Phytoplankton-Bacterial Interactions Mediate Micronutrient Colimitation at the Coastal Antarctic Sea Ice Edge

Erin M. Bertrand
John P. McCrow

See next page for additional authors

Follow this and additional works at: http://digitalcommons.uri.edu/gsofacpubs

Citation/Publisher Attribution
Available at: http://dx.doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1501615112

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Graduate School of Oceanography at DigitalCommons@URI. It has been accepted for inclusion in Graduate School of Oceanography Faculty Publications by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@URI. For more information, please contact digitalcommons@etal.uri.edu.
Phytoplankton–bacterial interactions mediate micronutrient colimitation at the coastal Antarctic sea ice edge

Erin M. Bertrand1,5, John P. McCrow1, Ahmed Moustafa1,2,3, Hong Zheng4, Jeffrey B. McQuaid1,2, Tom O. Delmont4, Anton F. Post6, Rachel E. Sipler7, Jenna L. Spackeen8, Kai Xu9, Deborah A. Bronk1, David A. Hutchins9, and Andrew E. Allen1,2,3

*Microbial and Environmental Genomics, J. Craig Venter Institute, La Jolla, CA 92037; †Integrative Oceanography Division, Scripps Institution of Oceanography, University of California, San Diego, La Jolla, CA 92037; Department of Biology and Biotechnology Graduate Program, American University in Cairo, Cairo, Egypt 11235; ‡Josephine Bay Paul Center, Marine Biological Laboratory, Woods Hole, MA 02543; §Graduate School of Oceanography, University of Rhode Island, Narragansett, RI 02882; ‡Department of Physical Sciences, Virginia Institute of Marine Science, Gloucester Point, VA 23062; and 5Marine and Environmental Biology, Department of Biological Sciences, University of Southern California, Los Angeles, CA 90089

Edited by David M. Karl, University of Hawaii, Honolulu, HI, and approved July 2, 2015 (received for review January 25, 2015)

Southern Ocean primary productivity plays a key role in global ocean biogeochemistry and climate. At the Southern Ocean sea ice edge in coastal McMurdo Sound, we observed simultaneous cobalamin and iron limitation of surface water phytoplankton communities in late Austral summer. Cobalamin is produced only by bacteria and archaea, suggesting phytoplankton–bacterial interactions must play a role in this limitation. To characterize these interactions and investigate the molecular basis of multiple nutrient limitation, we examined transitions in global gene expression over short time scales, induced by shifts in micronutrient availability. Diatoms, the dominant primary producers, exhibited transcriptional patterns indicative of co-occurring iron and cobalamin deprivation. The major contributor to cobalamin biosynthesis gene expression was a gammaproteobacterial population, Oceanospirillaceae ASP10-02a. This group also contributed significantly to metagenomic cobalamin biosynthesis gene abundance throughout Southern Ocean surface waters. Oceanospirillaceae ASP10-02a displayed elevated expression of organic matter acquisition and cell surface attachment-related genes, consistent with a mutualistic relationship in which they are dependent on phytoplankton growth to fuel cobalamin production. Separate bacterial groups, including Methylophaga, appeared to rely on phytoplankton for carbon and energy sources, but displayed gene expression patterns consistent with iron and cobalamin deprivation. This suggests they also compete with phytoplankton and are important cobalamin consumers. Expression patterns of siderophore- related genes offer evidence for bacterial influence on iron availability as well. The nature and degree of this episodic colimitation appear to be mediated by a series of phytoplankton–bacterial interactions in both positive and negative feedback loops.

Significance

The coastal Southern Ocean is a critical climate system component and home to high rates of photosynthesis. Here we show that cobalamin (vitamin B12) and iron availability can simultaneously limit phytoplankton growth in late Austral summer coastal Antarctic sea ice edge communities. Unlike other growth-limiting nutrients, the sole cobalamin source is production by bacteria and archaea. By identifying microbial gene expression changes in response to altered micronutrient availability, we describe the molecular underpinnings of limitation by both cobalamin and iron and offer evidence that this limitation is driven by multiple delicately balanced phytoplankton–bacterial interactions. These results support a growing body of research suggesting that relationships between bacteria and phytoplankton are key to understanding controls on marine primary productivity.


The authors declare no conflict of interest.

This article is a PNAS Direct Submission.

Frequently available online through the PNAS open access option.

Data deposition: The data reported in this paper have been deposited in the NCBI sequence read archive (BioProject accession no. PRJNA228183; BioSample accession nos. SAMN0365520-SAMN03655310). Assembled contigs, predicted peptides, annotation, and transcript abundance data for this study can be found at https://sirrps.ucsd.edu/lab/aileen/data.

1Present address: Department of Biology, Dalhousie University, Halifax NS, Canada B3H 4R2.

2To whom correspondence should be addressed. Email: aileen@jcvi.org.

This article contains supporting information online at www.pnas.org/lookup/suppl/doi:10. 1073/pnas.1501615112/-/DCSupplemental.
Southern Ocean, cyanobacteria are scarce (11), and *Thaumarchaeota* appear to be important, in terms of abundance and contribution to cobalamin biosynthesis proteins, only in winter and springtime (12, 13). Although seasonal trends in Southern Ocean cobalamin concentrations have yet to be investigated, these biogeographic data suggest that Austral summer Southern Ocean cobalamin production may be low relative to other seasons and locations. Indeed, cobalamin limitation has been observed in mid to late summer in the Ross Sea, but was absent in springtime (14). This leads to the hypothesis that reduced cobalamin supply in summer, along with enhanced demand by blooming diatoms, results in possible cobalamin limitation or cobalamin and iron colimitation of primary production. Despite hints that the microbial source of cobalamin during this summertime period may be gammaproteobacterial (15), it has remained uncharacterized to date, rendering inquiry into interactions between microbial sources and sinks of the vitamin difficult. Although instances of mutualistic cobalamin-based interactions between bacteria and algal laboratories have been identified (16), little is known about microbial dynamics surrounding cobalamin production and exchange in the field.

Within McMurdo Sound, which connects the Ross Sea of the Southern Ocean with the McMurdo ice shelf, primary production rates can reach upward of 2 g C m$^{-2}$ d$^{-1}$, with most annual production occurring between December and January (17). Because this area is highly influenced by coastal processes, it has generally been assumed that productivity in the region is not iron-limited (4). However, we show here that at the sea ice edge, McMurdo Sound primary production was both iron- and cobalamin-limited in mid-January 2013, as well as 2015 (Fig. 1; *SI Appendix*, Fig. S1). By examining co-occurring changes in bacterial and phytoplankton transcriptional profiles in response to micronutrient manipulation during this colimited period, we identify specific bacterial and phytoplankton processes that contribute to cobalamin limitation and its relationship to iron dynamics in this key marine region.

**Results and Discussion**

In a late summer McMurdo Sound community (Fig. 1; *SI Appendix*, *Fig. S1 and Table S1*), cobalamin and iron addition each independently enhanced chlorophyll $a$ (Chl $a$) production, indicating that phytoplankton growth was simultaneously limited by availability of these two micronutrients. The difference in chlorophyll concentrations in the control treatment between 24 and 96 h also suggests that light limitation may have been a factor (*SI Appendix*). Similar results were obtained in a subsequent year during the same period, whereas earlier in that year, the phytoplankton community appeared to be both iron- and cobalamin-replete. These data suggest this colimitation is a consistent, episodically important phenomenon (*SI Appendix*, Fig. S1). We examined the short-term transcriptional response of the January 16, 2013, community to cobalamin and iron addition to further characterize the nature and implications of this colimitation. RNA sequencing was performed on triplicate samples 24 h after micronutrient addition. Sequencing and assembly statistics are given in Dataset S1. This timescale is short relative to phytoplankton community growth rates ($0.23 \pm 0.09$ d$^{-1}$; Chl $a$-specific growth rate). Thus, observed differences in transcript abundance are expected to directly reflect responses to changes in micronutrient availability, rather than shifts in community composition. This is supported by phylogenetic contributions to the mRNA pool, as well as 16S and 18S ribosomal RNA amplicon analyses (Fig. 1; *SI Appendix*, Figs. S2 and S3). Diatoms and particularly *Pseudonitzchia* and *Pseudo-nitzschia* dominate the majority of the phytoplankton community (Fig. 1 B and C; *SI Appendix*, Table S1). Bacterial contributions to the mRNA pool were dominated by Proteobacteria and Bacteroidetes, with minimal archaeal or cyanobacterial contributions (Fig. 1 D), consistent with our 16S rRNA amplicon analyses (*SI Appendix*, Fig. S3), as well as previous austral summer Southern Ocean observations (12, 13).

Across all major groups in the community, cobalamin addition drove a more extensive transcriptional shift than iron addition (*SI Appendix*, Fig. S4), suggesting diverse microbes are poised to manage and respond to cobalamin depletion. Additionally, the major primary producers in this system, displayed transcriptional patterns consistent with the simultaneous cobalamin and iron limitation observed via Chl $a$. Previously identified diatom cobalamin stress indicators cobalamin acquisition protein 1 (CBA1) and MetE (8, 19) were repressed by cobalamin addition across a range of diatom taxa, regardless of iron status (Fig. 2; *SI Appendix*, Figs. S5 and S6). CBA1 is involved in cobalamin acquisition (19), and its transcripts were present at $9 \pm 4 \times 10^3$ copies L$^{-1}$ in control and $+Fe$ treatments, and were repressed to $2 \pm 0.4 \times 10^3$ copies L$^{-1}$ 24 h after cobalamin addition. MetE replaces the cobalamin requirement in diatoms (8) and its transcripts were repressed from $3 \pm 1 \times 10^5$ to $6 \pm 0.4 \times 10^4$ copies L$^{-1}$. Their relatively high expression in unamended control samples thus reflected cobalamin stress in the natural community. A subset of diatom sequences encoding the canonical iron starvation indicator flavodoxin (22) were significantly repressed by iron addition, as were select transcripts encoding another diatom iron starvation-induced protein, ISIP2A (23) (Fig. 2; *SI Appendix*, Figs. S5 and S6). Multiple diatoms ISIP2A and flavodoxin encoding ORFs were not repressed 24 h after iron addition. These ORFs may have been repressed by iron addition on a different timescale, or it may be that some Antarctic diatoms constitutively express these genes, as observed previously for flavodoxin (24). Nitrate uptake rates were elevated after iron addition, in line with observed up-regulation of diatom...
Given that cobalamin is produced only by bacteria and archaea, a full understanding of cobalamin colimitation in phytoplankton requires interrogation of these communities as well. Through combining these transcriptomic data with a genome sequence obtained from the assembly of metagenomic data recovered from another Southern Ocean surface water community, we identify the Oceanospirillaceae ASP10-02a population as the dominant source of transcriptional capacity for cobalamin biosynthesis, contributing more than 70% of cobalamin biosynthesis-associated reads in this experiment (Fig. 3; Dataset S2). We also suggest this group is a key contributor to cobalamin biosynthesis throughout Austral summer surface waters of the Southern Ocean, as it contributes the majority of cbiA/cobB (cobyricinic acid, a-diamide synthase) metagenomic sequences from a range of Southern Ocean locations in that season, when Thaumarchaea and SAR324 contributions are low (SI Appendix, Fig. S8). Oceanospirillaceae ASP10-02a also contributes a majority of CobU (adenosylcobinamide kinase)-encoding sequences in Southern Ocean metagenomes (SI Appendix, Fig. S8). In addition, Oceanospirillaceae ASP10-02a CbiA-derived peptides were previously detected in the Ross Sea [identified as Group RSB12 (15); SI Appendix, Fig. S9]. The assembled Oceanospirillaceae ASP10-02a genome also recruited nearly 20% of all bacterial-assigned reads from this experiment, suggesting it is an important contributor to this bacterial community (Fig. 3; Dataset S3). High expression levels of a diverse suite of organic compound acquisition genes, possible cell surface attachment-related genes (26), and phototroph/bacterial genes were detected and attributed to Oceanospirillaceae ASP10-02a (SI Appendix, Fig. S10). This key cobalamin producer may thus have been directly associated with phytoplankton cells and acquiring a wide range of phytoplankton-derived organic compounds as growth substrates, suggesting a mutualistic relationship.

Notably, Oceanospirillaceae ASP10-02a-attributed cobalamin biosynthesis pathway genes did not show differential expression upon vitamin addition. However, in other bacteria, genes attributed to the final steps in the pathway (e.g., cobU) were repressed by cobalamin addition (Fig. 3; Dataset S2). This latter part of the pathway can be referred to as the salvage and repair portion and is present in many bacterial genomes that do not encode the entire biosynthesis pathway (27). Although Oceanospirillaceae ASP10-02a contributed the majority of cobU reads, one ORF, most similar to a different gammag proteobacterial sequence, contributed nearly 10% of cobU reads and was significantly repressed by cobalamin addition (Fig. 3). This suggests that during this late Austral summer experiment, a subset of bacterial groups repressed cobalamin salvage under conditions of sufficient vitamin availability; increased cobalamin concentrations appear to have resulted in reduced repair and reuse. Sequences most similar to this cobalamin-repressed cobU ORF are also highly represented in Southern Ocean metagenomics datasets in the Austral summer (SI Appendix, Fig. S8; gammag proteobacterium HTCC2134), suggesting repression of salvage and repair may be a widespread phenomenon. Bacteria and archaea can also be important cobalamin consumers. Previous studies in the Ross Sea and other coastal marine locations suggest bacteria are able to assimilate as much genes encoding nitrate transporters (SI Appendix, Fig. S7). Notably, alleviation of iron limitation was not required for this community to display signs of cobalamin stress, and vice versa, supporting the conclusion that these nutrients simultaneously limited community growth. Although it is possible that this response, along with the observed chlorophyll production pattern, could be produced if different groups within the primary producer community were limited by iron and others by cobalamin, a dominant diatom species in this experiment (Fragilariopsis cylindrus) was simultaneously iron- and cobalamin-deprived. CBA1, MetE, and ISIP2A sequences that showed >99–95% identity (blastp) to this genome were repressed by cobalamin and iron additions, respectively (Table 1). These observations support a model for colimitation whereby growth can be reduced as a result of deprivation of two nutrients simultaneously (25). Certain types of colimitation, such as biochemical substitution or dependent limitation (25), do not have known molecular mechanisms pertaining to iron and cobalamin in eukaryotic phytoplankton. Rather, diatom cobalamin use appears to be largely independent of iron demand and use (8), suggesting this is an instance of independent colimitation (25).
cobalamin as phytoplankton (14, 28). We identified four sequences encoding the bacterial cobalamin uptake protein BtuB in this study (Fig. 3). One of two highly expressed BtuB-encoding genes is most similar to those from Methylophaga. Methylophaga also contributed significantly to the total bacterial portion of the metatranscriptomes analyzed here, suggesting it may be a quantitatively important cobalamin consumer in this study (Fig. 3, Dataset S4). This group has previously been detected in other areas of the coastal Southern Ocean and across a range of additional marine locales (29–31). Characterized members of this group do not produce cobalamin (32–34), but contribute significantly to both methanol and dimethylsulfide consumption in the surface ocean (30, 31). Methylophaga displayed signatures of iron and cobalamin deprivation, with repressed cobalamin uptake functions upon cobalamin addition, and repressed iron complex uptake and elevated iron storage transcripts after iron addition (Fig. 4). In addition to signs of micronutrient deprivation, the Methylophaga group strongly expressed genes for methanol and other one-carbon compound use. These include quinoprotein methanol dehydrogenase, the enzyme required for conversion of methanol to formaldehyde, which is the initial step in assimilatory and dissimilatory methanol use (Fig. 4). Importantly, as methanol is a ubiquitous, abundant phytoplankton waste product (35), this gammaproteobacterial group also couples methanol production via phytoplankton growth to competition for cobalamin and iron. Strong iron binding ligand production by bacteria has long been thought to play a role in enhancing iron bioavailability in the ocean (e.g., ref. 36). Here, we document repression of genes encoding siderophore uptake proteins upon iron addition, supporting the notion that siderophores are a source of iron to bacteria under iron limited conditions (Dataset S5). In addition, we document significant induction of possible bacterial siderophore biosynthesis genes upon iron addition (nonribosomal peptide biosynthesis; Dataset S5). Although counter to the canonical negative Fur regulation of siderophore production, this induction is consistent with results from iron fertilization studies.
A series of feedback loops, driven by phytoplankton and bacterial dynamics, appears to control interactivity of cobalamin and iron. These feedback loops are described here as responses to pulsed iron input. Molecular support for feedback loops is shown (A) in the heat map of relative expression levels (log10) of diatom CBA1, MetE, fla2 flavodoxin, and ISIP2A transcripts. Bacterial gene expression patterns supporting these feedback loops include (B) Methylophaga sp. methanol consumption (methanol dehydrogenase and key ribulose monophosphate pathway enzymes) and iron and cobalamin deprivation (iron acquisition (FecA), iron storage (bacterioferritin), and cobalamin uptake (BtuB))-related genes. Highly expressed Oceanospirillaceae ASP10-02a (D) organic matter transport and binding functions and possible adhesion functions (HecA family), as well as cobalamin biosynthesis, also support this model. Siderophore-related genes that were influenced (significant; FDR < 0.05) by iron are shown, highlighting induction of possible Bacteriodetes-associated nonribosomal peptide synthase genes by iron addition (E) and repression of various proteobacterial Fe-complex uptake-related genes (details provided in Dataset S5).

Fig. 5. A series of feedback loops, driven by phytoplankton and bacterial dynamics, appears to control interactivity of cobalamin and iron. These feedback loops are described here as responses to pulsed iron input. Molecular support for feedback loops is shown (A) in the heat map of relative expression levels (log10) of diatom CBA1, MetE, fla2 flavodoxin, and ISIP2A transcripts. Bacterial gene expression patterns supporting these feedback loops include (B) Methylophaga sp. methanol consumption (methanol dehydrogenase and key ribulose monophosphate pathway enzymes) and iron and cobalamin deprivation (iron acquisition (FecA), iron storage (bacterioferritin), and cobalamin uptake (BtuB))-related genes. Highly expressed Oceanospirillaceae ASP10-02a (D) organic matter transport and binding functions and possible adhesion functions (HecA family), as well as cobalamin biosynthesis, also support this model. Siderophore-related genes that were influenced (significant; FDR < 0.05) by iron are shown, highlighting induction of possible Bacteriodetes-associated nonribosomal peptide synthase genes by iron addition (E) and repression of various proteobacterial Fe-complex uptake-related genes (details provided in Dataset S5).

which have shown that iron additions may stimulate production of strong iron binding ligands in the ocean (36, 37). A series of feedback loops driven by phytoplankton-bacterial interactions thus appear to govern coupling of cobalamin and iron dynamics in this late Austral summer system (Fig. 5). When iron is added to the system, for instance, as a result of pulsed aeolian input or melting sea ice, this will stimulate iron-limited phytoplankton growth. Availability of such iron may be enhanced as a result of bacterial ligand production, which is stimulated both by iron addition via a regulated response and, in a positive feedback loop, enhanced availability of phytoplankton-derived organic matter. Elevated phytoplankton-derived organic matter availability to bacteria is expected upon alleviation of iron limitation (38, 39). In another positive feedback loop, cobalamin production increases, also as a result of this enhanced organic matter availability, providing a mechanism for further increasing phytoplankton growth. This may be counterbalanced by negative feedback loops in which phytoplankton and bacterial demand for cobalamin increase while bacterial salvage and repair of degraded cobalamin is reduced in response to increases in cobalamin supply (Figs. 3 and 5). In this experiment, cobalamin and iron addition alone each stimulated production, but together did not enhance Chl a beyond the level of iron addition alone [described as subadditive-independent colimitation (40)]. This suggests that, by 96 h, in situ cobalamin production may have been enhanced by iron addition, and a manipulative cobalamin addition was not required to generate cobalamin-replete conditions (Fig. 1; SI Appendix, Fig. S1). This interpretation suggests the positive feedback loop (Fig. 5) may have dominated. Alternatively, it is possible that another nutrient may have become limiting (e.g., manganese), preventing an additive effect. In contrast, previous summertime observations in the Ross Sea (5) documented a condition in which simultaneous cobalamin and iron addition stimulated substantial additional growth beyond iron addition alone [serial limitation (40)]. In this instance, it appears that the negative feedback loops offset the positive, and upon iron addition, cobalamin demand was stimulated beyond production. Each of these types of colimitation (subadditive independent and serial) have been observed repeatedly in marine, terrestrial, and freshwater systems for major nutrients (40). The results described here offer potential mechanisms that underpin microbial interactions and possibly drive this system into one type of colimitation over another. In addition, the potential light limitation observed here (Fig. 1) could also interact with the described colimitation, for instance, by altering abiotic cobalamin degradation rates or influencing iron quotas, and warrants further investigation in future efforts.

Future work is also required to understand relative rates of the processes identified here, as well as controls on when and where the positive or negative feedback loops described prevail. However, mechanisms by which bacterial community composition could substantially influence the net balance are apparent. It is also likely, given the highly seasonal nature of Southern Ocean microbial communities (12), that other important interactions may be at play during different times of year. It is clear, however, that late summer phytoplankton growth in this productive region is synergistically influenced by the availability of cobalamin and iron, which appears to be largely regulated by the interactions described here. We propose the term “interactive colimitation” to describe such scenarios, in which multiple limiting nutrient cycles are affected by one another through interactions among different microbial functional groups. This example of interactive colimitation was identified because of our relatively extensive understanding of the molecular mechanisms governing acquisition and management of these micronutrients. As studies of mutualism and competition between microbial groups advance, we anticipate that additional instances of such interactive colimitation may be identified as important drivers of marine biogeochemical processes.
Materials and Methods
On January 16, 2013, seawater was collected from 3 m depth at the sea ice edge in McMurdo Sound of the Ross Sea (77° 36.999′ S 165° 28.464′ E), using a trace metal clean technique. Triplicate bottles (2.7 L) of each treatment (unamended control, +1 mM added FeCl₃, +200 μM added cyanocobalamin, and +200 μM +1 mM cyanocobalamin and 1 mM Fe) were placed in an indoor incubator at 0°C (+45 μmol photons m⁻² s⁻¹ of constant light. After 24 h, RNA samples were collected (450 mL) and nitrate uptake and primary productivity rates were measured. Samples were collected for Chl a at 0, 24, and 96 h. RNA was extracted using the TRIzol reagent (Life Technologies). Ribosomal RNA was removed with Ribo-Zero Magnetic Kit (Epicentre Biotechnologies). Total RNA was purified and subjected to amplification and cDNA synthesis, using the Ovation RNA-Seq System V2 (NuGEN). One microgram of the resulting high-quality cDNA pool was fragmented to a mean length of 200 bp, and Truseq (illumina) libraries were prepared and subjected to paired-end sequencing via illumina HiSeq. Reads were trimmed and filtered, contigs were assembled in CLC Assembly Cell (CLCBio), and ORFs were predicted (41). ORFs were annotated de novo for function via KEGG, KOG, Pfam, and Tigrfam assignments. Taxonomic classification was assigned to each ORF using a reference dataset, as described in the SI Appendix, and the Lineage Probability Index (LPI, as calculated in ref. 18). edgert was used to assign normalized fold change and determine which ORFs were significantly differentially expressed in pairwise comparisons between treatments, considering triplicates, within a given phylogenetic grouping (42). For Fig. 2, diatom ORFs [identified as diatom via LPI analyses; LPI > 0.8 (18)] were clustered using MCL (Markov cluster algorithm) (21), and these clusters were used to produce MANTA plots (20). For Oceanaer Screptaceae ASP10-02a genome assembly, water was collected from 10 m in the Amundsen Sea on December 19, 2010. Metagenomic libraries were created with the Ovation Ultralow kit (NuGEN). Overlapping and gapped metagenomic DNA libraries were prepared for sequencing on a HiSeq platform (Illumina). CLC was used to assemble scaffolds, tetranucleotide frequencies of scaffolds were analyzed (43), and draft genomes were generated via binning scaffolds clustered (hierarchically) together in well-supported clades, refined using UC content and taxonomical affiliation (44). ORFs identified in metatranscriptomic analyses were mapped to the Oceanaer Screptaceae ASP10-02a genome bin from the best-scoring nucleotide alignment, using BWA-MEM with default parameters (45). ORFs with >99% similarity to the genome scaffold sequences were used for subsequent analyses of gene expression patterns within this population. Complete methods and materials are given in the SI Appendix.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS. We thank Marian Walworth and Ariel Rabines for assistance in the laboratory and field, and Ruth Benzie for nutrient measurements in our cobalamin stock. We are grateful to Antarctic Support Contractors, especially Jen Erelke and Ned Corkran, for facilitating fieldwork and to Mal Saito for helpful comments on the manuscript. This study was funded by National Science Foundation (NSF) Antarctic Sciences Awards 1103503 (to E.M.B.), 0732282 and 1043671 (to A.E.A.), 1043748 (to D.A.H.), 1043635 (to D.A.B.), and 1142095 (to A.F.P.); Gordon and Betty Moore Foundation Grant GBMF3828 (to A.E.A.); and NSF Ocean Science Awards 1136477 (to A.E.A.).

8. Bertrand EM, et al. (2013) Methionine synthase interreplacement in diatom cultures to assign normalized fold change and determine which ORFs were significantly differentially expressed in pairwise comparisons between treatments, considering triplicates, within a given phylogenetic grouping (42). For Fig. 2, diatom ORFs [identified as diatom via LPI analyses; LPI > 0.8 (18)] were clustered using MCL (Markov cluster algorithm) (21), and these clusters were used to produce MANTA plots (20).

PNAS | August 11, 2015 | vol. 112 | no. 32 | 9943