law suit.⁷⁷ Thus, the court found COYOTE v. Roberts to be a significant causal factor in decriminalization and attorneys were awarded fees.

Prostitution Amendments in 1980

⁷⁶ See page 10 of the December 17, 1980 Supplement Opinion filed by Judge Pettine. He says, too, that the plaintiffs would have been happier if all private preparatory activity was decriminalized as well, but they were happy with the results regardless.

⁷⁷ This argument can be found on pages 6-10 of the December 17, 1980 Opinion by Judge Pettine.

The increase of prostitution in the West End of Providence in the 1970s frustrated residents. They were frustrated further by the inefficiencies of prosecutorial efforts to reduce prostitution. Before Transportation For Indecent Purposes—Streetwalking—Harboring Prostitution was amended, the solicitation was felonious, meaning prostitutes arrested would have a trial by jury and were entitled to an appeals process. The court proceedings were lengthy and prostitutes did not usually wait in jail for hearings. George Kelly, a resident of the West End who testified before the House Judiciary committee on March 21, 1980, regarded the legislation prior to the decriminalization being “as useful as a screen door in a submarine.”⁷⁸ In response, attendee of the meeting Chief Judge Henry E. Laliberte drafted legislation sponsored by Representative Matthew J. Smith and Senator Richard A. Patterson.⁷⁹

Rep. Matthew J. Smith and Senator Richard A. Patterson, the sponsors of the 1980 prostitution amendments, worked to redefine prostitution from being a felony to a petty misdemeanor for both buyers and sellers of sex. Pandering remained felonious. While the reduction of penalties may have seemed in conflict with the intention of cracking down on prostitution, the amendments, Smith and Patterson reasoned, would “bring about speedier court decisions and limit appeals, which [then took] a long time to resolve and [left] prostitutes on the streets in the process.”⁸⁰ While it is unusual for a Judge to draft legislation, Laliberte also cited the intensity of Rep. Smith’s support of this bill as unique in saying: “It is unusual for House

⁷⁸ Walsh, Thomas E. “Legislators get message from West Enders and ‘yea’ bill to change prostitution laws” Providence Journal. 22 March 1980 in the *Providence Journal* on 3/22/80.

⁷⁹ Walsh, Thomas E. “Smith bill would speed decisions on prostitution.” Providence Journal. 19 March 1980. In this article Chief Justice Henry Laliberte is named the author of the prostitution amendments. Chief Justice Henry Laliberte was also the Rhode Island Democratic Delegate to the Democratic National Convention in 1960 and the former president of the Providence City Council (1955-1965), the former Chairman of the Downtown Master Planning Committee of the City Council, and a former member of the Board of Directors for Progress in Providence. It was unusual for a Judge to write legislation, as judges typically do not become politically involved.

⁸⁰ Walsh, Thomas E. “Legislators get message from West Enders and ‘yea’ bill to change prostitution laws” Providence Journal. 22 March 1980.

Speakers to personally push for legislation but in this case Smith said he will ‘push as hard as [he] can.’⁸¹

Prior to amendments to the prostitution-related statutes made on May 15, 1980, §11-34-5 prostitution was criminalized indoors and felonious:

TRANSPORTATION FOR INDECENT PURPOSES – STREETWALKING—HARBORING PROSTITUTION.—It shall be unlawful for any person to secure, direct or transport, or offer to secure, direct or transport another for the purpose of prostitution, or for any other lewd or indecent act; or to loiter in or near any thoroughfare or public or private place for the purpose of inducing, enticing, soliciting, or procuring another to commit lewdness, fornication, unlawful sexual intercourse or any other indecent act; or to commit or in any manner induce, entice, or solicit, or procure a person in any thoroughfare, or public or private place or conveyance to commit any such act; or to receive or offer or agree to receive any person into any place, structure, house, building, room, or conveyance for the purpose of committing any such acts, or knowingly permit any person to remain therein for any such purposes, or to, in any way, aid or abet or participate in any of the acts or things enumerated herein.

Any person found guilty under this section, shall be subject to imprisonment in the adult correctional institutions not to exceed five (5) years.

The 1980 amendments were both substantive and procedural. The May 15, 1980, amendments decriminalized prostitution indoors in RI and moved the act of prostitution to §11-34-8, Loitering for Indecent Purposes, a new section. The act of prostitution became a misdemeanor with a truncated appeals process. Certain preparatory acts remained felonious. The legislation read:

§11-34-5: TRANSPORTATION FOR INDECENT PURPOSES—HARBORING PROSTITUTION.—It shall be unlawful for any person for pecuniary gain, to secure, direct or transport, or offer to secure, direct or transport another for the purpose of prostitution, or for any other lewd or indecent act; or to receive or offer to agree to receive any person into any place, structure, house, building, room, or conveyance for the purpose of committing any such acts, or knowingly permit any person to remain herein for any such purposes, or to, in any way, aid or abet or participate in any of the acts or things enumerated herein.

⁸¹ Walsh, Thomas E. “Smith bill would speed decisions on prostitutes” Providence Journal, 22 March 1980.

§ 11-34-8: LOITERING FOR INDECENT PURPOSES—It shall be unlawful for any person to stand or wander in or near any public highway or street, or any public or private place, and attempt to stop motor vehicles, for the purpose of prostitution or other indecent act, or to patronize or induce or otherwise secure a person to commit any such act. Any person found guilty under this section shall be deemed guilty of a petty misdemeanor and shall be subject to imprisonment for a term not exceeding six (6) months or by a fine of not more than five hundred dollars (\$500), or both.

Analysis:

In theory, those advocating for the amendments to the prostitution-related laws felt this would be more efficient. Previously, since prostitution was a felony, the legal process was lengthy and prostitutes would remain on the streets waiting for a jury trial. The procedural amendments making prostitution a petty misdemeanor seem to have been intended to speed up the legal process, and thus, allow for a greater number of arrests, in hopes of reducing the prostitution issue. The predominant concern, it seems, from the community meetings and growing pressure to address the prostitution issue, was to have it removed from the community. The residents of the West End may not have realized the substantive amendments effectively decriminalized prostitution indoors, and if they did realize, their greatest concern seemed to be getting prostitutes off the street and out of their neighborhood. If prostitution was occurring indoors, it was invisible to the community.

Judge Pettine determined the sex discrimination law suit moot, since amendments passed in 1980 redressed the complaints of *COYOTE v. Roberts* through decriminalization. The determination of *COYOTE v. Roberts* as a causal factor, along with media attention to increasing prostitution and community action, not superfluous to the amendments to Transportation For Indecent Purposes—Streetwalking—Harboring Prostitution and the addition of Loitering for Indecent Purposes in the Criminal Code in the Supplemental Opinion to determine attorney's

fees showed the influence of the suit. Analysis of the suit and community action also reveals, while community action may have been responsible for procedural amendments, decriminalization of prostitution indoors was entirely because of COYOTE v. Roberts.

While Rhode Island seemed to certainly have a sex industry prior to 1980, as is clear from the testimony of Jane Doe, the increasing reputation of Rhode Island as a sex tourism destination, in part because of the safety from legal recourse indoors, seems to have increased the demand in Rhode Island. One way of monitoring this is through the expansion of the massage parlor brothel industry, one form of indoor prostitution.

CHAPTER FOUR:

ASIAN MASSAGE PARLOR BROTHELS

Introduction:

The massage parlor brothel industry increased after decriminalization and exponentially grew after media attention to the issue of sex trafficking. The industry is much different today than before decriminalization of prostitution indoors in 1980. Only a couple of American massage parlor brothels and few American escort service rings seemed to represent the existent organized indoor prostitution industry before 1980. The first time an Asian massage parlor brothel was mentioned in local media was in 1997, when police raided a “spa” on Park Avenue in Providence.⁸² In November 1998, police raided Club Osaka, and found more than a house of prostitution. Sgt. Nicholas Cardarelli, commander of the Special Services Division of the Providence Police Department, said “This was like slavery.”⁸³ The brothel used a front of a legitimate health club, but during the raid, the machines were found to be unplugged and undercover officers were propositioned with sexual services during massages. Officers seized \$14,000 and a bag of pink condoms.

The raid found women had been brought to the United States from Southeast Asia. They were lured to Flushing, NY, by the club owner’s girlfriend, and then transferred to Providence. They were forced into prostitution to pay off their travel expenses, and kept nothing but cash tips, from which they paid living expenses. The women worked sixteen to eighteen hour days.

⁸² Salit, Richard. “Four charged in raid of alleged brothel.” Providence Evening Bulletin. 28 August 1997. C-5. Detective Captain Michael Chalek said police raided a 1071 Park Avenue spa when Il Kang of Greenlawn, NY solicited an undercover officer. She and the manager, Kim Cha of Warwick were arrested. The word spa is in quotations because this is one of the fronts the massage parlor brothels use to pose as a legitimate business

⁸³ Rockoff, Johnathan. “Police allege club was a brothel; The Providence police say that women from Southeast Asia were brought to Club Osaka to work as prostitutes to pay off their passage to the United States” Providence Journal. 24 November 1998. B-1.

Cigarette burns were found on one of the women's arms. The owner of the club, Seng Uk Han, and six women were arrested. Han was investigated by federal agents who believed the club may have been part of a nation-wide ring. Charges against the women were dropped.⁸⁴ Media coverage of the raid of Club Osaka was the first mention of sex trafficking in local media, and afterwards, a series of massage parlor brothel raids periodically were mentioned in the local media. Measures to regulate the massage parlor industry have faltered throughout the years.

Today there is a densely concentrated sex industry operating indoors offering commercial sex acts without breaking prostitution laws. Examples include massage parlors, nail salons, apartments, hotels, strip clubs, and escort services. While it is important to acknowledge the existence of other venues of prostitution that may be linked to sex trafficking, the research focused on the massage parlor brothels in Rhode Island for a number of reasons. The massage parlors advertise publicly, seem to be highly organized, many times have a paper trail through corporate files, and have received a lot of media attention.

Tracing the history and patterns of the Asian massage parlor brothels generates the most information and has been concretely linked to sex trafficking. Decriminalization of prostitution indoors allows the Asian massage parlor brothel industry to expand, perpetuating an industry vulnerable to sex trafficking. This chapter seeks to illustrate the trends, history, and nature of the Asian massage parlor brothels in Rhode Island by tracing observed patterns of the brothels, indicators of sex trafficking, providing profiles of the prostitutes and the "johns," history, and case studies.

⁸⁴ From "Providence police drop charges against women arrested in raid. The owner of Club Osaka remains charged with several prostitution-related counts. Meanwhile the U.S. Attorney's Office is reviewing the case" by Johnathan Rockoff in the *Providence Journal* on 6 March 1999, A-3.

General Observances and Trends

The Massage Parlor

To date there are 33 identified massage parlor brothels in Rhode Island; 32 advertise Asian women and one advertises American women.⁸⁵ These figures reflect tremendous growth. In 1998, there seemed to be two to three Asian massage parlor brothels. In 2006, there were ten to twelve. Over the period of observation (from May 2008 to April 2009), several new massage parlor brothels have opened, relocated, or have been renamed. At the beginning of the research period, there were 23, by October 2008, there were 28, and as of April 2009, there are at least 32.

There is a misconception all the massage parlor brothels are in Providence in unsafe or poor areas. Asian massage parlor brothels can also be found in Middletown, North Providence, Central Falls, East Providence, Pawtucket, Warwick, and Cranston. Some of the massage parlors are located in residential areas, some in commercial, industry, or manufacturing areas. Some are stand-alone buildings, some part of strip malls, or part of an office building. Some of the massage parlor brothels are located in expensive, mainstream, commercial districts near public officials' offices. Some are located near housing projects, schools, playgrounds, nurseries, and family businesses. Nearly all of the massage parlor brothels have easy highway access, most off of interstate 95. It seems there is a high concentration of Asian businesses and social associations near the massage parlor brothels that advertise Asian women. For instance, two of the Asian massage parlor brothels are within a few buildings of one another, near two Asian restaurants, an Asian social association, an Asian market, and an Asian nail salon. Ethnic

⁸⁵ Achorn, Edward. "One business R.I. could do without." Providence Journal. 10 April 2007. B-5. Achorn claims there are Asian women working in 100 or more brothels in Rhode Island. I believe there are far more than 34 brothels in the state prostituting women of other ethnicities, too.

business concentration is true for several of the Asian massage parlor brothels. Some are also close to “adult entertainment” stores, strip clubs, bars, and restaurants. Closeness in proximity to other Asian ethnic businesses or to entertainment businesses could indicate a correlation.

The visibility and means of concealment of massage parlor brothels varies. Differences in exterior and interior upkeep and appearance, registration and compliance with rules of incorporation, and public advertisement show the diversity of prominence. The massage parlor brothels can occupy stand-alone buildings, floors of a multi-tiered commercial building, part of a residential apartment building, or part of a multiplex building.

The exterior marking of the brothel differs. The massage parlor brothels either pose as a legitimate business or as inconspicuously as possible. Those posing as legitimate businesses use fronts such as health centers, wellness centers, bodywork centers, and spas. All massage parlor brothels cover their windows, but those using fronts of legitimate business have more ornate and inviting window coverings, such as bamboo, trellises, and leaves. They usually have a front entrance, lobby, and rooms with massage tables in them, or with exercise equipment, or health information posted on the walls. The true nature of the business, however, is clearer when more closely examining the impersonating mechanisms—finding machines unplugged and dusty in health centers, outdated health information in a different language posted in wellness centers, or a lack of massage tables in massage parlors. These massage parlors may even have big awnings with their name on it or big signs outside, but walking into and taking a look around the inside, it becomes clear the advertised business is just a front for a brothel.

Other massage parlor brothels take measures to remain as hidden as possible. Usually these brothels, if marked at all, will be marked only with the building number, with a neon or LCD “open” sign, or marked somewhere on the building with “SPA” in red letters. Sometimes

the brothel has simply written “SPA” with permanent black marker on the doorbell. A growing number of massage parlor brothels are operating out of residential buildings. These brothels use window coverings like black paint, sheets, or cardboard that are less decorative.

Even if there is a front door, the “johns” usually enter through a back or side door. The “johns” many times have to be buzzed in from a remote location monitored by surveillance video cameras.⁸⁶ The front desk is staffed by the “madam”/ “mamasan,”⁸⁷ or on occasion, by a male manager, called the “papasan.” One of the more legitimate-appearing brothels was entered through the front door during research and the distressed reaction of the woman acting as the madam indicated entering through the front door was unusual.

Many of the Asian massage parlor brothels have a high level of self-containment, meaning efforts are made to make it difficult to easily enter or exit the brothel aside from one entry that is closely monitored. For instance, “Spa F” in Providence has sheets blocking the front windows, the fire escape is ripped off the back of the building, the garage door and back windows on the first floor have been sealed, and there are bars on the second story windows. For many of the massage parlor brothels, there is only one easy way in or out and the entrances and exits are monitored by surveillance video camera. Self-containment, interference of women’s ability to freely leave the brothel, and close counter-surveillance and monitoring of women’s movement indicate sex trafficking.

The variance of the massage parlor brothels’ participation as a corporation and maintaining compliance with corporation standards and rules also shows how some massage

⁸⁶ This information is confirmed from observation of “johns” entering through back or side doors. The “johns” time and again have reported on the “johns’ forums” that they enter through back or side doors. For instance, on 5/29/07, “Buggie 100” writes: “Found the door and rang the buzzer. The lock clicked, I entered.”

⁸⁷ “Mamasan” is another term for “madam,” a usually older female manager of a brothel. “Mamasan” is a term the johns have been using in this region to identify the female manager.

parlor brothels try to pose as legitimate. Many massage parlor brothels in commercial zones incorporate, some as a domestic profit corporation and some as limited liability companies, pursuant to Title 7, Rhode Island Businesses Corporation Act, listing themselves as “spas,” “massage parlors,” “health and beauty services,” or not listing a purpose. The massage parlor brothels register in a way that makes them hard to locate and track. Some massage parlor brothels are listed under different names or locations than they advertise. Nearly all of the massage parlor brothels incorporated have changed business names, managers, locations, purpose, and registering agent more than once. Analysis of the massage parlor brothel corporate files found all of the managers, owners, or incorporators have Asian names. Many were listed as living in New York, in mostly Flushing,⁸⁸ and many were also listed residing at the brothel location.

The massage parlor brothels usually advertise publicly, using code language to alert the “johns” that they are offering sexual services. Some of the codes include: “body rubs,” “body shampoos,” “table showers,” “acupressure,” “dry saunas,” and “Hot Asian Women.” Many of the massage parlor brothels advertise in the “Adult” section of the *Providence Phoenix*, a free weekly local publication, supported by the sex industry, under the section entitled, “Spas,” varying in frequency. Massage parlor brothels do most of their advertising on the internet. Some massage parlor brothels advertise and are reviewed on more mainstream websites like Yahoo.com and other local business and spa listings, and the therapeutic section of Craigslist.com. A good number advertise on “adult entertainment” websites, mostly the “erotic services” section of Craigslist.com, a site used to promote commercial sex acts. The explicitness

⁸⁸ United States Department of Justice. “31 Korean Nationals Arrested Throughout the Northeastern United States in Federal Human Trafficking Case.” Press Release. 16 August 2006. Flushing, NY is often referred to as a center for information and transit of Korean sex trafficking. This Press Release is one example.

of the advertisements vary, from nude or semi-nude photos of Asian women in suggestive poses with insinuating text such as “no rush,” “We leave you glowing from top to toe,” “Come and we make you cum,” to more clinical photos with code language. Other “adult entertainment” sites include Spafinder.com, FindaLay.com, and BigDoggie.net, where “johns” are able to rate the brothel facility and prostitute. The most frequented and complex review site, the “johns” forums on USA Sexguide, provides a space for “johns” to give detailed reviews of the experiences they have at the Asian massage parlor brothels, discuss relevant media coverage, sexual fantasies, and concerns.

The advertised Asian massage parlor brothel business hours differ from the typical legitimate massage therapy business. Generally, the massage parlor brothels open early in the morning, around 9:00 or 10:00, and stay open well into the night, the latest advertised at 3:00 in the morning. These hours mean the prostitutes could have as long as fourteen to sixteen hour days, with little rest. Sometimes, women work while menstruating or even if they are sick. For example, on November 21, 2005, the “johns” reported that “Chanel” of “Spa L” had returned from the dentist and was in pain and still made to work. They said the women have mentioned they do not have control of their schedule. At “Spa GG,” a “john” reported of “Lidi”: “[she] did mention she works everyday and has no time off...sounds like she’s working off a debt or simply, not free to set her own schedule.”⁸⁹

Advertisement on the streets and referrals of businesses to the brothels are part of indications of sophisticated and organized networks. Observation of a number of brothels found men ranging in age patrolling the vicinity of the brothel on bicycles, motorcycles, or in vehicles. “Johns” patronized a number of local entertainment businesses, such as bars, strip clubs, and

⁸⁹ Posted on the USA Sexguide.info on 7/7/06 by “A Regular Guy.”

restaurants, and made use of parking lots when the brothel did not have their own.

Conversations with local business owners and employees near the brothels were all aware of prostitution occurring in the brothel. When observing more than one brothel in a day, it was common that at second and third brothels, and so on, the “madam” would very quickly come outside upon arrival. Similar appearing cars were found at a number of brothels at different times.⁹⁰ During observation, usually at some point a woman would come out to see what was going on. The only women who came out were clearly the “madams,” older Asian women, with a generally concerned attitude, often phone in hand. Sometimes the “madam” would just peak out the door or window, other times they were confrontational. One “madam” went as far as to chase down the street, and when talked to, went through a range of emotions and reasoning in an attempt to prevent further observation or suspicion. Periodically, men who seemed to be managers would be inside the brothels overlooking the brothel.⁹¹

The massage parlor brothels offer a range of sexual services including: vaginal and anal intercourse, fellatio, cunnilingus, and manual stimulation. When “johns” refer to “extras” it could be any sexual service. After entering the massage parlor brothel, usually through a side or back door, the “johns” are screened by the “madam” or male manager. They are asked if they have been there before. If they have not, the “johns” are supposed to indicate they have been to other

⁹⁰ Observation has seen the same cars at different brothels. On the USA Sexguide on 1/9/09, “Guest 123” reported: “I neglected to mention in my previous report that yesterday while I was there [‘Spa L’], a Grey Mercedes SUV stopped at the corner and picked up a middle-aged asian woman [sic.] waiting outside the building. I didn’t think much of it at the time. However, while I was parked there today, the same Grey Mercedes SUV that I saw yesterday pulled up front. The male driver and a woman got out and walked into the building carrying a new 32” flat panel TV and other boxes of stuff. I hung around eating my lunch, so I pulled out behind them when they left. Two blocks later I decided to follow them to see where they would go. They went straight to ‘Spa S’, park[ed] in back and walked into the back door.”

⁹¹ Posted on the USA Sexguide on 8/4/07, Vargr mentions a “papasan,” or male manager at “Spa Y.”

massage parlor brothels. The “johns” pay the house fee of approximately \$60-\$70.⁹² The appointment most of the time is a walk-in, but “johns” sometimes call ahead and book an appointment with a preferred woman. When available, the “johns” can request a line-up of women to choose from.

The “johns,” then, are taken to a room to undress, sometimes a sauna, and given a place to store their belongings, such as a plastic purse or locker. One way the “johns” indicate wanting sexual services is remaining nude. Another code is putting all the money necessary for a particular service within a site, such as on a table or counter.

Next, depending on the available facilities at the massage parlor brothel, the “john” is given a table shower or shower. Usually the table shower consists of a scrubbing clean of the body in some manner; either using buckets of water, which is preferred, or by spraying water. During the table shower, it is common that some sort of manual stimulation or sexual “teasing” is initiated by the prostitute.

Following the shower, the “john” is brought to the “massage room,” in which the “massage table” could be anything from a dirty bare mattress on the floor to a professional massage table. The “massage” consists of touching or pushing with fingertips, sliding of the “prostitute’s” body against the “john’s,” back-walking, or a massage comparable to a professional one. The “john” typically is placed facedown, and some sort of massage is initiated. Before the “john” is turned over onto his back, there is some level of sexual “teasing,” at which point sexual services are generally negotiated. Options vary from manual stimulation from \$50-\$80, oral sex from \$60-\$100, and sexual intercourse from \$120-\$160 in addition to the house fee.

⁹² Recently, perhaps in response to the recession and increased competition from several new massage parlor brothels, the massage parlors have been offering coupons in the *Providence Phoenix* or “internet specials” on Craigslist.com to reduce the house fee, generally by \$10 or 10-15% off.

Following the sexual services, if there is time remaining in the forty-five- minute or hour-long session (based on house fee), the woman will continue to give the “john” a “massage.” Occasionally the prostitute will participate in the “GFE” (girlfriend experience), an expectation of many “johns” by lying down with the “john,” helping dress them, or bringing them something to drink.

The Prostitutes

Nearly all of the women at the massage parlor brothels are Asian, mostly Korean, Japanese, or Chinese.⁹³ The women range in age. The “johns” have hinted that some of the women are underage. They have complained of “tightness” and feeling they were “ripping [the prostitutes] apart.”⁹⁴ These complaints could signal prostitutes’ youth or lack of sexual experience. Sometimes the prostitutes leave and come back taller and more developed after a period of time, which means the prostitutes could still be in puberty. The prostitutes’ timidity and reluctance could be age-related. Reporter Edward Achorn wrote:

“Many of [the women at the massage parlors] are underage when they arrive, in the bloom of girlhood...In a few years, they have become hardened, brutalized, beaten down, addicted to drugs, afflicted by sores, infected with disease. Some receive a death sentence of AIDS.”⁹⁵

Usually the “madam” is the older woman at the massage parlor brothels. Some women are in their forties or fifties, as one “john” recalls: “I felt like I was forcing myself on a 40+ year old fat

⁹³ “Police allege club was a brothel; The Providence police say that women from southeast Asia were brought to Club Osaka to work as prostitutes to pay off their passage to the United States” by Johnathan Rockoff in the Providence Journal on 1/24/98.” Johns” frequently report on the ethnicity of the prostitutes. Rockoff provides one instance in which the press has commented on the ethnicity of the women found during brothel raids.

⁹⁴ “But when she started sounding like I was ripping her apart, I lost it.” [about “Yoko” from “Spa L”] written by “SuperXFly on 6/9/06 on USA Sexguide. “Spa L,” especially, is known for having younger women. For instance, “Mickey,” who was new at “Spa L” in April of 2006 is described as being “very tight” and uncomfortable being touched.

⁹⁵ Achorn, Edward. “One business R.I could do without.” Providence Journal. 10 April 2007. B-5.

sex slave.”⁹⁶ Observation has found “madams” to appear as old as in their sixties. It seems common for the prostitutes to be sent out for cosmetic surgery, most commonly breast implants and liposuction.⁹⁷

From a number of raids, it has been indicated most of the women at the massage parlor brothels are foreign nationals, with many women undocumented. Phone calls made to the massage parlor brothels found the women to likely not have been raised in the United States. Most of the women could barely speak English, and their English was spoken with a thick accent. The longer the conversation continued, the more nervous, suspicious, and at times hostile their attitudes became. When inquiring about the price of services or when unsure of what was being said, the women would quote the house fee rate, “\$60.” The women whose English was slightly better were pressed further about services offered. Many times the women would say an appointment would have to be made well in advance and they would return the call to confirm the appointment. The women did not return calls to confirm appointments. Usually at some point during the conversation, the women would question how their massage parlor was found. When asked where the boss was, the women always said the boss, always a man was not there and became increasingly on guard and near-hostile.

Research also revealed that the prostitutes are at one massage parlor brothel on a temporary basis, usually a couple of weeks to a few months, and many of the brothels advertise new girls frequently. They rarely return to the same brothel, but if they do, it is common for them to be very reserved at first. For instance, “Jasmine” of “Spa L,” whose “johns” had previously favored for her “enthusiasm,” found her rushed, mechanical, and reluctant. The “madams”

⁹⁶ “Again with my eyes closed as tight as they can go. I had to stop as I felt like I was forcing myself on a 40+ year old fat sex slave.” By “Toodw” 3/28/07 [about a woman at “Spa R”].

⁹⁷ “Sonny indicated that she would be gone for six weeks in order to undergo some cosmetic surgery. Suffice it to say she’ll be thinner and bustier when she returns.” By “Guest 123” posted on USA Sexguide on 3/14/07.

explain the disappearance of women to “johns” by saying the women went on “long vacations,” they are sick, or they quit. Cases have shown the massage parlor brothels to be operating on intricate circuits. A woman will be brought from Southeast Asia to the hub of the circuit in the United States, and transported from city to city. One of the hubs of these circuits is located in Flushing, NY.⁹⁸ This is documented with the federal case involving “Spa L,” and has been referred to several times by the “johns.” In one case, the circuits reached from New England to the South, along the East Coast. One “john” said: “I ran into a girl that was at ‘Spa R’ for awhile named ‘Julie,’ this weekend in NJ at another spa,”⁹⁹ which shows how the women are rotated on a circuit, remaining at one brothel for brief periods. More detailed information on the circuit patterns can be found in the “Federal Case” section in this chapter.

The women rotated on the massage parlor brothel circuits generally have a debt to pay to their pimps and transporters. There are many ways a person can be sex trafficked, but there have been many indicators that women trafficked into Rhode Island from Southeast Asia may be trapped in debt bondage, a form of coercion used in sex trafficking. Several sources have indicated the “madams” may be getting women addicted to gambling as a way to encourage them to borrow and owe more money. The “johns” pay the house fee to the “madam” and have to pay very high living expenses. One “john” said of the women’s additional costs:

“The girls pay room and board when they live at the AMP [Asian massage parlor]. This can be as little as \$400 per week and is often more than that depending on location. If they ‘live within two blocks of the place,’ do you think they stay there rent free? The girls that have told you there are very little costs if they stay at the AMP are lying to you. Transportation from say, Flushing ([in New York] where most of the girls live) to an AMP in RI via a Korean taxi driver is typically \$300 one way. Although I’m pretty sure

⁹⁸ This belief that many of the women are transported on a circuit with an information and transit hub in Flushing, NY is strengthened through case evidence, conversations the “johns” report having with the women who indicate a likelihood of the aforementioned, Rhode Island Korean massage parlors with the same names as massage parlors located on the large network centered in Flushing, NY as part of a 2006 bust.

⁹⁹ Posted on the USA Sexguide on 7/23/07 by “Spicey Dig.”

that's gone up since my wife [a woman who he claims was a prostituted at an Asian massage parlor brothel] retired.”¹⁰⁰

Observation, case review, and information on the “johns’ forums” shows in a number of the massage parlor brothels, women do not have free mobility or consent. The women seem to be housed on the premises, either within the brothel area or in living quarters above or below. The “johns” corroborate findings of living, eating, and bathing quarters found by Providence Police during raids. One “john” said: “When leaving I noticed a bunch of the girls laying down on the front office [floor] on blankets.”¹⁰¹ Reporter Edward Achorn wrote:

“They are trapped in dirty brothels, day and night, fearful of being beaten or killed if they try to leave...they serve men with their bodies from the time they get up until they go to sleep. They sleep on filthy mattresses and cook from Sterno cans in a back room. They are essentially slaves.”¹⁰²

When the women live in the massage parlor brothels they are often dependent on the “madam” for all their needs. Observation of a number of massage parlors indicated the women are unable to leave the brothel freely or independently. For instance, observation of “Spa E” found a very young Asian woman wearing an apron and thin flip-flops accompanied by an older woman, presumably the “madam,” enter CVS Pharmacy and leave with several cigarette cartons and return to the brothel.

The Johns

“Johns,” who range in age, class, occupation, ethnicity, also range in attitudes and expectations of the massage parlor brothels. “Johns” vary in their motive for seeking out

¹⁰⁰ Posted on USA Sexguide on 6/23/08 by Sarang Haeyo who claims he is married to a Korean woman who retired from the Asian massage parlor brothels several years ago. Prices today are likely higher.

¹⁰¹ Posted on the USA Sexguide by “I Luv Amp” on 7/29/06.

¹⁰² Achorn, Edward. “One business R.I. could o without.” Providence Journal. 10 April 2007. B-5.

prostitutes, particularly Asian women in the massage parlors. Many exoticize the women and are turned on by their “otherness,” while others wish there were more American women in massage parlor brothels. The following testimony indicates the range of “johns” attraction to the women and expectations of their experiences:

“ I get assigned a girl—whose name I forget, I apologize. But she was short, very petite, and 100% anglicized. Asked her where’s she’s from---‘New York.’ She was clearly U.S. born and raised, probably not even first generation. I knew this [sic.] was going to be a problem... But the weirdest thing was that one there appeared to be from the old crew not fresh-off-the-boat Asians. Even the woman washing the towels was Hispanic!”¹⁰³

“Where the hell else is a middle aged man gonna hook up with a young sexy hot sex slave in real life? Like the old saying goes, we want a ***** [likely means whore] in the bedroom but a lady in the kitchen. Just don’t expect you gf [girlfriend] to be as whory [sic] as the real whores. You’ll be disappointed. Even though we have plenty of sex, I still crave that AMP [Asian Massage Parlor] experience just for the fun of it, and I doubt if I’ll ever get over it. So beware what you’re getting into, it can be very addicting.”¹⁰⁴

“If I want to hear a woman speak English I just listen to my wife complaining, or my mother, or that ***** at work. The language barrier is sweet silence my friends. My ideal woman would say nothing at all. That said, some latinas would be nice to have around, or Haitians (wow!), etc.”¹⁰⁵

The “johns” intentions vary. A sense of camaraderie is present in the way the men describe and boast about their experiences and caution other “johns” of potential dangers. Married “johns” or “johns” in relationships discuss ways to keep their behavior inconspicuous on the “johns’ forums.”¹⁰⁶ Some men go in groups to the massage parlor brothels to share a common experience. Occasionally, a young man who has never been to the massage parlors before and is a virgin will post on the forums seeking advice, and many of the other men will coach him through the experience. One “john” even said he was using the experience to

¹⁰³ Posted on the USA Sexguide on 4/6/07 by “WebDog.”

¹⁰⁴ Posted on the USA Sexguide on 8/27/07 by “Jolly Rocks.”

¹⁰⁵ Posted on the USA Sexguide on 3/19/09 by “Strike 2.”

¹⁰⁶ Posted on the USA Sexguide on 7/25/06 by “Ulle Facedown”: “Yup, I saw it [a Donny Deutsch ‘Caught on Tape’ special about the Providence Asian massage parlor brothels] With my wife sitting next to me on the couch!!! Don’t know if she noticed me turning white as a ghost.” This was posted on 7/25/06 on the USA Sexguide.

reminisce his time servicing in the military: “Not [to] degrade the importance of the day [Memorial Day], but I went to “Spa L” to remember the days I spent with my Brothers in Arms, on leave in various countries.”¹⁰⁷

Joe Parker classifies the four types of “johns” as “users,” “sadists,” “necrophiles,” and “child molesters,” all of whom present themselves on the “johns’ forums.” Most common is the “user,” who despite believing himself to be and projecting himself as an average, respectable person, is quite self-centered. Becoming aware of potential sex trafficking, he will express concern, but will not discontinue his “using” behavior. He will not admit any intent to harm another, but his projected empathy does not dissuade his sense of entitlement. This type of “john” views the transaction as commercial. If he is buying someone’s life for the hour, he expects the woman to be at his full disposal, willing to engage in the sex act he desires, and to be performed well. And if the “john” is not pleased with his use of the woman’s body, he sometimes refuses to pay. Through the content analysis of the “johns’ forums” this consumerist attitude has been found time and time again. The “johns” may discuss the plight of trafficked women that has been brought to public attention to promote sympathy, but internally validate the “use” of these women and continue their behavior. One “john” perfectly demonstrates his mindset as a “user:”

“While I try not to think of the girls as ‘robots’ and always/ ALWAYS treat them the same as I would any other lady, in this transaction, I am the customer/client. I am not interested in their state of mind, making them feel good about themselves or their career choice (and they are doing this by choice; don’t believe one word of the right-wing hippocrite’s BS written about trafficking.slavery!)

“They are doing a job and it needs to be done correctly/as advertised or I will not return for their ‘services’ and will patronize their competition.

“Plain and simple.”¹⁰⁸

¹⁰⁷ Posted on the USA Sexguide on 5/29/06 by “RI Designer.”

¹⁰⁸ Posted on USA Sexguide on 1/24/09 by “Jhonny 8770.”

Less common than “users,” a large number of “johns” are considered “sadists.” “Sadists” are obsessed with power and control and take pleasure in the discomfort, fear, and pain of others. Parker says “sadists” are attracted to prostitutes because “they are willing to get into a car or come to a place where the ‘sadist’ can be in control.”¹⁰⁹ “Sadists” look for easy victim like prostitutes who they believe are less valued by society. They also target smaller women, with whom they can more easily be brutal and controlling. Several “johns” have commented on being turned on by the unwillingness and youth of a prostitute. Other “johns” have reveled in engaging degrading and unusual sexual acts with women at the massage parlors, such as urinating on the women or being particularly rough, taking pleasure in their discomfort.

In one situation, a “john” tried to convince a prostitute at “Spa L” to let him use a sexual object he brought on her. She could barely speak English and communicated she did not want this done to her by placing a towel over the object. The “john,” however, forced it on her while engaging in sexual intercourse:

“After a while I was ready, and she was making broken English remarks about too big. Now all of us want to be told that, but I know I am no super hero. I flipped her on her back and went at it. NO SHIT!!! She was really [sic.] small, and I think it actually hurt her. She was tight as hell. So after a few positions, I completed my mission.”¹¹⁰

This situation represents the prevalent unwillingness and reluctance of women to engage in sex acts, and the sense of entitlement and use of force of the “johns.”

“Necrophiles” take pleasure in “filth, degradation, and destruction.”¹¹¹ “Necrophilic johns” are turned on by women with physical emotional difficulties. They fantasize about their superiority and often express this when using a prostitute. There have been instances where the “johns” are younger than the prostitutes, sometimes by twenty or thirty years. “Johns” have

¹⁰⁹ Parker, Joe. “How Prostitution Works.” 4 August 1998. Page 2.

¹¹⁰ Posted on the “Downtown Accupressure” thread of the USA Sexguide on 8/21/05 by “Little Tony II.”

¹¹¹ Parker, Joe. “How Prostitution Works.” 4 August 1998. See page 2.

mentioned women missing teeth, unpleasant body odors, being out-of-shape, or having other physical issues, but these men are still turned on enough to have sex with these women.

“Necrophilic johns” are turned off by women who have self-esteem, are empowered, and stable.

One “necrophilic john” complained that the women at “Spa S” “believe they are elite,” and expressed he would not return to “Spa S” for that reason.¹¹²

One necrophilic and sadistic “john” wrote a lengthy report about the pleasure he took in a dehumanizing, brutal, and violent “consensual rape” (his term for the experience) of a drug-addicted Asian woman in her sixties. He sardonically discusses his disgust with her appearance, her cocaine usage, and how pathetic her situation is. He feigns not being sexually aroused by her at first, but is extremely aroused by her when he begins to violently assault her, or “master” her, as he describes the experience.¹¹³

“Child molesters” are pedophilic “johns” who have a preference for women who appear to be either underage or very young. Some of the “johns” seek women they consider “spinners.” “Spinners” are extremely petite and thin girls who can be easily physically manipulated, and could be indicative of a very young, possibly underage girl. “Johns” have described and bragged about some of the women at the massage parlor brothels as petite, timid, undeveloped, and vaginally “tight.” The massage parlor brothels advertise to this market, with taglines like “We

¹¹² Posted on USA Sexguide on 7/26/06 by “I Luv Amp.”

¹¹³ Posted on the USA Sexguide on 1/14/09 by “Jhonny8770.” An excerpt of his post: “So. I closed my eyes and began my ‘assault’ of her throat. I’m not kiddin’! You might call it a ‘consensual [sic.] raping.’ I made he gag again and again; jammed deep in her throat and left it there til her eyes were watering like small, black rivers (too much mascara). I called her every name I could think of and she just took it. Finally I blasted in her throat with my balls on her chin. She just let it go down and I’m sure she thought it was over, but I wasn’t through. She started to say something, but I told her ‘shut up; this is my dime’! had her lie on the bed (on her back) with her head hanging over the edge and ‘went to town’ again. I said to ‘suck me like a wh*re-vacuum while I facef**k your lying mouth’ which she did and after another ten minutes of CR (He is calling her a ‘cum rag,’ meaning a towel to wipe up ejaculate), I thanked her by ending round 2 with a very nice face-spraying. She laid there trying to catch her breath/moving her jaw slowly up/down as I wiped myself clean with her bedsheets and got dressed. Dropped my C-note (money) next to her head, told her she should be more honest and maybe try offering ‘wh*ore-vacuum’ as a service.”

offer great body therapy given by young and warm very friendly oriental girls,” or “young hot Asian beauties.”

Case Studies of Spas

“Spa E”

“Spa E” was incorporated on July 27, 2004, as a Domestic Profit Corporation, pursuant to Title 7-1.1-51, a provision that has since been repealed. The purpose was first listed as “massage parlor,” but in 2008 it was changed to “health and beauty salon.”¹¹⁴ This could reflect community pressure to shut down massage parlors operating as brothels on licensing violations. The brothel changed its name several times since incorporation and has several aliases. The owner of “Spa E” is listed as residing at the brothel’s address. The registering agent for the spa is a Providence attorney and the agent for “Spa A” and Spa DD.” He is also involved in real estate with the owner of “Spa DD.” The previous registering agent was an attorney specializing in immigration and criminal defense.¹¹⁵

“Spa E” is located in a more high-end commercial area. The massage parlor brothel is located in close proximity to City Hall, the Federal Courthouse, the State Archives, a Judicial Annex, and Senator Sheldon Whitehouse’s office. “Spa E” uses the front of a legitimate day spa. They have an awning and attractive window display, one of the more ornate, using bamboo, leaves, and various Asian figures to conceal the windows. “Spa E” occupies the first floor of the building and the rest is used as apartments.

¹¹⁴ This information came from the Corporate Database on the Rhode Island Secretary of State website, <http://www.state.ri.us>.

¹¹⁵ While these connections are certainly non-conclusive, they are interesting and could indicate some connection. The other corporations the current registering agent incorporated have been thought to be linked to organized crime or illegal behavior.

Despite the legitimate and inviting appearance of the front exterior, all “johns” enter through the back door in a back alleyway. “Spa E” is the only business with a clearly marked sign, vividly, with large blue and white numbers above the doorway. Despite, the visibility of the entrance is obscured by a large dumpster and expensive car.¹¹⁶ Three surveillance video cameras on the back door and one on the front door are used to monitor entrances and exits. The interior of the brothel, if one were to enter through the front entrance, has a front desk and about five small rooms with doors. The brothel has a table shower, sauna, bathroom, and private massage rooms. Direct discussion with one “john” revealed all of the women stay in a back room when not working. When asked if there is any talking or noise coming from the room, he said it is always quiet. He said they sleep in there on benches.

“Spa E” advertises both in the *Providence Phoenix*, and on Craigslist.com on occasion. Weekly, “Spa E” repeats the slogan “a pleasant and delightful atmosphere with a very courteous staff...” in the *Providence Phoenix* with a relatively non-descript ad. The ad lists the following services: “body rubs,” “dry saunas,” and “body shampoos.” On Craigslist.com, “Spa E” boasts: “five beautiful sexy young girls offering you an unforgettable, relaxing experience. We promise to give you an erotic asian bodyrub that you will not soon forget.”

“Johns” at “Spa E” follow the typical procedures as listed in the “General Observances” section. They arrive through the back door and pay a \$60 house fee to the “madam.” They are sometimes able to select a woman from a line-up who leads them to a room where they undress. They are given a table shower. A “massage” is initiated and sexual services are negotiated. “Spa E” offers sexual intercourse for \$140 in addition to the house fee. They also offer fellatio with or without a condom and manual stimulation.

¹¹⁶ A car matching a similar description has been spotted at other Korean massage parlor brothels as well.

The prostitutes at “Spa E” are Korean women who generally are younger than women at other massage parlor brothels. The women wear aprons with a flirtatious name on them, like “Candy” or “Cookie.” Most of the women are petite; some are described as young, shy, or thin. “Spa E” seems to be part of the Korean network of massage parlor brothels. “Spa E” is highly organized with strong counter-surveillance. When colleagues were monitoring the back entrance of “Spa E” from a distance and in broad daylight, they say two Asian men circled them on motorcycles. Then, Asian men pulled up to them and made an unsettling comment. Because of this quick action, it appears the “madam” closely monitors the cameras and has ready connection to men who are protecting or involved with the brothel. The women are at “Spa E” stay for short periods of time and rarely return.

“Spa S”

“Spa S” was incorporated on March 22, 2004, as a Domestic Limited Liability Company pursuant to Title 7-16: “Spa.” The manager is listed as residing at the residence.¹¹⁷ “Spa S” is a couple of blocks from “Spa P” in a more run down urban area of Providence. “Spa S” is located in a stand-alone, non-descript, large gray building, with a very inconspicuous, heavy metal door in the front under a large purple awning out front reading “Spa S.” The brothel has very few windows, and the ones visible were barred with metal netting. The “johns” use the back entrance, marked with another purple awning with a ramp and stairs leading to the doorway. There is a temporary car cover style garage at the back of “Spa S” parking lot. A black Mercedes, which has been described at other massage parlor brothels and an extermination company van, are usually in the parking lot.

¹¹⁷ Information about the incorporation and business history were found on the Rhode Island Secretary of State website, <http://www.state.ri.us>.

“Spa S” advertises weekly in the *Providence Phoenix* and often on Craigslist.com.¹¹⁸

They also advertise and are reviewed on a number of other websites. Their slogan is “Come treat your body right...” They advertise: “dry sauna,” “body shampoo,” and an “Oriental style body rub.” On Craigslist.com, “Spa S” generally has a semi-nude or provocatively clothed woman in suggestive positions. One recent ad reads: “You’ll love the SEXY feeling of total body massage!!! Clean, private, and friendly staff.”¹¹⁹ On Yahoo.com’s business review site, a reviewer boasts “Spa S” has “great hj’s,” a code for manual stimulation. They are listed, too, on FindaLay.com and Bigdoggie.net.

All the women at “Spa S” are Korean and younger than at other massage parlor brothels. Even though “Spa S” only offers manual stimulation, it is highly preferred among “johns” because of the reputation for younger women. The women also seem to be more skilled at providing massages.¹²⁰ “Jenny” is one of the women who could be underage. She is described as very tiny both in height and body. Descriptions of her small stature are coupled with a hesitant attitude. One woman, “Lisa,” is described as young, hesitant, and shy. Like most of the other massage parlor brothels, “johns” complain about women being mechanical and timid. Descriptions of women and the facilities indicate they may be living at the brothel.¹²¹

¹¹⁸ For most of the research period, “Spa S” did not advertise on Craigslist.com. It was only in the past few months, from about January 2009 to April 2009 has “Spa S” advertised on Craigslist.com.

¹¹⁹ Taken from a 1/9/09 ad on Craigslist.com.

¹²⁰ On the website, <http://www.findalay.com>, two “johns” reviewed their experiences at “Spa S.” “Chevyroadster” describes himself as a 60 year old, White heterosexual man from Bedford, NH, who prefers White women. He says he “loves asian massage parlors.” Dunree is a 59 year old heterosexual Asian man from Upton, MA who prefers Asian or White women. When describing himself, he says he is “retired, love companionship, and massage.”

¹²¹ There have been indications of women cooking and sleeping at “Spa S” on the USA Sexguide. On 7/29/06, “I Luv Amp” posted: “When leaving I noticed a bunch of the girls laying down on the front office on blankets.”

“Spa L”

Since about 2004, “Spa L” was housed in the upper levels of a “reputedly mob-connected office building” in downtown Providence around the corner from City Hall and the Federal Courthouse and in close proximity to Brown University.¹²² In 2006, “Spa L” was involved in a federal sex trafficking case spanning the East Coast, and will be discussed in further detail in the “Federal Case” section of this chapter. In early January 2009, “Spa L” move a few streets away closer to the Attorney General’s office. The following information focuses on the old location of “Spa L” since it remained at the old location for much of the research period.

The building “Spa L” was in was undergoing renovation. The interior of the building was an unsafe and uninhabitable construction site that was dusty, with rickety stairs, and stripped walls in some spots. Other businesses were advertised but did not exist. The previous location was surrounded by businesses catering to “johns,” such as upscale restaurants and bars where “johns” expressed enjoying getting an alcoholic beverage afterwards. “Johns” made use the parking lot of a local restaurant. Oddly, through the back alley and around the corner of the building, was a photography studio with a picture of a nearly naked woman on the outside of the building. During observation a beer truck made a delivery to the studio.

“Spa L” advertises in the *Providence Phoenix* weekly, but during periods of heavy observation in August 2008 and prior to moving to the new location, “Spa L” removed postings temporarily. Their ads offer: “dry sauna,” “body shampoo,” and “body relaxation.” Their hours are listed from 10:00 a.m., to 3:00, a.m., the longest advertised business hours of all the massage parlor brothels. This means, essentially, a seventeen-hour work day. “Spa L” advertises

¹²² Posted on the USA Sexguide on 4/26/07 by “VilunyaChert.” The old location of “Spa S” was located 0.2 miles from the Bell Gallery building of Brown University. It is now 0.5 miles from the Bell Gallery, but only 0.2. miles to the Health Services building.

frequently on Craigslist.com boasting on March 3, 2009, “Hot Asian Gals! Offering the best body rubs! Friendly sexy girls at your service at your service!!” “Spa L” offers fellatio, cunnilingus, sexual intercourse, and manual stimulation. The house fee is usually \$60, but coupons online and in the *Providence Phoenix* have reduced the house fee to either \$50 or 10% off.

“Spa L” did not have a back entrance. To enter the building and reach the brothel, “johns” had to ring a buzzer on the front door, monitored by a surveillance video camera, and wait to be let in. Strong counter-surveillance was obvious from observation and commentary by “johns.” One “john” wrote: “The new ‘mamasan’ already had the door open as I reached the fourth floor. I’m convinced they watch the door and stair monitors.”¹²³

Colleagues’ stories of observation confirmed counter-surveillance tactics and the use of street advertisement. Two colleagues, dressed inconspicuously, were sitting in a car down the street from “Spa L” late at night. After a few minutes, a man brought an Asian woman outside the building and onto the street corner where he began simulating sexual relations with the woman and pointing upward, towards the brothel. The colleagues mentioned seeing a teenage boy circling the brothel on a bicycle, stopping and talking to various men. It is possible the boy on a bike is a form of street advertisement used by “Spa L.” They may also have had support from local bars and parking lot attendants.

Once the “john” arrives at “Spa L” on the fourth floor, the “madam” collects the house fee and the “john” usually is able to choose a woman from a line-up. The typical procedures listed in the “General Observances” section are followed here. The “massage” rooms, for the most part, are just mattresses on the floor. The women range in age, but “Spa L” is notorious for

¹²³ Posted on USA Sexguide on 3/14/07 by “Guest 123.”

having very young women. “Candy,” new to “Spa L” in August of 2005, described in “The ‘Johns’” section of this chapter as having an object forcibly inserted inside her and a “john” unrelenting to her pleas, shows the rape of a likely underage girl. “Mickey,” new in March 2006, is described as uncomfortable being touched at all, “rushed,” “very tight,” and having poor massage skills. “Yoko,” who arrived in May 2006 fit the description of a potentially underage girl. A “john” reported: “[I wanted to have sexual intercourse with her] but when she started sounding like I was ripping her apart, I lost it.”¹²⁴

As with the other massage parlor brothels, when a woman leaves, they usually do not return, however, at “Spa L,” it seems more common for a woman to return, but if they do return they usually have a reluctant attitude. For instance, “Jasmine,” who had been favored by “johns” for her enthusiasm returned after several months of “johns” being told she was “on vacation,” behaving like she did not want to be touched at all. “Johns” complained she was mechanical, rushed, and unwilling. She has left and returned a number of times.

A young woman in her early twenties, “Chanel,” came to “Spa L” in mid-September 2005. On November 21, 2005, she returned from a dental procedure and was made to work as a prostitute the same day. By February 2006, she was missing and “johns” were told she was “on vacation.” In March 2006, she returned, and then in April, “johns” were told she quit.

Some of the women were sent for plastic surgery. “Sonny,” a young woman who was brought to “Spa L” in early 2007, told “johns” she was a mother struggling with alcoholism, and had been in a drunk driving accident recently. In mid-March of 2007, she informed “johns” she would be having cosmetic surgery.¹²⁵

¹²⁴ Posted on the USA Sexguide on 6/9/06 by “SuperXFly.”

¹²⁵ Posted on USA Sexguide on 3/14/07 by “Guest 123:” “‘Sonny’ indicated she will be gone for six weeks in order to undergo some cosmetic surgery. Suffice it to say she’ll be thinner and bustier when she returns.”

“Spa L” is one of the largest and most popular massage parlor brothels in the state. It is highly organized, houses more prostitutes than most massage parlors in the state, and services a high number of men per day. It has the longest business hours, is open seven days a week, and seems to have many men monitoring, advertising, and involved in operations. “Spa L” is now located close to the original location but in less busy area.

United States v. Kim, et. al.¹²⁶

In 2006, Down Town Spa was one of many Korean massage parlor brothels involved in a massive sex trafficking case with sites spanning the East Coast. The arrests and charging of 31 individuals on August 15th, included Kyong Polachek, the “madam” of Down Town Spa. Over 70 victims were freed and 20 brothels were shut down.¹²⁷ The United State’s Attorney’s Office for the Southern and Eastern Districts of New York charged the defendants with the following: conspiracy to and engagement in human trafficking, conspiracy to and engagement in interstate transportation of women for the purpose of prostitution, and interstate transportation of women for the prostitution, conspiracy to and engagement in transportation of illegal aliens, and conspiracy to operate an unlicensed money transmitting business. The defendants included brothel owners and managers, middlemen who worked as transporters and assisted the organization of the sex trafficking ring, and money transmitters.¹²⁸

¹²⁶ is Case F # 2006R00United States of America v. Kim, Il, Lnu, Park, Bae, Polachek, Son, Lee, Choi-Son, and Lnu pursuant to T. 18 U.S.C. §§ 2, 371, 2421, 1960 (a), and 3148.

¹²⁷ Milkovitz, Amanda. “Federal sweep shutter city spa: A woman who federal officials say managed a busy downtown brothel faces charges in a multi-state investigation of a human trafficking ring.” Providence Journal. 18 August 2006.

¹²⁸ United States Department of Justice. “31 Korean Nationals Arrested Throughout the Northeastern United States in Federal Human Trafficking Case.” 16 August 2006. Pg. 1.

In 2005, the Federal Bureau of Investigation (FBI) and the U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement (ICE) began a joint investigation. The initial focus was on intelligence that Ae Soon Cho (“Gina Kim” or “Choe”) and Geeho Chae (“Chae”) were operating a large Korean massage parlor brothel in Flushing, NY, often referred to as the Korean information and transit hub for sex trafficking. In November, the FBI and ICE were issued authorization for a wiretap, which revealed a larger network of Korean massage parlor brothels. “Choe” and “Chae” operated four brothels in Queens and maintained a “stash house,” or a separate residence to store cash and “prostitutes.” They were collecting about \$4,000 per day.

“Choe” and “Chae” relied on a network of middlemen based in Queens who they spoke with on a daily basis. They would “order” women through middlemen to place in brothels. Specifications included immigration status, age, looks, body type, and service type. “Choe” and “Chae” were arrested on March 8th and indicted on April 6th.

The investigation found an undercover New York Police Department (NYPD) officer was being bribed by a Korean massage parlor brothel in Queens to prevent raids. Between May 2005 and March 2006, the undercover officer was paid a total of \$126,500.¹²⁹ On March 8th, a couple found to be operating the brothel giving bribes to the officer were arrested.

The further connections revealed in the investigation warranted an extension of wiretaps. A wiretap of defendant Tae Hoon Kim, a middleman and transporter in Flushing, uncovered a massive and elaborate network of Korean-owned brothels throughout the East Coast. Korean-speaking Special Agent for the FBI, Won Yoon, listened to the recordings and reviewed

¹²⁹ United States Department of Justice. “31 Korean Nationals Arrested Throughout the Northeastern United States in Federal Human Trafficking Case.” 16 August 2006. Pg.1.

transcripts of the wiretaps. He and others also used surveillance of the defendants and interviewed witnesses to further the investigation, and other tactics.¹³⁰

The reports indicated the women were brought from South Korea to the United States. They were told they would be able to make money to send home to their families. The recruiters arranged for their transportation to North America. They would either be brought directly to the US, or first to Canada or Mexico and then smuggled into the US. Some of the recruiters would provide fraudulent immigration documents to smuggle them into the US. Once in the US, the women were charged with large financial debts incurred from transportation and other costs, usually tens of thousands of dollars owed to the Korean recruiters and middlemen.

The central point of the network was in Flushing, NY. Once in the US, the women were brought to Flushing, and were transported through a network of drivers to one of the ring's brothels. The brothels posed as legitimate businesses, such as massage parlors, acupuncture clinics, or health spas, where they were made to work as "prostitutes" to pay off their debts. The women were recruited and transported based on customer demand.

Once the women arrived at their first brothel, their travel and immigration documents were confiscated and they were supervised by the brothel owner or manager, to whom they were dependent. Defendants were found to receive hundreds of thousands of dollars annually by charging "johns" "house fees." "Johns" paid additional money to the women for sexual services. The women, who were paid no wages, were required to pay the defendants up to \$800 per week

¹³⁰ Won Yoon, was a Special Agent for the FBI. He was assigned to the Asian Criminal Enterprises Unit of the NY Division of the FBI in 2002. Other forms of evidence included seized items and funds, testimony of seven victims, and testimony of undercover officers. Won Yoon worked with the U.S. Attorney in the Eastern District of NY. This information can be found in the affidavit of the case.

from customer tips.¹³¹ The defendants used “hawalders” to illegally transfer money back to South Korea.¹³² During raids, investigators found thousands of dollars in cash, log books, and hundreds to thousands of condoms hidden throughout the brothels.

Victim testimony indicated the women usually were required to sleep inside the brothel and not allowed to leave at any time, unless they were getting in a taxi to be sent to the next brothel. Victims were required to follow “house rules.” Many of the victims testified about frequent sexual assaults by “johns” and brothel owners. When they were assaulted, defendants told the victims to “refund the customers’ money and return to work.”¹³³ Some women testified they were threatened to be turned over to law enforcement or immigration authorities or told their families in Korea would be harmed if they came forward.

On May 11, 2006, ICE raided a number of brothels, including Down Town Spa. A wiretap caught brothel manager Kyong Polachek (“Big Sister Maek Do”), a 56 year old Korean woman, ordering women with valid green cards to accommodate her busy brothel.¹³⁴ ICE and the FBI arrested many of the women working as “prostitutes” at Down Town Spa, and questioned them about the drivers. They replied that they had taken a bus from a casino in order to get to the brothel.

¹³¹ “Five Convicted of Human Trafficking Offense by Manhattan Jury.”

¹³² “Hawalders” are hawala brokers. “Hawala” means the process whereby money is transferred via a network of hawalders. On page 5 of the affidavit, it reads: “Typically, an individual approaches a hawala broker in one city and gives the broker money to be transferred at black market currency exchange rates to a recipient in a foreign country. The hawala broker calls another hawala broker in the recipient’s city and tells the recipientbroker how much money and to whom to disperse the funds, minus a small commission, with the assurance that the debt will be settled later.”

¹³³ “Five Convicted of Human Trafficking Offense by Manhattan Jury.”

¹³⁴ From the affidavit.

CONCLUSION

The aims of this research were to find how prostitution was decriminalized indoors in Rhode Island, what the implications of decriminalization are, and if sex trafficking is occurring. The research into decriminalization and Asian massage parlor brothels successfully answered these questions.

Decriminalization resulted from legal resolution of *COYOTE v. Roberts*, a sex discrimination lawsuit. COYOTE, a prostitutes' rights group, argued criminalized prostitution violated the right to privacy and was enforced discriminatorily because a greater number of women than men were arrested. The court case was resolved by decriminalization of prostitution in 1980. Without this law suit, prostitution would likely not have been decriminalized.

Decriminalization in 1980 has had far-reaching impacts on the sex industry in Rhode Island. Decriminalization has factored in the absence of any federal or state sex trafficking cases.

Decriminalization has facilitated growth and expansion of the sex industry. Absence of regulation or criminal liability of the commercial sex industry increases susceptibility to sex trafficking. Decriminalization is attractive to those who want to open up brothels because there are no laws or regulations on prostitution indoors.

Research found likely sex trafficking in Asian massage parlor brothels. Indicators of sex trafficking were found, including women's reluctance and resistance to engage in sex acts, women's limited mobility, rotation of women on a circuit of brothels, and the presence of living quarters in brothels.

Decriminalization makes it difficult to stop sex trafficking in Rhode Island by interfering with the ability to use existing statutes for organizing and controlling prostitution and prosecuting perpetrators. It also interferes with the ability to identify and assist victims of sex trafficking.

To combat sex trafficking in Rhode Island, prostitution law reform is necessary to enable prosecution of sex trafficking and assist victims. A “victim-protected law reform approach” re-criminalizes prostitution while giving prosecutors and law enforcement victim-centered tools to assist those compelled or coerced into prostitution and target perpetrators.

Decriminalization has enabled expansion of commercial sexual activity susceptible to sex trafficking and prevents prosecution of traffickers and aid to victims. If prostitution is not re-criminalized, the commercial sex industry, and consequently sex trafficking will continue to increase. Decriminalization only expands vulnerability to sex trafficking and contracts legal measures to combat it.

APPENDIXES

Appendix A

STATUTES

Rhode Island General Laws

Prior to amendments to the prostitution legislation in RI made on May 15, 1980,

**§11-34-5 TRANSPORTATION FOR INDECENT PURPOSES – STREETWALKING—
HARBORING PROSTITUTION.**—It shall be unlawful for any person to secure, direct or transport, or offer to secure, direct or transport another for the purpose of prostitution, or for any other lewd or indecent act; or to loiter in or near any thoroughfare or public or private place for the purpose of inducing, enticing, soliciting, or procuring another to commit lewdness, fornication, unlawful sexual intercourse or any other indecent act; or to commit or in any manner induce, entice, or solicit, or procure a person in any thoroughfare, or public or private place or conveyance to commit any such act; or to receive or offer or agree to receive any person into any place, structure, house, building, room, or conveyance for the purpose of committing any such acts, or knowingly permit any person to remain therein for any such purposes, or to, in any way, aid or abet or participate in any of the acts or thins enumerated herein.

Any person found guilty under this section, shall be subject to imprisonment in the adult correctional institutions not to exceed five (5) years.

§ 11-9-1 Exploitation for commercial or immoral purposes. – (a) Every person having the custody or control of any child under the age of sixteen (16) years who shall exhibit, use, or employ, or shall in any manner or under pretense sell, give away, let out or otherwise dispose of any child under the age of sixteen (16) years to any person for or in the vocation, occupation, service, or purpose of rope or wire walking, or as a gymnast, wrestler, contortionist, equestrian performer, acrobat, or rider upon any bicycle or mechanical contrivance, or in any dancing, theatrical, or musical exhibition unless it is in connection with churches, school or private instruction in dancing or music, or unless it is under the auspices of a Rhode Island society incorporated, or organized without incorporation for a purpose authorized by § 7-6-4; or for or in gathering or picking rags, or collecting cigar stumps, bones or refuse from markets, or in begging, or in any mendicant or wandering occupation, or in peddling in places injurious to the morals of the child; or for or in the exhibition of any child with a disability, or in any illegal, obscene, indecent, or immoral purpose, exhibition, or vocation, injurious to the health or morals or dangerous to the life or limb of the child, or who shall cause, procure or encourage any child under the age of sixteen (16) years to engage in that activity, or who, after being notified by an officer mentioned in § 11-9-3 to restrain the child from engaging in that activity, shall neglect or refuse to do so, shall be held guilty of a misdemeanor and shall, for every such offense, be imprisoned not exceeding one year, or be fined not exceeding two hundred fifty dollars (\$250),

or both, and shall forfeit any right which he or she may have to the custody of the child; provided, that the provisions of this section shall not apply to any child, not a resident of this state, who is engaged in any dancing, theatrical, or musical performance in this state and is accompanied by a parent, guardian, or tutor, when a permit for the appearance of the child is granted by the mayor of the city or the president of the town council of the town, where the performance is to be given; provided, further, that the provisions of this section shall not apply to any child, a resident of this state, who is engaged in any dancing, theatrical, or musical performance in this state on a day when the public schools are not in session in the town or city where the dancing, theatrical or musical performance shall be given (not however on Sunday) if the child is accompanied by a parent, guardian or tutor, when a permit for the appearance of the child is granted by the mayor of the city or the president of the town council of the town where the performance is to be given.

(b) Any person who shall in any manner or under any pretense sell, distribute, let out or otherwise permit any child under eighteen (18) years of age to be used in any book, magazine, pamphlet, or other publication, or in any motion picture film, photograph or pictorial representation, in a setting which taken as a whole suggests to the average person that the child has engaged in, or is about to engage in any sexual act, which shall include, but not be limited to, sodomy, oral copulation, sexual intercourse, masturbation, or bestiality, shall, upon conviction for the first offense be punished by imprisonment for not more than ten (10) years, or a fine of not more than ten thousand dollars (\$10,000), or both; upon conviction of a subsequent offense, be punished by imprisonment for not more than fifteen (15) years, a fine of not more than fifteen thousand dollars (\$15,000), or both.

(c) Every person who shall exhibit, use, employ or shall in any manner or under pretense so exhibit, use, or employ any child under the age of eighteen (18) years to any person for the purpose of prostitution or for any other lewd or indecent act shall be imprisoned not exceeding twenty (20) years, or be fined not exceeding twenty thousand dollars (\$20,000), or both.

§ 11-34-1 Pandering. – (a) It shall be unlawful for any person to secure a person for a house of ill fame, or to procure for a person a place as inmate of a house of ill fame; or by any promise, threat, by abuse of person, or by any other device or scheme, to cause, induce, persuade, or encourage a person to become a prostitute, to enter upon or lead a wanton or dissolute life, to become an inmate of a house of ill fame, to enter a place in which prostitution is encouraged or allowed, or remain in it as an inmate, or to come into this state or leave this state for the purpose of prostitution. It shall be unlawful for any person to receive or give, or agree to receive or give, any money or thing of value for procuring or attempting to procure any person to become a prostitute, to enter upon or lead a wanton or dissolute life, or to become an inmate of a house of ill fame, either within or without this state, or come into this state or leave this state for the purpose of prostitution. It shall be unlawful for any person by any means to keep, hold, or detain against his or her will or restrain any person in any place for the purpose of prostitution, or in a house of ill fame or other place where prostitution is practiced or allowed for any purpose; or to directly or indirectly keep, hold, detain, or restrain, or attempt to keep, hold, detain, or restrain in any house of ill fame or other place where prostitution is allowed or practiced, any person by any

means for the purpose of compelling that person, directly or indirectly, to pay, liquidate, or cancel any debt, dues, or obligations incurred or said to have been incurred by that person.

(b) Every person who commits any of the offenses described in subsection (a) of this section, or who assists, abets, or aids another to commit any of those offenses, shall be guilty of pandering. For the first offense that person shall be punished by imprisonment for not less than one year and not more than five (5) years and a fine of not less than two thousand dollars (\$2,000), nor more than five thousand dollars (\$5,000). For every subsequent offense that person shall be punished by imprisonment for not less than three (3) years and not more than ten (10) years and a fine of not less than five thousand dollars (\$5,000), nor more than ten thousand dollars (\$10,000).

§ 11-34-2 Venue of pandering prosecutions. – It shall not be a defense to any prosecution for any of the offenses described in § 11-34-1 that the offense or any part of the offense shall have been committed outside the state, and any offense described in § 11-34-1 may be alleged to have been committed. The offender may be prosecuted and punished in any county in which the offender or the person upon or against whom the offense was committed may be found, or in which the offense was consummated, or in which any overt acts in furtherance of the offenses shall have been committed.

§ 11-34-3 Spouse as witness in pandering prosecution. – In any prosecution for any offense under § 11-34-1, any person shall be a competent witness against the offender in relation to any pandering offense committed by the offender upon or against him or her, or by the offender against or upon another person or persons in his or her presence, notwithstanding that person may have been married to the offender before or after the commission of the offense, and notwithstanding that person may be called as a witness during the existence of the marriage or after its dissolution.

§ 11-34-4 Search for and delivery of inmate of house of ill fame. – Whenever there is reason to believe that any person has been inveigled, enticed, induced, persuaded, or encouraged to enter a house of ill fame or other place where prostitution is allowed or practiced, or is being kept, held, detained, or restrained in any house of ill fame or other place where prostitution is allowed or practiced, upon complaint being made under oath by any director of human services, member of the division of state police, sheriff, deputy sheriff, chief of police, town sergeant, or constable, or by the parent, master, or guardian of the person, to any justice or clerk of a district court authorized to issue warrants, the justice or clerk may issue a warrant to enter by day or night the house of ill fame or other place, to search for the person, and to bring that person and the person in whose possession or keeping he or she may be found before the district court. The court may, on examination, order that person to be delivered to the director of human services, parent, master, or guardian, or to be placed in the charge of a probation officer, or to be discharged in accordance with law.

§ 11-34-5 Transportation for indecent purposes – Harboring prostitution. – (a) It shall be unlawful for any person, for pecuniary gain, to secure, direct, or transport, or offer to secure, direct, or transport another for the purpose of prostitution, or for any other lewd or indecent act; or to receive or offer or agree to receive any person into any place, structure, house, building, room, or conveyance for the purpose of committing any such acts, or knowingly permit any person to remain in the premises for those purposes, or to, in any way, aid or abet or participate in any of the acts or things enumerated in this chapter.

(b) Any person found guilty under this section shall be subject to imprisonment in the adult correctional institutions for not less than one year and not more than five (5) years, and a fine of not less than two thousand dollars (\$2,000) nor more than five thousand dollars (\$5,000). For every subsequent offense that person shall be punished by imprisonment for not less than three (3) years and for not more than ten (10) years and a fine of not less than five thousand dollars (\$5,000) nor more than ten thousand dollars (\$10,000).

§ 11-34-5.1 Deriving support or maintenance from prostitution. – Any person, knowing a person to be a prostitute, who shall live or derive support or maintenance, in whole or in part, from the earnings or proceeds of prostitution, from moneys loaned, advanced to, or charged against the prostitute by any keeper, manager, or inmate of a house of ill fame or other place where prostitution is practiced or allowed, or who shall share in the earnings, proceeds or moneys, shall be punished by imprisonment in the adult correctional institutions for not less than one year nor more than five (5) years, or by a fine of not less than two thousand dollars (\$2,000) and not more than five thousand dollars (\$5,000), or both, and for every subsequent offense shall be punished by imprisonment for not less three (3) years and not more than ten (10) years, and by a fine of not less than five thousand dollars (\$5,000) and not more than ten thousand dollars (\$10,000), or both. However, nothing in this section shall apply to a minor dependent of the prostitute.

§ 11-34-6 Reputation testimony as evidence. – In the trial of any person charged with a violation of § 11-34-5, testimony concerning the reputation of the place where the violation occurred or of persons who frequent or reside in it shall be admissible in evidence in support of the charge.

§ 11-34-7 Examination and treatment for venereal disease. – Any person convicted for any violation of § 11-34-5 or of any other statute relating to lewd or lascivious behavior or unlawful sexual intercourse, and who shall be confined or imprisoned in any correctional institution for more than ten (10) days, may be examined by the department of health for venereal disease, through duly appointed, licensed physicians as agents. Any person that is examined may be detained until the result of the examination is duly reported. If found with venereal disease in an

infectious stage, the person shall be treated, and if a menace to the public, quarantined, in accordance with rules and regulations, not inconsistent with law, of the director of health, who is authorized to formulate and issue them. Refusal to comply with or obey the rules or regulations shall constitute a misdemeanor and be punishable by fine not to exceed two hundred fifty dollars (\$250), or by imprisonment not to exceed three (3) months, or both. **§ 11-34-8 Loitering for indecent purposes.** – (a) It shall be unlawful for any person to stand or wander in or near any public highway or street, or any public or private place, and attempt to engage passersby in conversation, or stop or attempt to stop motor vehicles, for the purpose of prostitution or other indecent act, or to patronize, induce, or otherwise secure a person to commit any indecent act. Any person found guilty under this section shall be deemed guilty of a misdemeanor and shall be subject to imprisonment for a term not exceeding six (6) months, or by a fine of not less than two hundred fifty dollars (\$250) nor more than one thousand dollars (\$1,000), or both.

(b) Any person found guilty of a subsequent offense under this section shall be subject to imprisonment for a term of not more than one year, or a fine of not less than five hundred dollars (\$500) nor more than one thousand dollars (\$1,000), or both.

§ 11-34-8.1 Soliciting from motor vehicles for indecent purposes. – (a) It shall be unlawful for any person, while an operator or passenger in a motor vehicle to stop, or attempt to stop another vehicle or pedestrian, or to engage or attempt to engage persons in another vehicle or pedestrians in conversation, for the purposes of prostitution or other indecent act, or to patronize, induce, or otherwise secure another person to commit any indecent act. Any person found guilty under this section shall be deemed guilty of a misdemeanor and shall be subject to imprisonment for a term not exceeding six (6) months and by a fine of not less than five hundred dollars (\$500) nor more than one thousand dollars (\$1,000).

(b) Any person found guilty of a subsequent offense under this section shall be subject to imprisonment for a term of not more than one year and a fine of not less than seven hundred fifty dollars (\$750) nor more than one thousand five hundred dollars (\$1,500). No fine imposed under this section may be suspended.

§ 11-34-8.2 Forfeiture of motor vehicles. – (a) The motor vehicle being unlawfully operated as defined in § 11-34-8.1 by a person convicted of a second or subsequent offense of soliciting from a motor vehicle for indecent purposes pursuant to § 11-34-8.1, which vehicle is owned by the operator, may be seized by the law enforcement agency and forfeited at the discretion of the court.

(b) Property taken or detained under this section shall not be repleviable, but shall be deemed to be in the custody of the law enforcement agency making the seizure. The seizing agency shall sell the vehicle and grant the proceeds to the governor's justice commission for the purposes of rehabilitation and job training of those found guilty of prostitution and who are imprisoned. The seizing agency may retain ten percent (10%) of the proceeds of the sale up to a maximum of one hundred dollars (\$100), for the purposes of the administration of the sale.

§ 11-34-11 Loitering for indecent purposes in or near schools. – Any person who violates this section by attempting to engage a person for the purpose of prostitution or other indecent act, or to patronize or induce or otherwise secure a person to commit any indecent act in the building or on the grounds or within three hundred (300) yards of the grounds of a public or private elementary, vocational, or secondary school, shall be punished by a term of imprisonment of not more than one year and a fine of not less than five hundred dollars (\$500) nor more than one thousand dollars (\$1,000).

§ 11-67-1 Definitions. – As used herein:

(1) "Intimidation" means an intentional written, verbal or physical act or threat of a physical act that, under the totality of circumstances a reasonable person should know will have the effect of: physically harming, or damaging a person's property, placing a person in reasonable fear of harm to his or her person or to his or her family, or placing a person in reasonable fear of damage to his or her property.

(2) "Commercial sexual activity" means any sex act which is performed or promised in return for payment of money.

(3) "Forced labor" means labor performed or provided by another person that is obtained or maintained through:

(i) Any scheme, plan, or pattern intending to cause or threatening to cause physical harm to any person;

(ii) An actor's physically restraining or threatening to physically restrain another person;

(iii) An actor's abusing or threatening to abuse the law or legal process;

(iv) An actor's knowingly destroying, concealing, removing, confiscating, or possessing without a person's consent any actual or purported passport or other immigration document, or any other actual or purported government identification document, of another person;

(v) An actor's blackmail; or

(vi) An actor's intimidation.

(4) "Labor" means work of economic or financial value.

(5) "Maintain" means, in relation to labor, to secure continued performance thereof, regardless of any initial agreement on the part of the victim to perform such type of labor.

(6) "Obtain" means in relation to labor, to secure continued performance thereof.

(7) "Sex act" means any sexual contact or sexual penetration of a person, as defined in § 11-37-1.

(8) "Victim" means a person subject to the practices set forth in § 11-67-2 or 11-67-3.

§ 11-67-2 Involuntary servitude. – (a) Whoever knowingly subjects, attempts to subject, or engages in a conspiracy to subject another person to forced labor in order to commit a commercial sexual activity either by:

- (1) Causing or threatening to cause physical harm to any person;
 - (2) Physically restraining or threatening to physically restrain another person;
 - (3) Abusing or threatening to abuse the law or legal process;
 - (4) Knowingly destroying, concealing, removing, confiscating or possessing without that person's consent any actual or purported passport or other immigration document, or any other actual or purported government identification document, of another person; or
 - (5) By using intimidation; shall be guilty of a felony and subject to not more than twenty (20) years imprisonment or a fine of not more than twenty thousand dollars (\$20,000) or both.
- (b) In cases involving a minor between the ages of seventeen (17) and eighteen (18) years, the defendant is guilty of a felony, and subject to not more than thirty (30) years imprisonment, or a fine of not more than thirty thousand dollars (\$30,000), or both;
- (c) In cases in which the minor had not attained the age of seventeen (17) years, defendant is guilty of a felony, and subject to not more than forty (40) years imprisonment, or a fine of up to forty thousand dollars (\$40,000), or both.

§ 11-67-3 Trafficking of persons for forced labor or commercial sexual activity. – Whoever knowingly:

- (a) Recruits, entices, harbors, transports, provides, or obtains by any means, or attempts to recruit, entice, harbor, transport provide, or obtain by any means, another person, intending or knowing that the person will be subjected to forced labor in order to commit a commercial sexual activity; or
- (b) Benefits, financially or by receiving anything of value, from knowing participation in a venture which has engaged in an act described in violation of § 11-67-2, or 11-67-3, is guilty of a felony and subject to not more than twenty (20) years imprisonment or a fine of not more than twenty thousand dollars (\$20,000), or both; provided, however, that this subsection shall not apply to a "victim" as defined in this chapter.

§ 11-67-4 Restitution. – In addition to any other amount of loss identified, the court shall order restitution including the greater of:

- (a) The gross income or value to the defendant of the victim's labor or commercial sexual activity; or
- (b) The value of the victim's labor as guaranteed under the minimum wage law and overtime provisions of the Fair Labor Standards Act (FLSA) or the minimum wage law, whichever is greater.

§ 11-67-5 Forfeitures. – (a) A person who is found in a criminal proceeding to be in violation of § 11-67-2 or 11-67-3 shall forfeit to the state of Rhode Island any profits or proceeds and any

interest or property he or she has acquired or maintained in violation of this act, that the sentencing court determines, after a forfeiture hearing, to have been acquired or maintained as a result of maintaining a person in involuntary servitude or participating in trafficking in persons for forced labor in order to commit a criminal sexual activity.

(b) The court shall upon petition by the attorney general at any time following sentencing, conduct a hearing to determine whether any property or property interest is subject to forfeiture under this section. At the forfeiture hearing the state shall have the burden of establishing by a preponderance of the evidence that property or property interests are subject to forfeiture under this section.

(c) In any action brought by the state of Rhode Island under this section, wherein any restraining order, injunction, or prohibition or any other action in connection with any property or interest subject to forfeiture under this section is sought, the court shall first determine whether there is probable cause to believe that the person or persons so charged have committed the offense of involuntary servitude, involuntary servitude of a minor, or trafficking in persons for forced labor or commercial sexual activity and whether the property or property interest is subject to forfeiture pursuant to this section.

(d) All monies forfeited and the sale proceeds of all other property forfeited and seized under this section shall be deposited in the general fund.

Warwick and Smithfield Ordinances

Warwick

Chapter 38 MESSAGE PARLORS*

* **Cross References:** Businesses, ch. 10.

State Law References: Licensing of massage parlors, G.L. 1956, § 23-20.8-1 et seq.

Sec. 38-1. License required; authority to prescribe rules for operation.

Sec. 38-1. License required; authority to prescribe rules for operation.

(a) No person, firm or corporation shall practice or conduct an establishment for giving of massage, vapor, pool or other baths for hire, reward or compensation, nor shall any person, firm or corporation advise or hold himself/herself, itself or themselves out as being engaged in the business of massage or the giving of said baths in the city without receiving a license therefor from the board of public safety.

(b) The board of public safety is hereby authorized to formulate rules and regulations governing the practice of massage and the operation of establishments for the giving of massage, vapor, pool, shower or other baths and to establish fees for the issuance of licenses hereunder.

(Code 1971, § 12 1/2-1)

Smithfield

Editor's Note: State law reference - Definitions, G.L. 1956, § 23-20.8.1.

[Amended 2-24-1998; 6-1-1999]

For the purpose of this chapter, the following words and phrases shall have the meanings respectively ascribed to them by this section:

EMPLOYEE

Any person over 18 years of age, other than a massagist, who renders any service in connection with the operation of a **massage** business and receives compensation from the operator of the business or patrons.

LICENSEE

The person to whom a license has been issued to own or operate a **massage** establishment as defined herein.

MASSAGE

Any method of pressure on or friction against, or stroking, kneading, rubbing, tapping, pounding, vibrating or stimulating of the external parts of the human body with the hands or with the aid of any mechanical electrical apparatus or appliances with or without such supplementary aids as rubbing alcohol, liniments, antiseptics, oils, powder, creams, lotions, ointment or other such similar preparations commonly used in the practice of **massage**, under such circumstances that it is reasonably expected that the person to whom the treatment is provided or some third person on his or her behalf will pay money or give any other consideration or any gratuity thereof.

MASSAGE ESTABLISHMENT

Any establishment having a source of income or compensation derived from the practice of **massage** as defined in this section, and which has a fixed place of business where any person, firm, association or corporation engages in or carries on any of the activities described in the definition of "massage." For purposes of compliance with §§ **242-5A** and **242-12A** and **G** of this chapter only, the term "massage establishment" shall not include any business engaged in the practice of massage on the same premises where other professional health care services such as optical or chiropractic services are offered.

MASSAGIST, MASSEUR or MASSEUSE

Any person who, for any consideration whatsoever, engages in the practice of massage as defined in this section.

OUTCALL MASSAGE SERVICE

Any business, the function of which is to engage in or carry on massages at a location designated by the customer or client rather than at a **massage** establishment as defined in this section. For purposes of compliance with § **242-12A** and **F** only, the provision of

massages to fully clothed clients at the Smithfield Senior Center shall not be defined as an outcall massage.

PATRON

Any person over 18 years of age who receives a massage under such circumstances that it is reasonably expected that he or she will pay money or give any other consideration therefor.

PERMITTEE

The person to whom a permit has been issued to act in the capacity of a massagist (masseur or masseuse) as herein defined.

PERSON

Any individual, partnership, firm, corporation, joint stock company, corporation or combination of individuals of whatever form or character.

RECOGNIZED SCHOOL

Any school or educational institution licensed to do business as a school or educational institution in the state in which it is located, or any school recognized by or approved by or affiliated with the American Massage and Therapy Association, Inc., and which has for its purpose the teaching of the theory, method, profession or work of massage, which school requires a resident course of study of not less than 70 hours before the student shall be furnished with a diploma or certificate of graduation from such school or institution of learning following the successful completion of such course of study or learning.

SEXUAL OR GENITAL AREA

Genitals, pubic area, buttocks, anus or perineum of any person, or the vulva or breasts of a female.

§ 242-2 *Violations and penalties.*

Every person, except those persons who are specifically exempted by this chapter, whether acting as an individual owner, employee of the owner, operator or employee of the operator, or whether acting as a mere agent or independent contractor for the owner, employee or operator, or acting as a participant or worker in any way directly or indirectly who gives massages or operates a massage establishment or any of the services defined in this chapter without first obtaining a license permit and paying a fee to do so from the Town or shall violate any provisions of this chapter shall be guilty of a misdemeanor and upon conviction such person shall be punished by a fine not to exceed \$500 or by imprisonment for a period not to exceed six months or by both such fine and imprisonment

Exemptions.

Editor's Note: State law reference - Persons exempt from massage parlor licensing law, G.S. 1956, § 23-20.8-9.

This chapter shall not apply to the following individuals while engaged in the personal performance of the duties of their respective professions:

- A. Physicians, surgeons, chiropractors, osteopaths or physical therapists who are duly licensed to practice their respective professions in the state;
- B. Nurses who are registered under the laws of this state; and
- C. Barbers and beauticians who are duly licensed under the laws of this state, except that this exemption shall apply solely to the massaging of the neck, face, scalp and hair of the customer or client for cosmetic or beautifying purposes.

Register of employees.

The licensee or person designated by the licensee of a massage establishment shall maintain a register of all persons employed at any time as masseurs or masseuses and their permit numbers. Such register shall be available at the massage establishment to representatives of the Town during regular business hours.

§ 242-5 Required facilities.

No license to conduct a massage establishment shall be issued unless an inspection by the Town reveals that the establishment complies with each of the following minimum requirements:

- A. Construction of rooms used for toilets, tubs, steam baths and showers shall be made waterproof with approved waterproofed materials and shall be installed in accordance with the Town building code. Plumbing fixtures shall be installed in accordance with the Town Plumbing Code.
 - (1) Steam rooms and shower compartments shall have waterproof floors, walls and ceilings approved by the Town.
 - (2) Floors of wet and dry heat rooms shall be adequately pitched to one or more floor drains properly connected to the sewer, when such sewer is available. (Exception: Dry heat rooms with wooden floors need not be provided with pitched floors and floor drains).
 - (3) A source of hot water must be available within the immediate vicinity of dry and wet heat rooms to facilitate cleaning.
- B.

The premises shall have adequate equipment for disinfecting and sterilizing nondisposable instruments and materials used in administering massages. Such nondisposable instruments and materials shall be disinfected after use on each patron.

C.

Closed cabinets shall be provided and used for the storage of clean linen, towels and other materials used in connection with administering massages. All soiled linens, towels and other materials shall be kept in properly covered containers or cabinets, which containers or cabinets shall be kept separate from the clean storage area.

D.

Toilet facilities shall be provided in convenient locations. When employees and patrons of different sexes are on the premises at the same time separate toilet facilities shall be provided for each sex. A single water closet per sex shall be provided for each 20 or more employees or patrons of that sex on the premises at any one time. Urinals may be substituted for water closets after one water closet has been provided. Toilets shall be designated as to the sex accommodated therein.

E.

Lavatories or washbasins provided with both hot and cold running water shall be installed in either the toilet room or a vestibule. Lavatories or washbasins shall be provided with soap and a dispenser and with sanitary towels.

F.

All electrical equipment shall be installed in accordance with the requirements of the Town Building Code.

Editor's Note: See Ch. 154, Building Construction.

§ 242-6 Operating requirements.

- **Etiket**
- **Basic View**

A. Every portion of the massage establishment, including appliances and apparatus, shall be kept clean and operated in a sanitary condition.

B. Price rates for all services shall be prominently posted in the reception area in a location available to all prospective customers.

C. All employees, including masseurs and masseuses, shall be clean and wear clean, nontransparent outer garments, covering the sexual and genital areas. A separate dressing room

for each sex must be available on the premises with individual lockers for each employee. Doors to such dressing rooms shall be open inward and shall be self-closing.

D. All massage establishments shall be provided with clean, laundered sheets and towels in sufficient quantity and shall be laundered after each use thereof and stored in a sanitary manner.

E. No massage establishment granted a license under the provisions of this chapter shall place, publish or distribute or cause to be placed, published or distributed any advertisement, picture or statement which is known or through the exercise of reasonable care should be known to be false, deceptive or misleading in order to induce any person to purchase or utilize any professional massage services.

§ 242-7 *Minors on premises.*

No person shall permit any person under the age of 18 years to come or remain on the premises of any massage business establishment as masseur, employee or patron, unless such person is on the premises on lawful business.

§ 242-8 *Alcoholic beverages.*

No person shall sell, give, dispense, provide, keep or cause to be sold, given, dispensed, provided or kept, any alcoholic beverage on the premises of any massage business.

Hours.

No massage business shall be kept open for any purpose between the hours of 10:00 p.m. and 8:00 a.m.

Employment of massagist.

No person shall employ as a massagist any person unless said employee has obtained and has in effect a permit issued pursuant to this chapter.

Inspection required.

The Chief of Police or his authorized representatives shall be authorized to make inspections of each massage business establishment for the purposes of determining that the provisions of this chapter are fully complied with. If in the opinion of the Chief of Police or his authorized representative there is probable cause to enter a massage establishment for the purpose of making inspections and examinations pursuant to this chapter, he shall request the owner or occupant thereof to grant permission for such entry, and if refused, he shall inform the Chief of Police, and

he, or his designee, a police officer, shall make application pursuant to the General Laws of Rhode Island, to a Judge of the Superior or District Court for a search warrant showing the Judge why the search warrant should be issued for the purposes set forth in this chapter.

Unlawful acts.

A. It shall be unlawful for any person holding a permit under this chapter to treat a person of the opposite sex except upon the signed order of a licensed physician, osteopath, chiropractor or registered physical therapist, which order shall be dated and shall specifically state the number of treatments, not to exceed 10. The date and hour of each treatment given and the name of the operator shall be entered on such order by the establishment where such treatments are given and shall be subject to inspection by the police pursuant to § 242-11. The requirements of this subsection shall not apply to treatments given in the residence of a patient, the office of a licensed physician, osteopath or registered physical therapist, chiropractor or in a regularly established and licensed hospital or sanitarium.

B. It shall be unlawful for any person in a massage parlor to place his or her hand or hands upon, to touch with any part of his or her body, to fondle in any manner or to massage, a sexual or genital part of any other person. Sexual or genital parts shall include the genitals, pubic area, buttocks, anus or perineum of any person, or the vulva or breasts of a female.

C. It shall be unlawful for any person in a massage parlor to expose his or her sexual or genital parts, or any portion thereof, to any other person. It shall also be unlawful for any person in a massage parlor to expose the sexual or genital parts, or any portions thereof, of any other person.

D. It shall be unlawful for any person, while in the presence of any other person in a massage parlor, to fail to conceal, with a fully opaque covering, the sexual or genital parts of his or her body.

E. It shall be unlawful for any person owning, operating or managing a massage parlor, knowingly to cause, allow or permit in or about such massage parlor, any agent, employee or any other person under his control or supervision to perform such acts prohibited in Subsections A, B and C of this section.

F. It shall be further unlawful for any permittee under this chapter to administer massage on an "outcall" basis as defined in §242-1. Such person shall administer massage solely within an establishment licensed to carry on such business under this chapter. Any violation of these provisions shall be deemed grounds for revocation of the permit granted hereunder. The restriction on outcall massage shall not apply to a permittee who performs outcall massage as defined herein upon a customer or client who, because of reasons of physical defects or incapacities or due to illness is physically unable to travel to the massage establishment. If any outcall massage is performed under this exception, a record of the date and hour of each

treatment, and the name and address of the customer or client, and the name of the employee administering such treatment and the type of treatment administered, as well as the nature of the physical defect, incapacity or illness of said client or customer shall be kept by the licensee or person or employee designated by the licensee. Such records shall be open to inspection by officials charged with the enforcement of public health laws. The information furnished or secured as a result to any such inspection shall be confidential. Any unauthorized disclosure or use of such information by an employee of the business of the Town shall be unlawful.

G.

It shall be unlawful for any massage service to be carried on within any cubicle, room, booth or any area within a massage establishment which is fitted with a door capable of being locked. All doors or doorway coverings within a massage establishment shall have an unobstructed opening six inches in size capable of clear two-way viewing into and out of all cubicles, rooms or booths. The opening shall be not less than 4 1/2 feet from the floor of the establishment nor more than 5 1/2 feet from the floor. Toilets and cubicles used solely for the application of liquid and vapor baths shall have no such opening in the covering door or curtain, but shall be clearly marked as to purpose on the exterior door or curtain of said cubicle, room or booth. Nothing contained herein shall be construed to eliminate other requirements of statute or ordinance concerning the maintenance of premises, nor to preclude authorized inspection thereof, whenever such inspection is deemed necessary by the Police or Health Department.

Editor's Note: State law reference - Access and inspection powers, G.L. 1956, § 23-20.8-8.

City of Providence Zoning Ordinances

Chapter 27: Zoning

ARTICLE I. GENERAL PROVISIONS

Sec. 100. Purpose.

The zones and regulations set forth in this ordinance are in compliance with the Comprehensive Plan and are intended to address the following purposes:

- (A) Promoting the public health, safety, and general welfare.
- (B) Providing for a range of uses and intensities of use appropriate to the character of the City and reflecting current and expected future needs.
- (C) Providing for orderly growth and development which recognizes:
 1. The goals and patterns of land use contained in the Comprehensive Plan as defined;

2. The natural characteristics of the land, including, but not necessarily limited to, its suitability for use based on topography, potential surface water run-off and susceptibility to surface or groundwater pollution;
 3. The values and dynamic nature of coastal features, riverfronts, freshwater ponds, the shoreline, and freshwater and coastal wetlands;
 4. The values of unique or valuable natural resources and features;
 5. The availability and capacity of existing and planned public and/or private services and facilities;
 6. The need to shape urban development; and
 7. The use of innovative development regulations and techniques.
- (D) Providing for the control, protection, and/or abatement of air, water, groundwater, and noise pollution, and soil erosion and sedimentation.
- (E) Providing for the protection of the natural, historic, cultural, and scenic character of the city.
- (F) Providing for the preservation and promotion of the urban forest, street trees and open space.
- (G) Providing for the protection of public investment in transportation, water, stormwater management systems, sewage treatment and disposal, solid waste treatment and disposal, schools, recreation, public facilities, open space, and other public requirements.
- (H) Promoting a balance of housing choices, for all income levels and groups, to assure the health, safety and welfare of all citizens and their rights to affordable, accessible, safe and sanitary housing.
- (I) Providing opportunities for the establishment of low and moderate income housing.
- (J) Promoting safety from fire, flood, and other natural or man-made disasters.
- (K) Promoting a high level of quality of design in the development of private and public facilities.
- (L) Promoting implementation of the Comprehensive Plan, as it may be amended from time to time.
- (M) Providing for coordination of land uses with contiguous municipalities, other municipalities, the state, and other agencies, as appropriate, especially with regard to resources and facilities that extend beyond the city's boundaries or have a direct impact on the city.
- (N) Providing for efficient review of development proposals, to clarify and expedite the zoning approval process.
- (O) Providing for procedures for the administration of the zoning ordinance, including, but not limited to, variances and special use permits.
- (Ord. 1994, ch. 94-24, § 1, 6-27-94)

Sec. 101. Establishment of zoning districts.

For the purpose of this ordinance, the city is divided into zoning districts designated and described as follows:

101.1. Residential Zoning Districts.

R-1 One-Family District: This zone is intended for low density residential areas comprising single-family detached structures located on lots with a minimum land area of six thousand (6,000) square feet.

R-2 Two-Family District: This zone is intended for low density residential areas comprising single-family and two-family detached structures located on lots with a minimum land area of five thousand (5,000) square feet.

R3 Three-Family District: This zone is intended for medium and low density residential areas comprised of structures containing single-family dwelling units, two-family dwelling units and three-family dwelling units located on lots with a minimum land area of five thousand (5,000) square feet and a minimum land area of two thousand (2,000) square feet per dwelling unit.

R-G General Residence District: This zone is intended for medium density residential areas comprised of structures containing single-family dwelling units, two-family dwelling units, three-family dwelling units and four (4) or more family dwelling units located on lots with a minimum land area of five thousand (5,000) square feet and a minimum land area of two thousand (2,000) square feet per dwelling unit.

R-M Multi-Family Dwelling District: This zone is intended for high density residential area comprised of structures containing single-family, two-family and three-family, and four (4) or more dwelling units located on lots with a minimum land area of five thousand (5,000) square feet and a minimum land area of one thousand two hundred (1,200) square feet per dwelling unit.

R-P Residential Professional District: This zone is intended to preserve and enhance the residential integrity of certain heavily travelled streets while permitting compatible professional uses. Compatible professional uses are those that will fit into the existing structure so as to preserve the residential character of the street, including its architecturally attractive and distinctive qualities; provide opportunities for people to live, work, and receive professional services in the same area; and improve public safety by encouraging both day and night time occupancy in the area.

101.2. Commercial Zoning Districts.

C-1 Limited Commercial District: This zone is intended for neighborhood commercial/residential areas that primarily serve local neighborhood needs for convenience retail, services and professional office establishments.

C-2 General Commercial District: This zone is intended for commercial areas that serve citywide needs for retail, services and professional office establishments.

C-3 Commercial: Reserved.

C-4 Heavy Commercial District: This zone is intended for commercial areas for a wide diversity of commercial uses that serve regional needs for retail, service, professional office and automotive establishments.

101.3. Downtown Zoning Districts.

D-1 Downtown: Central Business District: This zone is intended to encourage revitalization and restoration of the historic core business area and to accommodate appropriate expansion of the

downtown area. A variety of business, financial, institutional, public, quasi-public, cultural, residential, and other related uses are encouraged in the downtown area. Compatible and appropriate mixed uses are encouraged to promote commercial, retail and other business activity at street levels; residential, retail, and office uses on the upper floors; and to preserve and foster the economic vitality of the downtown. See DOWNCITY DISTRICT Overlay Zone for additional regulations.

D-2 Downtown: Mill District: This zone is intended to foster expansion of the downtown uses into former manufacturing areas in which commercial, retail, residential, and office uses are being introduced. A variety of business, financial, institutional, public, quasi-public, cultural, residential, light manufacturing and other related uses are encouraged to provide the mix of activities necessary to accommodate the growth of Downtown Providence.

101.4. Industrial Zoning Districts.

M-1 Industrial District: This zone is intended for general industrial uses that accommodate a variety of manufacturing, assembly, storage of durable goods and related activities provided that they do not pose toxic, explosive or environmental hazard in the city; and to support live-work spaces only in those existing underutilized industrial and/or commercial structures that are included in article, V, section 501, Industrial and Commercial Individual Structure District.

M-2 Heavy Industrial District: This zone is intended to provide for areas for heavy industrial uses, especially for those uses that are potentially hazardous, noxious or incompatible with the uses in any other zone.

101.5. Waterfront Zoning Districts.

W-1 Waterfront: Commercial/Residential District: This zone is intended to promote primarily residential development while allowing limited commercial use as well as appropriately scaled mixed use developments; to promote waterfront access and uses which improve the integration of the waterfront and the neighborhoods adjacent to the waterfront.

W-2 Waterfront: Mixed Use District: This zone is intended to promote a balance among appropriately scaled residential, commercial and light industrial development; to enhance compatible development with adjacent areas and surrounding residential neighborhoods; to enhance and create public access to the waterfront as a public resource for the benefit of present and future generations; and, to provide a transition between the Port/Maritime Industrial uses and surrounding neighborhoods.

W-3 Waterfront: Port/Maritime Industrial District: This zone is intended to promote the Port of Providence and related maritime industrial and commercial uses within the areas of Providence's waterfront; to protect the waterfront as a resource for water-dependent industrial uses; and to facilitate the renewed use of a vital waterfront.

101.6. Open and Public Space Zoning Districts.

OS Open Space District: This zone is to ensure that open space areas, conservation areas and outdoor recreation areas are preserved in the city. This district includes parks, wetlands, flood plains, conservation areas and areas that cannot be developed.

PS Public Space Areas: This zone is to ensure that open space areas and areas for public

buildings and facilities are preserved in the city. This district includes park and recreation areas, public buildings and schools.

CD Conservation District: This zone is to ensure that city-owned conservation areas are preserved.

101.7. Overlay Zoning Districts. These are districts that are superimposed on existing zoning district(s) or part of a district which impose specified requirements in addition to, but not less, than those otherwise applicable for the underlying zone, and do not in any manner supersede or replace any requirements of the underlying zone. The boundaries of the overlay zoning districts are defined in section 102 of this ordinance. These boundaries may be amended in accordance with Article XI of this ordinance.

HD Historic District: This overlay zone is intended to preserve structures of historic and architectural value by regulating the construction, alteration, repair, moving and demolition of such structures. This overlay can include neighborhoods or single buildings.

DD Downcity District: This overlay zone is intended to regulate the design of buildings and open spaces and by fostering preservation of historic structures to insure that: new development is compatible with the existing historic building fabric and the historic character of downtown; historic structures are preserved, and design alterations are in keeping with historic character; development relates to the pedestrian; development promotes the arts, entertainment and housing; and, the goals of the Downcity Plan of the Comprehensive Plan are achieved.

MSCOD Main Street Commercial Overlay District: This overlay zone is intended to be superimposed on existing C-1, C-2, C-4, and R-P districts and will require additional dimensional requirements and performance standards. The overlay zone will establish zero lot line setbacks from a property line that abuts a street, special frontage treatment, and other requirements as provided in section 505.

Commercial Corridor Overlay Districts (CCOD): This overlay zone is superimposed on existing zoning districts on commercial corridor throughout the city. The overlay zone requires additional dimensional requirements and performance standards as provided in section 507. In some instances, the CCOD covers blocks that border the commercial area, in order to comprehensively protect the integrity of the block, and reduce the impacts of development on adjacent residential neighborhoods.

West Side Overlay District: This overlay zone is intended to be superimposed on existing C-1, C-2, C-4, R-P and D-2, districts on Westminster Street between Route I-95 and Route 10. The overlay zone requires additional dimensional requirements and performance standards as provided in section 506. In some instances, the West Side Overlay District covers blocks from Westminster Street to parallel streets such as Washington and Carpenter Streets, in order to comprehensively protect the integrity of the block, and reduce the impacts of development on adjacent residential neighborhoods.

101.8--Institutional Floating Zone Districts. These floating zones are unmapped and for new development and mapped for existing institutional uses. The latter are established on the Providence Overlay Zoning District Maps only for use by an institution as provided herein.

I-1 Health Care Institutions: This zone is intended to permit health care facilities (as defined in RIGL 23-15-2) and their expansion in a planned manner while protecting the surrounding neighborhoods.

I-2 Educational Institutions: This zone is intended to permit higher education institutions and their expansion in a planned manner while protecting the surrounding neighborhoods.

I-3 Downtown Educational Institutions: This zone is intended to encourage revitalization of the historic retail core of the city by permitting higher education institutional uses, student housing, practicums in addition to a variety of business, financial, institutional, public, quasi-public, cultural, residential and other related uses in the downtown area. Compatible and appropriate mixed uses are encouraged to promote pedestrian activity at street levels while encouraging full and varied use on the upper floors. This district is intended to encourage the development of educational uses while preserving and fostering the economic vitality of the downtown.

(Ord. 1994, ch. 94-24, § 1, 6-27-94; Ord. 1995, ch. 95-20, § 1-1, 1-2, 5-26-95; Ord. 1999, ch. 99-47, § 1A, 12-23-99; Ord. 2000, ch. 00-28, § 1, 9-15-00; Ord. 2001, ch. 01-14, § 1.A, 3-12-01; Ord. 2001, ch. 01-24, § 1, 7-17-01; Ord. 2002, ch. 02-12, § 1.A, 4-11-02; Ord. 2003, ch. 03-27, § 1, 5-2-03; Ord. 2004, ch. 04-41, § 1, 11-4-04; Ord. 2005, ch. 05-32, § 1, 7-21-05; Ord. 2005, ch. 05-63, § 1, 12-21-05)

Appendix B

INFORMATION ABOUT COYOTE V. ROBERTS PARTIES

Malcom Brown was a Providence Police officer during the time of COYOTE v. Roberts [CV 76-0254] who worked in the Narcotics and Vice division and was responsible for enforcement of prostitution laws at the time. He was questioned by the Plaintiffs. He attended a series of neighborhood meetings in the West End concerning prostitution, in particular the meeting held at the Assumption Church and sponsored by the West End Community Center on June 20, 1978.

Eileen G. Cooney was counsel for the Plaintiffs in COYOTE v. Roberts [CV 76-0254].

Following the case, Cooney was disciplined three times by the Rhode Island Supreme Court Disciplinary Council in three professional misconduct cases. The first case noted that she had been disciplined privately by the court in 1995 and received a letter of admonition by the disciplinary board in 2002. Each private disciplinary action was due to neglect of a client's case. On March 17, 2005, she was publicly censured for *failing to file a document in an immigration case, failing to prepare a document in a divorce case, lying to a client, and ignoring the state disciplinary board*. She is now retired.

Ralph Gonnella was counsel for the Plaintiffs in COYOTE v. Roberts [CV 76-0254]. Following the case, Gonnella was disciplined by the Rhode Island Supreme Court Disciplinary Council.

Donald R. Hickey was a Democratic Rhode Island Senator and sponsor of S-2304 in 1980, the Senate version of 80-H 7334. He was born in 1938 and was elected in 1976. He was Chairman

of the 5th Ward Democratic Committee. He was Assistant principal at Bishop Hendricken High School.

Harold Krause was a Special Assistant Attorney General representing the Defendants in COYOTE v. Roberts [CV 76-0254]. On September 21, 1999 Krause was disbarred in Rhode Island and on October 26, 2000 disciplinary actions proceeded against him through the Rhode Island Supreme Court Disciplinary Council. Thereafter, Krause moved to Wisconsin where his license was revoked.

Chief Judge Henry E. Laliberte was the Rhode Island State District Court Chief Justice from 1969 through the period of COYOTE v. Roberts [CV 76-0254]. He also drafted the amendments to RI state prostitution statutes that consequently decriminalized prostitution indoors [80 H7334]. Laliberte was born May 24, 1919 in Providence. He enlisted in the Army 9/14/42 and served in the Air Force between 1942 and 1945. He attended Providence College and Boston University School of Law in 1950. Laliberte was a member of the Board of Directors of Progress for Providence, was a member of the United Vet Council, and was the former Chairman of the Downtown Master Planning Committee of the City. Between 1955 and 1965 he was the President of the Providence City Council. In 1957 Laliberte served as a delegate to the RI Constitutional Convention and a delegate to the Democratic National Convention in 1960. He served as a state Senator from 1965-1969 and in 1969 was appointed as Chief Judge of the District Court.

Gerard McGeDelles was affiliated with Plaintiffs in COYOTE v. Roberts [CV 76-0254]. Following the case, McGeDelles ran as Lieutenant Governor for the Republican party in 1980 and lost. He is still practicing law.

Richard R. Patterson was a Democratic Rhode Island Senator who sponsored S-2304 the Senate version of the 1980 prostitution amendments. He was born in 1925 and elected in 1978. He was on the 9th ward Democratic Committee and the National Association of Executive Directors. He did a great deal of work advocating for seniors and people with physical and mental disabilities. He was Executive Director for the Retardation Center. He is deceased.

Chief Judge Raymond James Pettine was the Chief Judge of the U.S. Federal District Court of Rhode Island from 1971-1982 who presided over COYOTE v. Roberts [CV 76-0254]. Judge Pettine was born July 6, 1912 in Providence and died November 17, 2003 in Dallas. Judge Pettine graduated from Boston University School of Law, served in the Army, was a former U.S. Attorney, and Special Counsel for the Attorney General. In 1966 Pettine was nominated to the Federal District Court position by President Johnson. Pettine was considered “one of the great romantic judges.” The RI Historical Society commemorates his work:

“During his long career as a federal judge - over 30 years- Pettine gained the reputation as a strong defender of the U.S. Constitution. His interpretations of the rights granted in that document, however, led to public controversy on several occasions. Consequentially, Pettine gained the additional reputation for a willingness to adhere to his own code of ethics despite the risk of disapproval from the public and/or state and local governments. Several of his rulings, on emotional issues such as separation of church and state (the "Pawtucket creche" case, 1981), homosexual rights, women's rights, abortion, prison reform (conditions at the Adult Correctional Institution), and busing, earned him attention on the national level in the press, the federal government, and the United States Supreme Court. In 1979, he was selected a member of the Judicial Conference of the United States by unanimous vote of the judges of the First Circuit.”

Rhode Island Representative Matthew J. Smith was the House Sponsor of 80-H 7334. Smith was born in 1941 and he was elected as a Democratic Rhode Island Representative in 1973. In 1980 he was speaker of the House. Between 1975 and 1980, Smith was a member of the House Committee on Community and Health and the Committee on Education and Welfare. Between

1976 and 1980 Smith served as the Chair of the House Finance Committee. He later wrote the book *Rhode Island Party Politics during 1956-1964*.

William B. Zuccarelli was a Democratic Rhode Island Senator and sponsor of S-2304, the 1980 prostitution amendments. He was born in 1914 and elected in 1976. He was a production foreman at Uniroyal, Inc.

Appendix C

DEFENDANT RECORDS OF US V. KIM, ET. AL.¹³⁵

Defendant Sentence Statistics:

| Defendant Type | Range of sentence | Average sentence |
|-----------------------------------|----------------------------|---|
| Brothel Owners/Managers | 1 day to 4 years, 10 days | 2 years, 3 months, and 1 week |
| Middlemen/ Transporters | Unknown to 3 years, 3 days | 2 years, 10 months, 2 and a half weeks ¹³⁶ |
| Money Transmitters. “Hawalas.” | Unknown to 1 day | Not enough evidence ¹³⁷ |

Brothel Owners/Managers:

Kyo Hwa Adler

DOB: 3/21/1953

Status: Kyo Hwa Adler (59260-054), a 56 year old Asian woman was released from a minimum security prison in Danbury, CT on 3/27/09.

Sun Im An

DOB: 1/15/1962

Status: Sun Im An, a 44 year old Asian female, was released from a federal prison on 7/17/08 (42484-037).

Ji Hyun Bang

DOB: 6/2/1976

¹³⁵ is Case F # 2006R00United States of America v. Kim, Il, Lnu, Park, Bae, Polachek, Son, Lee, Choi-Son, and Lnu pursuant to T. 18 U.S.C. §§ 2, 371, 2421, 1960 (a), and 3148.

¹³⁶ The data for the Middlemen/Transporters is imperfect. Only two arrest records for the five defendants were found.

¹³⁷ Only one arrest record for a money transmitter was found.

Status: Hyun Ji Bang, a 32 year old Asian female, was released from a federal prison on 8/16/06 (43832-112).

Aeok Boydston, a/k/a “Big Sister Lillie”

DOB: 5/8/1957

Status: Aeok Boydston, a 51 year old Asian female was released from a federal prison on 8/26/08 (59249-054).

Un Sun Brown



DOB: 6/27/1950

Status: Un Sun Lee Brown (also known by Lee Unsun Brown, Kay Brown, and Lee Un Sun Lee) is a fugitive who has been featured on America’s Most Wanted (November 25, 2006), wanted for human trafficking, and transportation of illegal aliens in the Washington, D.C. area. She was found at K Street spa, a brothel linked to NY. She fled before investigators could arrest her. She has been associated with An Kim and Maria Velasquez-Reyes, both who are fugitives wanted for charges related to human trafficking.

Eun Sook Chim

DOB: 5/14/55

Status: Eun Sook Chim, a 53 year old Asian female, was released from a federal prison on 9/18/07 (59254-054).

Kim Chong, a/k/a “Big Sister Lora”

DOB: 5/20/1960 or 5/1/1960

Status: No records found.

Yong Chong, a/k/a “Ra Ra”

DOB: 12/16/1968

Status: Yong Chong, a 40 year old Asian female, was released from a federal prison on 12/31/07 (13926-067).

Sun Daneman

DOB: 10/15/1945

Status: Sun Daneman, a 63 year old Asian female is currently being held at the Carswell Federal facility in Fort Worth, Texas (59288-054) and is set to be released on 7/21/2010.

Daneman owned “Magic Health Salon” in Waterbury, CT.

Daneman faced a maximum sentence of five years.

Chong Girouard

DOB: 8/28/1949

Status: No records found.

Chun Grandt, a/k/a “Texas Imo”

DOB: 2/5/1952

Status: Chun Grandt, a 57 year old Asian female is currently being held at the Carswell Federal facility in Fort Worth, Texas (60684-066) and is set to be released on 5/13/09.

Mi Sun Hayes



DOB: 9/27/1953

Status: Mi Sun Hayes, a 55 year old Asian female was released from a federal prison on 5/2/08 (20919-058). She told neighbors she was an interpreter, but she was actually running “Moon Light,” a brothel in Baltimore. Investigators found Korean women being held as sex slaves through debt bondage. Hayes confiscated their documents and threatened to harm them if they tried to escape.

An Soon Kim

DOB: 8/2/1957

Status: No record found.

Hyang Ran Kim, a/k/a “Tina”

DOB: 6/7/1975

Status: Hyang Ran Kim, a 33 year old Asian female, is currently being held at a minimum security facility in Danbury, CT (59287-054), and is set to be released on 8/25/10.

Kim owned “OK Spa” in Washington, DC.

Kim faced a maximum sentence of ten years.

Hyea Kim, a/k/a “Patty Kim”

DOB: 1/15/1969 or 1/21/1969

Status: Hyea Kim, a 50 year old Asian female, was released from a federal prison on 8/29/08.

Kyung Hwa Kim

DOB: 11/1/1971

Status: No record found.

Yong Hui Kim

DOB: Unknown

Status: Yong Hui Kim, a 47 year old Asian female was released from a federal prison on 8/31/06 (58433-019). Young Kim was arrested in Washington, D.C..

Jung Lim, a/k/a “Big Sister Miko”

DOB: Unknown

Status: No record found.

Kum Ok Lowery

DOB: 4/23/1953 or 4/28/1953

Status: Kum Ok Lowery, a 55 year old Asian female, was released from a federal prison on 2/8/08 (42483-037). In mid-August, 2006, Feds raided Moon Light Tanning and Spa in Baltimore, the brothel Lowery was managing. Investigators found a log of customers and \$21,000 in cash. Sun Im An and Mi Ja Par were also arrested here. Other women were found hiding in secret compartments in the salon. Some of the women arrested avoided conviction.

Myong Moon, a/k/a “Debbie”

DOB: 2/19/1960

Status: Myong Moon, a 49 year old Asian female, is currently being held at a facility in Denver, Colorado, and set to be released on 5/9/09 (60683-066).

Tae Young Oh

DOB: Unknown

Status: No record found.

Eun Ja Park

DOB: 10/6/1967

Status: Eun Ja Park was arrested in Washington, D.C.. No arrest records found.

Mi Ja Park

DOB: 4/19/1965

Status: Mi Ja Park, a 43 year old Asian female, was release from a federal prison on 12/12/08 (42485-037). She was arrested at the Moon Light Tanning and Spa in Baltimore.

Sung Su Plourde

DOB: 1/22/1952

Status: No record found.

Seng Hee Ryan

DOB: 6/30/1973

Status: Seng Hee Ryan, a 35 year old Asian female, is currently being held at a high security facility in Hazelton, WV, and is set to be released on 6/22/10 (28733-016). Ryan owned the “Cleveland Park Holistic Center” in Washington, DC.

Ryan faced a maximum sentence of ten years.

Myong Sa

DOB: 3/20/1942

Status: Myong Sa, a 67 year old Asian female, was released from a federal prison on 7/2/08 (59243-054).

Jae Shim

DOB: 2/27/1966, 2/27/1968 or 12/13/1960

Status: Jae Shim, a 43 year old Asian female, is currently being held at a minimum security Alderson, WV facility, pending a 7/1/10 release (59256-054).

Shim owned “Hong Kong” in Flushing, NY.

Hyo Won Smith, a/k/a “Niko”

DOB: 12/20/1967

Status: No record found.

Tae Nam Thompson

DOB: 3/26/1950

Status: Tae Nam Thompson, a 58 year old Asian female, is currently being held at a minimum security Alderson, WV facility, pending a 1/1/10 release (28730-016). Thompson managed “14K Spa” in Washington, DC.

Thompson faced a maximum sentence of five years.

Chong Weishaupt

DOB: 9/30/1953

Status: Chong Weishaupt, a 55 year old Asian female, is currently being held at a facility in Dallas, Texas, and set to be released on 5/8/09 (59267-054).

Tae Young Oh

DOB: Unknown

Status: No record found.

Kyong Polachek, a/k/a “Ji-yeon Kim,” “Jennifer” and “Hana”

DOB: 3/29/1952

Status: Kyong Polachek, a 56 year old Asian female, was released from a federal prison on 9/18/07. She was the manager of Downtown Spa in Providence, RI.

Middlemen/Transporters:

Tae Hoon Kim, a/k/a “Tae Won”

DOB: 2/15/1967

Status: Tae Hoon Kim, a 42 year old Asian male, is being held at a low security facility in Lompoc, California, and set to be released on 8/18/09.

Lim, Sung Chul, a/k/a “Sung Chul II,” “Seong-cheol” and “Cheol-I”

DOB: 2/11/1967

Status: No record found.

Lee, Sung Ho, a/k/a “Seong Ho”

DOB: 10/10/1972

Status: No record found.

Tae Ho Choi, a/k/a “Tae Jun Park”

DOB: 12/20/1974

Status: No record found.

Do Hyup Bae, a/k/a “Do Hyeop”

DOB: 6/2/1969

Status: Do Hyup Bae, a 40 year old White male, could be the same as an inmate at the Moshanon Valley facility in Phillipsburg, PA, who is set to be released on 5/19/09 (35183-77)

Money Transmitters:

Byoung Il Son, a/k/a “Mr. Son”

DOB: 9/15/1964

Status: No record found.

Jin Sook Kim Lee

DOB: 6/9/1975

Status: No record found.

Miae Choi-Son

DOB: 9/5/1964

Status: Miae Son, a 44 year old Asian female, was released from a federal prison on 8/16/06.

Jong Tae Park

DOB: 2/7/1975

Status: No record found.

Appendix D

RHODE ISLAND BROTHEL DATABASE

Basic Brothel Spreadsheet

The “Basic Brothel Spreadsheet” contains simple contact and locale information of identified massage parlor brothels in Rhode Island.

| Name of Alleged Brothel | Telephone number | Address | City |
|--------------------------------|-------------------------|----------------|-----------------|
| “Spa A” | [REDACTED] | [REDACTED] | Providence |
| “Spa B” | [REDACTED] | [REDACTED] | Cranston |
| “Spa C” | [REDACTED] | [REDACTED] | Cranston |
| “Spa D” | [REDACTED] | [REDACTED] | Warwick |
| “Spa E” | [REDACTED] | [REDACTED] | Providence |
| “Spa F” | [REDACTED] | [REDACTED] | Providence |
| “Spa G” | [REDACTED] | [REDACTED] | Providence |
| “Spa H” | [REDACTED] | [REDACTED] | Providence |
| “Spa I” | [REDACTED] | [REDACTED] | East Providence |
| “Spa J” | [REDACTED] | [REDACTED] | Providence |
| “Spa K” | [REDACTED] | [REDACTED] | Cranston |
| “Spa L” | [REDACTED] | [REDACTED] | Providence |
| “Spa M” | [REDACTED] | [REDACTED] | Pawtucket |
| “Spa N” | [REDACTED] | [REDACTED] | Pawtucket |

| | | | |
|----------|------------|------------|------------------|
| “Spa O” | [REDACTED] | [REDACTED] | Middletown |
| “Spa P” | [REDACTED] | [REDACTED] | Providence |
| “Spa Q” | [REDACTED] | [REDACTED] | Providence |
| “Spa R” | [REDACTED] | [REDACTED] | Providence |
| “Spa S” | [REDACTED] | [REDACTED] | Providence |
| “Spa T” | [REDACTED] | [REDACTED] | North Providence |
| “Spa U” | [REDACTED] | [REDACTED] | Providence |
| “Spa V” | [REDACTED] | [REDACTED] | Providence |
| “Spa W” | [REDACTED] | [REDACTED] | Warwick |
| “Spa X” | [REDACTED] | [REDACTED] | Pawtucket |
| “Spa Y” | [REDACTED] | [REDACTED] | Providence |
| “Spa Z” | [REDACTED] | [REDACTED] | Providence |
| “Spa AA” | [REDACTED] | [REDACTED] | Middletown |
| “Spa BB” | [REDACTED] | [REDACTED] | East Providence |
| “Spa CC” | [REDACTED] | [REDACTED] | Central Falls |
| “Spa DD” | [REDACTED] | [REDACTED] | Central Falls |
| “Spa EE” | [REDACTED] | [REDACTED] | Providence |
| “Spa FF” | [REDACTED] | [REDACTED] | Providence |

Raid History January 1998-April 2009

| Date of raid | Name of spa | Arrests made | Notes |
|-----------------------|-----------------------|--|---|
| November 1998 | Club Osaka | Six women and the owner of the club, Seng Uk Han were arrested. | Sgt. Cardarelli said the conditions were slave-like. Women were told they had to work to pay off travel expenses. They were forced to work 16-18 hours a day and kept nothing but cash tips. The club presented itself as a health club, but the equipment was not plugged in, condoms found. Han's girlfriend lured the women to Flushing, N.Y. and then they were transported to Providence. One woman had cigarette burns on her forearms. |
| Between 2000 and 2001 | Studio Salon II | The women were charged with practicing a massage without a license, practicing a massage without proper clothing, and loitering for indecent purposes. | In this time period, Studio Salon II raided eight times. During the raids, there were girls found performing massages topless or in lingerie for a \$75.00/half hour massage. Undercover detectives were offered sexual services. Detectives found \$6,500.00 in cash on the owner. |
| April 2001 | North Main Street Spa | Five women arrested. | Neighbors complained of a high number of men coming and going to North Main Street Spa and were suspicious of the nature of activity due to the ad placed in the "Adult" section of the <i>Providence Phoenix</i> by the spa. |
| December 2001 | YoKo Spa | | Police raided the spa when an undercover detective was offered "boom boom" for an additional \$160.00. During the raid, police |

| | | | |
|---------------|--|--|--|
| | | | found another client having sex with a “massage therapist,” sleeping quarters, showers, and a kitchen. There were indications of sex trafficking. |
| August 2004 | Down Town Spa Wellness Center Bali Day Spa | Five women arrested and found to be undocumented. | All three brothels were raided. All their windows were covered. The women found during the raid did not have proper documentation and were sent to the Bristol County House of Correction in Dartmouth, MA to be held awaiting deportation proceedings. |
| October 2004 | Pine Tree Spa | 55-year-old manager was charged for 2 counts of pandering. Three women arrested for soliciting sex to undercover detectives. | Four arrests made following a raid. The women were arraigned in Providence District Court. One woman was detained by the Immigration and Customs Enforcement due to an expired visa. The manager was released on a \$1,000 bail. |
| November 2005 | Midori spa | Many women arrested by offered safe haven with Day One. All women declined help. | A spa employee asked undercover officer to undress, bathed him, and offered sexual services. Midori Spa contained eating, sleeping, and bathing quarters. Police officer, Stephen Campbell said conditions were slave-like. |
| October 2005 | Central Health | Briane Fontaine, the manager was arrested. | The women were found to be living on the premises. An investigation began in May 2005. Prostitutes were found to be collecting between \$18,000 to \$20,000 a month. Central Health was found to be part of a large network of Korean-owned brothels. These brothels posed as massage parlors, health spas, and acupuncture clinics. |

| | | | |
|---------------|--|--|--|
| November 2006 | Central Health North Main Street Spa | Sumi Ray, 53 of 57 Brewster Street in Providence was charged with one count of violating the state statute by operating a massage therapy establishment while knowingly employing an unlicensed therapist and allowing that person to perform a massage. | Police reported many of the women in the brothels raided were foreign nationals being exploited. |
| April 2009 | Asian Fantasies | Three Korean women questioned. No arrests. | Immigration agents and police and federal authorities are conducting a joint investigation. On the ground floor, rooms contained mattresses, a kitchen, cooking supplies, and personal items indicating the women likely were staying there for some period of time. The upstairs area contained a full bathroom, a waiting room area, and two rooms with massage tables in them. The business did not have a license. |

Rules of procedure for Asian massage parlor brothels

The following guide was posted on the USA Sexguide.

From Craigslist.com

Asian Massage Parlors in Providence - Review - m4w - 42

Reply to:

Date: 2006-05-26, 12:07AM EDT

This is for the frequent postings requesting reviews of Asian Massage Parlors (AMP). Here it goes:

I've been to all three of them in Providence and they are all very similar with small (but sometimes important) differences. Here are some commonalities and differences:

- * You pay \$60 to get in for one hour (half hours available)
- * Including hand job at the end (you must initiate)
- * No rush
- * All three places are Korean bath houses
- * Nice areas for two of them (██████████ House - dead-smack in the middle of downtown) and the one that posts very often on ██████████. The one I used first was the best, but doesn't post anymore, it was/is on ██████████, a somewhat less nice area, but still safe.
- * Custom House is difficult to park, although there is a company's parking lot that you can use after hours down the street. ██████████ has plenty of roadside parking (for example at the church across the street ;-) and Admiral Street (across from the ██████████ pharmacy) has their own parking lot in the back with discreet entrance from the back.
- * Entrances are often obscured and not easy to find: ██████████ is a normal business entry door to the left and around the corner of the pub, ██████████ is between two businesses (look for the large white ██████████ letters on a glass door), both are upstairs and in the back. ██████████ is the most obvious and easiest to access.
- * Pretty girls, although most are small breasted. Girls change and I am still hoping. ██████████ had the best but only two. Admiral Street had the most.

- * Sometimes you can choose the girls, sometimes everyone is busy and you can be glad to get any.
- * Don't get scared by the woman opening for you, she is usually the mama-san, old and ugly, but usually friendly. Don't worry, she won't be serving you (but she will take your \$60)! ;-)
- * Expect the question if you had been here before. Be polite, don't ask dumb questions about services and tell her "no, but I have been to others before". They are as concerned about getting busted as you are!
- * When you get in, you get naked in front of the clothed girl, one parlor gave me a little pouch for my valuables to take along to the bath (nice touch!), but your stuff is safe in your dedicated room, either way.
- * You go to a bathroom, lay down on a bench and the girl baths/washes you with warm water poured over you. She soaps you down (including all orifices and your General - I always get a "wow" at that point (thick!)), rinses and then dries you, wraps your towel around and leads you back to the room.
- * Room gets locked (!) and the girl starts a massage with you on your tummy. This goes on for a while and the girl may be walking all over you (literally: some have a bar at the ceiling to hold on to so she can walk over your back). Tell her what you like and don't like and enjoy it, it's a very nice experience. Up to this point, everything is perfectly legal, even if you get a hard-on during bathing!
- * Eventually, you must turn around, sometimes on your own without being asked. If you don't request a "special massage" you may not get it, but turning around and taking your towel away usually gets the point across. This is the beauty of these places: you can do all of this non-verbally by simply taking the girls hand and leading it to where you want it, starting to stroke the girl on or between her legs, moving to remove her top (she will finish it) etc.
- * I always ask if there is a "special-special" massage and use my index finger of one hand and slide it in and out of a formed hole in my other hand. Here is the biggest difference: in one place, the girl laughed and shook her head and proceeded with a hand job, in the other two places, the girls said yes and wanted \$120. Prices are negotiable but the full service part of the deal is usually not as unrushed as everything else, unless you pay premium \$\$ (200). One girl didn't want to touch the money until she was done, the other one took it outside after negotiating (don't worry, she'll come back for you).
- * When you're done, the girl washes your privates with a warm, moist towel, which is very nice.
- * Tell her if you want or not want oil or lotion for the massage portion - this is after you get washed, hence, will remain on your body when you get home!! I assume that nobody would object to a second shower if you asked, but I never did that.
- * All in all a very worthwhile experience, especially if you like petite, small-breasted Asian girls. It's definitely a trust exercise on your part but can be a very nice experience with high return if you get the right girl. It certainly beats most strip clubs and many Craigslist Girls and you determine how far you want to take it. Most of this, by the way, also works with Asian girls

advertising independently. The only drawback that this has for me: Koreans love garlic!! 'nough said.

Enjoy!

General Sex Trafficking Indicators

Quotes from the johns:

- “Again with my eyes closed as tight as they can go. I had to stop as I felt like I was forcing myself on a 40+ year old fat sex slave” by “Toodw” 3/28/07 [“Spa R”].
- “Lidi” at “Spa FF” since at least 7/7/06 “did mention she works everyday and has no time off...sounds like she’s working off a debt or simply, not free to set her own schedule...you know what I mean.”
- “When leaving I noticed a bunch of the girls laying down on the front office on blankets. The girls I saw at Lily’s walking around seemed to be a younger group than the girls I’ve seen at “Spa U” by “I Luv Amp” on 7/29/06.
- “ I get assigned a girl—whose name I forget, I apologize. But she was short, very petite, and 100% anglicized. Asked her where’s she’s from---‘New York.’ She was clearly U.S. born and raised, probably not even first generation. I knew this [sic.] was going to be a problem... But the weirdest thing was that o one there appeared to be from the old crew not fresh-off-the-boat Asians. Even the woman washing the towels was Hispanic!” by “WebDog” 4/6/07 about “Spa H.”
- “but when she started sounding like I was ripping her apart, I lost it.” [about “Yoko” from “Spa L”] by “SuperXFly” on 6/9/06.
- “Sonny indicated that she will be gone for six weeks in order to undergo some cosmetic surgery. Suffice it to say she’ll be thinner and bustier when she returns.” By “Guest 123” on 3/14/07.
- “The new mamas an already had the door open as I reached the 4th floor. I’m convinced they watch the door and stair monitors” by “Guest 123” on 3/14/07 about “Spa L.”
- “reputedly mob-connected office building” by “VilunyaChert” on 4/26/07 [about the old location of “Spa L”]
- “I was at the old Oriental Garden Spa (off of North Main) and it got raided. I had just finished a HR and there was a ton of commotion in the next room, with yelling and stuff, then a friendly UC (undercover police officer) comes in my room (me face up buck naked) grabs the Girl and says sorry to me and then tells me you are all set just get dressed and get out of here” by “P Austin” on 10/16/07.
- “I observe three distinct AMP patterns around here so far: the [redacted] Korean pattern (most common by far), the "[redacted], and the "hole-in-the-wall" op operations with no signage, on lower [redacted] and [redacted].” on 1/10/09 by “Vagr.”
- “Ok first of all I can't imagine the fun it would be to live in Flushing the K [Korean] girl capital. it seems that no matter what Amp [Asian massage parlor] I go to and ask where they were from those that answered said Flushing.” On 1/28/09 by “Stressed Out.”
- “When a woman from an AMP goes "on vacation", that means she'll never be back. There are exceptions, but not many.” By “Bubba261” 1 March 2009.

Sex Tourism Indicators

- “...I haven’t read anything about its demise in the local papers, but maybe I missed it. It was a poor choice for a location, located on the main drag a couple of blocks down from the Plainville Police Dept. I’m not surprised. The few reports here since it opened were average at best. No reason to visit the place when you are just 5 miles away from the safety of the RI border” about [REDACTED] in Plainville, Massachusetts. By “Tue Hobbyist” on 10/23/08.
- “It is a buyer’s paradise out there [referring to RI]” by “Guest 123” on 10/24/08
- “(most people must roll solo on these missions but I always find it more fun to go with friends. It makes for some good laughs on the ride home and for good stories for later on). On 1/18/08 by “tuglover1.”
- “If only we could have such service here in Albany NY” “Worth the 3 hour drive” by “Torq465” on 5/29/06. [“Spa L”].
- “Not degrade the importance of the day, but I went to “Spa L” to remember the days I spent with my Brothers in Arms, on leave in various countries” by “Ri Designer” on 5/29/06.
- On 2/1/09, “Lao Ma” reported coming to Providence from China for sex during a layover at T. F. Green Airport.

Brothel Database

“Spa A”

Address: [REDACTED] in Providence.

Phone: [REDACTED]

Aliases: [REDACTED]

History of Existence: “Spa A” first advertised in the *Providence Phoenix* on 8/15/08 and was first discussed on the forums 9/15/08. Incorporated as [REDACTED] on 11/06/08. Purpose: Title 7-1.2-1701

Owners/Managers/Presidents: [REDACTED],

Registering Agents: [REDACTED] [REDACTED] in Providence.

Connections: [REDACTED] is also the incorporator for “Spa E”. He also is involved with the owner of “Spa DD”

Advertisements: “Spa A” advertises: sauna, steam, table shower, brand new facilities, dry sauna, body scrub, body rub, private parking. Consistent advertising in the *Providence Phoenix* weekly.

Girls:

- **“Annie”:** 50+ seems to be the mamasan. She has been there since at least 9/15/08.
- **“Bebe”:** Seems to be there since at least 10/22/08. Early 30s, tall, with natural body. Criticized for seeming to not be “into it.”

Services provided: Backwalking, table shower, sauna, manual stimulation, fellatio, sexual intercourse.

Facilities Information: Open from 10 am to midnight every day. The facility is brand new and in sight of popular Rhode Island restaurant. Facility has table shower and sauna. Entrance is on the side of the building near the spa parking.

Procedural information: n/a

Notes: n/a

“Spa B”

Address: [REDACTED] in Cranston

Phone: [REDACTED]

Aliases: [REDACTED]

History of Existence: [REDACTED] was formerly known as [REDACTED]. [REDACTED] was around since at least March 2008. In December 2008, it was renamed [REDACTED]. In February, 2009, it was renamed “Spa B.”

Owner/Manager/President: n/a

Registering Agent: [REDACTED]

Connections: [REDACTED] is also the registering agent of “Spa Q” in Cranston, The [REDACTED] Association, and [REDACTED] in Brighton, MA.

Advertisements: “Spa B” advertises weekly in *The Providence Phoenix*. The ads for [REDACTED] stopped for two weeks, one in November of 2008 and one in December of 2008. The first ad for [REDACTED] appeared in *The Providence Phoenix* on 12/5/08. They advertise services of bodywork and body shampoo and having “all new girls.”

Girls:

- **“Julie”:** there since at least 3/29/08. In her thirties, average size. 8/25/08 tells johns she will be leaving soon back to NYC.
- **“Mimi”:** there since at least 3/29/08. In her thirties, average size. 8/25/08 tells johns she will be on “vacation.”
- **“Nidi”:** there since at least 10/28/08: Older and thin.

Services Provided: After some time, sexual intercourse was provided, also manual stimulation, fellatio, and cunnilingus.

Facilities Information: [REDACTED] is located across the street from [REDACTED] restaurant. They do not have a sauna or a table shower.

Procedural Information: Four-handed massage at times. Since there is no table shower or sauna, the men are taking to a shower with a plastic chair in it.

Notes: n/a

“Spa C”

Address: [REDACTED] in Cranston

Phone number: [REDACTED]

Aliases: n/a

History of Existence: Open since at least 4/2008.

Owners/Managers/Presidents: n/a

Registering Agents: n/a

Connections: n/a

Advertisements: “Spa C” advertises weekly in the *Providence Phoenix*. They advertise: “very relaxing body work,” shiatsu, acupressure, and table showers.

Girls: n/a

Services provided: manual stimulation

Facilities information: n/a

Procedural information: n/a

Notes: n/a

“Spa D”

Address: [REDACTED] in Warwick.

Phone: [REDACTED]

Aliases: [REDACTED]

History of Existence: Since at least 12/12/08. Registered as In [REDACTED] on 3/13/08

Owner/Manager/President: [REDACTED]. Manager's prison record:

1. [REDACTED] [REDACTED] 41-Asian-F 04-17-1995 RELEASED
-

Registering Agent: n/a

Connections: [REDACTED] is the incorporator of "Spa A". Perhaps they are related.

Advertisements: The first advertisement in the *Providence Phoenix* occurred on 12/12/08 with a break in advertisement for a couple of weeks. Many advertisements listed on *Craigslist.com*

Girls:

- "Kay Kay": There since at least 12/17/08.
- "CeCe": There since at least 12/29/08
- "April": There since at least 1/4/08. "Young and petite" "Tight tight."
- "June": There since at least 11/12/08. She is Korean and in her early thirties.

Services provided: \$60.00 door fee, fellatio with condom, manual stimulation. \$140.00 for FS.

Facilities information: The building looks like a converted office. By a gold for cash place.

Procedural information: n/a

Notes:

- On 1/4/08: all new girls and new mamas an (by "Tleeony" on *Escort Reports* thread of USA Sexguide)
- All the girls from NY in December 2008.

"Spa E"

Address: [REDACTED] in Providence.

Phone: [REDACTED]

Aliases: [REDACTED]

History of existence: Before being called "Spa E", it was called [REDACTED]. It is registered as [REDACTED] a Domestic Profit Corporation [REDACTED] incorporated on 7/27/2004 pursuant to Title 7-1.1-51 Health and Beauty Salon (changed from massage parlor to health beauty salon in 2008). Before changing its name to [REDACTED], it was called [REDACTED]. Around July 2004 the name and management changed. [REDACTED] was around since at least 2/20/04.

Owner/Manager/President: President: [REDACTED]. Providence).

Registering Agent: [REDACTED]. The previous registering agent was [REDACTED] (who specializes in criminal defense and immigration law).

Connections: [REDACTED], the registering agent is also the agent for “Spa A” [REDACTED]. He also is involved with [REDACTED] which is incorporated by [REDACTED], near “Spa DD” [REDACTED]. He is connected to [REDACTED], the incorporator of “Spa A”. The counter-surveillance is very tight at “Spa E.” The building “Spa E” is in is owned by [REDACTED].

Advertisements: “Spa E” advertises weekly in the *Providence Phoenix* as providing “body rub; dry sauna; body shampoo.” Their slogan is “a pleasant and delightful atmosphere with a very courteous staff...”

Girls:

- **“Jackie”:** was there in May 06 but left.
- **“Judy”:** there at least since June 06
- **“Lilly”:** there since at least July 2006.
- **“Jennifer”:** there since at least 6/13/07. She has light brown hair, is young, and has implants. She says she is part Korean and part Chinese and from Singapore “shy.”
- **“Niomi”:** There since at least 8/16/07.
- **“Penny”:** There since at least 9/22/08. Voluptuous.
- **“Micki”:** There since at least 10/11/08. Very petite.
- **“Pepsi”:** There since at least 11/11/08. About 5’6,” slim (may have been at [REDACTED] in Waterbury, CT).
- **“Joy”:** There since 11/18/08. Told johns she was there until January. Had been there previously.

Services provided: \$60.00 house fee, full-service for \$140.00. Cunnilingus not permitted. Fellatio with and without a condom.

Facilities information: “Spa E” is located in an upscale, shopping district on Westminster Street within close proximity of Senator Whitehouse’s office, City Hall, the Supreme Courthouse, and the State Archives. Johns enter in the back alleyway entrance. A big blue sign marks number [REDACTED]. There are three security cameras in back and one in the front. A dumpster is typically used to make the entrance appear more hidden. They have table shower, sauna, bathroom, and massage rooms. The massage rooms have little red doors.

Procedural information:

Notes:

- In 2006 they stopped doing massages for a period of time due to pressure from raids.

“Spa F”

Address: [REDACTED], Providence.

Phone: [REDACTED]

Aliases: n/a

History of Existence: “Spa F” has been operating since at least February 2007.

Owner/Manager/President: n/a

Registering Agent: n/a

Connections:

Advertisements: “Spa F” posts regularly in *The Providence Phoenix* as of early August 2008. They seldom post on craigslist.com. They advertise “great bodywork by beautiful Asian girls.”

Girls:

- **“Wendy”:** Young. There since at least March 2007.
- **“Lola”:** There since at least 11/5/07.

Services Provided: Sexual intercourse, fellatio, and manual stimulation. \$70 house fee.

Facilities Information: No tableshower. They use a lawn chair instead of a table for this. The outside of the building is completely non-descript. The only indicator on the building is sticker numbers of 519. The facility is in the same building as the police owned bar, [REDACTED]. In the back of the building, the driveway is cemented shut, as well as the windows, and the fire escape has been ripped off. Strip club behind the facility.

Procedural Information: Bring your own condom policy.

Notes: n/a

“Spa G”

Address: [REDACTED] Providence

Phone: [REDACTED]

Aliases: n/a

History of existence:

Owner/ Manager/ President: n/a

Registering Agent:n/a

Connections:

Advertisement: “Spa G” advertises in the *Providence Phoenix* and in the therapeutic section of Craigslist.com.

Girls:

- **“Wendy”:** There since at least 2/27/09. 5’4” about 135 pounds. Speaks some English.
- **“Lisa”:** There since at least 2/27/09. 5’6” about 130 pounds. Speaks no English.

Services provided: \$60.00 house fee. Sexual intercourse for \$100.00. Manual stimulation for \$40.00.

Procedural Information:

Facilities Information: This is a house, with an apartment on the second floor. The first floor is the spa. Windows are covered with sheets and/or newspaper. Entrance through back door. Johns enter through a kitchen that is unfurnished into a living room with a massage table in it. No table shower.

Notes:

“Spa H”

Address: [REDACTED], Providence

Phone: [REDACTED]

Aliases: [REDACTED]

History of Existence: “Spa H” has been operating since at least 2004.

Owner/Manager/President: Manager: [REDACTED], 40 of [REDACTED] in Providence. In 2006, he was charged with “operating and managing a massage therapy establishment while knowingly employing unlicensed massage therapists and allowing them to perform massages.”

Registering Agent: n/a

Connections: In 2006, “Spa H” was one of the sites listed in the federal affidavit of the 31 massage parlor brothels involved in a large Korean sex trafficking ring.

Advertisement: “Spa H” advertises weekly in the *Providence Phoenix* as providing “dry sauna; table showers; steam sauna; body scrub; private parking.” They also advertise frequently on *Craigslist.com*. On *Craigslist.com* they advertise: “Arousing xxx Azianz.”

Girls:

- **“Terra”** – arrived early May 2006.
- **“Mimi”**: Korean girl there since at least June 2006.
- **“Jaime”**: since at least March 2007. “She acts as a ‘senior girl’ and teaches the others tricks of trade and language, etc. She resides in NYC and has for some time” “Ampdude” 2003 3-14-07. 5’3”. Aka Princess. From Manhattan. Perfect English
- **“YoYo”**: there since at least 3-16-07. 5’4”, slim.
- **“Julia”**: there since at least 3-16-07. Slim.
- **“Kate”**: there before January 2009. John was told on 1/28/09 that “Kate” was no longer there. “Kate” had been at the “Spa L.”

Services Provided: sauna, steambath, sexual intercourse, manual stimulation, and fellatio. Relaxation option \$60 and Massage therapy option \$80. \$60 at door. About \$140 tip for FS

Facilities Information: Very hidden, in projects area. Next to auto place.

Procedural Information: Must be buzzed in. A form distributed to john at door \$60 for “relaxation” and \$80 for “massage therapy”

Notes:

- Papasan there since at least 4-6-07
- “I get assigned a girl—whose name I forget, I apologize. But she was short, very petite, and 100% anglicized. Asked her where’s she’s from—‘New York.’ She was clearly U.S. born and raised, probably not even first generation. I knew this [sic.] was going to be a problem... But the weirdest thing was that no one there appeared to be from the old crew nor fresh-off-the-boat Asians. Even the woman washing the towels was Hispanic!” by “WebDog” 4-6-07

“Spa I”

Address: [REDACTED] in East Providence.

Phone: [REDACTED]

Aliases: n/a

History of Existence: Has existed from March 2009

Owner/ Manager/ President: n/a

Registering Agent: n/a

Connections: Same slogan as “Spa N.”

Advertisements: “Spa I” advertises weekly in the *Providence Phoenix* and on *Craigslist.com*. They advertise: “Beauty, relaxation, special body rub, total body relaxation. We will leave you glowing from top to toe.”

Girls:

Services provided: Sexual intercourse.

Facilities information: n/a

Procedural information: n/a

Notes: n/a

“Spa J”

Address: [REDACTED] in Pawtucket

Phone: [REDACTED]

Aliases: n/a

History of Existence: Has been at location since at least 6/3/08.

Owner/Manager/President: n/a

Registering Agent: n/a

Connections: n/a

Advertisements: “Spa J” advertises weekly in *The Providence Phoenix* and advertises as providing bodywork, reflexology, waxing, skin care, table shower, scrub. In August 2008, Daily Spa advertises on *Craigslist.com* in the “Therapeutic” and “erotic” sections as being new.

Girls:

- “Queeny”: There since 8/11/08.
- “Tina”: There since 8/15/08.

Services Provided: \$60.00 for manual stimulation, \$100.00 for fellatio with a condom, and \$150.00 for sexual intercourse. It seems that they offer reflexology, waxing, and skin care as well.

Facilities Information: The facility seems to have a front waiting room and a rear treatment facility.

Procedural Information: n/a

Notes: n/a

“Spa K”

Address: [REDACTED] in Cranston.

Phone: [REDACTED]

Aliases: [REDACTED]

History of Existence: They have been open since early January 2009.

Owner/ Manager/ President: n/a

Registering Agent: n/a

Connections: May be connected to [REDACTED] which is listed as operating out of the same building. [REDACTED] ([REDACTED]) is run by President [REDACTED] listed as residing at location. Also located next to plaza containing [REDACTED]. Nails which I have received information of potential trafficking and Vietnamese involvement. Thought to be owned by “Cindy” from “Spa FF.”

Advertisements: The first appearance of a “Spa K” advertisement in *The Providence Phoenix* occurred on 1/2/09. They advertise providing body work, body shampoo, table showers and “total stress relief.”

Girls:

- **“YuYu”:** There since at least 1/5/09. In her thirties, long hair, thin, with implants, very poor English.
- **“Cindy”:** There since at least 1/5/09. In her thirties, on the shorter side, petite.
- **“Sandy”:** There since at least 1/14/08. From Beijing.

Services Provided: Manual stimulation only.

Facilities Information: Located in a very high profile, busy area at the corner of Reservoir Ave and Park Ave.

Procedural Information: n/a

Notes:

- Soon after opening, the mamas an expresses concern about the slowness of business to a john: “Mama sits me down and tells me she needs my help. She asks why is it that no one is going there and I tell her point blank, its the front door on [REDACTED] avenue. People prefer to be more private. She understood, kinda I guess and asked me to relay a message to my friends (yup, you are all included in this). If you call either in advance or upon arrival and park on the side street, 401-[REDACTED], she will open the side rear door and let you in avoiding the possibility of an issue of waving to your neighbors.” Posted by “Daddyslookin” on 1/12/08.

“Spa L”

Address: [REDACTED] in Providence

Phone: [REDACTED]

Aliases: [REDACTED]

History of Existence: “Spa L” has existed since at least January 2006. They began [REDACTED] [REDACTED] on the Fourth Fifth floors above the [REDACTED] in Providence. They shut down and have moved to [REDACTED] in Providence as of January 2009.

Owner/Manager/President: Manager who was arrested in 2006 : [REDACTED]

Registering Agent: n/a

Connections: Seems to be connected to “Spa DD,” “Spa D,” and “Spa S.” May be connected to [REDACTED] ([REDACTED] Stamford, CT). The building they were housed in at the [REDACTED] location is owned by former Providence mayor, [REDACTED] (“reputedly mob-connected office building” by “VilunyaChert” 4-26-07).

Advertisements: They typically advertise every week in the *Providence Phoenix*. While doing surveillance they stopped and then started advertising again. Since 9/19/08, they have not advertised. They have been advertising, since late December, in *Craigslist.com*’s “erotic services” section the grand opening of “Spa L” in a new location. “Spa L” advertises offering the following: steam and dry sauna, table body shampoo and relaxation.

Girls:

- **“Yudi”:** There since at least 4/12/05. 5’3”
- **“Jasmine”:** There since at least 6/4/05. About 35 years old. About 5’4,” petite, long hair. She has at times had an attitude to want to rush through the process, mechanical, and didn’t want to be touched. At Down Town Spa until about 2/28/06 at which point she was “on vacation.” She returned the end of May 2006. At times she would act as mamas an. She was gone again for a long time. Reported on 1/18/09.
- **“Joy”:** there since at least 1/18/06. Young, petite, implants.-
- **“Susie”:** there since at least 7/29/05
- **“Mimi”:** there since at least 8/20/05. A little older.
- **“Candy”:** new 8/21/05. Short, petite, shy, poor English. Experience where it seems she is very young, forced to have sex. “After a while I was ready, and she was making broken English remarks about too big. Now all of us want to be told that, but I know I am no super hero. I flipped her on her back and went at it. NO SHIT!!! She was realllly small, and I think it actually hurt her. She was tight as hell. So after a few positions, I completed my mission” (by “Little Tony II” on 8/21/05).
- **“Chanel”:** there since at least 9/10/05 until maybe late October or early November 2005. About 25 years old, 5’6.” Slim, long hair. Poor English. On 11/21/05 **she was back from dentist in pain and still made to “work”** There until 2/20/06. On 2/28/06 john told “Chanel” had “gone on vacation for a few months.” Then on 4/17/06 a john was told that “Chanel” had “quit” and was not coming back. The previous week he was told she was out sick. On 4-17-06 John

told that “Chanel” had “quit” and was not coming back. She was back about 3/10/07.

- **“Tina”**: There since at least 10/7/05. Korean. Seems she left around 4/17/06.
- **“Michelle”**: there since at least 10/22/05
- **“Leanne”**: there since at least 1/12/06
- **“Joy”**: There since at least 2/20/06. Young, skinny, seems rushed, timid.
- **“BB”**: New as of about 4/1/06. Very slim, messy hair, could be young (“tight”). On 6/29/06 john is told she is “off this week
- **“CeCe”**: New as of about 4/1/06.
- **“Mickey”**: New as of about 4/17/06. Uncomfortable being touched at all. Rushed. “Very tight,” perhaps indicating she is very young.
- **“Hanna”**: there since at least 5/29/06. Young. Unenthusiastic.
- **“Sarah”**: There since at least 4/26/06.
- **“Leanne”**: there since at least 1/12/06. Poor massage skills.
- **“Lois”**: there since at least 5/29/06. Young, thin.
- **“Yoko”**: New in late May 2006. “but when she started sounding like I was ripping her apart, I lost it” (by “SuperXFly” 6/9/06). Tight. May be very young.
- **“Jennifer”**: There since at least March 2006. On 5/29/06 mamasan tells john she quit
- **“July”**: There since at least 5/29/06. About 5’ tall.
- **“Kelly”**: there since at least May 2006, acting as mamas an 6/29/06.
- **“Kimberly”**: there since at least July 2006. There early 2007.
- **“Sonny”**: there since at least 3/14/07. Leaving in a week. A bit heavier than the other girls. “Sonny indicated that she will be gone for six weeks in order to undergo some cosmetic surgery. Suffice it to say she’ll be thinner and bustier when she returns.” By “Guest 123” on 3-14-07. Being sent out for plastic surgery, breast implants, liposuction. Says she will return in May. There since 3-23-07.
- **“Katie”**: there since at least 3/18/08. “She mentioned that American guys are ‘ladies first,’ where she is from its ‘men first’” by “Ampdude 2003.”
- **“Happy”**: there since at least 4/8/07. 5’3”, slim, speaks some English. “TS was thorough, but not sensuous” by “Ampdude” 2003 4-8-07. She is not super experienced.
- **“Sonny”**: there since at least 5/29/07. Was in a drunk driving accident, used to have a drinking problem. She has children. She had been “out on vacation.”
- **“Chris”**: there since at least 6/16/07. Claims to be 27. About 5’6,” 130 pounds.
- **“Youna”**: There since at least 7/11/07.
- **“Kate”**: There since at least 10/5/07. Late twenties/ early thirties.
- **“Jackie”**: there since at least 3/13/08. Average weight.
- **“Maya”**: there since at least 7/24/08. Slim. Likely has implants.

Services Provided: Sexual intercourse, fellatio, cunnilingus, and manual stimulation.

Facilities Information: Old location: Johns must be buzzed up. Camera out front by buzzer, with very sophisticated and responsive count-surveillance (“The new mamasan already had the door open as I reached the 4th floor. I’m convinced they watch the door and stair monitors” by “Guest 123” on 3-14-07). No other businesses in the building. There is an advertisement or a mortgage place, but it does not exist. 4th Floor above [REDACTED]. Building next to it is a Judicial Annex. It seems like some of the Johns like to have a “cold one” at the bar on the corner. Seems they own the 5th floor as well. TS upstairs on 5th floor. Inside the building it is like a construction site. Through the back alley-way and around the corner of the building, is a photography studio with a picture of a nearly naked woman outside. At least some of the rooms are just mattresses on the floor.

Procedural Information: Johns at previous location on [REDACTED] would ring bell, go up four flights of stairs and mamasan would be waiting for them. Very good counter-surveillance. Johns are given plastic purse for wallet to carry with them.

Notes:

- “I was downtown prov [Providence] so I thought I would try “Spa L.” At first I felt wierd with the construction and the elevator not working a construction guy says "they are open upstairs" I now feel like the 1st time I bought some condoms or something like that.” By “AsianLPGA Fan” on 10/5/07.

“Spa M”

Address: [REDACTED] in Pawtucket

Phone: [REDACTED]

Aliases: [REDACTED]

History of Existence: “Spa M” was registered as a Domestic LLC on 9/17/2008 ([REDACTED]). Before it was [REDACTED] and before that [REDACTED]. It seems to date back to early 2007.

Owner/Manager/President: Manager: [REDACTED] (of [REDACTED] in Pawtucket) on 10/22/08 an amendment was made adding [REDACTED] as a manager who resides at the same address as [REDACTED] (even though [REDACTED] has been added as a manager, [REDACTED] does not come up in the database). The current manager has a criminal record.

Registering Agent: [REDACTED], LLC of [REDACTED] in Providence

Connections: n/a

Advertisements: They do not advertise in *The Providence Phoenix*. They advertise regularly on *Craigslist.com*. On *Craigslist.com* they advertise: “Come enjoy a soft massage & stress releasing massage performed by a beautiful Asian lady as only we know how!”

Girls:

- **“Anna”:** There since at least 9/6/08. She is in her thirties with long hair. From Korea, brought to NY. She was in U.S. three years as of 2008.
- **“Candy”:** There since at least 10/17/08.
- **“Chanel”:** There since 10/28/08. She used to be at “Spa L.” She is a bit older.

- **“Yuri”**: There since at least 10/28/08. She used to be at “Spa L.” She is slightly younger with very long hair and a high-pitched voice.
- **“Judy”**: There since at least 11/12/08: She is young, mid-twenties, and very petite with very long black hair. She has implants.

Services Provided: Sexual intercourse, fellatio, cunnilingus, and manual stimulation. \$60.00 house fee. \$50.00 for manual stimulation. \$140.00 for sexual intercourse.

Facilities Information: Non-descript brick building close to highway with private parking.

Procedural Information: There is an outer door that is left open. John then rings inner door for access.

Notes: n/a

“Spa N”

Address: [REDACTED] in Pawtucket.

Phone: [REDACTED]

Aliases: [REDACTED]

History of Existence: “Spa N” has existed since at least 12/2005.

Owner/Manager/President: n/a

Registering Agent: n/a

Connections: The “owner,” “Jade” used to work at “Spa U.” “Candy” from “Spa DD” there for a period of time (11/20/08). “D Williams” on USA Sexguide claims to be the owner. He says it was purchased from someone name [REDACTED] and rented from [REDACTED] and the attorney is [REDACTED]

Advertisements: “Spa N” advertises weekly in the *Providence Phoenix*, however they did not advertise in the *Providence Phoenix* between 10/3/2008 and 1/2/2009. First ad since the period of not advertising appeared on 1/9/09 advertising a 30% off coupon. They also advertise regularly on *Craigslist.com*. Their slogan is “We’ll leave you glowing from top to toe.” They claim to offer “table shower, sauna, body rub, and massage.” “Spa N advertises: “Let our fingers do the walking over your aching muscles. Pamper yourself. Be good to your body. Have a tantalizing Asian woman will ease your stress.”

Girls:

- **“Toni”**: There since at least 12/06 (“Toni the tiger”).
- **“Kim”**: there since at least 5/3/07. Poor English. On 5/27/07 Daddyslookin reported “she looked like hell and appeared to be emotionally sad... she was totally soaking wet with perspiration.”
- **“Jade”**: there since at least 8/1/07. She is considered to be the owner. In her mid-forties. She used to work to North Main Street Spa.
- **“Sarah”**: There since at least 1/18/08. Said she had worked there a few weeks and worked in another state beforehand.
- **“Micki”**: There since at least 5/05/08. Very petite.
- **“Lee”**: there since at least 6/19/08 Older.

- “Shirley”: there since at least 6/24/08. Early forties, chunky.
- “Gina”: there since at least 9/1/08.
- “Amy”: there since about July 2008. Very young and petite.
- “Joy”: there since at least 9/24/08. Older.
- “Yo Yo”: there since at least 11/2/08. About 25-30 years old.
- “Candy”: there since at least 11/20/08. Short hair. She was previously at “Spa DD.”
Johns believe she seems to be more worn out at “Spa N” than at “Spa DD.”

Services Provided: Sexual intercourse, manual stimulation, backwalking, and fellatio with condom. \$60.00 House fee, \$80.00 tip for fellatio with condom.

Facilities Information: n/a

Procedural Information: n/a

Notes: n/a

“Spa O”

Address: [REDACTED] in Middletown

Phone: [REDACTED]

Aliases: [REDACTED]

History of Existence: “Spa O” has been in existence since at least 2/18/06. “Spa O” was previously called [REDACTED]. It seems the name was changed in late September 2008.

Owner/Manager/President: n/a

Registering Agent: n/a

Connections: n/a

Advertisements: “Spa O” advertises weekly in the *Providence Phoenix*. On 10/3/08, the ad that showed the name change from [REDACTED] to “Spa O” was placed in the *Providence Phoenix*. “Spa O” advertises: “Shiatsu Tuina Bodywork,” shatsu,acupressure, tuina, bodywork, relaxing body rub, body shampoo, dry sauna, table shower.

Girls:

- “Annie”: there in around 2007.
- “Yuki”: there since at east 1/14/09. Late twenties. Says she is Japanese.

Services Provided: Manual stimulation only. \$60.00 house fee.

Facilities Information: No table shower despite being advertised.

Procedural Information: n/a

Notes: This spa seems to have Chinese women. Only one woman there sometimes, usually the “mamasan.”

“Spa P”

Address: [REDACTED]

Phone: [REDACTED]

Aliases: n/a

History of Existence: “Spa P” has existed since January 2009

Owner/Manager/President: n/a

Registering Agent: n/a

Connections: n/a

Advertisements: “Spa P” advertises in the *Providence Phoenix*. The first ad appeared on 1/9/09. “Spa P” advertises: table showers, Swedish body rub, acupressure, feet reflexology. They also advertise on *Craigslist.com* in the therapeutic and erotic services sections.

Girls:

- **“Angela”:** There since at least 1/12/08. Japanese. About 30-35 years old.
- **“Anna”:** There since at least 1/10/09. Late thirties.
- **“Coco”:** There since at least 1/19/09. Late thirties.

Services Provided: Sexual intercourse for a \$75.00 tip.

Facilities Information: There is a little building, perhaps like a workshop out back. “The location was a bit dumpy. It had graffiti on the building and a partially fenced in parking lot that was lit at night, but not well lit” (by “Edavle” on 2/12/09).

Procedural Information: They have a VIP card. 10 visits and the 11th is free.

Notes: n/a

“Spa Q”

Address: [REDACTED] in Cranston

Phone: [REDACTED]

Aliases: [REDACTED]

History of Existence: “Spa Q” was registered as a Domestic Profit Corporation on 11/8/2008, but the ads for the *Providence Phoenix* were present at the start of the research on 8/8/08 ([REDACTED]). Their Profit Corporation Annual Report for 2008 was filed on 2/1/08. Their registered purpose is: Title: 7-1.2-1701 “To engage in any lawful business. To carry on the business of a spa or similar activity.”

Owner/Manager/President: President: [REDACTED] listed as living at the address of the facility. [REDACTED] was arrested and released in 2005.

Registering Agent: [REDACTED]. of [REDACTED] in Warwick.

Connections: Located basically next door to “Spa Z,” a bar, and close to Asian markets and restaurants. [REDACTED]. is also the registering agent of “Spa Y” in Providence, The [REDACTED] Association, and [REDACTED], Inc. in Brighton, MA.

Advertisements: “Spa Q” advertises weekly in the *Providence Phoenix*. They advertise: “Hot Asian Girls,” beauty, relaxation, special body rub. They did not advertise on 11/28/08. They advertise frequently on *Craigslist.com*.

Girls:

- **“Tammy”:** there since at least 4/08. About 4’11” Gone 10/15/08.
- **“Kimmy”:** there since 7/5/07. Late thirties. A little heavier than the other girls.

- **“Ayuki”**: there since at least 7/28/07. Very young, 25 years old or younger. Tall. Japanese/Chinese mix. Slender. She says she gets bounced from place to place. Timid and worried about law enforcement:
 - “Back to the room with a medium massage. She starts telling me she is scared. Of what I say? Are you the police she says (can you believe that shit).” (7/28/07 by “DaddyLookin”).
- **“Tiffany”**: There since at least 7/31/07. Excellent English. Early thirties. Said end of July 2007 she would only be there for a couple of weeks.
- **“Lisa”**: there since at least 2/29/08. She says 5/22/08 she has been there for a year. Petite, average looking.
- **“KeKe”**: there since at least 8/12/08. Early thirties.

Services Provided: They have a table shower but not a sauna. Sexual intercourse offered. \$60.00 house fee.

Facilities Information: “Spa Q” is a small rectangular building with beige vinyl siding. The only marking is “SPA” on the building. It is next door to a bar called [REDACTED] with similar font and placement of its sign. Johns complain about the cleanliness of the facility.

Procedural Information: At times there has been an Asian male papasan.

Notes: n/a

“Spa R”

Address: [REDACTED] in Providence

Phone: [REDACTED]

Aliases: [REDACTED]

History of Existence: “Spa R” has existed since at least early 2005.

Owner/Manager/President: n/a

Registering Agent: n/a

Connections: There are pornographic pictures and strip club advertisements near the door to get up to “Spa R”. [REDACTED] which seems to be just a hair salon as of 1/12/08 is located underneath. Owner of “Spa R” said to be in New York City.

Advertisements: “Spa R” advertises weekly in the *Providence Phoenix*. They advertise: dry sauna, body rub, table shower.

Girls:

- **“Ce Ce”**: There since at least 1/13/08. From Korea.
- **“Tina”**: There since at least 1/7/07.
- **“Young”**: There since 7/1/07. She was at “Spa R” about three years beforehand and left then returned in 2007. “She actually said “I love you” wanted me to marry her and take her to Seoul, S. Korea where she lives.” Said to “Amplude 2003” 7/25/07.
- **“Hannah”**: There since at least 7/25/07. Seems to be mamasan but was previously masseuse. On 2/5/09 she told john she was “going on vacation.”
- **“Mimi”**: There in March 2007.
- **“Connie”**: There since at least 7/10/08.
- **“Hannah”**: There since at least 7/10/08. She is the mamas an.

- **“Pink”**: There since at least 12/20/08. Korean woman in her thirties. About 5’3.” One john said she looks like the Korean actress from the TV show “Lost.”
- **“Yuri/Yudi”**: there since about 10/08. Very young and tiny.
- **“Susie”**: there since about 1/19/09. About 5,’ average size.
- **“Ruby”**: there since at least 2/4/09. She is about 5’3,” thin, petite, about late 30s. “this girl seems to be very quiet which is fine by me. Off to the shower room and I can tell she is kinda new because she is kind of fumbling around like she is still getting use to everything” (“Muffythediver” on 2/4/09).

Services Provided: body slide, cunnilingus, sexual intercourse, fellatio, and deep French kissing.

Facilities Information: “Spa R” is located on the second floor of the building. Johns go up the stairs and down a hallway. The spa entrance is located on the left. There is a sign by a buzzer that says “Ring bell.”

Procedural Information: n/a

Notes: n/a

“Spa S”

Address: [REDACTED] in Providence

Phone: [REDACTED]

Aliases: [REDACTED]

History of Existence: “Spa S” was registered on 3/22/04 as a Domestic LLC ([REDACTED]) and registers its purpose as pursuant to Title: 7-16: “Spa (Massage Therapy).”

Owner/Manager/President: Partner: [REDACTED] who is listed as living at the facility.

Registering Agent: [REDACTED]

Connections: They seem to be connected to “Spa L.”

Advertisements: “Spa S” advertises weekly in the *Providence Phoenix*. Their slogan is “Come treat your body right...” They advertise: dry sauna, body shampoo, Oriental style body rub. They also write on an ad “You’ll love the SEXY feeling of total body massage!!!” The also have an advertisement on <http://www.findalay.com>. The link they post on that website is <http://www.rhodeislandspa.com> and it is a dead link. They are also listed on a Yahoo business site on which a customer says they provide “great hj’s” [hand jobs].

Girls:

- **“Connie”**: there since at least 3/5/06. In her thirties.
- **“BeBe”**: there since at least 3/6/06 mid-thirties, petite.
- **“Julie”**: there since at least 3/6/06.
- **“Angie”**: there since at least 6/8/06. She is a young, petite Korean girl.
- **“Tina”**: at least since 7/3/06. She is shy, thin, early to mid thirties. Below the shoulder length hair.
- **“Sara”**- there since at least 7/9/06.

- **“MiMi”**: there since at least July 2006 (and again 11/1/07). Mid thirties. Long brown hair with blonde highlights. Pretty good English.
- **“Ari”**: There since at least 12/20/07. Mid twenties. Tiny. About 4’11” and 90 pounds.
- **“Jeannie”**: There since at least 3/11/08.
- **“Sonny”**: There since at least 3/15/08. About 5’5.”
- **“Sue”**: There since at least 3/24/08. Tall and thin. On 4/13/08 Sue is gone.
- **“Tasha”**: There since at least 4/15/08. She is young. Says she is originally from CA. She claims she rents an apartment nearby.
- **“Gina”**: there since at least early 2008. John told she was “on vacation” 3/29/08.
- **“Young”**: there since at least 4/26/08.
- **“Jenny”**: there since at least 6/6/08. Very tiny in height and body.
- **“CeCe”**: there since at least 6/10/08. Short and very young. Very petite. Reviewed on 2/12/09. About 25 years old.
- **“Lisa”**: there since at least 9/25/08. Young, hesitant, shy. In her twenties.
- **“Cindy”**: there since at least 12/1/08. Frizzy shoulder-length hair.

Services Provided: “Spa S” does not provided sexual intercourse. They provide a massage that the johns most prefer as well as manual stimulation. No other services.

Facilities Information: “Spa S” is a large non-descript gray building. They have a large purple awning out front that says “Spa S” on it. The entrance the johns use is in the back. There is a ramp and another purple awning. There is a car cover style garage. They usually have a pest company car in back and a Mercedes, generally. On 12/19/08, johns begin complaining about cleanliness.

Procedural Information: n/a

Notes:

- Complaint that the “girls there believe they are elite.”
- “When leaving I noticed a bunch of the girls laying down on the front office on blankets. The girls I saw at ‘Spa S’ walking around seemed to be a younger group than the group I’ve seen at “Spa U” (“I Luv Amp” 7-29-06)
- The user information of those who rated “Spa S” on <http://www.findalay.com>:
 - *“Chevyroadster”*: “60 year old Caucasian/White Male from Bedford, New Hampshire, US. Chevyroadster’s sexual orientation is straight, chevyroadster’s preferred ethnicity is White. About chevyroadster: love asian massage parlors.”
 - *“Dunree”*: “59 year old Asian Male from Upton, Massachusetts, US. Dunree’s sexual orientation is straight. Dunree’s preferred ethnicities are asian and white. About Dunree: Retired, love companionship and massages.”
- “Visited ‘Spa S’ the other day around 1pm and was surprised to see the lot somewhat crowded with cars from three other states.” by “Meeso Horny” on 8/8/08.
- Korean women.

“Spa T”

Address: [REDACTED] in North Providence

Phone: [REDACTED]

Aliases: [REDACTED]

History of Existence: “Spa T” was registered as a Domestic Profit Corporation on 9/30/06 ([REDACTED]) for the purpose of Title 7-1.1-51: “to operate and run a business leasing, managing, owning, renting, occupying, or otherwise dealing in real estate.” The name was changed from [REDACTED] on 7/24/06.

Owner/Manager/President: President: [REDACTED] ([REDACTED] Lincoln, RI).

Registering Agent: [REDACTED]

Connections: “Spa T” may be connected to “Spa H” (they advertise as being located at [REDACTED] and “Spa T” was previously registered as [REDACTED]).

Advertisements: “Spa T” advertises regularly (which seems to be every other week) in the *Providence Phoenix*. They did not advertise on the following dates: 8/15/08, 8/28/08, 9/5/08, 9/12/08, 10/3/08, 10/31/08, 12/12/08, 1/9/09. They are listed on <http://www.findalay.com>. They occasionally advertise on *Craigslist.com*.

Girls:

- **“Miya”:** there since at least 5/27/06 in her late thirties
- **“Joy”:** there since at least June 2006. .
- **“Luby”:** there since at least June 2006.
- **“Hannah”:** there since at least 5/14/07. Older woman. Thin.
- **“Kim”:** there since at least 5/23/07. Has experience with massage therapy.
- **“Amy”:** there around the fall of 2007. She was 45 or older.

Services Provided: Manual stimulation, urination on woman, fellatio, cunnilingus. Not full service. \$60.00 house fee.

Facilities Information: John must be buzzed in. There is a back door. There is a second floor it seems.

Procedural Information: n/a

Notes:

- A user rating review on Yahoo reads as follows:
 - “2 out of 5 stars by “CCNP” on 6/3/08: Not bad...seems sketchy at first... locked doors and only let you in via buzzer, workers speak little English, make you pay first, you they tell you to go upstairs and pick a room, and someone will be in...not too professional...talked during the entire session, and ended up not being as sketchy as I thought it would be and they did make my back feel better...won't be back again, I do like a more professional environment. If you are a quiet relaxing experience, this is not the place.” (User also rated a legitimate spa and it seems they were not aware it was a brothel).
- About one of the women whose name the john could not recall: “she had an attitude like she didn't want to be there.” By “Riyaker” on 4/1/08.

“Spa U”

Address: [REDACTED] in Providence

Phone: [REDACTED]

Aliases: [REDACTED] (before 3/8/2000), [REDACTED] (after 3/8/2000).

History of Existence: Registered as [REDACTED] (name changed from [REDACTED] on 3/8/2000) on 12/31/99 as a Domestic LLC ([REDACTED]) pursuant to Title: 7-16 “Spa.” Spa was raided in November 2006.

Owner/Manager/President: President: [REDACTED] listed as living at the facility. [REDACTED], 56, was arrested for “operating and managing a massage therapy establishment while knowingly employing an unlicensed therapist and allowing that unlicensed person to perform a massage.”

Registering Agent: [REDACTED]. Former manager: [REDACTED] (53 of [REDACTED]. in Providence).

Connections: n/a

Advertisements: “Spa U” advertises weekly in the *Providence Phoenix*. They advertise: sauna, steam, body rub, and table shower. “Spa U” is listed on <http://www.findalay.com> as having Korean women.

Girls:

- **“May”:** There since at least 11/29/06. Her real name is Ok Lee and she was 54 in 2006 at the time of the raid.
- **“Hannah”:** There since at least 3/19/06
- **“Jenny”:** there since at least 3/19/06.
- **“Tina”:** there around 3/12/07. About 5’3” long dark hair. On 4/3/08 john called and asked for Tina. He was told she was on a “long vacation.”

Services Provided: Sexual intercourse, manual stimulation, and fellatio.

Facilities Information: an office-like building across the street from [REDACTED] Bedding and a [REDACTED] pharmacy.

Procedural Information:

Notes:

- From the above 2006 investigation, the women were found to be living on the premises.
- “‘Spa U’ is strange
Attitudes of many of the ladies has gone down hill, they’re getting too mechanical and just seem to be going through the motions, and at the same time they’ve really been getting pushy for bigger tips is all” by “Fly Dangler” 8/2006.
- On 2/11/07 there seems to have been a bust. In mid-January 2009 there seems to have been a bust also.

“Spa V”

Address: [REDACTED] in Providence.

Phone: [REDACTED]

Aliases: [REDACTED]

History of Existence: “Spa V has existed since January 2009.

Owner/Manager/President: n/a

Registering Agent: n/a

Connections: They use the same photos on their *Craigslist.com* advertisements as “Spa L.” They have the same slogan as “Spa

Advertisements: They advertise weekly in the *Providence Phoenix*. They advertise: dry sauna, table shower, body scrub. They offer a \$10 off coupon in the *Providence Phoenix*.

Girls:

- “**Amy**”: There since at least 10/23/08. Late thirties.
- “**June**”: there since at least 12/15/08.
- “**Lee**”: There since at least 1/9/09. Older.
- “**Angie**”: There since at least 1/9/09. Mid-thirties, Korean girl. Petite. About 5’1,” 100 pounds.
- “**Michelle**”: there since at least 1/9/09. Young, about 25. Will only be there for one month, then sent to San Francisco.
- “**Gina**”: there since at least 1/9/09.
- “**Mya**”: there since at least 10/19/08. She used to be at “Spa L”.

Services Provided: Sexual intercourse for \$140.00, Table shower, sauna. \$60.00 house fee.

Facilities Information: rooms are marked by letters (i.e. Room A, Room B, etc...). “Spa V” is located above the [REDACTED] on [REDACTED], and next to the [REDACTED]. They have a table shower and sauna. One of the waiting rooms has several chairs and a mattress on the floor. The Johns believe this may be where the girls sleep.

Procedural Information: Johns have to go to third floor of [REDACTED], and make a left down hall and ring buzzer outside door marked with just the number one on it. Johns are taken to sauna first, table shower, massage, sexual services.

Notes:

- “So we continued on our way to “Spa V” which after a call confirmed there were 5 girls on. I don't think it could be in a better location for anyone coming from MA down 146, it is literally right off the [REDACTED] Ave. Exit in the [REDACTED] section that has all the restaurants. We parked right outside the door and walked down the st. To hit the ATM and grab another drink before going in.” on 1/18/09 by “Tuglover1”

“Spa W”

Address: [REDACTED] in Warwick

Phone: [REDACTED]

Aliases: n/a

History of Existence: “Spa W” open since at least 2/18/09.

Owner/Manager/President: n/a

Registering Agent: n/a

Connections: They are just down the road from “Spa D” (located at [REDACTED] in Warwick).

Advertisements: They advertise weekly in the therapeutic section on *Craigslist.com*. Their slogan is: “You come, you cum.” They advertise being the finest Asian Spa. Another slogan: “Where the atmosphere is elegant, and the ladies are lovely.”

Girls:

- **“Coco”:** There since at least 2/26/09. She is very petite and young, about late 20s. Chinese.
- **“Tiffany”:** There since at least 2/26/09. Chinese. Athletic build. She speaks English well and has been in the US for eight years. She claims she was most recently in NYC. She has a tattoo on her lower abdomen.

Services: Table shower and manual stimulation. Sexual intercourse for \$100.

Procedural Information: n/a

Facilities Information: Johns report that the facilities are fairly well-kept inside, but outside the building looks really run down. The building next to it is abandoned.

“During the day they have a nice little sign with balloons on it, and by night a pinkish red blue neon sign that certainly sticks out in this area. It also comes complete with a location right across from one of uncle leo's favorite parking spots (just an fyi) so, the future of this sore thumb is yet to be determined.”(by “Mprov2” on 2/24/09). The sign on their door indicates to use the backdoor.

Notes: n/a

“Spa X”

Address: [REDACTED] in Pawtucket

Phone: [REDACTED]

Aliases: [REDACTED]

History of Existence: “Spa X” was registered as a Domestic Profit Corporation on 9/22/03 ([REDACTED]) pursuant to title 7-1.1-51: “Massage therapies and related therapy activities.”

Owner/Manager/President: President and Treasurer [REDACTED] (of [REDACTED] in Pawtucket, RI). Vice President and Secretary: [REDACTED] (of [REDACTED] in Attleboro, Massachusetts).

Registering Agent: [REDACTED] of [REDACTED] in Cumberland.

Connections: n/a

Advertisements: “Spa X” advertises weekly in the *Providence Phoenix* and on *Craigslist.com*. They advertise: “Wet and dry sauna, beautiful Asian girls, full steam room and dry sauna, body shampoo and body rub.”

Girls:

- **“Jade”:** There since at least 10/07.
- **“Ruby”:** There since at least 7/25/08
- **“Yuni”:** There since at least 9/30/08. Late twenties.
- **“Gina”:** There since about 4/08. Mid thirties to forty. Petite. She says she has a sister in NYC that she visits from time to time. She works 6 or 7 days a week, the johns claim.
- **“Connie”:** There since at least 2/18/09. Back after about a year. Probably mid thirties to forties.
- **“Hannah”:** There since at least 2/24/09.

Services Provided: Manual stimulation. Does not seem to offer sexual intercourse. \$60 for 45 minutes and \$70 for an hour.

Facilities Information: They have a steam room. Parking available along the street. Might not have a Table Shower?

Procedural Information: n/a

Notes: n/a

“Spa Y”

Address: [REDACTED], in Providence.

Phone: [REDACTED]

Aliases: [REDACTED].

History of existence: “Spa Y” was incorporated in RI on 6/14/07 as a domestic profit corporation ([REDACTED]). “Spa Y” was previously [REDACTED]. [REDACTED] shut down and after a period of time reopened as “Spa Y”. On *Craigslist.com*, “Spa Y” advertises the following license number:

info: RI 2008-[REDACTED]

Owner/Manager/President: President: [REDACTED] (of [REDACTED] in New York, NY 10002)

Registering Agent: [REDACTED]. ([REDACTED] in Providence).

Connections: [REDACTED]. is also the registering agent of “Spa Q” in Cranston, [REDACTED] Association, and [REDACTED]. in Brighton, MA.

Advertisements: “Spa Y” advertises on a weekly basis in the *Providence Phoenix*. Their slogan is: “Relaxing special body rub.” They have advertised weekly since August 2008, but have not advertised in January 2009. They also advertise on *Craigslist.com* in the “Therapeutic Services” section. They advertise offering: “table shower, deep tissue, Swedish, trigger point, Chinese traditional body rub, a comfortable place and quiet settings for nice body work. Best relaxation.”

Girls:

- **“Funny”:** there since at least 7/16/08. About 30 years old, petite.

- **“Ah-may”**: there since at least 10/3/08. Mid thirties, average size.
- **“Yuki”**: there since at least 8/4/07. Japanese petite girl.
- **“Annie”**: since at least 5/10/07. Chinese woman in her thirties.

Services Provided: Sexual intercourse, table shower, cunnilingus, manual stimulation, fellatio without a condom.

Facilities information: “Spa Y” is located above Club [REDACTED] and by [REDACTED] Near the DCYF.

Procedural information: In 2007 when they first opened as “Spa Y”, there was a papasan at the door.

Notes: n/a

“Spa Z”

Address: [REDACTED] in Providence

Phone: [REDACTED]

Aliases: Tea [REDACTED].

History of Existence: “Spa Z” was registered as a Domestic LLC on 10/23/07 ([REDACTED]).

Owner/Manager/President: Manager: [REDACTED] (of [REDACTED] in Quincy, MA 02170). On the Articles of Organization Form filed on 10/23/07, [REDACTED] is also added as a manager (of [REDACTED] in Flushing, NY 11355).

Registering Agent: [REDACTED]

Connections: Since “Spa Z” and “Spa Q” are so close and referred to as “the twins,” they may be connected. “Spa Z” is also in the same building as an Asian market, near an Asian social club, and Asian restaurants.

Advertisements: “Spa Z” advertises weekly in the *Providence Phoenix*. They offer: body work, body shampoo, steam sauna, and “beautiful Asian girls.”

Girls:

- **“Lea Lea”**: There since at least 10/23/07. In her forties, average weight. Speaks very little English.
- **“Shirley”**: There since at least 7/2/08. Older (at least 45), slim.

Services Provided: Sexual intercourse at a cheaper rate than other brothels, fellatio with a condom, manual stimulation.

Facilities Information: The facility has a second floor where there is a massage room and shower room. Very steep stairs. They have a small parking lot and a back door.

Procedural Information: n/a

Notes: n/a

“Spa AA”

Address: somewhere in Middletown

Phone: [REDACTED]

Aliases: n/a

History of Existence: "Spa AA" first advertised on 8/21/08.

Owner/Manager/President: n/a

Registering Agent: n/a

Connections: n/a

Advertisements: "Spa AA" advertised twice in the *Providence Phoenix*. The first ad appeared on 8/21/08. They advertise "erotic massage and hair cutting services" for men only and having American girls.

Girls: n/a

Services Provided: n/a

Facilities Information: n/a

Procedural Information: n/a

Notes: I called "Spa AA" on 1/13/08 and the phone was answered by a woman who seemed to be American and spoke perfect English with no accent.

"Spa BB"

Address: [REDACTED] in East Providence.

Phone: [REDACTED]

Aliases: [REDACTED]

History of Existence: "Spa BB" started as [REDACTED] at a different location in January 2009.

Owner/ Manager/ President: n/a

Registering Agent: n/a

Connections: n/a

Advertisements: "Spa BB" advertises regularly in the *Providence Phoenix* and on *Craigslist.com*. They advertise: "Truly gorgeous Asians, bodywork, table showers, deep tissue."

Girls: n/a

Services Provided: Sexual intercourse.

Facilities Information: n/a

Procedural Information: n/a

Notes: n/a

"Spa CC"

Address: [REDACTED] in Central Falls

Phone: [REDACTED]

History of Existence: "Spa CC" opened on 4/13/09.

Owner/ Manager/ President: n/a

Registering Agent: n/a

Connections: n/a

Advertisements: “Spa CC” has advertised in the *Providence Phoenix* about its grand opening. “Spa CC” regularly advertises on *Craigslist.com*. They advertise: “tableshowers, luxury dry sauna, body scrubs, full Asian style body rubs, four handed body rub specials, friendly, sexy Asian girls. Your satisfaction is our pleasure.”

Girls: n/a

Services provided: n/a

Facilities information: There are six rooms, two showers.

Procedural Information: n/a

Notes: n/a

“Spa DD”

Address: [REDACTED] in Central Falls

Phone: [REDACTED]

Aliases: [REDACTED].

History of Existence: “Spa DD” has existed since at least September 2006.

Owner/Manager/President: Could be [REDACTED] (who is the President of [REDACTED] [REDACTED] listed as located at the facility).

Registering Agent: [REDACTED] (of [REDACTED] in Providence).

Connections: [REDACTED] is also the registering agent for [REDACTED], “Spa E,” “Spa A,” several cash for gold businesses, and is the incorporator of [REDACTED] [REDACTED]

Advertisements: “Spa DD” advertises weekly in the *Providence Phoenix*. They also advertise frequently on *Craigslist.com*. The advertise: “Come experience true Asian pleasure. Relax with a nice sauna. Experience a total relaxation bodyrub. Air conditioned private room. Cool off with a nice shower. Discreet and private parking always available. Come see all our new young beautiful girls!! Because life is too short not to enjoy it.”

Girls:

- **“Angel”:** There since at least 10/18/06.
- **“Ruthie”:** There since at least 6/25/07.
- **“Pepsi”:** There since at least 1/18/08.

Services Provided: House Fees: \$60 for 40 minutes, \$70 for an hour. They provide table shower and sauna.

Facilities Information: The spa is in an unsafe neighborhood. The parking is in front of the building. There used to be a McDonalds next door that shut down.

Procedural Information: n/a

Notes: n/a

“Spa EE”

Address: [REDACTED] in Providence.

Phone: [REDACTED]

Aliases: n/a

History of Existence: “Spa EE” was registered as a Domestic Profit Corporation on 7/21/08 ([REDACTED]) pursuant to Title 7-1.2-1701.

Owner/Manager/President: Incorporator: [REDACTED] (listed as residing at facility)

Registering Agent: [REDACTED]

Connections: n/a

Advertisements: “Spa EE” advertises weekly in the *Providence Phoenix*. They offer: table shower, body shampoo, body rubs, Asian bodywork. They also advertise regularly on *Craigslist.com*.

Girls:

- **“Sandy”:** There since at least 10/1/08. Korean woman. Maybe a bit older.
- **“Hyna”:** There since at least 10/1/08. In her thirties. Very petite.
- **“Sarah”:** There since at least 11/25/08. In her late thirties. Pretty good English.
- **“Sandy”:** There since at least 1/3/09. Shorter and younger than some of the others.

Services Provided: Topless manual stimulation for \$50.00. Cunnilingus for \$50.00. Fellatio, sexual intercourse.

Facilities Information: Difficult to find parking. There is some parking in the back of the facility next to a big trailer. Not very clean.

Procedural Information: n/a

Notes: “A good choice for us Northern MA folks” on 8/30/08 by “Iamme Iam.”

“Spa FF”

Address: [REDACTED] in Providence

Phone: [REDACTED]

Aliases: [REDACTED].

History of Existence: In operation since at least February 2006.

Owner/Manager/President: n/a

Registering Agent: n/a

Connections: The owners of “Spa FF” seem to own or be connected to [REDACTED] (105 South St. in Plainville, MA). This spa seems to have shut down as of 1/13/08.

Advertisements: “Spa FF” advertises weekly in *The Providence Phoenix* and about daily on *Craigslist.com*. They advertise providing bodywork, reflexology, acupuncture, dry sauna, steam sauna, showers, fitness.

Girls:

- **“Tina”:** There since at least 3/26/06. There again as of 1/2009. Late thirties.
- **“Lidi”:** since at least 7/07/06. “did mention she works everyday and has no time off...sounds like she’s working off a debt or simply, not free to set her own schedule... you know what I mean...”
- **“Made”:** 5/26/07: older

- **“Michelle”**: There since at least 2/10/09. Very petite. She speaks English well.
- **“Jenny”**: There since at least 2/10/09. Thirties or older.
- **“Wendy”**: There since at least 3/3/09. Older and more full-figured than the other girls. Minimal English.

Services Provided: Manual stimulation for \$60 entrance and \$40 tip. Seems like sexual intercourse is offered, possibly a bring your own condom policy.

Facilities Information: “Spa FF” is located in the [REDACTED]. It is next to a porn store.

Procedural Information: n/a

Notes:

- Women said they were going on a “long vacation” 3/5/06.
- The women here are older.

REFERENCES

- "2 plead guilty to prostitution." Providence Evening Bulletin. 15 April 1977. B-4.
- "11 men, a youth are arrested while police continue crackdown." Providence Journal. 5 September 1976. A-14.
- "16-year-old girl charged with soliciting." Providence Journal. 4 March 1976. B-3.
- "ACLU calls for repeal of R.I. prostitution laws." Providence Journal. 30 December 1983. A-8.
- "Alleged prostitutes arrested in motel." Providence Journal. 21 May 2008. D-3.
- "Battling the brothels." Providence Journal. 26 August 2006. A-8.
- "Board shuts Bachelor's massage place." Providence Evening Bulletin. 15 April 1977. B-1.
- "COYOTE yelps in court, but few are likely to listen." Providence Journal. 28 September 1979.
- "Editorial: State of Prostitution." Providence Journal. 15 April 2009. B-6.
- "Indictments crack ring of hookers." Providence Evening Bulletin. 6 May 1977. B-1.
- "Loitering loophole." Providence Journal. 30 March 2008. D-6.
- "Man sues sauna for bias." Providence Evening Bulletin. 2 September 1976. B-3.
- "Massage parlor employees charged in prostitution case." Providence Journal. 19 October 2000. C-2.
- "Massage parlor bill submitted." Providence Journal. 4 March 1977. B-2.
- "Massage parlor raided, 8 jailed." Providence Journal. 21 March 1976. A-12.
- "Massage parlor regulations voted." Providence Journal. 5 March 1976. B-3.
- "Meeting called by foes of massage parlor." Providence Journal. 20 July 1976. B-3.
- "Narc squad arrests 3 for prostitution." Providence Evening Bulletin. 14 May 1976. B-5.
- "Prostitution has no place in R.I. economy." Providence Journal. 15 January 2009. B-1.
- "Prostitution, pimping charged." Providence Evening Bulletin. 14 April 1977. B-3.
- "Residents write mayor on harlots." Providence Journal. 21 June 1978.
- "Stop sex trafficking." Providence Journal. 6 December 2006. B-4.
- "Swedish Sauna granted stay of closing order." Providence Journal. 10 May 1977. A-10.
- "Swedish Sauna license suspended." Providence Journal. 5 May 1977. A-26.
- "Swedish Sauna will appeal." Providence Journal. 6 May 1977. A-8.

- “‘Teen Challenge Club’ defendant gets 7 years on sex offense pleas.” Providence Journal. 22 July 1977. A-5.
- “Temporary permits to 3 massage parlors.” Providence Journal. 28 August 1977. B-12.
- “Three more arrested in ‘cleanup.’” Providence Evening Bulletin. 22 October 1976. A-9.
- 6News Staff. “Charlotte woman arrested in sex slave ring.” WCNC.com. 17 August 2006. <http://www.wcnc.com/news/topstories/stories/wcnc-ad-8_16_06_sex_trade.71014b1.html>. Accessed: 21 March 2009.
- Achorn, Edward. “Must R.I. remain the Prostitution State?” Providence Journal. 18 March 2008. B-5.
- “One business R.I. can do without.” Providence Journal. 10 April 2007. B-5.
- Aho, Susana. “Local activists work to end R.I. human trafficking.” Brown Daily Herald. 15 February 2007. <<http://www.browndailyherald.com/2.12235/local-activists-work-to-end-r-i-human-trafficking-1.1674851>>. Accessed 23 March 2009.
- Allen, Hamilton F.. “Prostitutes challenge ban on ‘profession.’” Providence Evening Bulletin. 8 July 1976. A-1 and A-5.
- Arsenault, Mark. “Cicilline to co-host forum on human trafficking parlors.” Providence Journal. 25 November 2006. A-5.
- Associated Press. “Busted sex-slave ring includes Providence site.” Providence Journal. 16 August 2006. <http://www.projo.com/ri/providence/content/projo-20060816_brothels_.75d85af.html>. Accessed: 20 February 2009.
- Bramson, Kate. “‘Big Sister MaekDo’ jailed in federal prostitution case: Federal prosecutors say she did business at One Custom House St. in downtown Providence” Providence Journal. 17 August 2006.
- Broadwater, Luke. “No conviction for alleged brothel operators.” The Examiner. 23 February 2007.<http://www.examiner.com/a581115~No_conviction_for_alleged_brothel_operators.html>. Accessed: 23 March 2009.
- Castellucci, John. “Cicilline proposes tougher penalties on sex trafficking.” Providence Journal. 18 April 2007. B-2.
- Collins, William E. “License bd. Gives OK to four parlors.” Providence Evening Bulletin. 13 August 1976. B-1.
- Crowley, Cathleen F. “Landlord tells spa owner to vacate.” Providence Journal. 5 December 2005. C-1.
- Cullinan, Kathleen. “Feds: Tanning salon actually brothel.” The Examiner. 18 August 2006.
- Cushman, Robert F. and Brian Stuart Koukoutchos. *Cases in Constitutional Law*. (9th Ed.). Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice Hall, 2000.
- Davis, Marion. “Police close down two massage parlors.” Providence Journal. 14 March 2000. B-3.
- Dujardin, Richard C. “Court upholds city’s denial of permit for massage parlor: The mayor believes they are fronts for prostitution and says it’s difficult to close them because state law does not make prostitution illegal.” Providence Journal. 3 March 2005. C-1.

Dowling, Denise. "Last Call for Sin." Rhode Island Monthly. August 2008.

Ellsworth, Karen. "Call girl asks judge to legalize her trade." Providence Journal. 26 September 1979. A-1.

--- "Prostitutes go public with argument that their business is private matter." Providence Journal. 30 September 1979. A-18.

--- "These 'shady ladies' never ever give the customer a break." Providence Journal. 17 October 1976. A-1.

Farley, Melissa (Ed.). Prostitution, Trafficking, and Traumatic Stress. Binghamton, NY: The Haworth Maltreatment & Trauma Press, 2003.

Freyer, Felice J.. "Rally demands end to sex trafficking." Providence Journal. 26 October 2008. B-5.

Fitzpatrick, Edward. "Prostitution has no place in R.I. Economy." Providence Journal. 15 January 2009. B-1.

FOX News. "R.I. Massage Workers Sore Over Prostitution Crackdown." FoxNews.com. 18 July 2005. <<http://www.foxnews.com/story/0,2933,162906,00.html>>. Accessed: 8 January 2009.

Gara, Phillip. "Proposed business too 'Steam'-y for Fox Point." Brown Daily Herald. 8 March 2005. P. 2.

Giblin, Joseph P.. "17 are charged in morals sweep." Providence Evening Bulletin. 30 June 1976. B-2.

Greaves, Charles R. "A law that's sensitive to civil liberties." Providence Journal. 23 March 2008. D-7.

Hackett, Daniel. "Call girl raid nets 5 persons." Providence Evening Bulletin. 29 December 1976. B-1.

Hackett, Daniel. "Special police arrest 7." Providence Evening Bulletin. 5 November 1976. B-1.

Hulick, Doane. "Council gives massage bill first boost." Providence Journal. 20 February 1976. B-3.

Jenness, Valarie. "From Sex as Sin to Sex as Work: COYOTE and the Reorganization of Prostitution as a Social Problem." Social Problems. Vol. 37. No .3, August 1990. p.p. 403-420.

Leff, Walli F. and Marilyn G. Haft. *Time Without Work: People Who Are Not Working Tell Their Stories, How They Feel, What They Do, How They Survive*. Boston: South End Press, 1983.

Lengel, Allan. "31 Arrested in Reputed Korean Sex-Slave Trafficking Along East Coast." The Washington Post. 17 August 2006. B-8.

Lioce, Tony. "Prostitutes union now soliciting support in R.I." Providence Evening Bulletin. 22 October 1976. A-3.

Lowney, Brian J.. "State struggles with legal, moral aspects of human trafficking." Rhode Island Catholic. 22 June 2007. <http://www.catholic.org/national/national_story.php?id=24490>. Accessed 3 January 2009.

- Malinowski, Zachary W.. "Providence, R.I., Sex Industry Expands at Startling Pace." Providence Journal. 23 April 2002.
- "The Sex Business in RI- 'Why Here?'" Providence Journal. 21 April 2002. A1.
- McKinney, Matt. "Four charged in raid on alleged brothel." Providence Journal. 26 January 1999. C-1.
- Milkovitz, Amanda. "2 nabbed in massage parlor raid." Providence Journal. 29 November 2001. C-8.
- 8 arrested in massage parlor raids." Providence Journal. 6 December 2001. D-1.
- "Brothels survive weak R.I. law." Providence Journal. 21 August 2006. A-3.
- "Federal sweep shuts city spa: A woman who federal officials say managed a busy downtown brothel faces charges in a multi-state investigation of a human trafficking ring." Providence Journal. B-1.
- "Legislators drop bid to outlaw brothels: Providence Democrats abandon their bills strengthening the state's prostitution laws after critics say the language unfairly targets women." Providence Journal. 16 June 2005. A-1.
- Molinaro, Sara. "R.I. brothels to become illegal." Brown Daily Herald. 6 February 2007. < <http://www.browndailyherald.com/2.12232/r-i-brothels-to-become-illegal-1.1675058>>. Accessed: 23 February 2009.
- Needham, Cynthia. "Bill to close prostitution loophole." Providence Journal. 13 March 2008. A 11.
- Neubauer, David W. and Stephen S. Meinhold. *Judicial Process: Law, Courts, and Politics in the United States*. (4th Ed.). Belmont, CA: Thomson Wadsworth, 2007.
- Park, Jennifer. "Federal human trafficking bust implicates downtown establishment." Brown Daily Herald. 5 October 2006. < <http://www.browndailyherald.com/2.12232/federal-human-trafficking-bust-implicates-downtown-establishment-1.1676304>>. Accessed: 23 February 2009.
- Parker, R.N., Joe. "How Prostitution Works." 4 August 1998.
- Peoples, Steve. "Critics quick to find fault with bill to ban brothels." Providence Journal. 5 April 2007. A-1.
- Prosnitz, Franklin S.. "4 more 'Village' women face prostitution charges." Providence Journal. 2 November 1976. A-8.
- "E. Providence prostitution rings broken." Providence Journal. 30 October 1976. A-1 and A-36.
- Rockoff, Johnathan. "Cabana Girls club won't appeal suit: ACLU lawyers tell the appeals court they won't fight a federal judge's decision to dismiss their First Amendment lawsuit against the city." Providence Journal. 25 August 1998. C-3
- "Judge negates adult club ban: U.S. District Judge Ronald R. Lagueux declares the city's moratorium on adult entertainment licenses unconstitutional because it was 'indefinite' and indiscriminate." Providence Journal. 9 October 1998. C-1.

- "Police allege club was a brothel; The Providence police say that women from southeast Asia were brought to Club Osaka to work as prostitutes to pay off their passage to the United States." Providence Journal. 24 November 1998. B-1.
- "Providence police drop charges against women in raid. The owner of Club Osaka remains charged with several prostitution-related counts. Meanwhile, the U.S. Attorney's office is reviewing the case." Providence Journal. 6 March 1999. A-3.
- Salit, Richard. "Police allege prostitution at spa." Providence Journal. 28 August 1997. C-5.
- Santos, Kathy. "Taxes Rhode Island could stand." Providence Journal. 30 December 2008. B-7.
- Smith, Gregory. "City pressures building owners to evict spas: With threatening letters, arrest warrants and a surprise raid, authorities escalate their campaign against three massage parlor that they allege to be fronts for prostitution." Providence Journal. 2 December 2005.
- "Two charged at massage parlors." Providence Journal. 29 November 2006.
- Sutton, Jr., William W.. "Massage decision delayed." Providence Evening Bulletin. 6 August 1976. B-1.
- Tucker, Eric. "Working Girls Can Work Indoors in R.I." WTOP News. 10 September 2005. <<http://www.wtopnews.com/index.php?nid=456&sid=567818>>. Accessed: 14 August 2008.
- United States Attorney. "Five Convicted of Human Trafficking Offenses by Manhattan Jury." Press Release. 9 November 2007.
- United States Department of Justice. "31 Korean Nationals Arrested Throughout the Northeastern United States in Federal Human Trafficking Case." Press Release. 16 August 2006.
- United States Department of Justice Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons. "The Link Between Prostitution and Sex Trafficking." Fact Sheet. 24 November 2004. <<http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/38901.pdf>>. 31 March 2009.
- Walsh, Thomas E. "Legislators get message from West Enders and 'yea' bill to change prostitution laws." Providence Journal. 22 March 1980.
- "Smith bill would speed decisions on prostitutes." Providence Journal. 19 March 1980.
- Wells, Shanna. "Letters: What about the johns, pimps, traffickers?" Providence Journal. 14 July 2007. F-3.
- Wyss, Bob. "Prostitution crackdown works, but residents worry it won't last." Providence Journal. 13 December 1979.
- Ziner, Karen Lee. "Police bust three massage parlors in Providence." Providence Journal. 20 February 2003. B-1.
- "Police, federal agents raid Warwick spa." Providence Journal. 11 April 2009. B-1.
- "Target: Trafficking in humans." Providence Journal. 5 February 2007. C-1.

